McNair Research Review

Volume IX Summer 2011

Ronald E. McNair Postbaccalaureate Achievement Program
Sponsors

James E. Walker Library
College of Liberal Arts
College of Basic and Applied Sciences
College of Mass Communication
Jennings A. Jones College of Business
College of Education
University College
College of Graduate Studies
University Honors College
College of Behavioral and Health Sciences
Knowledge Never Goes Out of Style.

College of Liberal Arts
http://libarts.web.mtsu.edu

Art
English
Foreign Languages & Literatures
Geosciences
History
School of Music
Philosophy
Political Science
Sociology & Anthropology
Social Work
Speech & Theatre
College of Basic and Applied Sciences

Aerospace
Agribusiness and Agriscience
Biology
Chemistry
Computer Science
Engineering Technology
Mathematical Sciences
Military Science
Physics and Astronomy

mtsu.edu/cbas/
Advisory Board
October 2007- September 2012

Michael Allen, Ph.D.
Vice Provost for Research; Dean, College of Graduate Studies

Gloria Bonner, Ed.D.
Assistant to the President for Community Engagement and Support

Jim Burton, Ph.D.
Dean, Jennings A. Jones College of Business

Mark Byrnes, Ph.D.
Dean, College of Liberal Arts

Scott Carnicom, Ph.D.
Associate Dean, University Honors College

Thomas J. Cheatham, Ph.D.
Dean, College of Basic and Applied Sciences

John Harris, M.S.
Director, Disabled Student Services

Roy Moore, Ph.D.
Dean, College of Mass Communication

Lana Seivers, Ph.D.
Dean, College of Education

Debra Sells, Ed.D.
Vice President, Student Affairs

Stephen White, M.Div.
Director, Financial Aid

Harold Whiteside, Ph.D.
Dean, College of Behavioral and Health Sciences

Vincent Windrow, Th.B.
Director, Intercultural and Diversity Affairs

McNair Program Staff

L. Diane Miller, Ph.D.
Director

Stephen R. Saunders, M.A.
Assistant Director

Cindy K. Howell
Administrative Assistant

Denise Harris, Monique Richard
Graduate Assistants
proud supporter of the
Ronald E. McNair Program

2009-2010:
Two McNair Scholars

2010-2011:
One McNair Scholar

- 2011 Grammy for Best Engineered Album:
  Recording Industry Professor John Hill

- Grammy wins for two alumni: Clarke Schleicher ('80) for
  “Record of the Year” and Josh Kear ('96) for “Best Country
  Song” and “Song of the Year”

- $40,000 McCormick Foundation grant to School of
  Journalism for hosting conference on media coverage
  of Islam in the South

- New student media center coming in Fall 2011: home to
  campus newspaper Sidelines, public radio station WMOT,
  student radio WMTS, record label MT Records, and MTTV
  Channel 10

- $90,000 in cornerstone pledges from corporate and
  individual donors for student media center

- $1.4 million grant for new mobile production lab,
  Electronic Media Communication Department

- EMC Associate Professor Michael Johnson
  executive produced talk show Monique on BET

For more information
615- 898-5171
mtsu.edu/masscomm/
From the Director

The Ronald E. McNair Post-Baccalaureate Achievement Program at MTSU is completing its 12th year. It has been funded in four-year cycles, which means that we are drawing near the end of our third funding cycle and will soon be competing with other campuses across the country for another round of funding. Preparing a proposal for external funding is a good time to reflect on the many successes of the program and to be grateful for the support from administrators, faculty members, and staff.

The successes are reflected in the McNair students who have graduated and moved on to graduate schools across the nation. To date, MTSU’s McNair Program has served 153 students, including 20 current students. In the last 12 years, 123 of these students have graduated (92.48% of the 133 past students) with a baccalaureate degree. Thirty-six have earned master’s degrees; and, two students have completed professional doctoral degrees (MD and JD). Since the goal of McNair programs across the nation is to have the students they serve complete Ph.D. degrees, we give a special salute to Janet Awokoya who completed a Ph.D. in education and to Nathaniel Mills who completed a Ph.D. in counseling, both in 2009. Other students are nearing completion of this milestone in their lives. I look forward to recognizing them in future editions of the Review. Graduate schools that former McNair students have attended include Vanderbilt, Brandeis, North Carolina State, UC-Davis, Ohio State, Maryland, Notre Dame, and Florida, to name a few.

Volume IX of the McNair Research Review contains the research of students in a wide variety of disciplines. The students and their faculty mentors deserve all the credit for the outstanding papers published in this volume. Steve Saunders, assistant director, Cindy Howell, program secretary, and Monique Richard, graduate assistant, receive my thanks for making this volume of the journal exemplary.

I also want to thank Sidney A. McPhee, president, and Brad Bartel, provost of MTSU, for their strong support of the program; and, to all university staff who help our students in countless ways to achieve their academic goals. Hearty thanks as well to the nine colleges and library on campus listed on page 2 which contributed to the production of Volume IX. Without their support, this publication would not be possible.

To be eligible for the program, a student must meet the following criteria:

- Be a first-generation college student (neither parent or guardian has earned a baccalaureate degree) and be financially disadvantaged (according to federal guidelines);
- Or, be a member of a group currently underrepresented in graduate education (Black, Hispanic, Alaskan native, or American Indian);
- Plan to pursue a doctoral degree;
- Be enrolled in a degree program at MTSU or transferring to MTSU;
- Have completed at least 60 semester credit hours with a CUM GPA of 3.0 or higher; Be a U.S. citizen or permanent resident.

If you are an MTSU student and meet the qualifications above, please consider applying for admission to the program. If you are a member of the faculty, administration, or staff and know a student who is eligible, please encourage the student to drop by the McNair office in Midgett Building, Room 103 or go to www.mtsu.edu/~mcnair to apply.

Sincerely,

L. Diane Miller, Ph.D.
Director
Scholars in This Issue

Felicia Brown  Matthew Foriest  Joshua Fryer  Lindsay Gates

Johnathan Gilliam  Amber Gray  Matthew Hampton  Denise Harris

Michael Harris  Nick Mackie  Jenae Matikke  Chelsea Norman

Joseph Quarles  Ana Valenzuela  Kamryn Warren  Chris Young
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors and Advisors</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>From the Director</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>About Ronald E. McNair</td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Discourse of Health among Hispanic Women: A Literature Review</td>
<td>Felicia Brown and Dr. Ida Fadzillah-Leggett</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Impact of Interracial Activism in the Nashville Sit-ins</td>
<td>Matthew Foriest and Dr. Mary Evins</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China and the International Construction of Sovereignty</td>
<td>Joshua Fryer and Dr. Karen Petersen</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Red to Green: The Progression of Indian Agriculture from</td>
<td>Lindsay Gates and Dr. Mark Doyle</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independence to the Green Revolution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>An Analysis of the Factors that Contribute to Intellectual Property</td>
<td>Johnathan Gilliam and Dr. Charles H. Apigian</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theft</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety Management Systems: The Perspective of Tennessee Airports</td>
<td>Amber L. Gray and Dr. C. Daniel Prather</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How the Financial Crisis of 2007 Affected Household Wealth</td>
<td>J. Matthew Hampton and Dr. Stuart J. Fowler</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“More Than a Hamburger and a Cup of Coffee”: Connecting the NAACP</td>
<td>Denise Harris and Dr. Thomas L. Bynum</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth Councils and College Chapters to the Tennessee Sit-in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demonstrations</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inside the Criminal Minds of Highly Intelligent Fraudsters</td>
<td>Michael D. Harris and Dr. Mary E. Phillips</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calamitous Kurds: Prospects for Conflict in Kurdistan</td>
<td>Adrian Nicholas Mackie and Dr. Karen Petersen</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Formless Father Figure: Young Men Affected by the Absence of a</td>
<td>Jenae Matikke and Dr. Margaret Fontanesi-Seime</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male Figure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African Pentecostal Movements: Inspiring a Collective Ethic</td>
<td>Chelsea Norman and Dr. Ida Fadzillah Leggett</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Snow White: A Cinematic Study</td>
<td>Joseph Quarles and Dr. Martha Hixon</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creating a New Tradition: Perspectives on Foreign Policy of</td>
<td>Ana Valenzuela and Dr. Robert Hunt</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theodore Roosevelt and Woodrow Wilson</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perspectives of Refugee Resettlement Experiences in Middle Tennessee</td>
<td>Kamrynn Warren and Dr. Meredith Dye</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democracy and Crime in the International System</td>
<td>Chris Young and Dr. J. Douglas Heffington</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Future of Business!

Education is our business

www.mtsu.edu/business
Born October 21, 1950, in Lake City, South Carolina, Ronald McNair graduated valedictorian of his high school class in 1967. He earned a B.S. degree from North Carolina A&T State University in 1971 and a Ph.D. in physics from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology in 1976. He conducted research on electro-optic laser modulation for Hughes Research Laboratories until chosen by NASA in January 1978 to train as an astronaut. Ronald E. McNair died onboard the space shuttle Challenger when it exploded on January 28, 1986.

Later that year, Congress created the Ronald E. McNair Postbaccalaureate Achievement Program. This was the sixth TRiO program (named after the original three programs: Upward Bound, Talent Search, and Student Support Services). The purpose of the McNair Program is to help disadvantaged students (first-generation college/low-income or under-represented) complete their undergraduate degree, enroll in graduate school and earn a Ph.D.

The McNair Program at Middle Tennessee State University was established in October 1999. It is funded by a grant from the U.S. Department of Education under the Higher Education Act of 1965, Title IV, Part A, Subpart 2, and by MTSU.
College of Education
www.mtsu.edu/education/

In 1911 Middle Tennessee Normal School opened with the mission of preparing teachers for Tennessee.

Today, in 2011, Middle Tennessee State University embraces the past and builds the future by preparing educators who make a difference.

Continue the tradition ... TEACH.
Complete Your Degree Online at MTSU!

MTSUAnytime.com is your guide to all online and hybrid degree programs offered at MTSU.

We currently provide more than 14 complete degree programs in addition to hundreds of online or hybrid courses. Earn your online degree from the best public university in Tennessee.

MTSU—Tennessee’s Best

University College
Middle Tennessee State University
855 W. College Street, Suite K | Murfreesboro, TN 37129
(615) 898-5611
www.mtsuanytime.com

MTSU, a Tennessee Board of Regents university, is an equal opportunity, nonracially identifiable, educational institution that does not discriminate against individuals with disabilities.
From a Master’s student to the Ph.D. candidate, the College of Graduate Studies supports our talented McNair Scholars in their pursuit of a doctoral degree.

We look forward to welcoming future McNair students into our “Family of Scholars.”

For information on your graduate education opportunities, please visit our web site: www.mtsu.edu/graduate

Proud supporter of the Ronald E. McNair Postbaccalaureate Achievement Program
A Journal of Student Research
A publication of the MTSU Honors College

The journal accepts research from MTSU students either by themselves or in conjunction with a faculty mentor. Students should submit articles in an electronic format in Microsoft Word or Rich Text Format. Articles may be e-mailed as an attachment to scientia@mtsu.edu, submitted on a disk to Scientia et Humanitas, MTSU Box 267, or submitted by flash drive to the Scientia et Humanitas office, Honors 223, and/or to the Adviser in Honors 225. Students are responsible for confirming that the office has received their work.

Submissions must have 30 or fewer typed, double-spaced pages and may include revisions of papers presented for classes, for Scholar’s Week, or Honors theses. The submission should include the title of the article followed by the name(s) and department(s) of author(s) with an address, telephone number and e-mail at which the author(s) may be reached.

Papers should include a brief abstract of no more than 250 words stating the purpose, methods, results, and conclusion. Papers will typically include an introduction, a description of methods, a report of results, the author’s conclusions and notes and references formatted consistent with standards within the discipline.

All papers will be student reviewed. Accepted papers will be published online in the style of a professional journal and may be published in print form. Authors will retain copyright privileges and will receive five printed copies.

For more information please contact: Marsha Powers, Coordinator of Publications, University Honors College
898-5759 or scientia@mtsu.edu The website is currently being updated: www.mtsu.edu/~scientia
The Discourse of Health among Hispanic Women: 
A Literature Review

Felicia Brown
Dr. Ida Fadzillah-Leggett
Department of Anthropology

The following is an initial literature review concerning Hispanic women and how they perceive and treat health and illness. The sources explore the roles Hispanic women take in communities, families, and within the political/economic environment that surrounds them and how it in turn affects their perspective on healthcare, formal or otherwise. I focus on women because previous research has identified mothers as the primary caretakers within the family model. Doing so provides a more detailed picture of how families and belief systems are tied into health perceptions.

The focus here is on the ideas of health and culture held by Hispanic and Latin women living in the United States as well as in Central America. I survey the existing literature in the social sciences and in nursing on belief systems held by these women in order to compare and contrast “native” ideas of health and illness with mainstream “American” ideas. Sources examine the roles Hispanic women take in their families, communities, and within the political/economic environment they reside in and how these institutions influence their perspectives and practices concerning healthcare. Because previous research has indicated that mothers are the primary caretakers within the family model, inclusion of the feminist perspective is crucial to conceiving a holistic and in-depth analysis of practices and belief systems and how they affect health within the Hispanic culture. Though the feminist perspective has not been ignored, it has not been addressed as extensively as is necessary for a critical analysis. Because immigrant health has been a recent and pressing topic, this research is both timely and meaningful for potential policies both within and outside of the United States. Though this review is not meant to be generalized to all immigrant experiences and/or health perspectives, it is an initial step toward understanding the complex issues surrounding healthcare policies related to Hispanics.

The meaning of Hispanic has been disputed among sociologists and anthropologists alike. “The Hispanic population in the U.S. includes … Mexican Americans, Puerto Ricans, Cuban Americans, Central or South Americans and other Hispanics” (Juárbé as quoted in Higgins, 1999: 1105). For the sake of simplifying this debate, each group is named whenever possible. Because I take the perspective of medical anthropology, this term, too, requires definition: “A biocultural discipline concerned with both the biological and sociocultural aspects of human behavior and particularly with the ways in which the two interacted throughout human history to influence health and disease” (Foster and Anderson as quoted in Helman, 2007: 7). It is notable that in the U.S., “Hispanics, those making less than $36,000 a year, and 18-29-year-olds are the most likely to be uninsured, at 42%, 29%, and 28% respectively” in 2009 (www.gallup.com/video/121826/Slight-Uptick-Uninsured-2009.aspx).

Folklore and Belief Systems

Folklore is a type of traditional discourse that, while often considered unsubstantiated by the general public, is widely circulated and considered to be true by its practitioners. In what follows, I will focus primarily on medicinal folklore. In Latin American folk medicine, the idea of balance and reciprocity prevails, constructing an entirely different discourse for illness compared to America’s notion of “biological warfare” against disease. Hispanics believe that if you have too much of one thing, such as wealth, you will lose in another area. It is also believed that the most basic of the elements are fire and water, which are labeled as hot and cold respectively. Illness itself is viewed as an imbalance between being too hot or too cold. Actions/emotions like envy, lust, anger, and consumption are all hot, while giving and nursing are considered cold (Ingham, 1970: 78). Small plants and animals that live close to the ground are cold, while humans and larger animals have more exposure to sun and are deemed hot. Certain foods are deemed hot or cold, and any imbalance between them can make someone ill. This is cured by applying some-
thing of the opposite nature to absorb the hot or cold (79).

Even different illnesses are seen as hot or cold. For instance, respiratory infections such as bronchitis, pneumonia, and colds are caused by cold airs (aires) and fevers are attributed to displaced heat. The source of these aires are said to originate in river bottoms, ant hills, dank places, and caves, especially where the Devil resides. A couple of hot illnesses that seem to go back as far as Greek times are Derrame de bilis (overflow of bile) and mal de ojo (the evil eye). The overflow of bile results from someone with too much anger or courage, while the evil eye results from a “strong” or “hot” vision. Dano is another illness that can be caused by sexual excitement or by those who admire others’ children. It is said that cute children are very vulnerable to this, and to prevent it, parents will make them wear a gold earring, a snake’s fang, or garlic to deflect hot visions (80).

To fully explore the influence of folk medicine, one must also examine the influence of spirituality in general on the health of the Hispanic population. Spirituality itself has two definitions: “… it may mean an inner quality that facilitates connectedness with the self, other people, and nature … or one’s acknowledgement of and relationship with a Supreme Being” (Musgrave, 2002: 557). Religiosity, on the other hand, is the active practice of and attendance to religious activities. Together, these are a part of the lens through which to see the world within a culture. For Hispanic women in particular, “… mind, body, and spirit are inseparable” (558).

These beliefs have consequences for treating illnesses. “The Hispanic family is more inclined to resort to home remedies to treat illness than is the general U.S. population,” according to Higgins (1999: 1106). When families use folk healing (curanderismo), women usually serve as healers; older women can serve as health practitioners called parteras or curanderas. Curanderismo traces back to pre-Columbian beliefs as influenced by the Spanish healthcare traditions in the 16th century, and, further back, the beliefs of the Aztecs. The current belief systems of the Hispanic population combine these traditions along with some elements of modern medicine.

Spirituality itself seems to have certain advantages. “Studies indicate that spirituality may influence self-esteem and a sense of belonging, sustaining valued health behavior” (Musgrave: 558). Spirituality can also lead to more optimistic views on traumatic events, thus reducing stress-related diseases. Both religiosity and spirituality are associated with better immune functioning, lower blood pressure, and decreased depression (559). Though these beliefs have been studied extensively, they are not always held in a strict context and there are variations and extensions to such beliefs as with any popular discourse. One such variation is the belief in fatalism, which can be particularly influen-

tial in the area of preventative medications and treatments.

Chavez et al (1995: 42) say that though Latino women (defined in this study as women of Mexican descent and women born in Mexico or El Salvador) have the highest rates of cervical cancer and the highest cumulative risks in the U.S. compared to Caucasian and African American women, they have relatively low rates of cervical cancer screening tests. The authors also examine the discourse surrounding breast cancer. A frequent theme surrounding the risk of cancer deals with physical trauma or stress. Several women suggested that hitting one’s breast or having operations could cause cancer (49-50). Other causes are believed to be miscarriages, having too many children and contraceptives. From this stems the idea that lifestyle affects one’s health, which ties medical and cultural ideas together. For instance, some Hispanic women stated that starting sexual activity at a young age can make one more susceptible to cancer, and medical doctors agree, though for different reasons. The medical reason is that this usually leads to more STD exposure, whereas the women’s reasoning was that the vagina had been overused (53).

Certain Hispanic women seem to be taking on a more flexible definition of fate and its influence on health. For Dominican women, the idea of fatalismo (fatalism) has become increasingly popular and has been blamed for deterring them from cancer screening (Florez, 2008: 291). Fatalism as defined in this article is “the general tendency to believe that events are predetermined or caused by external forces and that little or nothing can be done to change their course” (292). However, findings show that though many Latino women believe in destiny, they also believe they have a certain amount of control over that destiny. For example, cancer is seen as a type of destiny insofar as it is hereditary, but to not get regular checkups is being careless, thus combining the belief in external forces and individual agency. This “destino (destiny) framework allowed participants to comfortably engage in screening while understanding that total avoidance of breast cancer was never truly possible” (297).

Some authors argue that fatalistic attitudes may be a result of economic deprivation rather than a cultural trait (Lewis as quoted in Leybas-Amedia, 2005). “It is also possible that fatalism is a broader mechanism that encompasses religious commitment to acceptance of conditions in one’s life” (135).

**Holistic Healthcare**

Asking why Hispanic women use treatment, and what kind of treatments they use, leads to another question: who provides their treatments? In Mexico, says Helman (2007), both folk healers and doctors are used. The two healthcare providers differ, of course. For instance, doctors have a ten-
dency to tell patients what has happened, while healers explain why. Folk healers work within the cultural values and discourse of a population to treat all aspects of a disease simultaneously, unlike “in the Western world, where different types of misfortune are dealt with by different types of healer—physical problems by physicians, psychological problems by psychiatrists or therapists, social problems by social workers, and spiritual problems by ministers of religion …” (87). The disadvantages to this may be that folk healers miss serious ailments like brain tumors or misdiagnose epilepsy with spirit possession. They may even accidentally contribute to infection or the spread of disease with such practices as acupuncture, or the use of unsterile instruments (88).

One particularly informative source was “Health Practices of Hispanic Women” by Higgins (1999). This was the only article I came across that contained actual interviews with Hispanic women to determine how they perceived health. Disease was generally thought of as controllable by physical exams (e.g., mammograms), reduced intake of fat, monthly breast self-examinations, dental care, and use of sunscreen. Health promotion seemed to generally match Western ideas, including maintaining optimal weight, reducing stress, health education, exercise, adequate sleep, and high fluid intake. Cleanliness was also seen as a way to promote health among the women interviewed. What was even more interesting was that these women expressed concern for their family’s safety, while placing their own on the back burner. They did not take sick days and did not wear seat belts but insisted the rest of the family do so (1111). Overall, the article supported the idea of a holistic view of health by noting that religion (mainly Roman Catholic) was often brought up or alluded to, particularly in times of high stress.

Belief systems often spread during immigration. Globalization has contributed to Hispanic culture. Migration within a culture may also spread belief systems. An example of the latter is the migration of Guatemalan women from rural to urban areas within the country, discussed below.

Acculturation and Immigration

“Migration as a social process has the potential to reduce both the financial and cultural barriers to formal health-care service utilization” (Lindstrom, 2006: 707). Migration includes the travel of money, knowledge, tradition, ideas, as well as people. With technological advances, this travel has become faster, easier, and larger scale than ever before. In Guatemala, the migration of women from rural to urban places is examined in relationship to their utilization of maternal healthcare. It was found that after controlling for education, household expenditures, ethnicity, and measures of access to prenatal care in the community, women with urban migration experience are 60% more likely to use formal prenatal care than women without that experience. “The value and impact of urban experience for maternal healthcare utilization are almost equally important if it is acquired by women vicariously through the experience of others with whom they are close, as when it is acquired by direct experience. Of the enabling resources, only health insurance coverage and the percentage of households with a television or radio are statistically significant” (715). It is assumed that the greater the prevalence of radios/televisions in a given community the greater the wealth, and thus the greater exposure to ideas and information that encouraged the use of formal medication. Health is a social issue as much as it is a biological issue.

Health as Identity

In response to the deterioration of public healthcare in Mexico, community health groups have begun to form and thrive. Health groups consist mainly of lower and working-class women who attain training through the group in both traditional and alternative medicine (Schneider, 2009: 235-36). One health group described by Schneider began with a small amount of money from the Mexican government to teach courses on traditional Mexican herbalism, nutrition, and the prevention, diagnosis, and the treatment of common illnesses. It was then tasked to offer health services to the community on a sliding scale. Another health group offers massage therapy, acupuncture, and homeopathy. Initially, many of the women began to participate due to their “dissatisfaction with allopathic medicine, an interest in gaining skills to help resolve their or their children’s health problems, and a general sense of disempowerment vis-à-vis government biomedical services.” Other common themes underlying their choice were to find a purpose, escape the sense of isolation commonly experienced within the home, and to increase economic independence (242). Once again, individual agency plays a role in the ideas surrounding health and thus the social lives of these women by ultimately providing them with a new purpose and identity. This suggests that traditional medicine itself can be effective in part due to the addition of social elements.

The idea of personalized care was brought to light by another article that examines “culturally appropriate” care; defined as “… at minimum, efforts to address language barriers through medical interpreter services” (Shaw, 2005: 290). It is very much like the health groups formed in Mexico as it is run by community members with no previous professional experience, but whose expertise “is one of authenticity, experience, and a humanistic respect for the dignity of
everyone unlucky enough to be subject to what they experienced as an insensitive and uncaring healthcare system” (296). Shaw notes that when using the hospital, one has no choice about who treats them. Moreover, only critical or emergency care is offered instead of preventative and continued care (297). Medicaid patients are afforded less privacy than those who have other means of insurance, further stigmatizing them (298). It is clear in this article that informal groups are thriving because they serve as an antidote to the depersonalization of the professional health establishment.

Common Threads

The common themes that run through all these articles are that health for Hispanic women is viewed in a holistic framework that involves spirituality, the body, the mind and the social relationship between caretaker and patient. It is also frequently mentioned that language, income, and insurance barriers may color their views toward medical treatment. These themes appear with both American and Hispanic culture concerning health. Health psychology has become a new and thriving area within the professional field and includes a more holistic perspective on health, and communication between doctor and patient is valued.

I set out to discover the differences in popular American culture and Hispanic culture concerning health only to find that despite slight differences, they are very much the same. Including a more feminist perspective is necessary due to the fact that mothers are usually the primary caregivers both in American families and Hispanic families. Though previous research has not ignored the feminist perspective, it has not been emphasized.

In the reviewed literature it was oft-mentioned that perhaps women suffer more because their role as a mother requires them to care for their family first, and themselves last. For those who have recently immigrated from Mexico, common distrust of the government follows them, so they would rather use home remedies if at all possible. Governmental distrust is especially determinant for illegal immigrants, of course. Despite a wealth of studies, I was not able to discern how often folk medicine was actually used, only that the ideas were still present. More research on these areas should be conducted in order to shed light on this question.

I also feel that some of these sources are biased. Even the titles of some journals suggest a normative bias (for example, the Journal of Health Care for the Poor and Underserved). Such titles insinuate that all of the Hispanic population is poor, thus implying inferiority of this population. In general, I would argue that a holistic view of health is not that different from current Western ideas of health and that a feminist perspective would provide an additional nuance to this debate.

Conclusion

The aim of this research was to explore current belief systems, gain an idea of how prominent these beliefs are among Hispanic women, and in turn begin to encourage more cultural sensitivity within the formal healthcare system in the United States. Such a sensitivity could possibly lead to the introduction of treatments following traditional schools of thought that seem to be successful in other cultures. It may additionally point to the idea that medication is not always the best solution, especially where beliefs are concerned.

In cases where traditional practice is unsuccessful, it may be possible to make formal medical care more accessible to these populations. Most research that has been conducted on this topic is done with statistics driven by surveys and databases from medical establishments both within and outside of the United States. Though this is not an exhaustive review, it is meant to display and interpret what has been studied thus far, in order to then determine what questions have not been asked.

A more complete insight can be attained by asking Hispanic women personally and not limiting data collection from those who are insured, visit the emergency room, or deal with social workers regularly. They will highlight what is important to them.
References


The Impact of Interracial Activism in the Nashville Sit-ins

Matthew Foriest

Dr. Mary Evins
Department of History

Challenging segregation in the Jim Crow South was not an easy endeavor and the activism to break it needed people of all races to confront it together. Students who took part in the sit-ins that began in February 1960 to integrate Nashville’s lunch counters faced harsh social, legal, and economic repercussions for their actions. Despite the threat to their personal well-being, hundreds of students from local universities joined in demonstrations. They worked together to recruit new members, train in the academic and activist theories of nonviolence, and then turn out en masse to challenge the status quo of Jim Crow. Black and white students stood side by side and this interracial activism contributed to the success of the movement.

The sit-ins of the 1960s were a backlash against southern segregation. The black community chafed at the restrictions whereby blacks were encouraged to spend their money in shops owned by whites, while certain amenities such as lunch counters were off-limits. While school desegregation was slowly proceeding after the Brown decision, there was little progress in other aspects of southern society. Expanding the challenge to segregation, college students focused on lunch counters. Students believed coercing the local lunch counters in their communities would be the first step toward dismantling the system of racial discrimination.

Sit-ins were nonviolent demonstrations that sought to temporarily shut down the businesses of segregated lunch counters. Students scouted locations to see what the store policies were before planning their demonstrations. The students politely asked to be served, and when they were not, they would inquire about the store’s policy. After gathering this information from multiple lunch counters, students chose which of the vendors would be their first target. Students would queue up outside of the chosen establishment and wait while other students asked to be served. When they were denied on the basis of race, the other students would continue to sit in empty seats and ask to be served; after being denied, the students remained in their seats. If they were physically removed by police or segregationists, the removed persons would not fight back. Instead, they would curl into defensive postures to protect themselves while other students would take their now-vacant seats. Their hope was that responding to violence with nonviolence might end the cycle of hate permeating the South.

Leading up to the sit-ins, the civil rights movement had laid the groundwork for the events that unfolded in Nashville and other cities in the early 1960s. The Supreme Court’s Brown v. Board of Education decision in 1954, ruling segregation in public schools unconstitutional, and the so-called Brown II decision in 1955 that urged desegregating public schools with all deliberate speed, prompted a surge in activism. Whereas up until that point most decisive actions emerged from legal challenges, the Brown decision gave black groups the confidence they needed to challenge segregation in everyday life. The Montgomery bus boycott of 1956 further persuaded groups that direct action was the key to successful integration.

Following the Brown decision, Tennesseans first experienced integrationist activism in Oak Ridge High School and Clinton High School. Oak Ridge High, the first Tennessee school to voluntarily desegregate, proved a unique case. Due to the Oak Ridge nuclear facilities and other government operations, Oak Ridge High received significant federal funding through the Atomic Energy Commission. Thus, following the Brown decision, the AEC issued instructions for Oak Ridge to integrate. While some hometown officials opposed integration, the public largely backed the decision, and in the subsequent municipal elections integrationists won political positions.

The case of Clinton High School proved to be more of a struggle. Fredrick John Casper’s White Citizens’ Council and Donald Davidson’s Tennessee Federation for Constitutional Government (TFCG) organized indi-
individuals who were opposed to integration in Clinton, and several violent incidents surrounding the integration of Clinton High School were linked to these two groups. Reverend Paul Turner of the Clinton First Baptist Church organized groups tasked with protecting children on their way to Clinton High School, while NAACP lawyers pushed for greater federal protection. While sheriffs and marshals were sent to help enforce law and order, the experience of local community organizers in defending black students and white sympathizers proved that, like in Montgomery, the most effective opposition to segregation had to be a movement of the people rather than of lawyers.

Although Clinton High School experienced significantly more violence than Oak Ridge High, both of these schools were successfully integrated. Their desegregation brought national attention to the Tennessee movement, including a segment on Edward R. Morrow’s See It Now CBS broadcast. Had Tennessee reacted as harshly as states such as Mississippi and Alabama to desegregation, then it is unlikely that the local movements would have achieved as much as they did in so short a period of time. If, however, there had been no strong opposition, then the individuals participating in these integrationist movements would not have gained much leadership experience. The reason Tennessee attracted so many individuals seeking to fight racial injustice in the late 1950s and on into the 1960s was because activists understood that integration in Tennessee represented an attainable goal of reforming racism without the brutal retaliation that prevailed in many other southern states.

Although Tennessee enforced many of the same Jim Crow laws that were common throughout the South, Tennessee had had a moderate political culture throughout much of its history, which was sustained after the Brown v. Board decision and would prove true through the sit-ins. The perceived progressive attitude of the state drew many students and activists who would later join the sit-in movement. The city of Nashville held a relatively liberal reputation for a major southern city for a variety of reasons. The Tennessee poll tax, one of the most common methods that kept African Americans from voting in the South, was defeated in the late 1940s. Because of this, Tennessee blacks voted in much larger numbers than in other states, which greatly impacted Tennessee cities’ political landscapes. Nashvillians elected two black city council members in the late 1950s in large part due to black voting rights. Although Nashville was far from a bastion of racial equality, its more moderate political climate made it more attractive to northern students and activists who wished to settle in the South.

While the traditional southern political attitude supported segregation in all facets of life, Dixiecrat ideology was not dominant in Tennessee as it was in other southern states. Tennessee’s moderate political culture was reflected by its two U.S. senators, Albert Gore, Sr. and Estes Kefauver. Whereas the senators of many southern states signed the Southern Manifesto, a document expressing disapproval of the Brown decision as an action of judicial activism, neither of Tennessee’s senators signed the document. Likewise, several Tennessee congressmen did not sign it, and then-governor Clement opposed it. The progressive stance of Tennessee’s political leaders reflects why the potential to demonstrate against segregation in Tennessee would have been assessed by civil rights advocates as promising a greater tolerance for racial progress, as opposed to Alabama, for example, where every member of its House and Senate delegation signed the Manifesto. Tennessee’s more open-minded leadership helped the state stand out as a viable location for northern students to settle as they moved south to take part in the civil rights movement.

The strong editorials of the Nashville Tennessean further cemented Nashville’s reputation. While most southern newspapers tended to rally against the Brown decision or remain passive in their coverage of the topic, the Nashville Tennessean supported desegregation in its editorials and, in the words of author David Halberstam, covered the implementation of integration with a “fearlessness that made it nothing less than a beacon to young journalists in the South.” Dogged, supportive press coverage was particularly important as the city implemented its stair-step integration of public schools, whereby one grade level at a time was integrated. The Tennessean highlighted the ways in which the residents of Nashville responded to the Brown decision, such as on May 25, 1954, when civil rights groups and parent-teacher associations met to organize biracial school associations to smooth over the implementation of the Brown. Had the Nashville Tennessean not devoted so much coverage to desegregation, it is possible that the city’s enlightened handling of integration would not have been a known factor as students and activists such as Jim Lawson chose cities out of which to base their desegregation activities. Because of the due diligence of the Tennessean, civil rights activists anticipated that their actions would receive fair treatment in the media in Nashville.

The Nashville sit-ins took place in large part due to Jim Lawson’s move to Nashville, Tennessee, during the academic year of 1957 to 1958. Lawson served as a missionary in India before his arrival in Nashville and his acceptance at the Vanderbilt Divinity School, and he imported nonviolence in theory and practice to the city. He had already been in contact with Nashville clergy before moving, and he wasted little time engaging in the local churches and the Nashville
Christian Leadership Council. Through this council Lawson worked with Reverend Kelly Miller Smith, who offered his church for activism functions, as well as with Glenn Smiley of the Fellowship of Reconciliation (FOR), who helped Lawson establish nonviolence and social action workshops. Smiley was a white liberal with thirty years’ experience working with FOR, while Lawson was a black minister who had spent years studying nonviolence in India. From the beginning, both knew that the philosophy and practice of nonviolence would be of paramount importance in promoting interracial activism.

The sit-ins generated controversy by challenging the Jim Crow status quo, but the tactics taught to sit-in participants were founded in mainstream, middle-class Christian values. Students who participated in the nonviolence workshops and seminars received instructions grounded in the teachings of Christ, Gandhi, and Martin Luther King, who all extolled the virtue of passive resistance to oppression. The most widely circulated principles were “Don’t strike back or curse aloud if abused,” “Show yourself friendly and courteous at all times,” and “Report all serious incidents to your leader.” Ministers and theological students taught the scriptural basis and intellectual theory behind nonviolence. They also taught secular and historical writings on nonviolence from ancient Chinese philosopher Lao-Tzu, Gandhi, Thoreau and Hegel. Studying the theory behind nonviolence was instrumental to the development and practice of the role-playing scenarios of later workshops that prepared students for the physical and verbal abuse they would encounter during their demonstrations. It was not enough for students to grit their teeth and bear through the abuse they might suffer; students had to believe in all aspects of the doctrine so that they would not be tempted to strike back in the heat of the moment.

The workshops also prepared individuals for specific duties during the demonstrations. The most common roles were organizers, spotters, and demonstrators. Organizers tended to help out behind the scenes in functions that did not require exposure to violence. They would help with recruitment drives, fundraising, and sit-in planning. There were a number of reasons behind-the-scenes people were required. The students who acted in this role often were those who could not maintain a nonviolent outlook. They agreed with the goals of the sit-ins and wanted to help, but many were aware that they would be too tempted to fight back. Spotters were students trained to remain outside of locations where sit-ins were occurring to watch for signs of trouble. They were given a list of phone numbers and instructed whom to contact in specific situations. White students were assigned spotter duties under the assumption that troublemakers and others who assaulted the sit-in demonstrators would overlook white onlookers. Before the sit-ins, students scouted local lunch counters in racially mixed groups and ask to be served, and if they were refused they would then ask if their white companions could be served. White students were also typically denied service because they were accompanying blacks.

After the students returned and discussed what had taken place on these scouting trips, the groups planned their demonstrations based on this information.

Participation of White Student Activists in the Sit-ins

Nashville attracted many students who wanted to participate in the movement not only because of its progressive reputation but also because it was a university town. For instance, Vanderbilt Divinity School had a nation-wide reputation of excellence that brought many white divinity students into contact with church-based civil rights activism. James Lawson’s attendance at Vanderbilt, beginning in the fall of 1958, helped sway several white divinity students to assist his efforts in promoting nonviolence. Students were also swayed through their involvement with the Nashville branch of the National Council of Churches where white ministers such as Reverend Will Campbell strongly supported Lawson’s work.

The civil rights movement was also influenced by secular colleges and universities. Many of the white students who attended Nashville’s Fisk and Meharry felt similarly to Paul LaPrad, who said he wanted to attend a “good college that was predominantly black, with black students, in order to give me a life experience … of working and living with people who were different than what I had grown up with.” These students were predominantly liberal and believed the secular issues of equality as promised in the Constitution were just as important as the religious motivations for the movement.

Paul LaPrad engaged in political activism because of the influence of his church and the values that were instilled in him throughout his childhood. He was raised in the Church of the Brethren, which was a historic peace church in his home state of Illinois. LaPrad believed strongly in Christian brotherhood and felt that he should experience living with people of other backgrounds to have a greater understanding of humanity. Two years into his studies in Manchester, Indiana, LaPrad traveled to Europe to look at life from a different perspective. During his travels, he visited several European countries still recovering from World War II. He traveled to several concentration camps throughout Central Europe and saw firsthand the poverty of refugees from Hungary and elsewhere in Europe. Ob-
serving the issues distressing Europe broadened LaPrad’s horizons and cemented his resolve to help those in need.

When LaPrad returned from his trip to Europe, he devoted himself to the cause of fighting injustice and poverty. He volunteered in the slums of Chicago with an inner city Mennonite parish while awaiting replies from his applications to several southern historically black colleges and universities including Fisk, Tougaloo, and Tuskegee. One of the Mennonite pastors told LaPrad about Jim Lawson and his interest in nonviolence in Nashville. This new information reaffirmed LaPrad’s interest in working in the South and committed him to Fisk University. After he was accepted to Fisk in 1959, he contacted Lawson and expressed an interest in the emerging nonviolence movement in Nashville.

Paul LaPrad’s involvement with Jim Lawson’s nonviolence training put him in a position to assist the growth of a student-led movement in Nashville. While Lawson prepared training sessions with his associates such as Glenn Smiley, expansion of his mission needed students recruiting like-minded individuals on Nashville’s college campuses. LaPrad focused on recruiting on the Fisk campus. Despite the relatively conservative nature of the Fisk establishment at the time, LaPrad succeeded in generating interest among black and white students who shared Lawson’s vision of challenging segregation through nonviolence. These students would often congregate in Fisk’s International Center, which is where he persuaded Diane Nash to attend Lawson’s nonviolence seminars.

Nash was skeptical of some of Lawson’s tactics when she began attending his seminars, but she continued going to them with LaPrad because it was “the only game in town.” LaPrad and Nash studied the nonviolent philosophies that Lawson taught and used those ideas to recruit other Fisk students to attend the training sessions. While LaPrad continued recruiting students to the civil rights movement, no one else he brought into the movement developed the national name recognition of Diane Nash.

LaPrad’s involvement went far beyond recruiting. Many white students who participated early on did so in spotter or organizational roles, but LaPrad involved himself in the actual sit-ins. His involvement in the early sit-ins generated some press regarding the “few white students from Fisk” who demonstrated with black students against segregation. LaPrad received significant news attention following the “Big Saturday” sit-in on February 28, 1960. Big Saturday was the fourth of the sit-ins, and by then students turned out in larger numbers to take part in the challenge to segregation, but so too did local segregationists. LaPrad received significant news attention following the “Big Saturday” sit-in on February 28, 1960. Big Saturday was the fourth of the sit-ins, and by then students turned out in larger numbers to take part in the challenge to segregation, but so too did local segregationists. LaPrad was singled out for his involvement with black students, taunted as a “nigger lover,” and beaten by a group of white delin-
sit-ins attracted even more media attention than did LaPrad’s, likely due to the oddity of a young white woman taking such direct action alongside African Americans in a time before feminism and female activism became commonplace.

In subsequent sit-ins, Anderson received the same negative reaction and treatment by the white male mob that LaPrad attracted, but during the second sit-in on February 20, 1960, a police officer intervened and closed down the lunch counter when she was harassed. Despite threats and the harsh physical brutality, Anderson remained involved with the sit-ins throughout the spring of 1960.

Anderson was arrested alongside her fellow sit-in demonstrators, both black and white, on Big Saturday. The students could pay a $50 or go to the workhouse for 33 days. Most students followed Diane Nash’s lead by refusing to pay the fine. The logic in refusing to pay was put eloquently by Nash: “We feel that if we pay these fines we would be contributing to and supporting injustice and immoral practices that have been performed in the arrest and conviction of the defendants.”

The photo of white students being arrested made the local papers, calling attention to the student’s goals of desegregating local lunch counters. Although the students were later released without having to complete their full sentence, the stand they took demonstrated their commitment to the cause.

Malcolm Carnahan’s involvement in the Nashville sit-ins began in the spring of 1960 after hearing about the movement as a graduate student at Vanderbilt Divinity School. Carnahan entered Vanderbilt in the fall of 1959, a year after Lawson did, seeking to become involved in the sit-ins due to his strong belief in social justice and Christian fellowship. He attended meetings that were no longer presided over by Jim Lawson but rather by Diane Nash by the spring of 1960. By the time Carnahan became involved, a younger generation of students had taken on increased leadership roles and direct involvement in training sessions and organizing, which freed Lawson to devote his time to wider initiatives. Carnahan acted as a spotter in March and April of 1960 due to injuries sustained in a car crash in the previous winter that had left him in a cast. He observed several sit-ins and assisted the demonstrators when he could, although he never had to deal with any situations as drastic as that of the Big Saturday assaults and arrests.

Carnahan acted also as a recruiter on his campus with his roommate, Rollin Russell. It was Russell, in fact, who had entered the V.U. Divinity program in the fall of 1958 as a classmate of Lawson and had introduced Carnahan to the possibility in Nashville of active civic engagement against segregation. Despite Vanderbilt’s rather conservative reputation, Russell and Carnahan were able to recruit several of their classmates into participating. In Russell’s words, “We were probably viewed with a mix-
point, the group altered its strategies, going beyond lunch counters to target restaurants and movie theaters. Carnahan’s role as treasurer involved holding money to pay students’ bail after they were arrested for protesting.\footnote{Ibid.}

Carnahan’s first involvement in a direct action role during a protest resulted in his first arrest. It also showed how the nonviolent principles of the movement could reform the South. When the Nashville committee shifted its focus to a broader range of venues to desegregate, students targeted several well-to-do restaurants. Carnahan demonstrated at one such restaurant, along with John Lewis from HBCU American Baptist Theological Seminary (ABT) in Nashville, by standing outside the establishment and asking to be let in to be served. The restaurant had hired men who acted as bouncers to keep the demonstrators out. The bouncers were not stationed outside to prevent violence directed at the demonstrators, of course. One of the young toughs, who often accosted demonstrators, assaulted Carnahan. Police intervened several minutes later and arrested many of those on the scene, including Carnahan and the man who assaulted him.\footnote{Ibid.}

On their way to the police station in the same paddy wagon, the assailant asked Carnahan why he had not fought back. After all, since Carnahan was larger, it was likely he would have won if he had fought back. Carnahan talked about nonviolence and the rights of each individual regardless of race. Several days after the arrest, the assailant found Carnahan’s apartment and the two men had another discussion about nonviolent principles. The former attacker became an informant, supplying the Nashville sit-in organization with information on the tactics he learned about that were going to be used against the students.\footnote{Ibid.}

The Impact of Interracial Activism on the Nashville Sit-ins

White students are typically not highlighted in the course of examining the civil rights movement, and for good reason. The ultimate victory for racial civil rights in the United States is rightfully attributed to African-American grassroots movement that changed the course of American history. Although white Americans contributed to this change, they perceived their roles modestly. Such was the case of the white students who joined the student movement in Nashville in the early 1960s. None of them has published a memoir, but rather viewed their participation more as a personal growth experience. Participation of white activists in African-American civil rights is layered with the complexities of race and power in America, and has often proven to be a distraction. Problems and issues of integrated activism may outweigh the benefits and ultimately “split the entire civil rights movement at its core.”\footnote{Lewis, \textit{Walking with the Wind}, 117.} But in the early days, the Nashville Student Movement welcomed young, dedicated people of any race who would together act on their idealism.

The white students who participated in the Nashville movement were a small minority but the roles they played were important. One of those roles was in the recruitment process. Paul LaPrad developed a network at Fisk University that brought Diane Nash into the sit-ins. When LaPrad and Nash expanded from their earliest cohort of activists to recruit even greater numbers of students from not only Fisk but from Meharry, Tennessee A & I, and ABT as well, they were drawing from the elite of Nashville’s collegiate student bodies. Students at these historically black universities could have declined invitations to attend Jim Lawson’s nonviolence sessions and likewise could have refused to participate in sit-ins that would hurt their reputation and social standing and embarrassed their families.\footnote{Ibid., 115.} It was not just the concept of fighting segregation that drew these students in, but also the determination of individuals like LaPrad and Nash who stood side by side in their efforts.

White students were also a significant component of the early planning process. Throughout the fall of 1959 many of Lawson’s nonviolence seminars were lucky to draw 10 or 20 people. Individuals would come and go as their schedules allowed but a core group of individuals emerged such as Diane Nash, John Lewis, and others who would become the preeminent black student leaders who attended most if not all of the training sessions. White students Paul LaPrad and Carolanne Anderson were also among those students in the core group. They never sought to become leaders in the movement, but they were there to help plan its course and could be relied on when the time came to implement the group’s plans.

The solidarity of such a diverse group of students helped to strengthen the societal impact that the sit-ins had on the city of Nashville. When demonstrations against segregation took place in cities like Chattanooga, those were often organized strictly on racial lines. White student activism was a rarity in the majority of cities where sit-ins took place. The lack of interracial solidarity limited the effectiveness to which more narrow action may have been received by large portions of the public. The black student activists struggled to gain even the support of some in their own black communities that they represented and often they could not relate to the white communities into which they sought to integrate.
The Nashville student movement proved, through its members’ own racial integration and their cross-race activities in Nashville, that the goal of a more egalitarian society founded on social justice could indeed be realized. The black and white students who worked together to bring about social change modeled their vision and values in their activism.

The integrated nature of the Nashville movement elicited friendly press coverage of the protests. While the Nashville Tennessean’s progressive viewpoint contributed to supportive press coverage, editors knew that headlines featuring beaten white students alongside injured black students drew more attention among its white readership than did showing black students alone. This pattern of interracial cooperation continued to be true throughout the early years of the civil rights movement when the Freedom Rides and Mississippi Freedom Summer attracted nationwide headlines. Interracial activism gained more attention and sold more newspapers, which helped the movement slowly earn a consensus throughout the Nashville establishment that integrating the city was the right side of the cause.

Challenging Jim Crow in Nashville was easier than it was in many other southern cities, but it was by no means a simple task. Students like Paul LaPrad were beaten, arrested, and had their lives threatened for standing up to the status quo. Women like Carolanne Anderson were harassed and accosted by delinquents who were offended not only by a white student standing with blacks against oppression but at the very notion of a woman taking a stand against the paternalistic attitudes of the South. Malcolm Carnahan and other Vanderbilt Divinity School students were challenged by their fellow students on how they could prepare to lead communities and congregations by untarnished example when they had broken the law and had been arrested. Yet despite the negative ramifications, these students did not take the easy path. Black and white students demonstrated together, and this spirit of interracial activism helped make the Nashville movement a success.

Bibliography

“16 Sitters Get Workhouse,” Nashville Tennessean, March 2, 1960, 1A-2A.


“Negroes ‘Strike’ Counter Again,” Nashville Tennessean, February 19, 1960, 4A.


“Student Attacked!” Nashville Tennessean, February 28, 1960, 1A.

Tally, James. “100 Students Arrested Here,” Nashville Tennessean, February 28, 1960, 1A, 6A.

OVEREIGNTY, BEING SO intricately tied to peace and conflict around the world, is an important concept to define. Despite the widespread use of sovereignty as a norm in international politics, many scholars over the last 25 years have come to accept that sovereignty is a social construct (Ruggie 1983, Wendt 1992, Barkin and Cronin 1994, Finne more 1996, Wendt and Duval 2008). The various constructed definitions of sovereignty are implicated in arguments regarding self-determination (Finnemore 1996). This concept has value because self-determination is a challenge to an existing state’s conception of sovereignty. The way the international community expresses its views of a state or people is a reflection of how that community defines sovereignty. These views determine the reputation of the state, the consequences of which can lead to greater conflict. Because China is involved in many disputes of sovereignty (e.g., Taiwan, Tibet, Hong Kong), it provides an ideal case for answering the question of how sovereignty is constructed. We may also ask how China influences the international construction of sovereignty.

A discussion of sovereignty would be incomplete without mention of Stephen Krasner. In “Sovereignty: Organized Hypocrisy,” Krasner (1999) identifies four different kinds of sovereignty: (1) international legal sovereignty, (2) Westphalian sovereignty, (3) domestic sovereignty and (4) interdependence sovereignty. International legal sovereignty deals with mutual recognition. Westphalian sovereignty is “an institutional arrangement for organizing political life that is based on two principles: territoriality and the exclusion of external actors from domestic authority structures.” Domestic sovereignty is the formal organization and effectiveness of political authority within a given state. Interdependence sovereignty is the ability to regulate cross border exchanges (Krasner 1999, 3-4). The author notes that “rulers have sometimes had to compromise their Westphalian sovereignty, the exclusion of external authority, to secure recognition, international legal sovereignty” (237). This is particularly relevant when looking at China, especially as it relates to Hong Kong:

- Sovereignty rules can be violated in inventive ways. The Chinese, for instance, made Hong Kong a special administrative region after the transfer from British rule, allowed a foreign judge to sit on the Court of Final Appeal, and secured acceptance by other states not only for Hong Kong’s participation in a number of international organizations but also for separate visa agreements and recognition of a distinct Hong Kong passport (28).

To provide an overview of sovereignty, David A. Lake lays out how it is viewed by three schools of international relations thought: classical, liberal, and constructivist. According to Lake, classicists view sovereignty as absolute (2003, 305-8). “A state is either sovereign – or it is not a state” (ibid.). Liberals view interdependence as an expression of sovereignty, while constructivists view “sovereignty [as] not exogenous to the system, but produced through practice” (ibid.). This research mainly focuses on the constructivist view of sovereignty.

Alexander Wendt, a constructivist, argues that sovereignty is not god-given or derived from nature, but rather is constructed by the international system itself. According to
Wendt (1992), sovereignty is a negotiated agreement. That is, a state’s “self” is realized through interactions with others, which influences its conceptualization of others, which determines the conceptualization of the system itself. Therefore, sovereignty is an intersubjective norm that requires an “other.” It also requires that the other recognize you as an “other.” Even at this point, sovereignty is not guaranteed, as it takes “others” to also legitimize the sovereignty of a state.

Kratochwil defends Wendt’s argument when he says “sovereignty ‘cannot be equated simply to power wielded by a self-interested (rational) actor, since part and parcel of playing the international game consists in recognizing the sovereignty of others.’ Sovereigns have to recognize other sovereigns as being equal to themselves, and so claims to sovereignty are therefore inherently limited” (Kratochwil 1995, 25). Wendt and Duval (2008, 607) say “few ideas today are as contested as sovereignty, in theory or in practice.” They go on to discuss how contentious people are regarding its definition, and how “struggles for self-determination and territorial revisionism have generated among the bitterest conflicts in modern times” (ibid.).

Finnemore (1996), following Wendt, describes the way in which changes in norms lead to a change in the system as a whole. The biggest change was the idea of self-determination during decolonization, which led to the concept of sovereignty and changed how one state intervened in the affairs of another state for humanitarian reasons. No longer could a state intervene unilaterally on the basis of humanitarianism because there had to be a multilateral consensus that a humanitarian violation was taking place. This forced a bit of transparency on states’ actions. Some states are unwilling to use humanitarian justifications for intervening in another’s affairs because it shines the humanitarian light onto their own practices, which may also be inhumane (Finnemore 1996).

According to Holzgrefe, interventions in Somalia, Rwanda, and Haiti under the order of the Security Council (empowered by Chapter VII of the United Nations Charter) implies that military intervention to end human rights abuses is considered a legitimate use of force by the international community, but it is difficult to show that unauthorized humanitarian intervention is normatively lawful. Many UN resolutions reject such a right to intervene without authorization. Even states that have intervened without authorization for the main purpose of ending human rights abuses typically state another reason for using force. For example, when India intervened in East Pakistan it used the justification of self-defense. (Holzgrefe 2003, 41, 47-48).

The change from unilateral to multilateral invasions of states on the basis of humanitarian concerns reflects a change of norms, and a change of the system. The arguments cited here by Finnemore and Wendt explain why social constructivism, which follows a more constitutive and inductive logic rather than a causal or deductive logic, is a valid theoretical basis for which to study international politics.

The United Nations (UN) is an organization that actively constructs structures, processes, and concepts. Considering the organization is an international mediator of conflict, and comprises most recognized states in the world, UN resolutions symbolize the wishes and goals of the international community, and may constitute international customary law when it defines these constructs — including the focus of this paper: sovereignty.

Kratochwil and Ruggie (1986) point out that UN General Assembly (GA) resolutions and treaties are relevant, but that they are undermined by voting blocs and UN Security Council vetoes. While this may be true, our focus here is not on the efficacy of UN GA resolutions, but on understanding what is the international consensus and construction of sovereignty. For this purpose, resolutions can be instructive.

**METHODOLOGY**

Realist and liberal theoretical approaches, as well as quantitative methodology have dominated international relations scholarship for some time (Wendt 1999, 2; George and Bennett 2005, 3). While these theories and methodologies are important to the study of IR, so are qualitative and constructivist methods. This is not to imply that any one theory is or should always be quantitatively or qualitatively derived. As noted by Wendt and Finnemore, sovereignty is a construction of the international system and the actors in that system. Taking on this constructivist perspective accepts constitutive mechanisms for how to explain issues in IR. The constitutive and inductive nature of the question led to the adoption of grounded theory as the methodology for this research. Grounded theories, because they are drawn from data, are likely to offer insight, enhance understanding, and provide a meaningful guide to action (Strauss and Corbin 1998, 12).

**Case Selection for the International Construction of Sovereignty**

The United Nations Bibliographic Information System was used as a source for data by conducting New Keyword Searches under Bibliographic Records. A general keyword search of the term “self-determination” was conducted of (B01) resolutions/decisions. A search for “self-determination” produced 1331 results. These results were listed in descending order based on publication date, and contained resolutions from the UN General Assem-
bly, Security Council, subcommittees, and trusteeships. Subcommittee, trusteeship and Security Council resolutions were then discarded. The Security Council is made up of five permanent members (with veto power) and 10 non-permanent members (without veto power) of the United Nations. Since the goal of this research is to determine how self-determination influences the construction of sovereignty as an international norm, and the Security Council less than adequately represents international norms, all Security Council resolutions were discarded.

Some resolutions were listed multiple times to account for different sections of multi-sectioned resolutions. These resolutions were counted once, with duplicates discarded. The total remaining resolutions totaled 689.

With respect to time, 63 resolutions were chosen via systematic sampling of the chronologically descending resolutions that remained. This number was chosen because the United Nations had held 63 sessions when this research began in May 2009. It also granted the likelihood that at least one resolution including the keyword “self-determination,” from each session that dealt with this issue, would be represented. They were included because resolutions and actions by the United Nations and its member states must adhere to the Charter of the United Nations and because they cover the issue of self-determination. During the coding process, UN General Assembly Resolution 1514—not part of the sample—was mentioned so frequently, that it was also included. This brings the total number of resolutions studied to 64, plus the Charter of the UN.

Case Selection for the Chinese Construction of Sovereignty

China’s votes on each of the same UN resolutions used in the case selection for the international construction of sovereignty were recorded. Additional data support for grounded theory development was sought via LexisNexis archives. LexisNexis archives articles from major publications covering international news events as well as a variety of Chinese-language articles and Chinese government statements reprinted in English. This search contained articles from 1980 to the present, and returned 983 articles. Due to time constraints, a systematic sample of 50 articles was taken.

Coding and Analysis

The grounded-theory methodology used in this research is based on the open and axial coding techniques of Anselm Strauss and Juliet Corbin, along with their methods of theoretical sampling and theoretical comparison (1998). The structure of UN documents allowed for a natural open-coding process where a line-by-line analysis was done to derive concepts and categories. As patterns in concepts and categories developed, sensitizing, theoretical, structural, and guiding questions were used to develop and reshape conceptual frameworks. As theoretical questions developed, theoretical comparisons were used as way of guiding the theoretical sampling process until theoretical saturation was reached.

RESULTS

International Construction of Sovereignty

Colonization is the most frequent cause of resolutions regarding self-determination. Self-determination is an inalienable right that promotes stability and well-being, along with peaceful and friendly relations, and must be obtained before people have adequate human rights, social progress, and freedom. Colonialism and/or denying people self-determination both breed conflict and impede world peace (UN General Assembly 1945, 1960). The United Nations uses this justification for its attempts to eradicate colonization. Colonizers are expected to remove all military personnel, end all oppressive and repressive actions, and sacrifice any controlling stakes, resources, or interests in territories they have colonized. Territorial size, geographical location, size of population, and limited natural resources are not justifications for delay of the implementation of self-determination (UN General Assembly 1991, 45/32, 46/68).

Colonization is not the only instance in which self-determination plays a role in the construction of sovereignty. The apartheid regime of South Africa is a reoccurring example in the research. In South Africa, a white minority held control of the South African government, establishing oppressive laws that denied the black majority their right to self-determination. According to the UN, non-representative regimes are a denial of self-determination and “the authority to govern shall be based on the will of the people, as expressed in periodic and genuine elections” (UN General Assembly 1991, 45/150). This line reiterates a common theme, which is that state sovereignty is derived from the inherent sovereignty of people, yet is only legitimate when that state adequately represents its people.

This is an important case because it brings to light an important, yet sometimes contradictory factor in how self-determination influences the construction of sovereignty. South African apartheid was a post-colonial issue of an independent state. The territorial integrity of independent states is absolute according to the United Nations, and to
representative government. Maintaining national sovereignty within a state—exclusive from alien interference. The UN does not endorse one type of political system, but does indicate that it must be democratic in nature and representative of the various peoples and nations within a state—exclusive from alien interference.

National sovereignty is an important sub-theme of representative government. Maintaining national sovereignty during the election process is very important to ensuring legitimate self-determination. Only the peoples and nations historically tied to the land encompassed by a state should be able to vote in elections to ensure they are genuine, free of alien manipulation, and adhere to territorial integrity (UN General Assembly 2004). “Peoples have the right freely to determine, without external interference, their political status and to pursue their economic, social and cultural development, and that every State has the duty to respect that right within the provisions of the Charter, including respect for territorial integrity” (UN General Assembly 2000).

When people are not allowed free elections for the purposes of self-determining their own future as a whole, their historical territory, and its natural resources, then the sovereignty of the controlling regime is illegitimate (UN General Assembly 2000). The eradication of oppression/repression, the development of democratic processes, self-determination, and sovereignty are intertwined. This does not mean the United Nations always supports invasion by a third-party, as the UN’s main objective is securing international peace and stability. Because sovereign people reside within states, the UN stresses the territorial integrity of states, regardless if the sovereignty of controlling regimes is illegitimate (UN General Assembly 1986, 1994, 2000).

Table 1 shows the variance in the structure and process of self-determination as they relate to different denials of self-determination (colonization, apartheid, and illegal territorial acquisition). The structures and processes of self-determination, as it relates to these reoccurring denial types, were discovered through the method of theoretical comparison. In studying resolutions that dealt with these various denials of self-determination, consistent processes and varying structures were found throughout the data. The process of achieving self-determination is the same regardless of the cause of the initial denial of the right: ending oppression, holding democratic elections, and transferring power from the controlling power to the formerly non-self-governing peoples.

For example, the concept of a democratic process for self-determination was present in nearly every resolution studied. This led to the theory that democratic elections and self-determination were constitutive. However, the concept of independence did not hold up in theoretical comparison. Independence is not a structure of self-determination as it relates to apartheid, and is actually discouraged (UN General Assembly 1971, 1979, 1985).

The resulting structure of self-determination varies depending on the initial cause of denial. After decolonization, the structure is one of independence or freedom, and the creation of a new state with the existing territorial sovereignty. Alternately, a decolonized territory may
China consistently supported the international construction of sovereignty. As you can see in Table 2, China only voted NO on one resolution and Abstained on one resolution. While China was represented in the United Nations by the Republic of China until 1971, when the People’s Republic of China (PRC) took over representation, all votes were included in this study so that any change over time could be documented. Interestingly enough, China’s voting record in the UN General Assembly shows that it overwhelmingly and consistently supported the international construction of sovereignty during representation by both the Republic of China and the People’s Republic of China (UN General Assembly 1945-2009). This study does not look at why the opposing factions of Chinese leadership voted similarly regarding sovereignty, but further research should be conducted.

The theory that China supports the international construction of sovereignty is substantiated by its stated position on issues of sovereignty as collected through articles from LexisNexis. The most significant data in the research pertain to China’s development of its Five Principles of Peaceful Coexistence, announced in 1954. They are: (1) Mutual respect for sovereignty and territorial integrity, (2) Mutual non-aggression, (3) Mutual non-interference in internal affairs, (4) Equality and mutual benefit, (5) Peaceful coexistence (People’s Daily 1982).

In addition to the Five Principles, the following four concepts of Chinese sovereignty also recurred throughout the research: (1) sovereignty and administrative powers join an existing independent state, thereby, expanding the existing state’s territorial sovereignty. The structure of self-determination post-apartheid is different, in that an independent state already exists. The structure is one of unifying the people of the state through proportionally represented government. Considering that an independent state already exists, territorial sovereignty is upheld—avoiding any kind of secessionism. In the case of illegal territorial acquisition, one nation uses force to illegally acquire the territory of another nation, and then use that territory to form a new state where power is centralized. In this case, the structure of self-determination is one of independence, and the creation of a new state with a territorial sovereignty different than what currently exists for that territory.

In studying how self-determination influences sovereignty, two over-arching theories developed from the research: sovereignty is derived from people, and representative government and self-determination are constitutive. Through the processes of theoretical comparison and coding of each resolution, it became apparent that people do not have all of their rights unless they have self-determination, and that the sovereignty of a state is not legitimized until those people are able to pass on their sovereignty through self-determining, free elections and a representative government.

Chinese Construction of Sovereignty

While somewhat unexpected, the research shows that

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Colonization</th>
<th>Apartheid</th>
<th>Illegal Territorial Acquisition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>End oppression</td>
<td></td>
<td>End oppression</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic elections</td>
<td></td>
<td>Democratic elections</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer of power</td>
<td></td>
<td>Transfer of power</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independence</td>
<td></td>
<td>Proportionally represented government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New state with existing territorial sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unity within existing state</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR joining an existing independent state—expanding that state’s territorial sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
<td>Upholding existing territorial sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Structure                                                                |                                                  |                                              |                                                                         |
| Independence                                                            |                                                  | Independence                                  |                                                                         |
| New state with existing territorial sovereignty                          |                                                  | New state with different territorial sovereignty|                                                                         |
| OR joining an existing independent state—expanding that state’s territorial sovereignty |                                                  |                                              |                                                                         |

China consistently supported the international construction of sovereignty. As you can see in Table 2, China only voted NO on one resolution and Abstained on one resolution. While China was represented in the United Nations by the Republic of China until 1971, when the People’s Republic of China (PRC) took over representation, all votes were included in this study so that any change over time could be documented. Interestingly enough, China’s voting record in the UN General Assembly shows that it overwhelmingly and consistently supported the international construction of sovereignty during representation by both the Republic of China and the People’s Republic of China (UN General Assembly 1945-2009). This study does not look at why the opposing factions of Chinese leadership voted similarly regarding sovereignty, but further research should be conducted.

The theory that China supports the international construction of sovereignty is substantiated by its stated position on issues of sovereignty as collected through articles from LexisNexis. The most significant data in the research pertain to China’s development of its Five Principles of Peaceful Coexistence, announced in 1954. They are: (1) Mutual respect for sovereignty and territorial integrity, (2) Mutual non-aggression, (3) Mutual non-interference in internal affairs, (4) Equality and mutual benefit, (5) Peaceful coexistence (People’s Daily 1982).

In addition to the Five Principles, the following four concepts of Chinese sovereignty also recurred throughout the research: (1) sovereignty and administrative powers join an existing independent state, thereby, expanding the existing state’s territorial sovereignty. The structure of self-determination post-apartheid is different, in that an independent state already exists. The structure is one of unifying the people of the state through proportionally represented government. Considering that an independent state already exists, territorial sovereignty is upheld—avoiding any kind of secessionism. In the case of illegal territorial acquisition, one nation uses force to illegally acquire the territory of another nation, and then use that territory to form a new state where power is centralized. In this case, the structure of self-determination is one of independence, and the creation of a new state with a territorial sovereignty different than what currently exists for that territory.

In studying how self-determination influences sovereignty, two over-arching theories developed from the research: sovereignty is derived from people, and representative government and self-determination are constitutive. Through the processes of theoretical comparison and coding of each resolution, it became apparent that people do not have all of their rights unless they have self-determination, and that the sovereignty of a state is not legitimized until those people are able to pass on their sovereignty through self-determining, free elections and a representative government.

Chinese Construction of Sovereignty

While somewhat unexpected, the research shows that

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Colonization</th>
<th>Apartheid</th>
<th>Illegal Territorial Acquisition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>End oppression</td>
<td></td>
<td>End oppression</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic elections</td>
<td></td>
<td>Democratic elections</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer of power</td>
<td></td>
<td>Transfer of power</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independence</td>
<td></td>
<td>Proportionally represented government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New state with existing territorial sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unity within existing state</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR joining an existing independent state—expanding that state’s territorial sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
<td>Upholding existing territorial sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Structure                                                                |                                                  |                                              |                                                                         |
| Independence                                                            |                                                  | Independence                                  |                                                                         |
| New state with different territorial sovereignty                          |                                                  | New state with different territorial sovereignty|                                                                         |
| OR joining an existing independent state—expanding that state’s territorial sovereignty |                                                  |                                              |                                                                         |

China consistently supported the international construction of sovereignty. As you can see in Table 2, China only voted NO on one resolution and Abstained on one resolution. While China was represented in the United Nations by the Republic of China until 1971, when the People’s Republic of China (PRC) took over representation, all votes were included in this study so that any change over time could be documented. Interestingly enough, China’s voting record in the UN General Assembly shows that it overwhelmingly and consistently supported the international construction of sovereignty during representation by both the Republic of China and the People’s Republic of China (UN General Assembly 1945-2009). This study does not look at why the opposing factions of Chinese leadership voted similarly regarding sovereignty, but further research should be conducted.

The theory that China supports the international construction of sovereignty is substantiated by its stated position on issues of sovereignty as collected through articles from LexisNexis. The most significant data in the research pertain to China’s development of its Five Principles of Peaceful Coexistence, announced in 1954. They are: (1) Mutual respect for sovereignty and territorial integrity, (2) Mutual non-aggression, (3) Mutual non-interference in internal affairs, (4) Equality and mutual benefit, (5) Peaceful coexistence (People’s Daily 1982).

In addition to the Five Principles, the following four concepts of Chinese sovereignty also recurred throughout the research: (1) sovereignty and administrative powers join an existing independent state, thereby, expanding the existing state’s territorial sovereignty. The structure of self-determination post-apartheid is different, in that an independent state already exists. The structure is one of unifying the people of the state through proportionally represented government. Considering that an independent state already exists, territorial sovereignty is upheld—avoiding any kind of secessionism. In the case of illegal territorial acquisition, one nation uses force to illegally acquire the territory of another nation, and then use that territory to form a new state where power is centralized. In this case, the structure of self-determination is one of independence, and the creation of a new state with a territorial sovereignty different than what currently exists for that territory.

In studying how self-determination influences sovereignty, two over-arching theories developed from the research: sovereignty is derived from people, and representative government and self-determination are constitutive. Through the processes of theoretical comparison and coding of each resolution, it became apparent that people do not have all of their rights unless they have self-determination, and that the sovereignty of a state is not legitimized until those people are able to pass on their sovereignty through self-determining, free elections and a representative government.

Chinese Construction of Sovereignty

While somewhat unexpected, the research shows that

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Process</th>
<th>Colonization</th>
<th>Apartheid</th>
<th>Illegal Territorial Acquisition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>End oppression</td>
<td></td>
<td>End oppression</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic elections</td>
<td></td>
<td>Democratic elections</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer of power</td>
<td></td>
<td>Transfer of power</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independence</td>
<td></td>
<td>Proportionally represented government</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New state with existing territorial sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unity within existing state</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OR joining an existing independent state—expanding that state’s territorial sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
<td>Upholding existing territorial sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Structure                                                                |                                                  |                                              |                                                                         |
| Independence                                                            |                                                  | Independence                                  |                                                                         |
| New state with different territorial sovereignty                          |                                                  | New state with different territorial sovereignty|                                                                         |
| OR joining an existing independent state—expanding that state’s territorial sovereignty |                                                  |                                              |                                                                         |
cannot be separated, (2) the sovereignty of a state is indivisible, (3) humanitarian concerns cannot override a country’s sovereignty, and (4) sovereignty includes “political, economic, security, judicial, and diplomatic areas” (Bone 2004; China Radio International 1999; Kwang 1999; Xinhua 1983, 1998). These Chinese concepts of sovereignty were also present in the data for the international construction of sovereignty. They align with the intersubjective concepts that independence movements are not supported, and that maintaining territorial integrity is of utmost importance (UN General Assembly 1971, 1979, 1985, 2000).

While it may be possible to accuse China of violating the sovereignty of other nations and not allowing full representation, China stands firmly behind its argument that these territories in question are historically part of China and therefore under China’s sovereign authority, and that the PRC represents all Chinese people including those in Tibet and Taiwan (Carlson 2005, 40-41; China Post 2003; Xinhua 1998).

However, regardless of the accuracy of these statements, China’s position on sovereignty is, for the most part, consistent and in line with the international construction of sovereignty with the exception of full democratic representation and the idea of mutual non-interference of internal affairs. This research finds that the international construction of sovereignty does allow for international diplomatic pressure and sanctions to be used as a way of changing the domestic politics of a foreign state.

As stated earlier, UN attempts to maintain territorial integrity by supporting national movements, and using sanctions and other forms of international pressure in order to change domestic policies. In this way, it honors the territorial integrity of states, while attempting to change a state’s perceived sovereignty into actual sovereignty, derived from its people. While this research finds that China is in favor of using diplomatic pressure, it is more apprehensive when it comes to the use of sanctions because it can be seen as a violation of economic sovereignty (BBC 1994, 2007).

Looking back at Allen Carlson’s research we see that states must respect “the status quo of established territorial boundaries.” The UN Charter prohibits any unprovoked military force against any part of another state’s territory. In addition, states derive legitimate sovereignty from people by representing the will of the nation. This supports the principle of self-determination.

This research finds that China’s consistent response is that it supports the will of its people, and that it is only preventing small factions from disrespecting its historical territorial boundaries. Regardless of the accuracy of China’s public statements, through the process of theoretical comparison, this research finds that China has greatly influenced the international community’s stance on sovereignty by remaining consistent on principles shared by a majority of the world as is evident via the passage of UN Resolutions in line with China’s message.

CONCLUSIONS

Self-determination influences the construction of sovereignty through the process of legitimization. Sovereignty is derived from people, and therefore, in order for states and regimes to gain or maintain sovereignty, they must be representative of their people. Representative government and self-determination play constitutive roles in the development and/or legitimization of state sovereignty.

The sovereignty of people holds greater importance than the sovereignty of states. These findings may have broad implications on the international stage, especially in international law. One implication is the legality or international acceptability of one state’s invasion of another sovereign state on behalf of a people denied the right to self-determination or suffering human rights violations. While the United Nations does not actively support secessionism or third-party invasion, based on the concept of territorial integrity, and while it has historically sought change through sanctions and other coercive means, its historical influence on the construction of sovereignty implies that securing the right of self-determination of people, and therefore the sovereignty of those people, should be a high international priority.

The next step to take with this research is to include a content analysis of Security Council resolutions. This research chose to only look at General Assembly resolutions, as the goal was to show how self-determination influences the construction of sovereignty as an international norm, but more specific implications may be discovered by looking at the Security Council, which may show how sovereignty is actually practiced and whether or not it deviates from the accepted norm. A case study of Chinese perceptions of sovereignty would also be useful. As China is a state involved in many disputes of territorial sovereignty, its perception of sovereignty, and the international system’s perception and reaction make it an ideal case for continuing research that attempts to determine how sovereignty is constructed.
References


Appendix

United Nations Documents Included in Study

- A/RES/549(VI) - Special session of the Economic and Social Council to precede the eighth session of the Commission on Human Rights (1952)
- A/RES/1044(XI) - The future of Togoland under British administration (1957).
- A/RES/1514(XV) - Declaration on the Granting of Independence to Colonial Countries and Peoples (1960).
- A/RES/1952(XVIII) - Question of Northern Rhodesia (1964).
- A/RES/2229(XXI) - Question of Ifni and Spanish Sahara (1967).
- A/RES/2521(XXIV) - Special programme of activities in connexion with the 10th anniversary of the Declaration on the Granting of Independence to Colonial Countries and Peoples (1970).
- A/RES/1044(XI) - The future of Togoland under British administration (1957).
- A/RES/1514(XV) - Declaration on the Granting of Independence to Colonial Countries and Peoples (1960).
- A/RES/1952(XVIII) - Question of Northern Rhodesia (1964).
- A/RES/2229(XXI) - Question of Ifni and Spanish Sahara (1967).
- A/RES/2521(XXIV) - Special programme of activities in connexion with the 10th anniversary of the Declaration on the Granting of Independence to Colonial Countries and Peoples (1970).
- A/RES/31/57 - Question of the United States Virgin Islands.
Middle Tennessee State University - Summer 2011

Islands (1977).


• A/RES/33/183 - Situation in South Africa (1979).

• A/RES/35/29 - Implementation of the Declaration on the Granting of Independence to Colonial Countries and Peoples by the specialized agencies and the international institutions associated with UN (1980).

• A/RES/36/226 - The situation in the Middle East (1981).


• A/RES/54/174 - Strengthening United Nations action in the field of human rights through the promotion of
international cooperation and the importance of non-selectivity, impartiality and objectivity: resolution / adopted by the General Assembly (2000).


- A/RES/55/104 - Strengthening United Nations action in the field of human rights through the promotion on international cooperation and the importance of non-selectivity, impartiality and objectivity: resolution / adopted by the General Assembly (2002).


- A/RES/58/108 - Questions of American Samoa, Anguilla, Bermuda, the British Virgin Islands, the Cayman Islands, Guam, Montserrat, Pitcairn, Saint Helena, the Turks and Caicos Islands and the United States Virgin Islands: resolutions / adopted by the General Assembly (2003).

- A/RES/58/189 - Respect for the principles of national sovereignty and diversity of democratic systems in electoral processes as an important element for the promotion and protection of human rights: resolution / adopted by the General Assembly (2004).


From Red to Green: The Progression of Indian Agriculture from Independence to the Green Revolution

Lindsay Gates

Dr. Mark Doyle
History Department

India under Nehru embarked on a path of neutrality and Third World solidarity. Despite it non-alignment, the new nation patterned its agricultural policies on those of the Soviet Union and China. This stance was to change after a border war with China and severe food shortages soon thereafter. At this point, the United States provided food aid coupled with the proviso that India implement Green Revolution methods provided by U.S. multinationals. As a result, India gained a measure of self-sufficiency but at a political cost.

In the mid-1960s, India implemented the use of new seeds designed by the Rockefeller Foundation, through community development programs funded by the Ford Foundation, at the behest of the United States government. This agricultural method increased yields beyond expectation and became known as the Green Revolution. The Green Revolution was a radical departure from previous agricultural plans. It was western science-based, and did not improve the lives of farmers as a whole, but was directed at farmers that were already prosperous with quality land and substantial water resources. It went against everything India had previously attempted in agriculture, namely eastern forms of agriculture and reforms that would benefit poor farmers rather than the wealthy.

The Green Revolution is still hotly debated today. Many critics claim, with substantial evidence, that the revolution created further disparity among farmers, damaged the soil, caused dangerous drops in the water table, and poisoned the land and water with toxic pesticides causing health problems among inhabitants. Proponents maintain that not only are the claims of environmental damage greatly exaggerated, the Green Revolution was the only way to save millions of people from starvation. But even this claim is coming under more scrutiny as more environmentalists, historians, and scientists investigate the claims made in the 1950s of the coming threat of starvation due to population booms. Many are beginning to question the validity and motivation of studies such as Ford’s India’s Food Crisis and Steps to Meet It and other Malthusian-esque warnings of future famine.

While there are many studies that continue to debate the efficacy and effects of the Green Revolution, there have been few studies devoted solely to how and why the Green Revolution began. This topic is often included in books on Indian history, economics, and foreign policy; it is not often the sole topic of research. Many studies have been undertaken to denounce or support the Green Revolution, but most of this scholarship is devoted to the consequences of the effort and give scant attention to its origin. Most of these studies, looking at the Green Revolution from a purely scientific or economic frame, assume that it was the inevitable result of India’s growing population and inadequate food supplies. However, this does not take into account the pressure from outside India, nor does it address specific factors that led India to adopt such a revolutionary agricultural method. From a historical view, it is impossible to address the efficacy of the Green Revolution without first evaluating its inception.

One scholar, a scientist not a historian, has examined the early beginnings of the Green Revolution. In her book Violence of the Green Revolution: Third World Agriculture, Ecology and Politics, Vandana Shiva, physicist and seed activist in India, posits that the Green Revolution was established under U.S. pressure and that its results are ultimately negative. Not only does she present a compelling argument, she is one of the few scholars to present the Green Revolution as a technopolitical movement rather than a purely agricultural, or even economic decision. The Green Revolution in India had to come from the top down, because of the need for government subsidies and the radical changes that it made in India’s former agricultural plans. This system could not work without government backing in India.

Shiva is not the only scholar who sees the politics embedded in the revolution. Akhil Gupta in his book Postco-

lontial Developments: Agriculture in the Making of Modern India, writes that the Green Revolution was largely, due to India’s loss of sovereignty in food production. He claims, “It was the crisis in the agricultural sector that truly challenged the sovereignty of the nation-state,” and that the Green Revolution was an attempt to regain national self-sufficiency in food grains.” This illustrates that the Green Revolution was an economic and political move with ramifications for India outside the country and beyond merely feeding the people.

Both scholars make well-supported claims as to the political causes of the Green Revolution and undeniable U.S. involvement; however, neither examines the full history of the United States’ involvement in the country, the factors that allowed them to influence India’s agricultural decisions, or the international challenges that faced India at the time. The Green Revolution was certainly not inevitable. It was a radical departure from previous agricultural plans that had sought to limit the role of the U.S., and was the direct result of sustained U.S. influence and pressure.

The roles of the United States and the Soviet Union were both integral not only to Indian foreign policy decisions but also to domestic policies. India gained independence in 1947 when the Soviet Union and the United States were looking for Cold War allies, and both disapproved of India’s neutrality. Despite India’s non-alignment, Prime Minister Jawaharlal Nehru made it clear that imperialism, not communism, was the greatest threat in the eyes of India. He stated, “The world problem is ultimately one of imperialism – the financial imperialism of the present day,” and that the Soviet Union represented “a new order fundamentally opposed to that of imperialism.” True to his rhetoric, Prime Minister Nehru shaped the nation much more along Soviet lines, and this was reflected in early agriculture.

For a number of reasons, Prime Minister Nehru chose to model Indian agriculture after the East rather than the West. Due to “lingering suspicion of western ‘economic domination’” and fear of political “strings” attached to U.S. involvement, Nehru looked to the Soviet Union and China for methods of rapid development and self-sufficiency. The Chinese development model was, according to Edward Luce, “a third pillar of Nehru’s foreign policy … Third World solidarity.” From a purely realistic perspective, Nehru recognized that western countries had had much more time to develop their economies and that India needed a different model in order to develop with more rapidity. In agriculture, this meant the implementation of land reform and collective farming.

Land reform was implemented in the Soviet Union and China, and it was a fairly violent undertaking in both nations. In the Soviet Union, there was an “abolition of private property rights in land.” In China, “about 43 per cent of … cultivable land had been confiscated and redistributed.” India made land reform attempts with limited effectiveness. As a democracy, it could not implement change without the support of the people, as the USSR and China had done. India did disallow the ownership of land in absentia with much land redistributed to the peasants that had worked it for years. However, the government’s “reluctance to hurt the interests of the feudal and mercantile intermediaries” restricted the implementation of other reforms.

Following land reform, the Soviet Union and China organized farmers into collectives. In his book comparing China and India, Jay Taylor describes this process in China as a combination of “a mass political campaign,” execution of former landlords, and the organization of farmers into collectives. Though the process was also violent in the USSR, the kolkhozy, or collective farms, in the Soviet Union allowed for the ownership of some property while seeds and farm implements were owned collectively. The style of collective farming promoted by Nehru also allowed farmers to retain ownership of the land. Because small farmers could not “take advantage of modern techniques or the facilities offered by new methods,” Nehru offered collective farming as the best way that, “without giving up their property rights, the farmers could increase their productivity.”

11 Hedlund, Crisis in Soviet Agriculture, 9.
12 Nehru, Jawaharlal Nehru, 276.
Once again, as a democracy, India could not implement reform by force and many farmers feared that they would lose their autonomy and their land. There were also many critics of the Chinese/Soviet influence on India’s agricultural policies.\textsuperscript{14} Though the early attempts to “communize” Indian agriculture were largely failures, they do show the strong pull of the government toward eastern nations and away from U.S. methods in the early planning of the 1950s.

The United States became involved in India on a minor scale in 1951 and 1952. P.J. Eldridge marks 1951 as the first year of “substantial outflow of American aid to India.”\textsuperscript{15} The situation in 1951 is similar to the developments of the mid-60s that led to the Green Revolution; however, the outcome in this instance was quite different. In 1951, India experienced a drought that led to a need for increased food grain imports. As early as 1947, members of the U.S. government believed that India would need economic assistance for development and that the United States was best equipped to provide this assistance. Even as U.S.-Indian relations chilled, American officials were confident they held the diplomatic trump card.\textsuperscript{16} Despite this widespread view, there was still a majority in Congress and among the general population that was reluctant to “grant a non-aligned India much assistance.”\textsuperscript{17} In 1951, conditions were attached to Indian aid giving the United States responsibility for doling out the food grains it provided. According to Eldridge, “Nehru balked at the prospect of a ‘foreign agency controlling India’s grain distribution system or its development plans” as this “might be construed as giving the United States a voice in all of India’s development plans.”\textsuperscript{18} Nehru turned to the communist countries, receiving grain from both China and Soviet Russia. Though the amounts received were nowhere close to meeting all the nation’s grain needs, communist aid compounded with the fear that instability in India would lead to “subversive activities of the Communist Party” and endanger the conservative Nehruvian government,\textsuperscript{19} prompting American supply of the needed aid. This was the first instance of adroit Indian use of Cold War politics and the Soviet bogey. In the future, as stated by Gilles Boquerat, “The Indians did not hesitate when required to use the threat of Soviet aid in order to obtain more assistance from the West.”\textsuperscript{20} Despite needing western aid, India made a concerted effort, in the words of Nehru, to “proceed with caution and … [not fall] entirely under the influence of the United States.”\textsuperscript{21} But U.S. encroachment was already beginning.

In 1952, following the first disbursement of American aid, the Ford Foundation, a non-governmental organization with close ties to the U.S. government, began active operation in Indian agriculture in cooperation with the government. Though the Ford Foundation had been involved in agriculture since 1951, 1952 marked the beginning of new community development projects. According to Shiva, “In 1952, 15 community development projects each covering about 100 villages, were started with Ford Foundation financial assistance.”\textsuperscript{22} The agricultural purpose of the Community Development and Rural Extension Program, according to Stanley Wolpert, was land reclamation, improvement of the water supply and better seed, livestock, and fertilizers.\textsuperscript{23} Though the Community Development Program was active in a relatively small land area, its presence and activities in the country were of profound importance to the implementation of the Green Revolution in 1966.

It was not until 1959 that another big push was made to bring scientific agriculture to India. The year 1959 saw massive attention given to agriculture from the western (or northern) world to the eastern (or southern). In 1959, the Rockefeller Foundation, after success with new crop varieties in Mexico, made plans with the Ford Foundation to establish an International Rice Research Center in the Philippines. As stated in the 1959 Rockefeller Foundation annual report, “The two foundations decided to join forces to establish an effort of outstanding quality in contrast to supporting a larger number of limited projects.”\textsuperscript{24} This was also the year the Ford Foundation published a report of a study conducted from January 23-April 7, 1959.\textsuperscript{25} In this

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{14} Austin Granville, Working a Democratic Constitution: The Indian Experience (New Delhi: Oxford University Press, 1999), 116.

\item \textsuperscript{15} P.J. Eldridge, The Politics of Foreign Aid in India (New York: Shocken Books, 1969), 29.


\item \textsuperscript{17} Talbot, India and America, 141.

\item \textsuperscript{18} Eldridge, The Politics of Foreign Aid, 271-372.

\item \textsuperscript{19} Ibid., 358, 363, 369.

\item \textsuperscript{20} Gilles Boquerat, No Strings Attached?: India’s Policies and Foreign Aid, 1947-1966 (Delhi: Lordson Publishers, 2003), 249.


\item \textsuperscript{22} Shiva, Violence of the Green Revolution, 34.

\item \textsuperscript{23} Stanley Wolpert, A New History of India (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), 363.


\item \textsuperscript{25} Book Review for India’s Food Crisis and How to
report, the foundation “warned of the ‘stark threat’ of an ‘ominous crisis’ in the agricultural sector.” The report predicted that the population of India would grow to such an extent that the country would be unable to feed its population by 1966. One of the key steps to averting the tragedy, according to the report, was to implement technological change in the form of improved seeds, chemical fertilizers, and pesticides in areas with the best conditions for scientific agriculture. To that end, Ford stepped up its funding and technical support of scientific agriculture in India through an Intensive Agricultural Development Program. That same year, “fertilizer companies and associations from around the world gathered with FAO officials to formulate a plan to promote wider use of fertilizers and thereby ‘introduce the scientific method and modern technology into traditional agriculture.’” By 1960, India had Green Revolution technology in place on a small scale and access to “improved” varieties of rice as close as the Philippines. These were important prerequisites for the Green Revolution of 1966.

As agriculture was being reshaped throughout the international community, Indian-U.S. relations were also undergoing some changes. Robert Walters states in American and Soviet Aid that “it was not until 1957… that the United States came to accept neutralism as a legitimate policy.” By this time the Soviet Union had already built a solid rapport with India. And according to Robert McMahon in his study of the Cold War and South Asia, “Kennedy hoped to reverse that trend by demonstrating a more tolerant attitude toward neutralism and offering more generous financial commitments to the economic development of neutralist nations.” Kennedy’s attitude and India’s inclination to accept it brought new warmth to the relations. However, it took the border crisis of 1962 to push India into closer ties with, and more reliance on, the United States.

In 1962, China launched an attack on the Indian border that the Indian military was unequipped to counter. In his book on U.S.-Indian relations, Norman Palmer writes that “the Kennedy administration responded promptly to Nehru’s appeal for military supplies and equipment.” Britain also “came very promptly to the assistance of the Indians.” The Soviet Union, though censoring China for the action, did not materially aid India in her fight. The border war had long-term effects on Indian foreign policy. That is, India realized security from China could only come through good relations with the United States, forcing “the Indians to adopt a much more calculated and conciliatory foreign policy.” This was the end of foreign policy based on Prime Minister Nehru’s somewhat idealistic policy of Third World solidarity and it was the beginning of a new phase in U.S.-Indian relations.

On the heels of the border war came a new crisis: as in 1951, a drought hit India. The nation needed staggering amounts of food to ward off famine. Unlike 1951, the United States was not as fearful of Soviet involvement, as it was obvious that the Soviet Union could not cover Indian needs. Nor was the United States distracted, this time, by events in Europe but was highly interested in India and Indian agriculture. President Johnson, was tired of taking responsibility for India and receiving nothing in return. This time, food would come with a price, both economic and political. Robert Paarlburg states, “Never before or since was India the target of such a determined U.S. food power exercise.”

The mid-1960s saw what Mitchell Wallerstein describes as “a large, well-orchestrated U.S. effort to shift the pace and focus of Indian agricultural development.” President Johnson, following advice from Secretary of Agriculture Orville Freeman, instituted what he termed a “short-tether policy” toward India. Instead of giving an annual or several-year contract for food, it was now to be shipped on a month-to-month basis at the discretion of the president. India became known

Meet It, ed. Robert L. Tate III, Soil Science: An Interdisciplinary Approach to Soil Research, 175 (August 2010), 112.

26 Guha, India After Gandhi, 328.
34 Ibid., 4.
as a “ship to mouth” state, a term they found humiliating. “Most of the demands were focused on the reform of India’s own internal agricultural policies,” according to Paarlburg. “But Johnson also pursued a more self-serving food power objective, by linking monthly food aid shipments to changes in Indian foreign policy, specifically to less vocal Indian criticism of U.S. war policy in Vietnam.” In this, Johnson went outside the use of food power as suggested by Freeman.

India had no room to maneuver. The Soviet Union could not shoulder the burden of supplying Indian food needs, and the United States no longer responded to the threat of communist aid by reducing stipulations as they had in the past. Johnson even went so far as to say, “It might be a good thing if Russia did a little of it [aiding India] for awhile.” The Indian government had to placate the United States to receive monthly food aid or thousands would starve. This meant a massive overhaul of agriculture that was defined by America as self-help. “As the Johnson administration defined the term, self-help meant India … should adopt measures proved elsewhere – in the United States, for example – to have raised productivity.” With little to no recourse, India capitulated to American demands. According to Francine Frankel, “By November 1965, [India’s] Food Ministry was ready with a full blown version of the ‘New Strategy’: in essence it called for the implementation of a High Yield Varieties Program in districts that had already been selected for intensive development.” The areas with Community Development Programs were the previously selected sites that began rapid implementation of the new technology. By 1966, Indira Gandhi, the new prime minister, had given her full support to the Green Revolution due to U.S. pressure and the need to regain control of the food supply. By 1967, the traditional “Samba paddy was replaced by two successive shorter crops of a high yield variety.” But the separation from western influence, so important to Nehru and so integral to early India, was now irrevocably lost.

The early years of Indian agriculture saw a valiant effort by the Nehru administration to build a self-reliant na-

38 Paarlburg, Food Trade and Foreign Policy, 145.
39 Recording of conversation between Johnson and Ambassador Goldberg (18 September, 1965); quoted in Boquerat, No Strings Attached, 376.
42 Gilbert, Studies in Indian Agriculture, 229.
Bibliography


Tate, Robert L., Ed. Review of India’s Food Crisis and How to Meet It, by Ford Foundation. In Soil Science: An Interdisciplinary Approach to Soil Research, 175 (August 2010): 112.


An Analysis of the Factors that Contribute to Intellectual Property Theft

Johnathan Gilliam

Dr. Charles H. Apigian
Computer Information Systems

Piracy of intellectual property is costly and one of the most highly destructive illegal activities facing creative industries in the United States and abroad. For every $100 of legitimate software sold globally, another $69 is pirated. To help analyze this problem, a survey was developed asking a range of questions that relate actual and future piracy factors that may influence an individual to illegally download digital files. The purpose is to find significant factors that contribute to computer and media piracy in students at Middle Tennessee State University. Business college students took the surveys and the results were analyzed using regression. The findings suggest that knowledge of methods of piracy and daily computer use were significant factors in actual piracy activity, with knowledge of the methods of piracy also a significant factor in future piracy activity. In addition, actual piracy activity correlated significantly to future piracy activity.

1.0 Introduction

Piracy of intellectual property is one of the most destructive illegal activities facing creative industries in the United States and abroad. For every $100 of legitimate software sold globally, another $69 is pirated. The U.S. 2007 State Piracy Study notes that one in five pieces of software is illegal. The result is $11.4 billion in lost revenue. This translates to 54,000 tech jobs lost. The decline in tax revenue from the legal sales is estimated at $1.7 billion, which could have built 100 middle schools or 10,831 affordable housing units. Alternatively, it could have hired 24,395 police officers.

Despite the huge loss, the United States, along with other developed countries such as Japan, New Zealand, and Luxembourg, have the lowest rates of piracy. According to the U.S. 2008 Global Piracy Study, developed countries’ piracy levels are around 20 percent while developing countries (e.g., Armenia, Bangladesh, Georgia, and Zimbabwe) have rates over 90 percent. In China, 80 percent of software is pirated. The problem of piracy continues to grow worldwide. From 2007 to 2008, global piracy increased from 11 percent to 41 percent, reaching a staggering $53 billion total cost, up from $11 billion in 1999.

As software piracy continues to be a threat to the growth of national and global economies, understanding why people pirate software and learning how to discourage the use of pirated software are urgent and important issues. This research analyzes a group of factors, including perceived risks, subjective norms, personal attitudes, knowledge about piracy, methods of piracy, daily computer use compared, and computer experience to determine significant influences on piracy.

2.0 What is Piracy?

Piracy is a multifaceted illegal activity defined as the illegitimate copying of another person’s intellectual property, such as a program or an audio or video recording, with the intent to sell without permission, or simply for personal use. The following section offers details into the different types of piracy.

2.1 Software Piracy

Software piracy typically refers to the unauthorized duplication, distribution, and downloading of computer programs and applications. Software piracy is one of the least known of the four types of piracy, which include software, music, videos, and games, but it is the most serious. In mainland China, the software piracy rate has reached an astonishing 98 percent!

The kinds of piracy include copying from the original disc, downloading, sharing, and selling or installing multi-
Peer-to-peer networks are decentralized structures and alarming rate in recent years. The illegal downloading of music is the most well-known practice of pirating files. Most people are familiar with Napster and the Apple iTunes digital music store. Rhapsody, MusicMatch, Pandora, and eMusic charge less than $1 per song or $13 per album. Apple’s iPod sold over 88 million units in 2006 alone, and Apple iTunes sold over 70 million downloads in its first year. Despite Apple’s success, there is still a decline in the conventional distribution of music.

Unfortunately, music downloading through legal and illegal websites and P2P programs is growing at a rapid and alarming rate in recent years.\(^1\) Dejean (2009) suggests that a 30 percent reduction of files available on P2P networks would increase the music industry’s revenue by more than $260 million. The consequence of P2P networks has been a consistent decline in music sales by 7 percent annually, after the music industry peaked in 1999.

According to the literature, music piracy is on the rise because of several factors. Music files do not lose sound quality when they are downloaded illegally. The smaller size of files and the ease in downloading files because of faster Internet access has helped compound losses for music industries. Gopal and Sanders (2003) conducted a survey of more than 200 students and find that 60 percent of the respondents had experienced corrupted downloads frequently but, nevertheless, 90 percent rated the music quality as almost the same or very good compared to the original CD quality. In regards to reasons that music piracy increases, the authors claim that music is easier and more feasible for Internet users to access because of its significantly smaller size and less expensive nature. D’Astous et al. (2005) indicate that piracy occurs because “the more a person thinks that music piracy is a normal, habitual behavior, the more favorable his or her attitude toward this behavior, and the greater the likelihood of engaging again in this behavior.”

Most scholarly research on piracy focuses mainly on music and somewhat on software and videos. The research suggests that the main factors affecting music piracy are very similar to software piracy. The literature shows that personal attitude is one of the strongest indicators (D’Astous et al. 2005, Plowman et al. 2009, and Wang et al. 2009). If one’s attitude toward piracy is positive, the more likely one is to pirate. D’Astous et al. (2005) also find that anti-piracy arguments have no significant impact on the behavioral dynamics underlying online music piracy. In addition to attitude, Plowman and Sigi (2009) indicate that price is a significant factor in illegal downloading.

Other researchers focus on ways to decrease music piracy. Sinha and Mandel (2008) conclude, “Positive incentives, such as improved functionality, can significantly reduce the tendency to pirate among all the consumer segments studied.” Another motive for lower piracy comes from the Wang et al. study (2009). They reveal that idolatry of music singers moderates the relationship between the intention to download illegally music and the intention to buy music.

\(^1\) Peer-to-peer networks are decentralized structures...
2.3 Video Piracy

Video piracy has significantly grown in the past 10 years as broadband internet access has become more available. In previous years, videos took several hours to download because of their size and slow dial-up speeds. Video piracy can take the form of pirated and ripped copies of the original commercial copy and Internet sharing of the video file. Another form of video piracy is the illegal recording of a motion picture while it is in theaters with a camera to redistribute the film online or sell it before it becomes available on DVDs or other media formats.

The impact of piracy on the video industry is significant and substantial. The statistics from rentals during 1986 to 2005 document the impact of piracy on movie production for home use. Rentals accounted for 74 percent of total video spending in 1986, but for only 32 percent in 2005. The Motion Picture Association of America’s 2005 estimate indicated that losses from all video piracy amounted to approximately 7 percent of legitimate video revenues. In conjunction with rentals, video piracy has apparently decreased movie attendance. The Motion picture association argues that U.S. studios lost $6.1 billion in 2005 for this reason. This number is important because profits from attendance are necessary for the movie industry to survive because the costs of movie production and advertising continue to grow.

There is notable literature on the cost of piracy to the motion picture enterprise. Vany et al. (2007) quantify the cumulative loss of theatrical revenue due to pirate download sites. During the 14-week run of a theatrical showing of a movie, illegal download websites cost the motion picture industry between $29.2 million (using $242 per active site) and $49.5 million (using $621 per active site)! The literature suggests that the majority of video piracy comes from overseas in the form of hard copies in addition to websites. Illegal hard copies of movies are obtained by purchasing or acquiring a VHS, DVD or VCD (Video Compact Disc) through a commercial source or making illegal copies for oneself or receiving from a personal source an illegal copy of a legitimate VHS. In 2007, the Special 301 Report states, hard goods of DVD and VCD are around 85-95 percent of the market in China. At a currency exchange of roughly 7 RMB to 1 USD, a pirated movie would cost around $1.42 in China. It is very common to see pirated DVDs and Blu Ray movies for sale to the public.

2 I saw the distribution of pirated movies and software in a mall in Lanzhou, China, and on the streets of Beijing in the summer of 2009, but they focused more on actual hard copies. Many of the video files, like most software and digital files, come from the Internet and are slowly transferred from a hard copy to a website or P2P programs. After the pirated video is on a website or uploaded to a P2P program, it will download to the illegal owner’s computer without regard for copyright laws.

To prevent copyright violations, the movie industry has produced barriers that require some expertise to overcome. The most common is DRM (Digital Rights Management), which attempts to improve distributor control by introducing obstacles in the form of coding to protect DVDs from piracy. DRM has been cracked but it does reduce copying by less determined and less skilled violators. In response to DRM’s failure to protect video media, a new code called CSS was created. In turn, CSS (Content Scrambling System) was broken in 1999, and many DVD players do not use the new Macrovision protection system, so the CSS code is also flawed and ineffective. Even though the newest discs have safeguards, they still fall victim to hacking and pirating. The next generation of home video, HD-DVD and Blu-Ray Disc, have a new form of DRM called AACS (Advanced Access Content System) that prevents copying of the movie. This form of protection has also been broken.

Enforcement and regulations have helped combat video piracy. Walls and Harvey (2010) explain “the confluence of street-level enforcement (which raises piracy costs) and increased online availability (which lowers demand for hard goods piracy) may soon cause the physical hard goods markets for pirated films to disappear entirely as cyberspace becomes the primary domain for sharing digital content.” But the illegal video market may subsequently evolve once again.

2.4 Games Piracy

Another growing mode of piracy is the gaming industry. Bootleg copies of games have exploded in the past 15 years. Illicit games have followed a path very similar to the video black market. Every time the gaming industry creates a countermeasure, pirates counter it with a mod chip or other software.

Gaming piracy started with copies of games made on floppy discs, installed on a computer then returned to the distributor. Since the floppy disc days, the problem has spread from computer games as the original major source. Nowadays this includes most console gaming systems, like PlayStation, PlayStation 2, Dreamcast, Xbox, Xbox 360, and Nintendo Wii. As a consequence, the losses to the
gaming industry from piracy are substantial. In 2003, the US $6.9 billion gaming industry lost $3.2 billion in sales due to theft. That is a 46.4 percent piracy rate, or nearly five times the loss by theft to the music industry. Nintendo, alone, lost $649 million in sales. In 2004, when sales of video games in the United States set a record of $7.3 billion, the industry lost more than $1.8 billion to global piracy.

To understand game piracy, one must study the main forms of attack on game copyright protection. According to Myles and Nusser (2006), modification of the console for the purpose of overriding copyright protection with chips is one of the ways to attack the system. Modification of chips to bypass copy protection allows the illegally copied game to run on the console. The gaming industry fought back against mod chips with legal recourse. One person, David Rocci, pled guilty to importing 450 mod chips. He sold them for $45-$60 each, netting nearly $28,000, and he faced up to five years and a $500,000 fine.

Since gaming piracy, at least on consoles, is a recent phenomenon there seems to be very little academic research focused on gaming piracy. Myles and Nusser’s research is one of the very few academic articles (as of this writing) that pertain to game piracy. In the paper, they describe the use of branch-based software watermarking to discourage and detect piracy through a registration-based system. Their research focuses on the prevention of piracy not the causes or factors of it.

### 3.0 Countermeasures

Governments, companies, and organizations use many means to catch pirates and prosecute them. Over the past years, the United States has passed many laws that punish people for copyright infringement, but other countries are just learning how to cope with illegal users and distributors. The United States is the world’s leader in making laws and teaching other countries how to combat piracy with laws and legal recourse.

#### 3.1 Laws in the USA

One of the best ways to help lower piracy rates is to educate people about the laws and legal parameters associated with piracy and copyrights. Even though piracy is rising globally, the United States’ legal system and policies toward copyright infringement shows promise. Zhang et al. (2009) note, “It has been found that a person with higher ethical propensity is less likely to engage in software piracy, and that people with good knowledge of computer software copyright law are unlikely to be involved in software piracy.”

The United States took the initiative and created laws that focused on copyright infringement and targeted individuals who pirate or redistribute pirated software in the software, music, video and gaming industries. In 2002, there were 8,254 civil cases related to intellectual property theft. In 2005, government agencies began to aggressively targeting people who infringed on copyright laws by increasing fines and penalties. The RIAA (Recording Industry Association of America) has attempted to increase the perceived probability of being caught by suing more than 14,000 file swappers. It has also attempted to increase the perceived magnitude of negative consequences by imposing expensive penalties, such as a fine of $750 per copyright infringement (Baker 2004).

By 2007 and 2008, the prosecutions of people caught pirating became more publicized. In 2007, BSA (Business Software Alliance) sent takedown notices to nearly 14,000 auction sites worth an estimated $13.3 million. Two brothers in Florida who sold pirated software were sentenced to 62 months in prison for profiting by more than $6 million in pirated software through their website. Another case involving a woman who sold 1,600 illegal counterfeit software copies on eBay consisted of a judgment of $250,000.

The United States is one of the global watchdogs for copyright infringement. Piracy is certainly on the rise, but the United States and other nations are attempting to counter piracy with the legal system. Table 1 lists some of the important laws that focus on pirating and copyright infringement, and are the basis and foundation of other countries’ laws.

#### 3.2 Global Laws

Global piracy has increased over the years, but changes in the Asian legal system and government, because of the United States demands for a crackdown on piracy, are attempting to lower the incredibly high rates. This crackdown in Asia is due to high piracy rates. If the rates can be lowered through legal means, it could be a way to use it in other parts of the world with high rates of piracy such as the Balkans and other developing countries.

Malaysia’s government and court system have embraced the U.S. approach to combat piracy. In 2000, Malaysia passed six laws to protect against intellectual property
cannot be connected to the internet and their USB ports have been disabled to keep them from downloading information.

4.0 Hypothesis Development

The foundation for most of the literature is the theory of reasoned action and the theory of planned behavior. The theory of reasoned action focuses on attitudes and subjective norms of people toward an activity; it evolved into the theory of planned behavior in 1991. The theory of planned behavior adds a new layer called perceived control beliefs on top of attitudes and subjective norms.

4.1 Theory of Reasoned Action

The foundation and fundamentals of this research came from the theory of reasoned action. Fishbein and Azjen (1975) developed the theory that focused on attitude and behavior. Its key application was to predict intended behavior based on a person’s behavioral intention, which in turn results from attitudes regarding the behavior and perceptions of social influences, or subjective norms. This theory influenced many other topics. Christensen and Eining (1991) used the theory was
a foundation for a model on software piracy. The authors theorize that attitude and social norms influence piracy in the relationship $AP + SN \rightarrow IP \rightarrow P$ where $AP$ is attitude toward software piracy, $SN$ is subjective norms, $IP$ is intention to pirate, and $P$ is pirating behavior. Christensen introduced one of the first models to take into account computers, material consequences, normative expectations, socio-legal attitudes, and effective or emotional factors as determinant in an individual’s intention to engage in software pirating behavior. Their results indicate that computer attitudes, material consequences, and normative expectations are significant factors in helping to explain piracy.

Using the same theory, Bandura (1991) concluded that, “a person with a strong perceived self-regulatory efficacy has a greater chance to resist social pressures and behave in ways that violate their standards. People with low self-efficacy increase their vulnerability to social pressures for transgressive conduct.” The precursor to a theory of planned behavior was the theory of reasoned action, and the theory of planned behavior spawned even more types of research.

4.2 Theory of Planned Behavior

The Ajzen’s theory of planned behavior, which is fundamental to this research, focuses on three key determinants. First, attitudes toward behavior refers to the degree to which a person has a favorable or unfavorable evaluation or appraisal of the behavior in question. Second, subjective norms’ refers to the perceived social pressure to perform or not to perform the behavior. Third, perceived behavioral control is the people’s perception of the ease or difficulty of performing the behavior of interest.

The results of the theory of planned behavior are much more precise than reasoned action because it adds perceived behavioral control. According to Ajzen (1991), the attitudes and subjective norms toward behavior and perceived control over behavior are found to predict behavioral intentions with a high degree of accuracy. Additionally, Azjen suggests that behavior is determined by intention, while intention is determined by one’s personal (attitude), social (subjective norms), and volitional (perceived behavioral control) beliefs. The theory of planned behavior uses many of the same definitions and terms as reasoned action.

5.0 Constructs

Expanding from the theory of planned behavior, this research brought on computer use and knowledge with piracy methods. Every survey had questions grouped into these individual constructs. If they did not fit after a factor analysis, they were removed. This paper uses the following constructs, perceived risk, subjective norms, personal attitude, knowledge about piracy, computer use, actual and future activity.

5.1 Perceived Risk

Perceived risk is defined as a feeling of uncertainty regarding possible negative consequences (Featherman and Pavlou 2003). Perceived risk increases with higher levels of uncertainty and/or the chance of greater associated negative consequences (Campbell and Goodstein 2001). Furthermore, an individual with a personal identity inclined toward risk-taking may copy software because he perceives it as a risky endeavor, at least in terms of potential consequences (Goles et al. 2007).

Sims et al. (1996) say that males are significantly more likely to copy software than females because males are more prone to risk-taking than females. In the Sims experiment, perceived risk is divided into three main groups. The three groups are named perceived legal risks, perceived performance risks, and perceived social risks.

5.2 Perceived Legal Risks

Perceived legal risks is defined as the sense one feels about being caught for pirating or using illegal software and facing legal recourse. The higher the perceived risk of prosecution or likelihood of punishment, the less likely one is to engage in piracy (Hsu and Shine 2007, Liao et al. 2009, and Moores and Nill 2009). Liao et al. researched the hypothesis that “perceived prosecution risk will negatively affect attitude toward using pirated software.” The same conclusion was found in Moores and Nill (2009). They propose, “the perceived likelihood of punishment for engaging in software piracy will positively determine a hostile attitude towards copyright violations, and a fear of the legal consequences for engaging in software piracy will positively determine a hostile attitude towards copyright violations.” In one study, (Peace et al. 2003), punishment severity and certainty negatively impact one’s attitude about software piracy, suggesting that anti-piracy campaigns would be effective at reducing piracy. With these findings as support, the hypotheses for perceived legal risks are:

$H1a$: A fear of legal consequences will negatively affect actual illegal activity.

$H1b$: A fear of legal consequences will negatively affect future illegal activity.
5.3 Perceived Performance Risks

Perceived performance risks is defined as the anticipated chance or likelihood for a person to receive a virus or other problem when downloading some digital file illegally. In a 2006 study of the prevalence of computer viruses at websites offering pirated software or key generators, IDC found that 255 were viruses, Trojan horses and key loggers. The literature suggests that perceived performance risks should not be a huge significance factor in the reason someone would or would not pirate.

Tan (2002) notes that “perceived performance risk has no significant influence on either attitude or intention toward using pirated software.” But perceived performance risks have greater influence in the use of pirated software than financial and time risks since these risks emerge only when the pirated software fails to function (Tan 2002). Also relating to perceived performance risks, the previously mentioned Laio et al. study (2009) hypothesized that perceived performance risk will positively affect attitude toward using pirated software. Based on their research, it can be hypothesized that:

H2a: The likelihood of perceived performance risks will **positively** affect actual piracy activity.

H2b: The likelihood of perceived performance risks will **positively** affect future piracy activity.

5.4 Perceived Social Risks

Perceived social risks can be described as how society, friends, family, or others will perceive someone if they pirate software or media. Perceived social risks are hypothesized to be somewhat significant toward attitude and piracy. Liao et al. (2009) say perceived social risk will negatively affect attitude toward the use of pirated software, therefore it is hypothesized that:

H3a: Perceived social risks will **negatively** affect actual piracy.

H3b: Perceived social risks will **negatively** affect future piracy.

5.5 Subjective Norms and Attitude

Subjective norms refer to the perceived peer or social pressure to perform (or not perform) a specific behavior, such as piracy. Subjective norms strongly relate and correlate to personal attitude and intention to pirate software. Subjective norms and attitude derive from the original theory of reasoned action (Fishbein and Ajzen, 1975), and the theory of planned behavior (Azjen, 1985) asserts that intention is determined by attitude.

The relationship between personal attitude and subjective norms showed a strong correlation in the factor analysis. Other researchers found this to be true as well. Liao (2009) notes, “There is significant evidence to indicate that attitude and subjective norm are not independent. Subjective norm is found to influence attitude (Al-Rafee and Cronan, 2006; Chang, 1998; Lim and Dubinsky, 2005). Persuasion theory (Eagly and Chaiken, 1993) and cognitive dissonance theory (Festinger, 1957) can help explain a person’s attitude formation and change.”

In Vullizon (2004), the attitudes and subjective norms toward behavior and perceived control over behavior are found to predict behavioral intentions with a high degree of accuracy. Villazon examined subjective norms that influence piracy behavior and concluded that students’ piracy of software was directly related to their attitude toward the behavior and their perception of reference groups.

Attitude is more significant than subjective norms if tested separately. Woodley and Eining (2006) and Christensen and Eining (1991) found strong support for attitude and less support for subjective norms. Peace et al. (2003) and Thong and Yap (1998) found strong support for attitude and less support for subjective norms in predicting software piracy.

Many variables can affect attitude. Hostile attitude toward copyright violations will positively determine one’s level of copyright compliance (Moores et al., 2009). The fear of legal consequences is the prime motivating factor impacting significantly on attitude toward software piracy, and consequently on behavior. The hypotheses for subjective norms and personal attitudes were viewed together because of their closeness in the theory and in the factor analysis. The hypotheses are:

H4a: Software pirated by one’s peers and one’s personal attitude will **positively** affect actual activity.

H4b: Software pirated by one’s peers and one’s personal attitude will **positively** affect future piracy.

5.6 Knowledge about Piracy and Copyright Laws

Several factors about knowledge influence piracy rates. One is the level of knowledge about piracy, such as the cost and effects of piracy on others. Another is knowledge of copyright laws, which means the consequences and punishments for copyright violations, not specific laws. For software piracy, legislation and education may lessen the seriousness of the problem, but may not stop individuals from using, reproducing, sharing, and dis-
tributing unauthorized software (Hsu and Shine, 2007).

To increase the knowledge of piracy’s damage and effect on society, the U.S. government has invested in education on the harms of piracy. Educational outreach programs have existed since the early 1990s, with campaigns such as “Don’t Copy that Floppy,” developed by the Software Publishers Alliance (SPA). In Goles et al. (2007), the more an individual is aware of laws regarding software copying, the less favorable his or her attitude will be toward piracy.

To support the hypotheses, Goles et al. (2007), Villazon (2004) and Moores et al. (2009) suggest that knowledge of piracy would have some effect on piracy levels. The Moores study notes that knowledge of software piracy will positively determine one’s perceived likelihood of punishment for engaging in software piracy, and knowledge of software piracy will positively determine one’s fear of the legal consequences for engaging in software piracy. Goles indicates that awareness of the law is a weak indicator, with other constructs such as moral obligation and habitual past behavior being better predictors of intention than attitude, social norms, and perceived behavioral control (e.g., Cronan and Al-Rafee, 2008). Goles et al. (2007) suggest that knowledge about piracy and copyright laws decreases piracy rates. Therefore, it is hypothesized that:

H5a: One’s level of knowledge of software piracy and one’s knowledge of copyright laws will positively affect actual activity.

H5b: One’s level of knowledge of software piracy and one’s knowledge of copyright laws will positively affect future activity.

H6a: The more knowledge of the methods used to pirate software, the more likely actual activity will be.

H6b: The more knowledge of the methods used to pirate software, the more likely future activity will be.

### 5.7 Computer Use

Computer use in this study is trifold: use compared to peers, daily use, and actual computer use. If daily computer use is high, computer self-efficacy theoretically should be higher, which means that the more one is on the computer, the more likely one is to obtain the skills necessary to pirate software or virtual media. At the very least, a longer time amount on the computer gives one the ability to be more comfortable in the use of computers and the methods needed to pirate. Counter-intuitively, Sinha and Mandel (2008) and Christoph et al. (1987) found that prior computer experience made no significant difference in attitudes toward piracy, and Kini et al. (2000) found that attitudes toward software piracy were not affected by experience with computers but were significantly affected by general demographic variables such as age. The significance of the construct of computer use and computer experience stems from the logic that the more one spends on a computer, the more skillful or at least comfortable one would feel with a computer. This means greater self-efficacy and greater likelihood that one would be able to pirate because of the skills or at least confidence one has acquired compared to one who has little or no experience or use (Villazon, 2004). Therefore it is hypothesized that:

H7a: The more daily use one has compared to peers the more positive the effect on actual activity because of computer efficacy.

H7b: The more daily use one has compared to peers the more positive the effect on future activity because of computer efficacy.

H8a: Computer use from experience and daily use will positively affect actual activity.

H8b: Computer use from experience and daily use will positively affect future activity.

H9a: Experience with computers positively affects actual activity.

H9b: Experience with computers positively affects future activity.

### 5.8 Future and Actual Software Piracy

Actual activity is the admitted level and frequency of piracy of different media and software. A few researchers have studied actual activity, which has the same characteristics as past activity. Goles et al. (2007) state that “constructs such as moral obligation and habitual (past) behavior” are a better predictor of intention than “the trio of attitude, social norms, and perceived behavioral control.”

Past behavior is a significant predictor of intention across all settings, and a significant predictor of attitude in the home setting. The more favorable his or her attitude toward soft lifting, the more the individual is inclined to pirate.

The best way to measure what people will do in the future is to measure their actual (present) activity. This is enforced by the findings of Fredricks and Dossett, 1983. So:

H10: Actual activity is a positive indicator of future activity.

### 6.0 Methodology

Constructs were created, located in Table 2, based on the literature. The theory of planned behavior gave the theoretical and practical data for personal attitude and subjective norms. Perceived risks, which include legal, social, and performance...
Table 2. Hypotheses and Construct Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| PRL (Perceived Legal Risks)             | H1a: A fear of legal consequences will *negatively* affect actual illegal activity.  
                                          | H1b: A fear of legal consequences will *negatively* affect future illegal activity.                                                                                                                                 |
| PRP (Perceived Performance Risks)       | H2a: The likelihood of perceived performance risks will *positively* affect actual activity.  
                                          | H2b: The likelihood of perceived performance risks will *positively* affect future activity.                                                                                                                                 |
| PRS (Perceived Social Risks)            | H3a: Perceived social risks will *negatively* affect actual piracy.  
                                          | H3b: Perceived social risks will *negatively* affect future piracy.                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| SN and PA (Subjective Norms and Personal Attitudes) | H4a: Software pirated by one’s peers and one’s personal attitude will *positively* affect actual activity.                                                                                             
                                          | H4b: Software pirated by one’s peers and one’s personal attitude will *positively* affect future piracy.                                                                                                                                                   |
| KKP and KKCL (Knowledge about Piracy and Copyright Laws) | H5a: One’s level of knowledge of software piracy and one’s knowledge of copyright laws will *positively* affect actual activity.                                                                       
                                          | H5b: One’s level of knowledge of software piracy and one’s knowledge of copyright laws will *positively* affect future activity.                                                                                                                                  |
| KMP (Knowledge with Methods of Piracy)  | H6a: The more knowledge of the methods used to pirate software the *more likely* actual activity will be.                                                                                               
                                          | H6b: The more knowledge of the methods used to pirate software the *more likely* future activity will be.                                                                                                                                               |
risk came from Hsu and Shine (2007), Liao et al. (2009), and Moores and Nill (2009). Knowledge of copyright laws and piracy came from Goles et al. (2008), Villazon (2004) and Moores and Nill (2009). The last five constructs, which are knowledge with methods of piracy, daily use, computer use, and computer experience, and actual activity, were developed without a theory or significant literature involvement.

After IRB approval, each of the constructs were tested and administered to students in a pilot study with 10 surveys. The pilot study was used to test for clarity, focus, and the amount of time needed for each survey. Each survey asked around 122 questions. After testing, the survey was administered to general business classes. The surveys totaled 152. For demographics (see Tables 3 and 4).

Once the surveys were administered, the data was manually typed into a spreadsheet. The spreadsheet data was used in a factor analysis to eliminate factors that did not load on the constructs neatly (basically p<.5). Aggregates were used for each construct and analyzed using regression analysis.

### 7.0 Results

The results come from three regression analyses. Surveys that had over five blanks were not used in the analysis. Regression analysis was used three times to compile all the information: constructs compared to ac-

| Daily Use | H7a: The more daily use one has compared to their peers the more positive the effect on actual activity because of computer efficacy.  
H7b: The more daily use one has compared to their peers the more positive the effect on future activity because of computer efficacy. |
|---|---|
| CU (Computer Use) | H8a: Computer use from experience and daily use will positively affect actual activity.  
H8b: Computer use from experience and daily use will positively affect future activity. |
| Computer Experience | H9a: Experience with computers positively affects actual activity.  
H9b: Experience with computers positively affects future activity. |
| Actual Activity | H10: Actual activity is a positive indicator of future activity. |

| Table 3. Gender of Respondents |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Gender** | **Frequency** | **Percent** | **Valid Percent** | **Cumulative Percent** |
| Male | 103 | 67.8 | 67.8 | 67.8 |
| Female | 49 | 32.2 | 32.2 | 100.0 |
| Total | 152 | 100.0 | 100.0 |

| Table 4. Age of Respondents |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Age** | **Frequency** | **Percent** | **Valid Percent** | **Cumulative Percent** |
| 18-25 yrs. | 93 | 61.2 | 61.2 | 61.2 |
| 26-40 | 50 | 32.9 | 32.9 | 94.1 |
| >40 | 9 | 5.9 | 5.9 | 100.0 |
| Total | 152 | 100.0 | 100.0 |
Table 5. Actual Activity Compared to Constructs Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypotheses</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Standard Coefficient $b$</th>
<th>t-value (P-value)</th>
<th>Hypotheses Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1a (-)</td>
<td>PRL (Perceived Legal Risks)</td>
<td>-.011</td>
<td>-.151 (.880)</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2a (+)</td>
<td>PRP (Perceived Performance Risks)</td>
<td>-.005</td>
<td>-.069 (.945)</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3a (-)</td>
<td>PRS (Perceived Social Risks)</td>
<td>-.120</td>
<td>-1.542 (.125)</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H4a (+)</td>
<td>SN and PA (Subjective Norms and Personal Attitudes)</td>
<td>.135</td>
<td>1.8812 (.072)*</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H5a (-)</td>
<td>KKP and KKCL (Knowledge about Piracy and Copyright Laws)</td>
<td>-.119</td>
<td>-1.539 (.126)</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H6a (+)</td>
<td>KMP (Knowledge with Methods of Piracy)</td>
<td>.366</td>
<td>4.835 (.000)**</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H7a (+)</td>
<td>CUE (Computer Use Compared to Peers)</td>
<td>.182</td>
<td>2.378 (.019)**</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H8a (+)</td>
<td>CUE (Daily Use)</td>
<td>.118</td>
<td>1.527 (.129)</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H9a (-)</td>
<td>CUT (Actual Computer Experience)</td>
<td>-.030</td>
<td>-.404 (.687)</td>
<td>Not supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes:
(+ ) indicates a positive expectation  (-) indicates a negative expectation
Notes: (p<0.1* indicates somewhat significant); (p<.05** indicates significant)

The overall significance of the model (see Table 5) is (p < 0.00) with (R = .560) and (R² = .314). The significant constructs include KMP (Knowledge with Methods of Piracy) and CUE (Computer Use Compared to Peers). The significance of KMP (p = 0.000) and CUE (p = 0.019)

7.1 Discussion

Beginning with theoretical analysis of the data, subjective norms and personal attitudes did not load as a significant factor in either actual activity or future activity (see Tables 5 and 6). The theory of planned behavior suggested that subjective norms and personal attitude would load much higher. Subjective norms and personal attitudes did load as somewhat significant when tested against actual activity (p = 0.072). Subjective norms and personal attitudes had an opposite effect on future activity with a high value (p = 0.829), which means that the two factors had almost no effect on future activity. One reason that these factors may have loaded against the theory of
The overall significance of the Future Activity model (see Table 6) is \( p = 0.001 \) with \( R=0.410 \) and \( R^2=0.168 \). The only significant construct is KMP (Knowledge with Methods of Piracy). The significance of KMP \( p = 0.000 \) was the only one with a \( p \) value under .05.

planned behavior could be that people do not depend on the opinions of others or care about their own attitudes to pirate or not to pirate to determine actual or future activity. Perhaps the time difference from the original research is significant, and people have changed when it comes to pirating. Another reason could be that the small number of students surveyed is not representative.

Some factors that seemed like they would be significant factors are perceived legal risks and performance risks. Apparently, respondents did not believe punishment by the law or performance risks from downloading illegally would affect their actual or future activity. Perceived legal risks and perceived performance risks had the highest \( p \) value \( p = 0.880 \) and \( p = 0.945 \) in actual activity table (see Table 5). Perceived legal risks and perceived performance risks had very high values in future activity as well \( p = 0.734 \) and \( p = 0.765 \).

8.0 Practical Implications

The implications of this study suggest that piracy is
Table 7. Actual Activity Compared to Future Activity Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Independent Variables</th>
<th>Model Results</th>
<th>Hypotheses Support</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H10 (+) Actual Activity</td>
<td>.649</td>
<td>10.451 (0.000)** Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: (+) indicates a positive expectation  (-) indicates a negative expectation
Notes: (p<0.1* indicates somewhat significant); (p<.05** indicates significant)

The overall significance of the model (see Table 7) is (p = 0.000) with (R=.421) and (R²=.418). The model shows that actual piracy activity is a significant factor and predictor of future piracy with a p value of 0.000.

Table 8. Summary of Findings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Summary of Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Independent Variables</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRL (Perceived Legal Risks)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRP (Perceived Performance Risks)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRS (Perceived Social Risks)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SN and PA (Subjective Norms and Personal Attitudes)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KKP and KKCL (Knowledge about Piracy and Copyright Laws)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KMP (Knowledge with Methods of Piracy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CUE (Computer Use Compared to Peers)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CUE (Daily Use)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CUT (Actual Computer Experience)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Actual Activity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: (p<0.1* indicated somewhat significant); (p<.05** indicates significant)
real, ongoing, and an ever-growing problem. The most important point to take from the research is that perceived legal consequences produced almost no change for the students surveyed when asked about actual and future piracy. Another implication from the study is that one of the only reasons people are not pirating is because they simply do not know how to do it and not because they are afraid of the consequences. Also, this study suggests that once pirating begins it will continue in the future (see Table 7).

9.0 Conclusion

With billions of dollars being lost to piracy, the U.S. has led the way in copyright laws and protection to combat the problem. The problem of software, music, gaming, and video piracy is global as well. The theory of planned behavior was one of the theories used to discover factors and reasons people pirate. The theory of planned behavior makes sense of subjective norms and personal attitudes, although some researchers focus on perceived risks, performance, and legal risks. Combining knowledge with methods of piracy and computer use created constructs to help obtain a better view of the reasons one would pirate.

There were some limitations to this study. First, the number of surveys administered is the most obvious limitation: only 152. The next limitation is the type of students surveyed; most students were from business majors or the Business College.

The overriding factor with the most significance on one’s ability and desire to pirate digital files is one’s knowledge of the methods of piracy. Another significant factor for actual activity is computer use compared to peers, and a somewhat significant construct is subjective norms and personal attitudes. For future activity, actual activity is one of the strongest factors, and somewhat significant factors include knowledge about piracy and copyright laws (see Table 8).

References


Christoph, R.: 1987, “Development of Information Sys-


Safety Management Systems: The Perspective of Tennessee Airports

Amber L. Gray

Dr. C. Daniel Prather
Aerospace

Safety Management Systems (SMS), which is the proactive, formalized approach to managing risk and enhancing safety, is not yet mandatory within the aviation industry in the United States. Two pilot SMS studies were conducted at a handful of airports nationwide by the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA), which examined the feasibility of implementing SMS at airports. Although SMS is not yet mandatory in this country, many in the industry feel it will become mandatory in the near future. This research investigates via a brief, online questionnaire with two additional follow-ups, data analysis, and aggregate reporting of data, the degree to which Tennessee airports support SMS adoption. The majority of Tennessee airports responding to the survey are not too familiar with SMS; currently have a proactive safety plan in place other than SMS; support a mandatory SMS for Part 139 airports; may consider implementing an SMS if it remains voluntary; would expect some resistance from airport employees, tenants, and users if implementing an SMS; and would anticipate needing additional funding to properly develop and implement an SMS.

“Needless deaths through accidents are a betrayal of our society.”

~Worick (1975, p. 7)

EVERY ACCIDENT IS the result of “faulty habits and attitude,” and everyone should know what their attitude is and how it can be tailored (Worick, 1975: 25). Most people think of engineering as a job; however, it can also be a way of coming up with how to do a proper system, including a safety system (Rodgers, 1971). “Safety touches many areas of a man’s life. There are ethical, moral, religious, aesthetic, legal, and many other considerations that involve safety” (Worick: 1).

According to Rodgers (1971), everyone thinks that they understand the meaning of safety, yet they have a hard time writing a definition of it. Rodgers (1971: 2) defines safety as “the surety that the environment that personnel or items are subjected to is free from inadvertent or unexpected events which may result in injury to personnel or damage to the items exposed. Mroz (1978: 7) defines safety as “the prevention of accidents and mitigation of personal injury or property which may result from accidents.” According to Rodgers (1971: 1), “piloting a private airplane is considered relativity safe, to a trained pilot; but, to someone who has never taken flying lessons, it would be a very dangerous and almost certain fatal venture.”

Literature Review

According to Roland and Moriarty (1983: 11), the earliest form of a safety concept in aerospace came in 1947 from a paper that was presented to the Institute of Aeronautical Sciences entitled “Engineering for Safety,” which said, “Safety must be designed and built into airplanes just as are performance, stability, and structural integrity. A safety group must be just as important a part of a manufacturer’s organization as a stress, aerodynamics, or a weights group.” Unlike other industries that have been around for some time, having safety as a profession in aerospace is still new.

Many accidents can be prevented by simply having a safety program in place. Accidents are the leading cause of death in the United States among ages 1 through 38, and the fourth leading cause of death in all ages (Mroz: 1). A safety program needs to be proactive rather than reactive, and that is what Safety Management Systems is all about. Florio, Alles, and Stafford (1979: 429) say that using safety programs in the aviation profession “between 1912 and 1976 accident fatality rates dropped by 71 percent.”

Rodgers (1971: 2) states, “Safety programs have been
established in the past on an after-the-fact philosophy,” meaning that something major must happen for an employer to recognize that something needs to change in order for that accident to not occur again. It is widely acknowledged that most of the minimum standards set at airports are usually the result of something that occurred at the airport. This is a tragedy.

Pybus (1996: 11) gives many examples of accidents, including the well-publicized accident that occurred on January 28, 1986. … at 11:38 eastern standard time, the Space Shuttle Challenger was launched from the Kennedy Space Center. Seventy-three seconds later its flight ended in an explosive burn of hydrogen and oxygen propellants. All seven crew members died. The immediate cause of the disaster was the failure of a rubber O-ring on one of the two solid fuel booster rockets, leading to a leak of fuel, which ignited. The flame deflected onto the surface of the external liquid hydrogen/liquid oxygen Shuttle propellant tank, causing failure of the tank structure and escaping liquid fuels ignited explosively, and the Shuttle assembly was destroyed. With this space-age technology, how was it that a simple O-ring failed with such disastrous consequences? The Presidential Commission of enquiry unearthed significant underlying causes.

After a thorough investigation of the Space Shuttle Challenger accident, there proved to be four main causes of the accident. The first cause was improper design of the O-ring. It was too sensitive for the environmental conditions it would be utilized in. At the time of the launch, the temperature was 39 degrees. According to NASA policy, the temperature was not supposed to be lower than 52 degrees. Interestingly, the design of the Challenger’s rocket booster was rated fourth out of all its other competitors (Pybus: 12).

The second cause of the accident was that no one objected to the faulty design. Furthermore, employees tended to ignore the problems. As time elapsed through the investigation phase, NASA and the seal manufacturer decided to stick by their choice of the design rather than go back and redesign it. They did this because they did not want to add more costs to the project. There were also gaps in communications, which is the third cause of the accident, between the people who were conducting the launch and senior management.

Lastly, because this was a high-profile project, the demands of meetings deadlines, and “resources were stretched and fundamental principles overridden” (Pybus: 13). All the while there was proof to not launch the space shuttle, but the determination to launch was even greater – at the cost of seven lives. As Pybus notes, “It was the replacement of a safety-driven culture by a performance-driven culture.”

Safety Management Systems

The International Civil Aviation Organization required member states to have certified international airports establish safety management systems in November 2005. The Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) released an Advisory Circular in February 2007 entitled, “Introduction to Safety management Systems (SMS) for Airport Operator” to introduce the SMS concept, obtain public comment and ensure there was congruence with previous regulations. Training and implementation were set in 2010.

Two projects have been funded to help the further guidance of implementation of SMS. The FAA used these pilot studies to determine the costs and time involved for SMS implementation as well as to develop models for future airports SMS projects. Results showed that all airports had a safety program in place but, also, that they were all in need of a Safety Management Systems.

The Transportation Research Board’s “Safety Management Systems Overview” of 2007 says that aviation safety has been reactive rather than proactive and that human factors are usually the cause of accidents: “There will always be hazards and risks in the airport environment. Proactive management is needed to identify and control these safety issues before they lead to mishaps.” (Transportation Research Board, 2007: X). The report further says that “SMS provides a systemic, explicit, and comprehensive process for managing risks” and that the “FAA projections anticipate 1.4 million additional domestic takeoffs and landings each year from 2007 until 2020” (Transportation Research Board, 2007: x-1).

Safety Management Systems have four key principles: management commitment to safety, proactive identification of hazards, actions taken to manage risks, and evaluation of safety actions. SMS should be something that all employees receive, from top management to bottom airfield crew, with everyone having a proactive approach (Transportation Research Board, 2007: 2).

SMS should not be burdensome to the average employee and is not intended to formulate extra steps in day-to-day activities. It is something that should come as second nature without the employees realizing it. The benefits of SMS are manifold. First, it will provides analysis of airport accidents and injuries and provides solutions, as they are approaching. (Appendix 1, courtesy of Prather Airport Solutions, presents the gap analysis and SMS manual and implementation plan.) Next, costs will be reduced by recognizing the early signs of incidents and accidents and have
good company morale with communication from top management to department. Other benefits include a track record of good safety, learning from mistakes, and overall improving practice (Transportation Research Board, 2007: 3-4).

There are four distinct pillars that make up Safety Management Systems, as shown in Figure 1.

**Safety Policy.** The first element of the Safety Policy pillar is the policy statement, which should include a statement of the company’s dedication to implementing the process, properly monitoring safety performance, addressing the issue of employees having fear of reporting certain issues, addressing proper behavior toward safety, establishing and evaluating goals, and allotting the resources needed (Transportation Research Board, 2007: 6). The organizational structure is the second element. The precise organizational structure will depend on the size of the airport. Larger airports may have a more defined structure full of many different parts for each department such as accounting, human resources, or leasing office. While smaller, general aviation airports may only have an SMS Director/Manager who supervises the implementation and ensures the successful implementation. The third and final element is procedure, spelled out in a document. When procedures change, they must be communicated to all those affected (Transportation Research Board, 2007: 6).

**Figure 1. SMS Components (Federal Aviation Administration, 2009).**

**Safety Risk Management.** Although it is impossible to eliminate all risks, Safety Risk Management techniques reduce risks through the consistency of its three elements, hazard identification, risk assessment, and risk and mitigation and tracking (Transportation Research Board, 2007: 8).

One must first determine what hazards the airport faces and what must be implemented to be able to identify what may happen (Transportation Research Board, 2007: 8). The Risk Management Matrix, as shown in Figure 2 is often used to measure the severity of risk. The risk assessment addresses both how bad the consequences are and the chances of it happening again.

**Safety Assurance.** Safety Assurance consists of three elements: internal audits, external audits and corrective action. First, internal audits should be done by each department, and should be conducted regularly. External audits are conducted by an independent agency. Corrective action used to make sure hazards are being resolved (Transportation Research Board, 2007: 10).

**Safety Promotion.** Safety Promotion consists of culture, training and communication. SMS should not only be the priority of management but also all employees. The culture should be a positive one. Training equips employees with the skills to fulfill their responsibilities and communication ensures that the process runs smoothly.

Research has shown that SMS is needed in the aviation industry. Safety Assurance, for instance, could have prevented such incidents as occurred on July 5, 2000, when an Air France Concorde flying from Paris to JFK crashed after takeoff from Charles de Gaulle International Airport. A Continental DC-10 departing before the Concorde lost a 16-inch strip of metal, which caused the Concorde to run over it, puncturing a tire, and rupturing a fuel tank, killing 113 people.

**SMS Implementation**

There are three approaches to implementing SMS. They are the evolutionary style, phased methodology approach,
having an Airport Safety Committee (ASC), which “is a formal organization, which holds bimonthly meetings, reviews safety statistics, hosts joint training sessions, conducts joint inspections, and makes explicit recommendations for coordinated practices in ramp operations that enhance the safety of all operators” (Fullerton, 2008).

Airports in the United States are currently working on proactive SMS plans. One is San Antonio International Airport. At the American Association of Airport Executive Annual Conference in May 2010, John Chase (SMS Manager for San Antonio), said San Antonio wants to expand its SMS and implement it into air traffic control in four to five years.

After implementing their version of SMS, there still are many unanswered questions. For example, will the FAA have regulated safety-reporting software or will it be up to the individual states or airports themselves? Where does accountability really lie? How are fines going to work and who is regulating that? Regardless of the many unanswered questions, one thing is certain: San Antonio has a solid SMS in place. Staff members who find the most safety issues receive awards such as Chili’s gift cards.

Another proactive SMS currently in place is at Seattle-Tacoma International Airport (SEA-TAC). Safety has always

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Severity</th>
<th>No Safety Effect</th>
<th>Minor</th>
<th>Major</th>
<th>Hazardous</th>
<th>Catastrophic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Likelihood</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Probable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Remote</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely Remote</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely Improbable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 2. Risk Management Matrix (Federal Aviation Administration, 2007)
been a focal point for SEA-TAC, so when the airport discovered Safety Management Systems and the possibility of participating in a pilot study conducted by the FAA, they wanted to take part in it. Having successfully completed a Phase I pilot study they were optimistic about their participation in the Phase II follow-on study. During Phase II they learned that SMS should be integrated all over the airport from administration to the ground and that “if implemented correctly, can leverage, build upon, and enhance the safety of the entire airfield” (Coates, 2010: 39). Furthermore, SEA-TAC has implemented an automated regulatory system and introduced safety programs addressing communications routes.

For airport managers, then, SMS facilitates the anticipation of accidents and provides a way to manage risk situations, thus allowing the airport to fully break down the occurrence and learn ways to fix problems. The TRB states, “the SMS approach reduces losses, improves productivity, and is generally good for business” (Transportation Research Board, 2009:7).

**Statement of the Problem and Methodology**

In an effort to determine the degree of support for SMS among Tennessee airports, the current research project was carried out during the summer of 2010. Tennessee airport managers were chosen to complete a brief online survey in order to answer the following:

1. To what extent are airports familiar with SMS?
2. What type of SMS is currently in place at the airport?
3. If SMS remains voluntary, would airports still consider implementing SMS?
4. Would airports need additional funding to properly develop and implement SMS?

According to the Tennessee Department of Transportation, Aeronautics Division, in Tennessee there are currently...
Figure 5. Voluntary SMS

Would you consider implementing an SMS if it remains voluntary?

- Yes 23.1%
- No 11.5%
- Maybe 65.4%

**1 participant skipped this question**

Figure 6. Support Mandatory SMS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How supportive would you be for a mandatory SMS for:</th>
<th><strong>1 participant skipped this question</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Highly Supportive</strong></td>
<td><strong>Supportive</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class I-Part 139 certificated airports</td>
<td>24% (6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class II, III, IV-Part 139 certificated airports</td>
<td>21.7% (5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Part 139 certificated airports</td>
<td>4% (1)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 7. Resistance to SMS

If SMS were implemented at your airport, what degree of resistance would you expect from:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>1 participant skipped this question</strong></th>
<th><strong>High Resistance</strong></th>
<th><strong>Some Resistance</strong></th>
<th><strong>No Resistance</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Airport Employees</td>
<td>0% (0)</td>
<td>52% (13)</td>
<td>48% (12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenants</td>
<td>30.8% (8)</td>
<td>57.7% (15)</td>
<td>11.5% (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Users</td>
<td>19.2% (5)</td>
<td>69.2% (18)</td>
<td>11.5% (3)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
75 public-use airports. Twelve of these airports do not have an email address so a paper survey was sent out on June 14, 2010 to them. For the rest, an electronic survey was made available on June 17. A follow-up was sent on June 24 and telephone follow-ups were made on July 1. A total of 47 airports were called to request their participation. After conversations with some of the airport managers, eight of them requested the survey be resent. This was done. The $n$ of the survey is 68.

**Findings/Discussion**

Surprisingly, slightly less than half the managers of Tennessee airports are familiar with SMS, as seen in Figure 3. The majority of managers say they have a proactive (but not SMS) program in place (Figure 5) and nearly two-thirds are ambivalent about implementing SMS if the program remains voluntary (Figure 6).

From Figure 6 we see that airport managers in Tennessee are not particularly supportive of SMS. Indeed, just slightly more than half of Class I airports and only 28 percent on non-certificated airports are to some degree supportive.

Managers also expected resistance if SMS were to be implemented at their airports, especially from airport users (Figure 7).

Not so surprisingly, the vast majority of managers believe that the development and implementation would require additional funding (Figure 8),
Conclusion

Aviation is a safe mode of transportation but is nevertheless still prone to accidents (Stolzer et al., 2008). As air transportation demands rise, so does the need for a formalized safety plan. Safety has evolved from an unregulated system, to a regulated one without a systems approach, to a regulated one with a systems approach. Safety has moved from technical issues that needed to be fixed to human performance issues and presently the proactive approach being SMS. SMS has a bright future full of jobs, community-building within airports and prevention of accidents. According to an article in Airport Magazine, “compliance with regulations doesn’t mean it’s an effective SMS; SMS is about people, processes, and relations” (Coates, 2010: 39).

Research in other industries, as well as other countries, has shown SMS to be successful. The safety benefits it provides not only is beneficial for Tennessee airports, but for airports nationwide and the entire aviation industry. “If compliance guaranteed safety, then we would only need one rule: Don’t crash. Obviously, it takes a lot more than that” (FAA, 2008).

APPENDIX 1

Courtesy of Prather Airport Solutions, Murfreesboro, TN
Work Management Summary

Clearly, developing a Safety Management System is a complex process. The RFQ for this project lists nine main requirements and three deliverables that the selected consultant would be responsible for completing. However, as stated in the RFQ, these requirements are not all-inclusive. Therefore, in determining what tasks will be completed by our firm for this project, and relying upon our expertise in developing Safety Management Systems, we have referred to the Statement of Work for the 2nd FAA SMS Airport Pilot Study. As a result, if se-
lected for this project, our firm will complete a detailed Gap Analysis, as well as an SMS Manual & Implementation Plan, containing no less than 21 distinct components.

I. Gap Analysis

1.1. Review of current airport safety management practices, including safety plans and practices of tenants and operators at the airport

1.2. Review of current safety-specific airport documents, including Airport Certification Manual, Memorandums of Understanding/Memorandums of Agreements, Safety During Construction Plans, Surface Movement Guidance and Control System Plans, Airport Emergency Plans, and any quality management and/or risk management program

1.3 To be conducted utilizing the unique Gap Analysis Form (Appendix E) developed by Prather Airport Solutions, Inc. utilizing guidance from TP 14343E and the 2nd FAA SMS Airport Pilot Study Statement of Work

SMS Manual & Implementation Plan

2.1. Written safety policy statement and description of how it is communicated to airport employees

2.2. Identification and description of the airport safety goals

2.3. A plan for employee SMS indoctrination and training, including an outline of proposed curriculum and resources required

2.4. Documented process to identify training requirements for systems safety

2.5. Plan to validate training effectiveness and the process to gain training feedback, including usable metrics

2.6. Defined process to communicate safety policies and objectives throughout the organization, including examples of how information will be communicated and processes for follow-up

2.7. Plan and description for employee non-punitive reporting systems, both existing and new

2.8. Organizational chart identifying the names and safety responsibilities of all key personnel, including top management, safety manager, department heads/managers, and established safety committees and chairpersons

2.9. Description of the safety risk management (SRM) process, including application of “The Five Phases of SRM,” as discussed in FAA AC 150/5200-37

2.10. Guidance on the use of SRM and trend analysis

2.11. Defined process for documenting the results of SRM to include a description of how documents will be stored

2.12. Description of how top management will follow-up on SRM to ensure safety mitigation strategies are appropriate

2.13. Description of the airport quality management and/or risk management program (if currently existing) and its integration into the airport SMS

2.14. Description of a plan to integrate apron safety management into the airport SMS, including a description of current apron safety management practices and an explanation of how current apron safety management practices meet the intent of SMS

2.15. Detailed method to document self-auditing processes and their findings, to include use of airport self-inspection process to address system safety

2.16. Detailed method to document self-inspection reviews, analysis, and findings

2.17. Description or plan to integrate the tailored SMS program into the overall operation of the airport

2.18. Documented plan for training and education, safety communication, competency, and continuous improvement processes

2.19. Procedures to promote safety awareness and participation in non-punitive reporting systems

2.20. Process to document and review lessons learned from within the organization

2.21. Schedule for implementation and anticipated associated costs
APPENDIX 2

Courtesy of Prather Airport Solutions, Murfreesboro, TN
Preliminary Work Plan

Based on our experience, to effectively produce a Safety Management System that is usable by the Airport and supported by all levels of staff and tenants, certain tasks must take place. In essence, implementing an effective Safety Management System involves much more than simply writing a Safety Manual. It requires a concerted effort by the consultant and Airport Management to bring about real change in the organization. Without this effort, any attempts to implement an SMS will be met with resistance and will enjoy little success (if not complete defeat).

True, there is wide variation in methods and approaches to developing and implementing an SMS. ICAO, Transport Canada, and FAA offer guidance on this, although there appears to be no “one best way.” Prather Airport Solutions, Inc., based on past experience and in studying the extensive guidance on this issue, has developed the following Work Plan:

Step 1: Meet with Airport staff to agree upon a Work Plan and Schedule
Step 2: Conduct Safety Culture Survey of a sample of Airport employees and management
Step 3: Develop Senior Management Commitment to Safety
Step 4: Determine Safety Manager and members of the SMS Committee
Step 5: Conduct Gap Analysis
Step 6: Revise Work Plan based on gaps identified
Step 7: Develop the SMS Manual
Step 8: Develop the Implementation Plan
Step 9: Offer follow-on services to client in the form of Training, SRM, and On-line Non-Punitive Reporting System

Step 1: Work Plan and Schedule
This step involves the consultant meeting with the client to agree upon the scope of the project, develop a Work Plan to meet the client’s needs, and develop a schedule which is mutually beneficial.

Step 2: Safety Culture Survey
To determine the current safety culture of the organization, a sample of organization employees and management will be asked to complete a Safety Culture Survey (adopted from Transport Canada). These results will be analyzed and shared with management.

Step 3: Senior Management Commitment to Safety
Prather Airport Solutions, Inc. will develop a draft Senior Management Commitment to Safety and in consultation with senior management, the written commitment will be revised and signed by Senior Management. This will then be distributed to organization employees so that, early in the process, they will understand the importance of safety and support the move toward a fully functioning SMS.

Step 4: Safety Manager and Members of the SMS Committee
The importance of this step cannot be overstated. It is very important for one individual to have responsibility for managing the Safety Management System and be involved in this process from the beginning. Additionally, by appointing members of the SMS Committee at this early stage, input can be sought for the development of the SMS Manual and Implementation Plan, thereby engendering support.

Step 5: Gap Analysis
Due to our knowledge of SMS criteria and the requirements for an effective SMS Program, Prather Airport Solutions, Inc. has designed a unique Gap Analysis Form. This Gap Analysis Form guides the firm in conducting a Gap Analysis for the client, considering both FAA requirements and Transport Canada guidance. This Gap Analysis involves comparing the 21 components of the SMS Manual and Implementation Plan to existing systems at the airport. Each gap analysis question is designed for a “yes” or “no” response. “Yes” responses indicate that the airport already meets the criteria for that particular SMS component. A “No” answer indicates that a gap exists between the stated criteria and the airport’s policies, procedures, or processes. If the response is “Yes”, the next column of the gap analysis form can be used to indicate where (in company documentation) the requirement is addressed. If the response is “No”, the same column can be used to indicate how and/or where the policy, procedure, or process will be further developed to bring the airport into compliance with the requirement.

Step 6: Revise Work Plan
Clearly, once the gaps are identified, the firm and the client will have a much better understanding of areas where ad-
ditional work is needed. As a result, it is prudent to meet again and revise the Work Plan from this step forward.

**Step 7: SMS Manual**

At this step, the information gathered thus far, as well as knowledge of the components of the SMS Manual, are utilized to develop the SMS Manual. The firm has developed an SMS Framework (Appendix F) to guide this effort. At this stage, all of the resources of the firm are committed to producing this deliverable to the client.

**Step 8: Implementation Plan**

This final phase involves the development of an Implementation Plan for the client. As previously stated, the SMS Manual is only one aspect of a fully functioning Safety Management System. After the Manual is produced, the respective components must be implemented over time. It is important for the client to note that this is not accomplished overnight. To assist with this, phases of implementation have been developed. Appendix G contains these Phases of Implementation.

**Step 9: Offer Follow-on Services**

Lastly, once the project is completed, Prather Airport Solutions, Inc. always offers additional services to the client to allow the easy realization of a fully functioning SMS. For instance, our firm can host an on-line, confidential reporting system for the non-punitive reporting of safety concerns, as well as training programs, awareness materials, and independent safety audits.

**References**


How the Financial Crisis of 2007 Affected Household Wealth

J. Matthew Hampton

Dr. Stuart J. Fowler
Department of Economics and Finance

Using data from the Panel Study of Income Dynamics, the time-series behavior of household wealth in the United States for the years 2003-2009 (pre/post financial crisis) is documented. The time-series behavior of wealth shows three main results. First, housing/real estate makes up the majority of household wealth, roughly 72%. Second, wealth has significantly fallen post-crisis. Regression analysis shows that real wealth fell by $26,000. Finally, the post financial crisis wealth of economic young households (those ages 18-30) has not been significantly affected. Alternatively, old-age households (those ages 56 and up) had the largest wealth reductions. Presumably, the old have been affected the most due to their deeper investment in housing and larger amount of total wealth.

According to economists, the recent financial crisis is the largest economic downturn since the Great Depression (1929-1939). Most economists agree that the financial crisis started in 2007 and was partly due to the fall of the housing market. By definition, financial crisis implies falling values of assets. Since assets, such as homes, determine wealth, it would follow that the financial crisis could have a large effect on household wealth. It is the purpose of this paper to quantify and document the severity of the effects of the crisis on household wealth. In addition, I attempt to measure which households have been hurt the most by the crisis.

What can come from a better understanding of the effects the financial crisis had on household wealth? Presumably, having knowledge of the effects can lead to improvements in policy. For example, knowing who has been hurt the most, in terms of wealth, can lead to better targeting of benefits. Also, it is important to understand the true cost of the crisis to households. Knowing the true cost of the crisis helps economists to predict how long it will take to recover from the crisis.

The economic definition of wealth is the value of assets owned less liabilities owed. In the field of accounting, everything is derived from one key principle: Assets – Liabilities = Owner’s Equity. Owner’s equity can be thought of as an equivalent to wealth. There are two different types of wealth: tangible and intangible. Tangible wealth consists of cash, stocks, bonds, etc. This is wealth that holds concrete dollar value. Intangible wealth does not have concrete value. An example of intangible wealth is human capital. Due to the difficulty of pricing intangible wealth, I will mainly focus on tangible wealth in this research. Furthermore, since we know that wealth equals assets minus liabilities, we are able to perform wealth calculations if given access to both asset and liability data.

In the study of the financial crisis, it is important to have a basic understanding of its causes. The Federal National Mortgage Association (Fannie Mae) and Federal Home Loan Mortgage Association (Freddie Mac), two government-backed corporations, played a key role in the beginnings of the financial crisis. According to documentation provided by the Federal Reserve Bank of St. Louis at http://www.stlouisfed.org, financial institutions, such as banks, issue mortgages to those that qualify. Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac then purchase those mortgages from the financial institutions on a secondary mortgage market. Basically, the two government corporations insure part of the overall risk. Due to the insurance, bankers issued riskier mortgages called subprimes. Economists call this moral hazard, defined as the incentive for increased risk-taking due to the presence of insurance (St. Louis Fed). The beginning of trouble was signaled when Freddie Mac abruptly stopped purchasing the most risky subprime mortgages on February 27, 2007 (see Federal Reserve Timeline) followed soon by the collapse in the housing market.

This research is done in three main steps. In the following paragraphs I describe these steps and my methodology.

First, I collect and analyze data from the Panel Study of Income Dynamics (PSID). The PSID is a government backed organization which operates out of the University of Michigan. Beginning in 1968, the PSID has accumulated household financial data for over 40 years. The PSID collects data by conducting household surveys every two years. There are
roughly 8000 households interviewed by the PSID, a sample that is intended to be representative of the United States as a whole (e.g., Juster, Smith, and Stafford 1999). The core of the household financial information comes from the 2003, 2005, and 2007 Family files documented in the Panel Study of Income Dynamics Public Release Family File Codebook.

Second, the data is then used to construct balance sheets for the sampled households following the procedures set forth in Samphantharak and Townsend (2010). Their analysis method allows the use of wealth accounting principles. Much like an accounting firm might monitor a corporation, I apply an accounting framework to households. This helps show the effects of the financial crisis on households and thus facilitates comparisons of household wealth both pre- and post-crisis.

Third, a regression analysis is performed using the collected and relevant PSID data. Unfortunately, the PSID has yet to release the 2009 Family files. This prevents direct calculation of 2009 household wealth. Fortunately, however, the PSID has recently pre-released 2009 home values for the panel participants. The 2009 home values allow me to forecast and thus document 2009 overall wealth. In the regression, household wealth will be the dependent variable and home value will be the explanatory variable. This is where the pre-released 2009 home value data will prove to be quite important; the regression allows prediction of 2009 wealth using the 2009 home value data.

A quick summary of my main findings now follows. First, home values are the major component to wealth; roughly 72%. Second, wealth shares (the fraction of components to total) don’t vary much over time. In fact, there is no statistical change over the sample time periods. Third, there is a large decline in real home prices in 2009; roughly a $14,870 average decline. Fourth, wealth falls by about $26,000 from 2007 to 2009. Finally, due to their deeper investment in housing and larger amount of total wealth, older households seem to have been affected the most by the crisis.

The remainder of this paper is structured as follows. Section 2 presents preliminary facts that describe the households in the PSID survey. Section 3 constructs balance sheets for the households in the survey. Section 4 performs the regression analysis for the purpose of forecasting 2009 wealth. Finally, section 5 concludes.

Data Source

The single source for data is the Panel Study of Income Dynamics (PSID). Operating out of the University of Michigan, the PSID has collected household financial data for over 40 years. Roughly 8000 households are surveyed by the PSID. For this study, I make use of three different waves of data. These waves are 2003, 2005, and 2007.

There are several methods which I use to treat the data in this research. In order to compare variables over time, it is necessary to adjust the variables for inflation. To do this, I use the Consumer Price Index. By obtaining a CPI value for each year from www.bls.gov, the data is adjusted to make it real as opposed to nominal. This is done by dividing the data value by the CPI value, or in other words dividing out inflation. For example, if nominal total family income is $64,000 and the CPI value is 1.42 then real total family income would be 45,070. If this data treatment is ignored then all of the data values will be inflated and unrealistic. In order to obtain per-person averages, each variable is divided by the number of people in the household. This is done to account for the growth, possibly, of families. One final data treatment is performed to remove all survey participants who elect to not answer certain questions. If this data treatment is neglected then results will be skewed due to the lack of answering. For example, there are 143 participants left out in the 2003 PSID dataset. These are people who refused to answer. Because 143 is a small number, this obviously does not affect the sample of roughly 8000 to a large degree.

For an overview of the dataset’s characteristics, consider the household demographics for 2003, 2005, and 2007 that are shown above in Table 1. The average age of the head of household for the three waves is roughly 45. A majority of the households in the survey are married and they have on average 0.85 children. Real per-person income is $31,721 for 2003, $32,112 for 2005, and $31,715 for 2007. Roughly, this averages to $32,000. Lastly, the PSID survey includes questions on asset ownership. An example question would be “Do you own a home?” The PSID codes the answer 0 if no and 1 if yes. The mean of this variable thus gives the percentage of households that own a home; this is roughly 59% for the three waves.

Later in this analysis we will assume that home ownership rates do not statistically change. To formally test this assumption, Table 2 presents the test statistics of equality of means for home ownership percentages across the three periods. We see that the computed test statistic for equality of mean home ownership from 2003 to 2005 is 1.5719. This is well within acceptance at 2%. Additionally, the equality of means test for the years 2005 to 2007, which has a test statistic of roughly 2, shows as well the home ownership rates did not statistically change.

Several conclusions can be drawn regarding Tables 1 and 2. First, there is a lack of serious variance in the data...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>2003</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age of Household Head</td>
<td>44.82</td>
<td>45.098</td>
<td>45.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Married</td>
<td>50.9</td>
<td>50.4</td>
<td>49.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Children</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.855</td>
<td>0.837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Family Income</td>
<td>31,721</td>
<td>32,112</td>
<td>31,715</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Own Home</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>58.83</td>
<td>57.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Own Farm/Business</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>9.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Checking/Savings</td>
<td>74.6</td>
<td>74.5</td>
<td>76.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Credit Debt</td>
<td>51.5</td>
<td>53.2</td>
<td>54.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Own other Real Est.</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>12.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Own Stock</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>18.47</td>
<td>18.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% With Retirement Accts.</td>
<td>26.4</td>
<td>25.9</td>
<td>25.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Testing the Equality of Means.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>0.6008</td>
<td>7679</td>
<td>0.4897</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>0.5883</td>
<td>7819</td>
<td>0.4922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>0.5719</td>
<td>8087</td>
<td>0.4948</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Test Statistic</th>
<th>t criterion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2003 = 2005</td>
<td>1.5719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005 = 2007</td>
<td>2.0951</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Do not reject $H_0$ of equality of means.
from year to year. For example, the total family income remains relatively static from 2003 to 2007. A lack of change is expected from the data because serious fluctuations would not be likely to occur in only two years. Also, after monitoring the data, it is safe to say that these values do look as if they represent the U.S. as a whole. For example, according to Wikipedia the percentage of home ownership in the U.S. in 2008 was 67.8% (a percentage which is relatively close to the % Own Home value in table 1 and has been shown not to statistically change). Lastly, and importantly, the high home ownership implies that the fall in the housing market would affect household wealth.

Wealth Calculations

A benefit of this micro-dataset is its detailed survey of income and the value of current assets owned by the households. These results allow for efficient computation of wealth. As previously stated, wealth is the equivalent to owner’s equity in accounting. Therefore, by adding up all assets and subtracting all liabilities, wealth can be obtained (e.g., Samphantharak and Townsend 2010). Presumably, housing is a critical component of wealth along with stocks, bonds, etc. Each component is calculated by using similar methods. For example, consider a house which is worth $378,000. To calculate the wealth in this home first take the value of the home ($378,000) and subtract from it the annual property tax (say, $5,000) and whatever is left to be paid on the mortgage. Therefore if the owner has completely paid off the home the wealth in the home would be $373,000 ($378,000 - $5,000 - 0). Calculations similar to this are used to compute each of the wealth components. Once each component is computed it can then be added (if assets) or subtracted (if liabilities) to compute total wealth.

Table 3 displays the components which make up total wealth for the years 2003, 2005, and 2007. Main home and other real estate make up the largest part of total wealth. A very sharp increase in wealth is seen from 2003 to 2005, followed by smaller growth from 2005 to 2007. The first seven components (Main Home – Other) are asset components while the final component (Credit Debt) is a liability component. By adding up all asset components and subtracting all liability components total wealth is calculated. One key thing to note is that leading up to 2007, American households saw large increases in wealth, due to increases in the real estate market.

To get a better understanding of how important each wealth component is, Figure 1 illustrates their percentages from 2003, 2005, and 2007. We see again that real estate makes up the largest component of wealth at roughly 72%. The next largest is stock, which makes up about 8%. Slightly smaller than stock is farm or business. Debt subtracts about 2% from wealth. Because wealth is determined primarily by real estate, it is useful to see how home values (presumably affected by the financial crisis) are related to wealth. Figure 2 plots home values to my calculations of wealth. We see that wealth consistently tracks home value. Interestingly, the growth of home prices and thus wealth are slowing by 2007. This matches the beginning of the timeline of the financial crisis presented at the Federal Reserve Timeline.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3. Real Per-Person Wealth.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Components of wealth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Real Estate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm or Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stock</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Checking/Savings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retirement Accounts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit Debt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Wealth</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
To get a better understanding of how important each wealth component is, Figure 1 illustrates their percentages from 2003, 2005, and 2007. We see again that real estate makes up the largest component of wealth at roughly 72%. The next largest is stock, which makes up about 8%. Slightly smaller than stock is farm or business. Debt subtracts about 2% from wealth.

Because wealth is determined primarily by real estate, it is useful to see how home values (presumably affected by the financial crisis) are related to wealth. Figure 2 plots home values to my calculations of wealth. We see that wealth consistently tracks home value. Interestingly, the growth of home prices and thus wealth are slowing by 2007. This matches the beginning of the timeline of the financial crisis presented at the Federal Reserve Timeline.

Obviously, the wealth calculations are obscuring some important microeconomic facts. It is known that a large segment of the population do not own real estate (or any other assets). Additionally, to get a better microeconomic understanding, the sample is divided into three subgroups and the descriptive statistics for these age groups are presented Table 4. The age groups are young (18-30), middle (31-55), and old (56 and up). The table shows that the older age group is more heavily invested in home ownership at 77%. The middle-aged are less wealthy, but have more income. Presumably, part of this income is being diverted to wealth when they are older. Finally, the young are relatively divested from wealth. Only 30% have any home equity.

Several conclusions can be drawn regarding the previous tables and figures. First, from Table 3 and Figure 1, real estate is the largest wealth component. Main Home makes up roughly 42% of total wealth, while Other Real Estate makes up 30%. When combined, real estate makes up a majority 72% of total wealth. For this reason, it can be expected that a collapse in the housing market would severely harm the wealth profiles of the survey participants. A second conclusion which can be seen in Table 3, is that the wealth components, as a percentage of total wealth, remain relatively stagnant from year to year. People typically do not prefer drastic change, especially when the change occurs in wealth. Therefore people typically invest the same percentages into each wealth component from year to year. This implies that there is a smoothing behavior within the households’ allocation of wealth. Lastly, Table 4 shows that the older households are heavily invested in housing and have little income. Whereas, the young are divested in housing. This suggests that the older households would be affected the most by the financial crisis. Alternately, the young would be affected the least.

Toward this end, using the collected PSID data, the regression presented in equation (1) is estimated via OLS.
Table 4. Household Descriptive Statistics by Age Group.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Young</th>
<th>Middle</th>
<th>Old</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>25.75</td>
<td>42.91</td>
<td>68.69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Married</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Children</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>0.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Family Income</td>
<td>21,300</td>
<td>36,646</td>
<td>28,932</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Own Home</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Farm or Business</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Checking or Savings</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Credit Debt</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Other Real Estate</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Stock</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Retirement Accounts</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 represents the regression results. As is seen the regression results, R-squared is 0.0691. The F value is 569.68 and it maintains significance at a level less than 0.0001. Vhome2, the explanatory variable, has a correlation coefficient of about 1.749. This would indicate that home value has a positive relationship with total wealth. The variable Vhome2 also has a p-value of less than 0.0001 and is therefore significant.

The results of Table 4 can be used to generate a forecast of 2009 wealth using the 2009 home price data provided by the PSID. By using the correlation coefficient for the Vhome2 variable, an estimation for 2009 wealth can be obtained. The change in the value of home from 2007 to 2009 is -$14,870. This value is multiplied by the correlation coefficient. The resulting value is -$26,005. Therefore, the calculations show

Wealth = α + β * home price + Error

In equation (1), wealth is the dependent variable. The explanatory variable is home price. The coefficient β is the marginal effect of home price on wealth. If, as expected, β is positive then an increase in home value will lead to an increase in wealth. Parameter α represents the intercept. The intercept is the average of wealth if home price is zero (i.e. a renter). Parameter α is expected to be positive.
Table 5. Regression Statistics.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R-Square</td>
<td>0.0691</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adj. R-Sq.</td>
<td>0.0690</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Error</td>
<td>7541.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obs.</td>
<td>7679</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ANOVA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>SS</th>
<th>MS</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Significance F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Regression</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.751</td>
<td>1.751</td>
<td>569.68</td>
<td>&lt; .0001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residual</td>
<td>7677</td>
<td>2.36</td>
<td>3.074</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>7678</td>
<td>2.535</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>df</th>
<th>Parameter Est.</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>t stat</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14314</td>
<td>7541.83</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>0.0577</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vhome2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.74884</td>
<td>0.073</td>
<td>23.87</td>
<td>&lt; .0001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

that wealth fell by $26,005. Figure 3 plots the response.

There are several conclusions which derive from the regression analysis. First, there is a decrease in home value from 2007 to 2009, thus causing a large decrease in total wealth. To be exact, wealth suffered during these years as it fell by approximately $26,000. This is quite a large amount, very near the amount it might cost to purchase a new car. Average total family income is roughly $32,000. Therefore American households suffered a wealth loss very near a year’s worth of income, which takes many years to make up.

Conclusions

The 2007 financial crisis is the largest economic downturn since the Great Depression of the 1930s. Economists study the crisis to gain a better understanding of its effects, including the topic focused on in this paper: its effect on household wealth. Three main conclusions in the current research are as follows. First, housing makes up a substantial percentage of overall wealth at roughly 72%. Second, the financial crisis has caused a large decrease in household wealth of about $26,000. Third, older households (those of age 56 and up) have suffered the most from the crisis due to their deeper investment in housing and other markets. For this reason, benefits targeted to older households would appear to be a policy conclusion. How to successfully implement such a policy is a question left for further research.
Figure 3. Home Value with Wealth.

References

Panel Study of Income Dynamics: Public Release Family File Codebook
“More Than a Hamburger and a Cup of Coffee”: Connecting the NAACP Youth Councils and College Chapters to the Tennessee Sit-in Demonstrations

Denise Harris
Dr. Thomas L. Bynum
History Department

The National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP) is one of the leading organizations in the fight for racial equality. However, many historians highlight the organization’s efforts concerning legislative change, and fail to emphasize the NAACP’s participation in grassroots activism, and this overlooked information has fueled a widely held belief that the NAACP is moderately conservative. In an effort to dispel this misconception, the research presented focuses on the role of the NAACP Youth Councils and College Chapters in the sit-in demonstrations that took place in Tennessee. The iconic sit-ins of Nashville and Memphis had a significant amount of NAACP youth participation while other regions of the state had less participation.

Since its inception in 1909, the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP) has been considered one of the leading organizations in the fight for racial equality. Generally, historians and other scholars have focused on the NAACP’s efforts to achieve civil rights through the courts but have failed to emphasize the organization’s grassroots direct-action activism. This narrow view of the NAACP working solely through the courts to achieve racial equality has fueled a widespread belief that the organization was moderately conservative and rarely participated in the grassroots direct-action demonstrations during the civil rights movement. In reality, the organization was involved in direct action to a significant degree. This research examines the role of the NAACP youth councils and college chapters in the Tennessee sit-in demonstrations, specifically demonstrations in Nashville, Chattanooga, Knoxville and Memphis.

At the 1960 White House Conference on Children and Youth, 1,800 delegates from youth and student organizations nationwide declared civil rights the number one issue facing American youth that decade. Indeed, the year had been one of the most explosive for youth activism, marked by a wave of student demonstrations to desegregate dining and other facilities throughout the South that year. However, this kind of student protest was not a new phenomenon in the history of black protest. Boycotts, picketing, sit-ins and other forms of protest were tactics used by students during the 1930s and 1940s to break down racial discrimination and segregation in various parts of the United States. For example, in the early 1940s, the Howard University NAACP Chapter staged a successful sit-in demonstration that desegregated Little Palace Cafeteria, a restaurant near the campus.

In the decades preceding the 1960 sit-in demonstrations, African-Americans also witnessed several events that would establish a precedent for increased activism in years to come. In 1954, the Brown v. Board of Education of Topeka, Kansas decision outlined the detriments of segregated schooling and allowed black children an equal opportunity to a non-segregated public education. The following year, the brutal murder of Emmet Till, a 14-year-old Chicago native who was visiting his family in Money, Mississippi, alarmed the nation and exposed the South’s violent and racist nature. And in 1956, the Montgomery bus boycott displayed the power of organized protest and offered civil rights leaders and organizations a blueprint for which to


2 Thomas L. Bynum, “‘Our Fight Is For Right’: The NAACP Youth Councils and College Chapters’ Crusade for Civil Rights, 1936-1965” (Ph.D. diss., Georgia State University, 2007), 57.
construct a successful mass protest movement. All of these tension-filled events established an environment suitable for mass civil rights agitation across the United States, particularly in the South. Indeed, these episodes inspired an entire generation of black youth to take up the fight of their ancestors and use direct-action tactics to gain racial equality.

Early NAACP History

The NAACP has always expressed a concern for America’s black youth. In 1910, the organization released its first issue of the Crisis magazine, the NAACP’s official publication, which, under the editorial leadership of W.E.B. DuBois, “set forth those facts and arguments which show the danger of race prejudice, particularly as manifested today toward colored people.” The Crisis often highlighted exceptional youth on its covers, and in the youth sections it emphasized the academic excellence of young people in black communities around the nation. The youth section also discussed issues important to the lives of oppressed, impoverished or misrepresented youth, and encouraged the NAACP and community members to not only be aware of such issues, but to include American youth in the larger fight for racial equality.

During the 1930s, the NAACP attained legal victories in the Supreme Court and further established its status as the nation’s leading civil rights organization. Yet, criticism surfaced concerning the organization’s commitment to its youth and the absence of an effective youth program. One of the NAACP’s biggest critics was the organization’s executive secretary Walter White. White asserted that “one of the greatest weaknesses of the NAACP is that we have not yet learned to have, or at least have not had, an intelligent, well-integrated young people’s program for the twelve million Negroes in America, seeing the importance of doing something about segregation, lynching, and disenfranchisement, etc.”

He urged the organization to recognize the outstanding potential in American youth and harness its fresh, energetic power to fuel the fight for equality. White’s criticism became a challenge for the national organization and would be met by a young and vibrant woman, Juanita Jackson. A recent graduate of the University of Pennsylvania and founder of Baltimore’s City-Wide Young People Forum, Jackson delivered a passionate speech at the NAACP’s St. Louis convention in 1935 that urged its members to develop a national program specifically designed for the NAACP’s youth. The following September, the NAACP Youth Division was established and Jackson was named the division’s first youth director. She implemented a new structure in the NAACP youth division. Under her leadership, the existing “junior branches” were replaced with “junior youth councils,” “youth councils” and “college chapters.” Jackson’s ultimate goal was to increase youth participation because the junior branches had limited membership to young people from 14 to 21 years old. The junior youth councils provided membership to young people from 12 to 15, while the youth council was opened to young people from 16 to 25. The college chapters also enrolled students from 16 to 25 years of age. When youth members reached age 26, membership was transferred to the organization’s senior branches.

Additionally, the new youth division was not independent of the NAACP’s senior branches. A member of the local senior branch advised the junior and youth councils, while college chapters were supervised by the national youth division from the organization’s national office. Directives for youth divisions reflected those of the national organization, focused on “equal education opportunities, employment opportunities, civil liberties and antilynching legislation.” Recognizing the importance of youth mobilization, Jackson worked hard to push youth councils and college chapters to be active in the fight for civil rights. Although she would resign from her position in 1938, her skillful planning and exceptional organizing would always be credited for the NAACP youth division’s solid foundation.

In the decade following, NAACP youth activism continued to support the national organization’s legislative gains and civil rights campaigns, but activism on the part of NAACP youth councils and college chapters would increase significantly in the 1950s with the Brown decision. As previously mentioned, the Brown decision resulted in the Supreme Court ruling against segregation in public schooling and deemed the system unconstitutional. The decision changed America and forged a direct link between its youth and the country’s civil rights issues. Attorneys from the NAACP Legal Defense and Education Fund had fought to

3 Julian Bond, Roger Wood Wilkins, and Mildred Bond, NAACP: Celebrating a Century 100 Years in Pictures (Layton, Utah: Gibbs Smith, 2009), 177-182.
4 Ibid., 27.
7 Ibid., 490-491.
8 Ibid., 491.
9 Ibid., 493.
bring the case to the nation’s highest court for years, and the entire organization was prepared to push state governments to enforce integration. NAACP youth groups were quick to respond and they developed parental support systems to ease student hardships and conducted protests to combat segregationist aggression. For example, the Nashville NAACP youth council sponsored orientation workshops in July 1959 to prepare parents and students for school integration.10 Resistance would prove to be much more relentless than the NAACP anticipated and the organization, along with others, would fight for another decade before integration of all American public schools was achieved. Nevertheless, African-Americans drew inspiration from the Brown decision and saw an equal-opportunity America closer in view. In conjunction with school integration efforts, the youth councils and college chapters launched protest demonstrations to end discriminatory practices in public accommodations. These demonstrations were fueled by a different generation — one less patient, less hesitant and much younger.

Sit-In Demonstrations

Youth activism increased significantly during the 1960s and sit-ins were often the protest strategy of choice. In 1960, sit-ins were conducted in 156 cities and 15 southern and border states.11 These demonstrations were not a new type of protest and had been practiced by African American youths decades earlier. Yet their frequency increased during the early sixties, particularly in the South. Sit-in demonstrations were often staged at the lunch counters of several segregated eateries in the downtown areas of urban cities. Most sit-ins were conducted in this manner: a group of people would enter a segregated eating facility, take seats at the lunch counter, and would remain seated until forced to leave or arrested. They were usually physically assaulted, but, in few cases, served.12 As the sit-in demonstrations rapidly spread across the South and youth activism increased in momentum the NAACP’s youth councils and college chapters played a pivotal role in helping to break down racial discrimination and segregation in Tennessee. Tennessee’s capital city, Nashville considered itself racially progressive in comparison to other southern cities, and on the surface its black populace validated such a claim. Nashville’s black community “had an active NAACP chapter, a group of competent lawyers, two weekly newspapers, four colleges and a large middle and professional class.”13 In the years following the Brown decision, Nashville’s black community, like many in the South, pushed the city’s education board to enforce integration. Not only did the Nashville NAACP chapter work to end segregation in public education, it also worked to end discrimination in public accommodations.

Guided by invaluable lessons from James Lawson and his nonviolence workshops, student demonstrators in Nashville were prepared for their battle with segregation. Formed in the fall of 1959 by 10 of Lawson’s loyal students, the Nashville Student Movement (NSM) soon became one of city’s most active youth organizations. The NSM included students like John Lewis, Diane Nash and Marion Berry, who all became prominent student leaders in the civil rights movement. The Nashville Christian Leadership Conference (NCLC), an organization founded by Nashville minister Kelly Miller Smith in 1958, greatly influenced the NSM. NCLC functioned as Nashville’s leading civil rights organization from the late 1950s into the 1960s. Smith, who served as the local NAACP’s president from 1956 to 1958, was a well- respected member of Nashville’s black community and the pastor of the First Colored Baptist Church. His leadership and support of the students’ protest demonstrations would be extremely valuable to Nashville’s sit-in movement.14

After canvassing the local downtown businesses and several practice sit-ins at the workshops held by James Lawson in the winter of 1959, Nashville students were eager to conduct real sit-demonstrations in the city’s downtown eateries. Their chance came in February of the following year, just 12 days after North Carolina A&T students staged sit-ins in Greensboro.15 On February 13, 1960, over 100 protesters staged sit-ins at the lunch counters of McLellan, Woolworth and Kress department stores in downtown Nashville.16 Seven days later, nearly 200 more students sat-in at the lunch counters of Walgreens, Woolworths, Kress, McLellans and W.T. Grant department stores. Students staged more sit-ins on

14 Ibid., 119-120
15 Ibid., 124.
16 Nashville Public Library, Special Collections Division, Nashville Public Library Foundation, Nashville Sit-Ins, Beth Odle, Allen Forkum, compilers (Nashville: Nashville Public Library, 2010)
February 27 which resulted in the 79 arrests. On March 2, more students were arrested at the Greyhound Bus Station’s lunch counter.\textsuperscript{17} Demonstrations continued into April when the home of Z. Alexander Looby, a local NAACP lawyer, was bombed. Nashville’s black community was alarmed by such violence and over 3,000 protestors marched silently, in rows of three, to the Davidson County Courthouse. Nashville Mayor Ben West, who, in hopes of relieving the city’s tension, met the protestors and responded to controversial questions from student leader Diane Nash and civil rights leader C.T. Vivian. When asked by Nash if segregation was moral, Mayor West said no and stated that “it is immoral to discriminate.” He also asserted that he was not in support of segregation and that the lunch counters should be integrated.\textsuperscript{18}

Although the Greensboro sit-ins were the first to gain national media attention, the sit-ins that took place in Nashville were considered one of the most successful and well organized. The 1960 sit-in demonstrations in Greensboro were largely viewed as spontaneous, while those that took place in Nashville were the result of nonviolent training, discipline and dedication.\textsuperscript{19} Woolworth, Kress, McLellan, Walgreens and Harvey and Cain-Sloan’s department stores opened their lunch counter for integrated business in May 1960 after a six-week boycott by the city’s blacks. In almost four months, Nashville’s student activists had challenged the status quo and brought about needed change. The student activists had compelled Nashville to live up to its claim of being the most progressive city in the South, and more importantly, they had given other student activists all over the South a successful template upon which to draw guidance and inspiration for their own sit-in demonstrations.

\section*{NAACP and the Nashville Sit-Ins}

Although Nashville maintained an active NAACP branch, NAACP participation in the Nashville sit-in movement was very low initially. The NAACP national office and local branches provided financial support to sit-in movements throughout the South and such support was the organization’s major contribution to the Nashville student movement. In a speech given at Fisk University, Thurgood Marshall, one of the organization’s leading lawyers, encouraged “the total Negro population” to support student demonstrators.\textsuperscript{20} On behalf of the national organization, Marshall pledged financial support to the sit-in movement and reassured students that “if we [the NAACP] don’t have enough lawyers or money, we’ll get more.”\textsuperscript{21} Marshall went on to mention that in one week alone, the organization had contributed $150,000 in bond money to the sit-in movement.

Moreover, Z. Alexander Looby, also a member of the Nashville NAACP legal counsel, provided legal advice to the students and represented them in court. His legal skills were invaluable to the Nashville student protest movement. To further underscore the NAACP’s role in the sit-in demonstrations one needs to look no further than to Kelly Miller Smith, pastor of the First Colored Baptist Church. Smith was an active member of the NAACP and had served as the local chapter’s president for two years. The First Colored Baptist Church graciously hosted many of the nonviolent workshops that were taught by James Lawson, and Smith raised money in his church and the local community to support the movement.\textsuperscript{22}

In 1958, two years before Nashville students began the city’s sit-in movement, the local NAACP youth division boasted an impressive membership of 1,040.\textsuperscript{23} However, the numbers dropped in 1959. By January 1960, Nashville’s local NAACP chapter began to experience a decrease of public interest in the organization.\textsuperscript{24} Thersessa Whittaker, president of Nashville’s NAACP Youth Council, sent a letter to Southeast Regional Youth Secretary Julie Wright in 1961 expressing her concern for the organization’s image in Nashville. She wrote, “I am increasingly becoming more concerned that many people mistake caution and tact on the part of the NAACP as conservatism and fear. The fact that too many make this erroneous assumption is evidently damaging our total program.”\textsuperscript{25} Whittaker’s concern would prove meaningful in 1962 when active college chapters and youth councils became dormant or nonexistent.\textsuperscript{26}

\begin{footnotes}
\item[17] Ibid.
\item[18] Ibid.
\item[21] Ibid.
\item[22] Lovett, The Civil Rights Movement, 119-120.
\item[24] Letter from Nashville Intercollegiate Chapter, NAACP Papers, part 19, series D, reel 17.
\item[25] Letter from Theressa Whittaker, NAACP Papers, part 19, series D, reel 16.
\end{footnotes}
affiliated themselves with NSM or NCLC during the 1960 sit-ins. Diane Nash, one of Nashville’s finest student leaders was affiliated with the local NAACP but she, like many other NAACP youth members in Nashville during the time, claimed membership of more than one organization simultaneously.

Chattanooga Sit-In Demonstrations

Just six days after Nashville students staged their first sit-in, Chattanooga youth converged on downtown eateries to challenge segregated lunch counters. Chattanooga’s black population was quite established in the city and the community included “four Negro branch insurance companies, the only Negro-owned five-and-dime store in Tennessee, and dozens of beauty and barber shops, as well as dentists, druggists, doctors, a few lawyers, funeral directors, building contractors, school principals, postmen, schoolteachers, caseworkers and public health nurses and a few clerical workers.”27 In 1954, as the city was adjusting to the recent Brown decision, Chattanooga’s black community was fighting for better housing, paved streets and more black state employees.28 In 1957, Chatta nooga blacks focused their efforts on bus desegregation. By 1959, integrating public accommodations had not become a protest priority. The following year, however, the issue was pushed to the forefront and Chattanooga’s youth would begin their fight against segregated eating facilities.

On February 19, 1960, a small number of students from Howard High School staged a sit-in demonstration at the lunch counter of McLellan’s department store in downtown Chattanooga. Motivated by a recent class debate about the Nashville sit-ins, students decided to act on their thoughts. They were refused service at McLellan’s and the store closed its lunch counter to discourage the students from returning. Unmoved, they remained inside the store, sang freedom songs and prayed. The students left 30 minutes later with plans for the next demonstration underway. Three days later, and with greater numbers, the students staged another sit-in demonstration in downtown.

They were met by violence from outside segregationists on February 23 and city officials enforced restrictions to counter violence, which brought a pause to protest demonstrations until April. That month the sit-ins resumed at the lunch counters of W.T. Grant and Woolworth’s stores in the downtown area. On May 13, nearly 50 students were arrested after staging sit-ins at Woolworth and Kress department stores. Chattanooga blacks protested the student arrests and conducted marches around the city’s jail. After meetings were held with the local NAACP, the Council for Cooperative Action and the city mayor, four white youths were charged for assaulting demonstrators and placed on probation. Many of the other students jailed were released by bond payment. The fruits of student protest were seen in Chattanooga in August when seven stores opened their lunch counters for desegregated business.

NAACP and the Chattanooga Sit-Ins

The NAACP had an active history in Chattanooga, yet youth division participation in the Chattanooga sit-ins was fairly low. In 1947, the local NAACP won a court case that equalized teacher salaries in the city, which widened the black middle class.29 Also, one of the city’s leading black physicians, Perry A. Stephens, was a founding officer of the local NAACP and worked diligently to change the city’s accommodationist attitude by emphasizing the needs of Chattanooga blacks and promoting progressive gains through the organization’s membership. However, the local NAACP youth council was defunct until the 1960 sit-ins and with a less-concentrated area of black colleges than Nashville, the local branch had difficulty establishing NAACP college chapters in Chattanooga.30

During the 1960 sit-ins, the local NAACP chapter was in total support of student participants and served as the sole provider of legal assistance after students were arrested and placed on trial. Officials from the local NAACP branch met on February 24, the day after sit-in demonstrations ended in violence and student arrests, to discuss the role it would play as sit-ins continued. The officials from the Chattanooga NAACP decided to hold a mass meeting on February 28 to publicly state organization support of the Chattanooga sit-ins, its willingness to negotiate with local store management to end segregation, and its goal to organize youth activists and obtain white support.31 The mass meeting held on February 28 attracted over 650 people who were all briefed on the practice of nonviolent protest.

A few days later, youth field secretaries from the national NAACP office met with a group of Chattanooga protestors and encouraged the students to perform a number of tasks before reviving their demonstrations. For example, the students sent friends and family letters discourag-

28 Ibid., 148.
31 Ibid.
ing them from shopping in downtown stores, launched a membership campaign for the establishment of a Howard High School Youth Council and held a city-wide youth rally to “maintain interest and support.” 32 The Chattanooga NAACP participation remained constant throughout the student movement that took place in 1960 and many of its participants, unlike those in Nashville, openly pledged allegiance to the local NAACP and its youth councils.

The Knoxville Sit-In Demonstrations

In 1957, Knoxville’s black community was engaged in a drive for voter registration. Initiated by professors and students from the city’s only black college, Knoxville College, the campaign significantly increased the number of registered black voters in the Knoxville area.33 The city’s black population maintained a small middle class that included professors from Knoxville College and ministers from the city’s black churches. Knoxville’s black community was quite aware of the opportunities created by the 1954 Brown decision and decided to take advantage of them by the late 1950s.

On June 9, 1960, students from Knoxville College staged their first sit-ins after growing impatient with merchant negotiations. A protest was initially scheduled for February 15; however, for fear of losing support from moderate whites, adult leaders convinced students to wait. Knoxville’s mayor, John Duncan, persuaded the management of downtown businesses to desegregate but some backed out, opting to obtain approval first from owners based in New York. Duncan, along with student representatives and Knoxville Chamber of Commerce representatives, went to New York to negotiate an agreement with the store owners.

When store owners refused to meet with student representatives, the group returned to Knoxville empty-handed. Frustrated with such a stall in progress, students conducted a single-file march through downtown Knoxville to demonstrate their continued efforts. Five weeks after the June 6 sit-in demonstrations, downtown stores finally desegregated their lunch counters, giving the students confidence to continue to challenge Jim Crow in Knoxville.34

NAACP and the Knoxville Sit-Ins

Despite accusations of “outside agitation” by local newspapers, nonlocal adult NAACP activism in Knoxville was low during the 1960 sit-ins. Knoxville demonstrations in 1960 were rather peaceful and short. They were also successful without significant arrests or incidents of violence. Perhaps these characteristics alleviated a dire need of NAACP legal or financial support. The presence of the Knoxville Associated Council for Full Citizenship, an organization formed by a group of black leaders and professors to organize Knoxville’s sit-in movement, may have substituted for assistance from the local NAACP branch. Most of the NAACP youth participation came from the Knoxville College NAACP college chapter. This chapter was very supportive and active in the downtown demonstrations.

Memphis Sit-In Demonstrations

Memphis blacks suffered from an oppressed system of race relations in the area for nearly six decades. The city was run by Edward H. Crump, a hardcore segregationist, and his “well-oiled political machine.” 35 The Crump administration controlled the city’s government and kept the city conducive to white prosperity and detrimental to black advancement. Fifty-eight percent of Memphis’s black population suffered severely low wages, poor housing and lived in poverty. The other forty-two percent were middle class. By 1952, Memphis had 21 black schools, a Catholic elementary and high school, 31 physicians and surgeons and several Negro-owned funeral homes.36

Agitation for civil rights started in Memphis in 1951 with the establishment of the Ministers and Citizens League, an organization founded by black politicians J. E. Walker, Roy Love and G. W. Lee. These men began a voter registration campaign in 1951, which, by 1954, doubled the number of black registered voters to over 46,000.37 In April 1956, O.Z. Evers, one of Memphis’s leading civil rights figures, attempted desegregation of the city’s buses when he and a friend took front seats on a city bus. The bus driver told them to get off or find seats in the back. The men decided to get off the bus; however, Evers later sued the bus company. When his case reached the Six Circuit Court of Appeals, it was dismissed.38

The local NAACP also brought a lawsuit against the city in 1957 when Jesse H. Turner, a member of the local NAACP branch and Tri-State Bank vice president, was kicked out

---

32 Ibid. It must also be noted that there were active youth councils already present in other schools around the city.
33 Lovett, The Civil Rights Movement, 145.
34 Ibid., 146.
36 Ibid., 112.
37 Ibid., 114.
38 Ibid.
of a white-only public library. In 1959, O.Z. Evers and his Binghampton Civic League pushed city bus managers, and the local Greyhound station, to enforce laws mandating desegregated bus services. By the end of the year, black leaders and organizations in Memphis had challenged unfair housing practices, discriminatory practices of the city zoo, excessive police brutality in black communities and conducted a boycott of the city’s segregated fairgrounds.39 Nearly every aspect of black oppression had been challenged in the city. Jim Crow faced a serious threat in Memphis and the 1960 sit-ins further attacked the city’s oppressive racial system.

On March 18, 1960, students from LeMoyne College staged sit-in demonstrations at the lunch counter of McLellan’s department store in downtown Memphis. The store’s management quickly closed the eating area and students left the store peacefully. The next day, students from Owen Junior College, another one of the city’s black colleges, joined the protestors as they moved their demonstrations to white libraries downtown.40 Students also conducted sit-ins at one of the city’s white art galleries. Thirty-six students were arrested and held in jail overnight. More than 2,000 people were attracted to the demonstrations and the local courts later found the students guilty of disturbing the public.

The students became instant heroes within the local black community but still suffered from employer blacklisting, which cost some of them their jobs.41 The black community continued its fight for racial equality in Memphis over the next few years. In June 1961, more sit-ins were staged at Goldsmith, Bry, Lowenstein, Gerber and Walgreens’ stores. In May 1961, Memphis city government finally desegregated its public libraries. Between 1960 and 1962, 318 cases involving sit-in demonstrations appeared in the Memphis courts.42

Memphis saw the success of the lunch counter sit-ins in February 1962, when 30 eateries desegregated. According to an article published in the Tennessean, no arrests took place and no violence was reported, although there were high tensions as “most of the first-day customers were from a group selected by the Memphis chapter of the NAACP.”43

NAACP and the Memphis Sit-In Demonstrations

The Memphis NAACP was the largest in the South and boasted nearly 7,000 members, of which 655 were youth members.44 The local branch had an extremely active past in the city and played an instrumental role in the 1960 sit-ins. Maxine Smith, one of Memphis’s leading female activists, was a very active member of the Memphis branch. Smith began her service with the local branch in 1957 as “membership chairman, director of voter education, coordinator of sit-in demonstrations and executive secretary.”45 During the 1960 sit-ins, the local NAACP youth council participated in the downtown protests and served as pickets to discourage patronage of stores with segregated lunch counters.46 The local NAACP had contributed a great deal of support to the desegregation movement in Memphis. In 1961, it recruited more volunteer workers, staged more pickets and sent police brutality complaints to the U.S. Justice Department. The Memphis NAACP chapter also informed the FBI and the local police commissioner of police brutality and even convinced popular black musicians to cancel performances at local white clubs.47 With dedicated leaders and an active college chapter, the Memphis NAACP branch maintained an instrumental role in the city’s modern civil rights movement.

Conclusion

The explosion of sit-in demonstrations that moved across the South in 1960 marked a pivotal change in the modern civil rights movement. The tactics used were not new and young activists drew upon the skills and experiences of previous generations to construct an aggressive attack on southern Jim Crow practices. For the NAACP, the nation’s premier civil rights organization, the activism of its youth councils and college chapters encouraged the organization to recognize the potential, dedication and leadership of its young people. Even in cities like Nashville and Knoxville, where NAACP sit-in participation remained low in the 1960s, the local NAACP branches contributed financial support and legal assistance to the sit-in movement while endorsing direct action protests.

Thurgood Marshall recognized the importance of the sit-in movement and understood the motives of the demonstrators. In a speech given to Fisk students in April 1960, Marshall asserted that students were fighting for “more than a cup of coffee” and were no more impatient than Americans during the Boston Tea Party.48 The youth re-

39 Ibid, 114-118.
40 Ibid., 189.
41 Ibid, 189-190.
42 Ibid, 197.
44 Lovett, The Civil Rights Movement, 117.
45 Ibid., 118.
46 Ibid., 191.
47 Ibid., 196.
ognized numerous civil rights opportunities in the 1960s and made use of them with an aggressive fight for progressive change. In Memphis and Chattanooga, prominent figures of the cities’ black communities belonged to the local NAACP chapters and played significant roles in the coordination and sponsorship of student sit-in demonstrations.

NAACP youth in Tennessee displayed a great deal of dedication to the fight for racial equality and their successful demonstrations inspired youth groups in other areas of the South. With the support and guidance of local NAACP branches, and other civil rights organizations, sit-in demonstrations throughout the 1960s successfully tackled segregation at lunch counters, bus stations, public libraries and parks in Tennessee. The sit-movement encouraged NAACP adult leadership to embrace, provide support and recognize direct action tactics as a viable means to gaining equal rights.

Bibliography

Primary Sources


Secondary Sources


Websites


Unpublished Works

Inside the Criminal Minds of Highly Intelligent Fraudsters

Michael D. Harris
Dr. Mary Phillips
Accounting

The purpose of this research is to learn the mental factors that were involved in the fraudulent acts of Frank W. Abagnale, a highly experienced con artist, thief, impersonator, and check swindler; Jeffrey Skilling, the CEO of Enron; and Bernie Madoff, a stockbroker, investment advisor, and non-executive chairman of NASDAQ stock exchange. The factors for each individual were used to construct a model, and similarities and differences were analyzed. The results revealed several notable similarities: all three were highly skilled, intelligent individuals who experienced unhappy childhoods, lacked positive role models, and were motivated by money and power.

FRANK ABAGNALE, JEFF Skilling, and Bernie Madoff are three names associated with large-scale business frauds committed in the United States. These three criminals committed fraudulent acts that went undetected for years before they were indicted. Recent studies discuss the background and details of the crimes committed, but do not focus on the decision-making processes for these three individuals. The purpose of this research is to examine and compare these processes for the three individuals. Starting with childhood, numerous events occurred that affected Abagnale, Skilling, and Madoff. It is important to note these particular events, because similarities in individual and motivational characteristics as well as opportunities could provide warning signs leading to fraudulent acts.

This paper is organized in the following way: first, we present earlier research and the development of the model on which our analysis is based. Next, we provide background on each of the crimes committed, and finally we apply our decision-making model to each individual and compare the results.

Literature Review and Model Development

Prior research shows several recurring factors involved in an individual’s decision-making process. Williams and Matthewman (1999) believe that the need to achieve results and the desire for new opportunities are the leading motivations in the process. Others believe that a person’s character is the most essential aspect influencing an individual’s decision-making process (Richardson 2000). A person’s character is the driving force and gives direction and meaning to one’s life, as well as a sense of right and wrong. However, if one does not feel acceptance by others, temptations arise to try to disguise the true self. A sense of acceptance can affect decisions that are made on a day-to-day basis. For example, Frank Abagnale did not accept himself for who he was, so he assumed various disguises to change the way he appeared to other people, including his career and background. A lack of ethical training can also influence an individual’s decision-making process. Jewe (2008) blames unethical decision-making on the lack of ethics education in schools: “For those individuals lacking experience in the ethical components of decision-making, the current level of ethics training provided in business schools is not adequate to make ethics a habit” (Jewe 2008, 1).

Ferrell, Gresham and Fraedrich (1989) developed a model for ethical decision-making, which they adapted from their Ferrell and Gresham 1985 model (see Figure 1). This model illustrates the interaction between the nature of the ethical issue and the characteristics of the individual, significant others, and opportunities. The significant others are those to whom the individual is exposed to for a period of time. For example, co-workers and top management are considered to be significant others as well as family members and friends. Setting boundaries between the individual and significant others could have either a positive or negative effect on the decision-making process of that person.

Individual characteristics included in the Ferrell, Gresham and Fraedrich model are knowledge, values, attitudes, and intentions. Many individuals are influenced by what is learned through education, moral philosophies,
Individual Backgrounds

Frank W. Abagnale

Frank W. Abagnale was a highly skilled check swindler and impersonator. At the age of 15, he committed the first of many criminal acts. He conned his father for $3,400 by purchasing tires and gas on his father’s credit card, and then instead of taking the tires and gas, he took the money instead. After this criminal act went unpunished, conning others for his own benefit became a game he could easily win over time. At the age of 16, he ran away from home.
Middle Tennessee State University - Summer 2011

and had to work dead-end jobs with minimum pay. Since he knew he would not get much of a paycheck, he used the skills obtained in graphic arts school to alter his birth date on various legal documents and leap ten years in age in one night. He started cashing checks from his checking account with Chase Morgan Bank and began writing several bad checks daily (Abagnale and Redding 2000).

Abagnale justified his actions, saying that “if people were stupid enough to cash a check without verifying its validity, they deserved to be swindled (Abagnale and Redding 2000, 25).” For the most part, he took advantage of banks, due to their employees’ lack of knowledge of their own occupation.

The impersonations continued undetected for more than four years because Abagnale would change his identity and move to different cities over time. By doing so, it was very difficult to catch him because no one knew his physical appearance and location. He avoided returned bad checks by learning the system and how to duplicate checks of all kinds. While posing as a different person with a specific job title, he learned how people of a particular profession talked, carried themselves and acted. Every detail counted to Abagnale, and because of that, he was a flawless impersonator.

Abagnale forged $2.5 million in checks in 20 foreign countries and the United States. He eventually served six months in one of Europe’s harshest prisons, the Perpignan House of Arrest in France, as well as some time at Malmo in Sweden (Abagnale and Redding 2000). After serving his time in two countries, other countries where he had committed crimes wanted Abagnale as well. Within months, however, he was transported back to the United States where he served five years of a 12-year sentence, having been indicted on seven counts of fraud (Abagnale and Redding 2000). Due to his skills in forging checks, the FBI granted him early release on the condition that he agree to help catch other criminals.

During the first six years of his new life, Abagnale impersonated a professor, a Pan Am pilot, a pediatrician, an attorney, and in one situation, an FBI agent. He said that he did all of these impersonations in search of himself and happiness. Unlike most criminals, Abagnale was not obsessed with power and money, but he needed money since he was enamored by women and living a glamorous life.

Jeffrey Skilling

Jeffrey Skilling was the brains behind the scandal at Enron. During his teenage years, he worked up to 50 hours a week while attending school. Skilling was tagged as a...
nerd and “a bit of a loner” and “tortured soul” (McLean and Elkind 2004, 29). However, he graduated from high school in the top 5 percent of his class of 600. All the money he made was invested in the stock market during his teenage years, and he was already becoming a risk-taker and a gambler.

Skilling joined Enron in June 1990, after having gained valuable management experience at McKinsey and Company. His specialty in the business was trading natural gas and energy, and he began as a consultant. He worked his way up the chain of command to chairman and CEO of Enron Finance Corporation. A year later, he took the position of chairman of Enron Gas Services Company, and in 1995 became CEO & director of Enron Capital & Trade Resources. Finally, in 2001, Skilling became CEO of Enron. He gained these positions in such a short time due to his big ideas, knowledge of gas and energy, and his outstanding performance. With soaring profits, Enron was viewed as one of the top businesses in the country.

Analysts believed in the integrity of Enron’s financial statements (McLean and Elkind 2004). However, Enron was able to mislead them because he had obtained approval from the SEC for mark-to-market accounting, which allowed Enron to record enormous profits. Only top management was aware of the deception. Most Enron employees and outside investors assumed that Enron was performing exceptionally well. Overall, Skilling was primarily responsible for the cover-up of Enron, and he was convicted on 19 of 35 counts of conspiracy, fraud and false statements. He is still serving his sentence of 24.5 years (Tolson and Fesser 2004).

**Bernie Madoff**

Bernie Madoff was a man who knew how to make money. During his teenage years, though, Madoff was not really outstanding in school and “lived in the shadow of his best friend” (Kirtzman 2009, 23). Madoff grew up feeling as if he had to prove others wrong about himself. People did not realize his potential to produce large amounts of money (Kirtzman 2009). Madoff was fascinated by the stock market, and his main goal was to be the next big hit on Wall Street. Throughout his twenties, he was trading stocks, and at the age of 22, Bernard L. Madoff Investment Securities was born (Kirtzman 2009). Madoff started small, but over time his business grew tremendously, and he obtained many of his clientele by word of mouth. He attracted other people’s money by using the strike split conversion strategy.¹ He attracted clients not only because of his reputation, but also because of the return percentage he guaranteed. Once new clients invested money with Madoff, the money they invested was used to pay off the old clients. This act continued until his business was revealed as a Ponzi scheme.²

Madoff was able to continue this scheme for years due to his reputation and his skill in covering up reality. Suspicion was raised when Harry Markopolos, a mathematician, tried to duplicate Madoff’s split-strike conversion strategy and was unable to do so. As a result of failing to duplicate the strategy, he later tried to convince the Securities and Exchange Commission of Madoff’s probable Ponzi scheme. If he had been taken seriously, Harry Markopolos would have brought down Madoff years earlier, but no one listened to him. According to Markopolos, “Madoff had too many lawyers, and those who were supposed to be financial experts, turned out to be more lawyers” (Davis 2010, 24). Therefore, Madoff was well protected, and since he was a major power (non-executive chairman) at NASDAQ, no one thought to question his success (Kirtzman 2009).

Andy and Mark Madoff, Bernie Madoff’s sons, reported Bernie Madoff to the authorities. Once Bernie Madoff confessed his crime to his sons, they met with their lawyer, and he encouraged them to report Bernie as soon as possible. The Madoff brothers did this out of fear that the authorities would arrest them and think they had a part in Madoff’s deception. Markopolos was finally recognized for his exposure of Madoff. Instantly, many people who invested with Madoff lost all of their money, which totaled in the billions. On June 29, 2009, Madoff went to trial in a Manhattan court. Due to the severity of his crime, the court sentenced him to a term of imprisonment of 150 years (Kirtzman 2009).

**Models and Explanations**

Using the revised model adapted from the Ferrell, Gresham and Fraedrich (1989), we analyze each of the three criminals. Each model contains factors that we believe contributed to the decisions made by Abagnale, Skilling, and Madoff. We analyze individual factors, motivational factors, opportunity factors and consequences for each of the criminals in the study, beginning with Abagnale.

**Individual Factors**Abagnale committed many of his criminal acts during childhood. Before he took the path of a con man, he lived an average life with the support of both parents until they divorced. Abagnale was a high school dropout and obtained the majority of his knowledge from experience. His intentions were to swindle

---

¹ An algorithm of stock and options trading that, he said, allowed him to limit losses and produce consistent returns whether the market moved up or down.

² Money from new clients is used to pay older clients while the swindler takes money for himself off the top.
Abagnale said the following about his ability as a con artist: Top con artists, whether they’re pushing hot paper or hawking phony oil leases, are well dressed and exude an air of confidence and authority. Observation is a skill that can be developed, but I was born blessed (or cursed) with the ability to pick up on details and items the average man overlooks. The third factor is research, the big difference between the hard-nosed criminal and the super con man. In my heyday as a hawker of hot paper, I knew as much about checks as any teller employed in any bank in the world and more than the majority. (Abagnale and Redding 2000, 129)

Abagnale deceived many people through his various impersonations and falsification of data. He was a professional con artist and forged checks in order to get the money he needed to continue his deceptive lifestyle.

Top con artists, whether they’re pushing hot paper or hawking phony oil leases, are well dressed and exude an air of confidence and authority. Observation is a skill that can be developed, but I was born blessed (or cursed) with the ability to pick up on details and items the average man overlooks. The third factor is research, the big difference between the hard-nosed criminal and the super con man. In my heyday as a hawker of hot paper, I knew as much about checks as any teller employed in any bank in the world and more than the majority. (Abagnale and Redding 2000, 129)

**Ethical Issue.** Abagnale deceived many people through his various impersonations and falsification of data. He was a professional con artist and forged checks in order to get the money he needed to continue his deceptive lifestyle.

**Opportunity Factors.** During the years while Abagnale was active, there was less fraud prevention in place than we have currently after the passage of Sarbanes-Oxley in 2002. Due to his knowledge and hands-on experience, he was able to pose as various professionals, such as a doctor and a pilot. In addition, he was able to forge checks flawlessly due to the information he obtained about the banking system.

Abagnale said the following about his ability as a con artist: Top con artists, whether they’re pushing hot paper or hawking phony oil leases, are well dressed and exude an air of confidence and authority. Observation is a skill that can be developed, but I was born blessed (or cursed) with the ability to pick up on details and items the average man overlooks. The third factor is research, the big difference between the hard-nosed criminal and the super con man. In my heyday as a hawker of hot paper, I knew as much about checks as any teller employed in any bank in the world and more than the majority. (Abagnale and Redding 2000, 129)

**Ethical Issue.** Abagnale deceived many people through his various impersonations and falsification of data. He was a professional con artist and forged checks in order to get the money he needed to continue his deceptive lifestyle.

**Consequences.** Inspector Joseph Shea finally tracked down Abagnale. Although Abagnale outsmarted Inspector Shea numerous times, he eventually was caught, and was indicted on seven counts of fraud and served five years. **Individual Factors.** During Jeff Skilling’s childhood, he
was exceptionally smart and thought school was boring, and he graduated in the top five percent of his class of 600 students. He worked countless hours throughout school, starting at age 14. As he got closer to his twenties, he developed a passion for the stock market, and before the age of 21, Skilling gambled all his money on stocks and lost it all. Skilling, even before Enron, had a gambling problem and was a risk taker.

**Motivational Factors.** Skilling, like many others wanted more power and money. He was successful in doing so, because of his intelligence and experience working for McKinsey & Co. (a consulting firm). Skilling received his first taste of power at McKinsey when he became a partner. Years later he became director. Taking on these roles caused Skilling to want more power. By the time he took the position as CEO of Enron, he had made millions of dollars.

**Opportunity Factors.** Skilling was intelligent (Harvard degree) and had excellent prior business experience. His skill and experience enabled him to develop mark-to-market accounting, his biggest opportunity, which contributed to the bankruptcy of Enron. With mark-to-market accounting, values that Enron chose to record were whatever Enron wanted them to be. For a long period of time, no one questioned Enron regarding its methods nor considered the company to be committing fraudulent acts.

**Ethical Issue.** Skilling and others in top management at Enron deceived everyone outside the company, convincing them that they were doing exceptionally well in the market. They also deceived the employees of Enron, who had invested their retirement funds in Enron stock. Employees lost their retirement funds in addition to their jobs when Enron’s stock fell dramatically as the fraud unfolded.

**Consequences.** Following a report by Bethany McLean, a journalist at Fortune Magazine, people started to question Enron’s phenomenal success in the market. In addition, Skilling damaged Enron’s professional outlook, through his remarks to McLean. An investigation and subsequent trial ensued, and Skilling was charged with 19 of the 35 counts and currently is serving 24.5 years.

**Individual Factors.** As a child, Madoff was pressured to succeed, and he felt he had to prove himself to everyone. He

---

**Figure 4**

Jeff Skilling

![Diagram showing the decision-making process involving individual factors, motivational factors, opportunity factors, consequences, and ethical issues.](image-url)
worked, installing sprinkler systems, during the times other kids played. According to Kirtzman (2009, 20), “he was a fairly popular kid, but he was an average to poor student – a huge negative in the world of Laurelton, where the children were expected to live out their parents’ single-minded drive for upward mobility.” In his hometown, going to school to be a doctor or lawyer was considered a success. Academics were not his strong point, but Madoff excelled with money. He enrolled in law school, but there was no passion or interest in it. Instead, Madoff dropped out of school and pursued his passion, and Bernard L. Madoff Securities was born (Kirtzman 2009). Madoff worked and saved what he earned. Throughout his career, hard work was evident, because without it he would not have been able to get others to invest in him. In his business, Madoff valued his customers and the quality of the investments, and he was driven by the will to win.

**Motivational Factors.** Madoff’s parents ran a rogue stock operation in their home, and Madoff helped his family and learned the trade of selling stock. He discovered that money could be the key to his happiness (Kirtzman 2009). In addition to money, Madoff was driven by what people thought about him. His reputation grew, and he became known as the best person to handle investments. Over the years, he went from dreaming about Wall Street to being a Wall Street tycoon.

**Opportunity Factors.** After his success on Wall Street, Madoff’s group founded the National Association of Securities Dealers Automated Quotations (NASDAQ) (Kirtzman 2009). NASDAQ allowed traders to post their quotes on the computer for the world to see. With this new market in place, Madoff’s business struck gold. People started to respect Madoff more and referred to him as “the king of democratization” on Wall Street (Kirtzman 2009, 51). He was known for the accomplishments and success of Bernard L. Madoff Securities.

**Ethical Issue.** Madoff deceived all his clients and others through his Ponzi scheme. All of the data, stock market results, and increases in clientele investment were falsified information from the day the clients decided to invest money with Bernie Madoff. He sacrificed his own integrity and reputation due to his search for power, money and respect.

**Consequences.** Harry Markopolos, a financial investigator for Rampart Investment Management of Boston, was the first to expose Madoff, and if he had been taken seriously, many lives would not have been shattered. Years later when Madoff felt the end approaching, he explained to his sons what he had been doing, and they reported him to the authorities. Madoff was convicted of
11 criminal charges, and billions of dollars were lost instantaneously. Due to his undetected crime, many of his clients were devastated because of the loss of their money.

Conclusions

If we examine the individual factors for the three cases, we see that all three criminals were very intelligent, but each had an unhappy childhood and lacked a positive role model as well. Abagnale actually started his life of crime as a child. Skilling was a loner and an unhappy child, while Madoff was pressured to succeed and felt he had to prove himself to his parents and others. Madoff’s family was involved in illegal stock operations, so he learned how to cheat early in life at home.

The common motivation for all three was money. Abagnale came from a poor family and started his life of impersonation early so he could earn more money than he could have earned with his own identity. He viewed money as a way to attract beautiful women. Skilling was a risk taker and was motivated by money as well as power. He strived to reach the top of the firms where he worked. Madoff believed that money was the key to happiness, and he risked his reputation and integrity in order to make billions.

The common thread in the opportunities for each of these three criminals is their high level of skill, which of course is related to their high level of intelligence. Abagnale was very skilled as an observer of detail. This allowed him to mimic every detail of the professionals he impersonated. Also, this skill helped him to perfectly forge checks, so he could continue to fund his lifestyle. Skilling was a high achiever with a great deal of knowledge about the oil and gas industry and about management as well. He rose to the top level in any organization where he worked. Madoff was well-respected for founding NASDAQ and for bringing high yields to his clients. Madoff knew the stock market from the inside out and was able to carry off his Ponzi scheme unsuspected for years.

We build on the Ferrell, Gresham and Fraedrich (1989) model to construct a model for each individual. We look at individual factors, motivational factors, opportunity factors and consequences related to the ethical issues faced by each criminal. We find several notable similarities: all three were highly skilled, intelligent individuals who experienced unhappy childhoods, lacked positive role models, and were motivated by money and power.

References


Calamitous Kurds: Prospects for Conflict in Kurdistan

Adrian Nicholas Mackie

Dr. Karen Petersen
Department of Political Science

The democratic peace theory (democratic states seldom if ever go to war against each other) has been resilient, and it has held for centuries. There are, however, theoretical indications that peace among democracies will be severely tested in the Middle East. One region — Kurdistan — in particular is a potential focal point for violence between democracies, as suggested by the literature in international politics.

The U.S.-led invasion of Iraq in 2003 has left an indelible impact on the Middle East, and the ramifications of U.S. actions in the region are likely to resonate in the coming decades. Currently, the United States is committed to the removal of all armed forces from Iraq by December 31, 2011 and a substantial decrease in forces by the end of August 31, 2010 (DeYoung: 2009; Mason: 2009). What will remain after withdrawal are questions about the stability of Iraq in the future and the viability of the new democratic system that has been instituted. The consequences of U.S. troop withdrawal may affect potential flash points between the Sunni and Shia populations, conflicts between the Baghdad government and the Kurdish Regional Government (KRG), threats of regional interference, and the possibility of civil war or internal strife as various groups compete for resources, power, and identity.

Iraq faces three options for the future — successful democracy, autocracy, or dissolution into smaller polities such as an independent Kurdistan and a much smaller Iraq. Additionally, while the democratic peace theory suggests that the institution of democratic regimes reduces conflict or at least associates democracy with the notion of peace, Iraq may in fact be more prone to conflict and pose a threat to its surrounding neighbors and be threatened by its neighbors in turn (Petersen and Saunders: 2009).

There are striking examples of mixed emotions among the Iraqi population with respect to the newly established democracy. In July 2010 there were attacks on a group of Shiite pilgrims during a religious holiday and the support for democracy is clear in a quote from one of the widows following the attacks: “Those who benefit from such acts are the enemies of humanity, the enemies of democracy” (Jordanian Times: 2010). In the same newspaper there was another article discussing the perceptions of the U.S. invasion of Iraq and, again, one of the widows was quoted: “This is what we got from occupation and the dreams of democracy: Orphans, widows, homeless, displaced and fugitives” (Jordanian Times: 2010). The contrast here only foreshadows the volatile future that Iraq faces.

A critical piece to the puzzle of the future of Iraq is the Kurdish population to the north which has benefited from de facto autonomy throughout the war in Iraq. The establishment of the KRG has created an unprecedented opportunity for the Kurds of northern Iraq to gain considerable headway in securing some form of permanent autonomy. However, with the many cleavages of potential conflict, the Kurdish question threatens not only the integrity of the Iraqi government but also of regional powers, especially Turkey, which borders Iraq to the north and has a sizable Kurdish population.

This paper will address the likelihood of the Kurds to become a focal point of conflict or a calamitous cleavage for the future of Iraq and for the Kurds themselves. The following section will include a brief discussion of the democratic peace theory as it applies to Iraq and the prospects of political stability in the region. Through this framework, the question of the political positioning of the Kurds will be addressed with particular emphasis on their development between 1991 and the present.

Democratic Peace?

In a Special Session of Congress, Woodrow Wilson stated, “Neutrality is no longer feasible or desirable where the peace of the world is involved and the freedom of its peoples,
and the menace to that peace and freedom lies in the existence of autocratic governments backed by organized force which is controlled wholly by their will, not by the will of their people.” Later in his speech, Wilson stated that lasting peace cannot exist except by a partnership of democratic nations (65th Congress, Document No. 5: 1917). His words did not resonate so eloquently in the speeches of George W. Bush and the invasion of Iraq but certainly seem to apply to the idealistic view of U.S. involvement in the “War on Terror.”

Wilson’s statements perhaps most succinctly summarize the democratic peace theory, which stems from Immanuel Kant’s notion of “Perpetual Peace” proposed in 1795 and has roots in Aristotle. It is a simple concept which suggests that democracies rarely go to war with one another. However, over the decades it has been amended to suggest that democracies most certainly will go to war with autocracies or be more prone to conflict when democracies are still nascent (Petersen and Saunders: 2009). More importantly, democratic peace theory suggests that other forms of government are more prone to war. This theory has been the underpinning of many administrations in the United States government and, according to Jack Levy, is the closest thing to an empirical law in international relations (Owen: 2005).

One important critique of the democratic peace theory is the location of the democracy in relationship to other democracies or autocracies. It should be noted that while the theory has its shortcomings, there has been no other theory proposed which adequately replaces it. Consequently, how does the democratic peace theory stand up to the future of Iraq? After all, theories are supposed to suggest potential outcomes but as Petersen and Saunders point out, Iraq may not fit the theory due to its geographical and political positioning in the Middle East (2009).

**Political Stability in Iraq**

In *Prospects for Political Stability in a Democratic Iraq*, Petersen and Saunders (2009) conclude that there is a high probability that the infant democracy in Iraq will be plagued by conflict in the short term and potential instability in the distant future should democracy spread in the region (a prospect that now seems quite possible with the popular revolutions taking place in 2011). This conclusion was derived from cluster analysis and revealed that because Iraq is surrounded by primarily autocratic regimes the probability of conflict is much higher than if Iraq were surrounded by democracies. To compound the issue, they highlight the existence of conflict cleavages domestically and with surrounding nations. The authors make a point, however, to note that while conflict is more probable there is always a possibility of achieving the less probable outcome. Additionally, the lack of a unifying theory on the Middle East makes it particularly difficult to predict the viability of democracy in the region, especially since Israel, a democracy, has engaged in multiple conflicts over the past 60 years (Petersen and Saunders: 2009; Galtung: 1971).

Several other scholars have attempted to tackle the question of post-war Iraq with an emphasis on the Kurdish question. In *Preventing Conflict Over Kurdistan*, Henri J. Barkey focuses on the Kurds of northern Iraq as central to the stability of the fledgling Iraqi government. Barkey argues that there are three primary concerns which could spark conflict — the role of the Kurdistan Regional Government (KRG) and tensions over Kirkuk, the tensions between Turkey and the Kurdish minority, and the reaction of Iranian and Syrian Kurds in their respective states (2009). Others argue that there could be conflict between the Kurds and the Sunni, and conflict internally between Kurdish factions, all of which could lead to civil war (Khalil: 2009; Natali: 2005; Cleveland: 2004).

Many of the documents highlighting potential conflict with the Kurds have been focused on policy recommendations which address the concerns of Kurdish autonomy in relationship to U.S. foreign policy. However, they are lacking in substance outside of historical justification and ethnic division to support these claims. Most certainly, current events are visible and easily reported on, but they do not provide a sound base from which to discuss present or predict future events as can be illustrated by the unforeseen Iranian revolution in 1979, resulting in the creation of a theocratic government or the first use of a commercial plane in terrorist attacks in the 1980s (Mackie: 2009). The past is important and defines, in many ways, the present and future. However, alone it cannot be the basis for what is and could be no matter how apparent it may seem (Said: 1994). For this reason, the following sections will address the historical background that is relevant to the Kurds as well as the theoretical framework which supports the various cleavages which are highlighted by Barkey, Khalil, and Natali.

---

1 Due to the constraints of the period of time which Iraq has established a democratic government, there is little quantitative research outside of Petersen and Saunders’s analysis of post-war Iraq. Consequently, the majority of articles focusing on the cleavages of conflict within Iraq have not been privy to their analysis and while they cannot be faulted, any future analysis of Iraq should include such studies.
Iraq and the Green Zone

It is important to begin with a brief history of Iraq and the Green Zone in order to frame the current situation in Iraq. According to Polity IV data, Iraq ranks as having one of the highest fragility indexes in the world, which means that it suffers from extreme levels of ineffectiveness in political, economic, security, and social legitimacy. It also means that Iraq is in the same category as Myanmar, Somalia, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, Chad, Ethiopia, and Sudan (Marshal and Cole: 2009). This is of course in spite of the semblance of relative stability that the presence of U.S. troops has provided. Additionally, Iraq is divided into two main parts — Kurdistan and Iraq proper. There are also two governments — the KRG and the Baghdad government. The presidents of both, respectively, are Massoud Barzani and Jalal Talabani who are from rival Kurdish parties and who carried out a civil war against one another in the mid-1990s (McDowell: 2007; Nisan: 2002).

The autonomous region of Kurdistan has gained a fair amount of political attention as a result of the relationship it has had with the United States throughout the “War on Terror.” This is largely the result of Turkey, one of the U.S.’s NATO allies, denying American access to Iraq during the initial invasion (McDowell: 2007; Barkey: 2009). The autonomous region of Kurdistan came into existence after the 1991 Gulf War primarily due to the international recognition of the Kurdish genocide known as the Anfal campaign. The area was turned into a no-fly zone and the Kurdish people were left to their own devices.

As a result of the sanctions that the United States placed on Iraq during the period, vital goods were not reaching the newly created region which resulted in division among the Kurdish political parties who were vying for resources. The result was a civil war between 1996 and 1998 lead by two political leaders as mentioned above — Jalal Talabani of the Patriotic Union of Kurdistan (PUK) and Massoud Barzani of the Kurdish Democratic Party (KDP). The two Kurdish parties craftily manipulated Iran and Iraq by playing to the unfriendly relations of the two which lingered from the Iran-Iraq war in the 1980s. The United States mediated the conflict in 1998 and goods were allowed into Kurdistan2 thereby alleviating the foundation of the internal Kurdish strife3 (Nisan: 2002; Natali: 2005). The Kurdish region would not register within the realm of strategic U.S. policy to any great extent until the invasion of Iraq which afforded the Kurds an unprecedented ability to develop governance and infrastructure, thanks in part to the removal of Saddam Hussein, the perpetrator of oppression against the Kurds in Iraq (Maoz and Sheffer: 2002).

The Kurds and Kurdistan

Understanding the geographical, social, and political placement of Kurdistan in relationship to Iraq allows one to begin to understand the critical nature of the Kurdish position in Iraq and potential conflict that may plague Iraq for years to come, especially since the Kurdish region as a whole cuts across the sovereignties of four countries. The Kurds themselves occupy much of northern Iraq, Turkey, Syria, and Iran with a population that varies depending on the source. It is estimated that there are approximately 25 to 30 million Kurds spread across the region (McDowell: 2007). According to the START Database (2010) there are several hundred individual Kurdish groups, all of which are nationalist, governmentally and violently oppressed, and, except a very few, militaristic. Additionally, according to Correlates of War Data, there have been at least six intra-state wars with the Kurdish population primarily between Iraq and the Kurds and Turkey and the Kurds (Sarkees: 2000). The World Incident Tracking Database lists hundreds of militarized conflicts between Kurds and other actors between 1991 and the present with the bulk being during the “War on Terror” (2010). However, inconsistency in the data with regards to the actors and initiators makes the data difficult to analyze. The only clear conclusion that can be drawn is that there was a tremendous spike in conflict during the last decade.

What particularly fuels the drive for Kurdish nationalism is the severe repression of the Kurds as a people. Because of their position in the states across the region and the lack of international recognition, governments have repressed Kurdish identity, especially in Turkey and Iraq. Governments have few options to deal with such minorities within their borders. They can eliminate them by genocide or expulsion, assimilate them by destroying their identity, dominate them via discrimination, recognize and incorporate them or provide internal autonomy/accept secession (Shulze, et al.: 1996; Ragazzi: 2009). Consequently, the Kurds in northern Iraq pose a threat to the integrity of Iraq which could spark further repression in Iran, Syria, and Turkey as suggested by Barkey. The real danger comes from the fact that the KRG is in a much stronger position than the Baghdad government which makes them a force with which to be reckoned as this could result in disastrous fracturing and civil war.

The basis for this claim can be found in Dixon’s dis-
Discussion of *What Causes Civil Wars?* (2009). He argues that the geography of a group of people can lead to civil war, especially in mountainous and resource-rich areas. Kurdistan, which is largely mountainous and contains many of the most important resources in Iraq, especially within Kirkuk, fits his model and suggests that if Kirkuk is not resolved in terms of resource sharing between the Baghdad government and Kurdistan that civil war is likely to break out. This, compounded by the rivalry between Barzani and Talabani, creates a powder keg for conflict as Iraq finds its way to stability. Moreover, the military prowess of the Kurdish forces shows the critical nature of Kurdistan as an entity which is central to the potential for conflict in Iraq. This is not to suggest that in the absence of the Kurdish question Iraq would not face challenges and potential conflict as a fledging democracy. However, the presence of the issue most certainly places it in the center of many of the issues which concern stability — resources, governmental integrity, and unity.

**KRG v. Baghdad**

The Baghdad government and the KRG are grappling with resource control and the strengthening of the central government, both of which threaten the existence of the autonomous region of Kurdistan. According to Khalil and Barkey, the KRG and the Baghdad government are in dispute over oil exploration contracts as well as the final status of Kirkuk and oil revenue profit-sharing (2009). According to many scholars, scarcity of resources can be one of many causes of civil war or other types of conflict (Williams, et al.: 2006; Dixon: 2009). If the KRG cannot overcome this obstacle the future of Kurdistan will be threatened, thereby creating a situation (control of oil) in which the Kurds are not likely to relent and are willing to fight over. Incident reports confirm the tension in the area (World Incident Tracking Database: 2010).

Moreover, the relatively weak state of the Baghdad government creates tremendous governance issues, especially in mediating ethnic divisions between the Sunni and Shiites. The lack of unity could result in fractures and two smaller polities (Petersen and Saunders: 2009). Another problem lies within the KRG itself. Some believe that the division between Talabani and Barzani is resulting in “Barzianistan and Talabanistan” (Khalil: 2009). The Baghdad government is also faced with recognizing the Kurds ethnically and politically which requires facing the Anfal campaign and recognizing Kurdish territories, which may or may not be an easy pill to swallow in terms of the geographical and resource complications that will arise (Natali: 2005).

Iraq is surrounded by autocracies and a democratic Turkey. Based upon the cluster analysis by Petersen and Saunders, this increases the probability of conflict from outside forces. What is particularly intriguing, however, is Turkey’s incursions into northern Iraq and participation in armed conflict with the PKK, a Kurdish terrorist group fighting for an independent Kurdistan in all regions that are Kurdish (*Marine Corps Times*: 2010; Fox News: 2010). Moreover, Turkey is cooperating with the Baghdad government and the KRG to deal with the PKK, resulting in a distinction being made between “Good Kurds” and “Bad Kurds” (McDowell: 2007; Long, et al.: 2007). This also creates competing Kurdish identities which could be detrimental to Kurdish nationalism and could ultimately result in further oppression in other states which contain Kurdish populations (Natali: 2005; Nisan: 2002; Moaz, et al.: 2002).

The final aspect which places Kurds and Kurdistan at the center of conflict in Iraq is nationalism. The biggest threat to an Iraq seeking to define itself is nationalism from within which does not establish an Iraqi identity. Kurdish nationalism stretches back to the creation of the Middle East but gains fervor in the mid-20th century with leaders such as Barzani and Talabani as well as the creation of the PKK. Given the past, the extreme level of violent, political repression, and the recent creation of an autonomous Kurdish region, it is unlikely that the Kurds will give up the ground which they have gained in the international arena. Along with geography and resources, Dixon integrates nationalism into his theory of civil war (2009). The presence of any one factor can lead to civil war. However, the presence of resources, geography, predisposition to conflict, and nationalism create a dangerous tonic when combined with the high probability predicted by Petersen and Saunders (2009). As stated before, the managing of minorities or groups with nationalistic tendencies requires that one eliminate the notion of nationalism, incorporate/assimilate the population, eliminate the people, or allow for secession (Shulze, et al.: 1996). This leaves three options — a successful democracy that incorporates the Kurds, an autocracy that represses the Kurds, or dissolution into polities either through conflict or secession as predicted by Petersen and Saunders through a different lens.

**Conclusion**

The Kurds and Kurdistan are a major cleavage of conflict in Iraq and likely will be critical to the future of Iraq’s stability. Petersen and Saunders show that there is a higher probability of conflict in Iraq but refrain from excessive speculation on what the conflict cleavages will be. Multiple authors mention the importance of the Kurds to Iraq and the likelihood that they will be the center of conflict but none support their speculation with any underlying theory. Given the theories on geographic location, critical resources, nationalism, ethnic division, as well as Petersen and Saun-


The Formless Father Figure: Young Men Affected by the Absence of a Male Figure

Jenae Matikke
Dr. Margaret Fontanesi-Seime
Social Work

In 2006, the percentage of children living in homes without fathers was 23.3, up from 8 percent in 1960. In 2007, the figure was 34 percent. This research examines males without fathers or male figures and how they are affected. The specific areas focused on were determined through an extensive literature review, which found that males without father or male figures tend to struggle with low self-esteem, self-identity, forming lasting emotional attachments, isolation, abandonment, and anger toward authority.

NATIONALLY, THE PROPORTION of children living in a home without a father or male figure was 23.3 percent, a very large increase from the 1960 percentage of just 8 percent. Yet in one year, from 2006 to 2007, there was greater than a 10-point leap to 34 percent. In Tennessee alone, 43% of children go to sleep at night without their fathers in the home. The number of children, male and female, growing up without a father or male figure continues to increase in our society today. This paper deals with young males and their experience of growing up without a father or male figure continues to increase in our society today. This paper deals with young males and their experience of growing up without a father or male figure. Many of the existing studies about males without father figures tend to focus on the behaviors of the males, rather than specific issues, and look at internal variables that lead to such behaviors. By examining those internal variables which affect males without father figures, the negative behaviors associated with absent paternal males may be prevented by early detection followed by early intervention.

Overview

For the purposes of this literature review it should be known that father and male figure are used interchangeably. Father/male figure is used in this review to mean a male who acts as a model or mentor in the life of a younger male, for example, coach, teacher, pastor, uncle, grand-father etc. A few of the studies examined in this review are categorized based on ethnicity, meaning that some of the literature focuses on all males without father figures and was not specific to ethnicity while others were.

Much of the literature is in agreement that the reason for the father’s abandonment of the son plays a major role in the ability of the son to cope with his absence. For example, if the father was a casualty due to war service, that is viewed by our society as honorable, which may provide the son with more support making it easier to cope with his father’s absence. On the contrary, if a father is absent from the son’s life due to incarceration, his absence is viewed as dishonorable and therefore may be more difficult for the son to cope with. Further, sons who deal with the deaths of their fathers may be in a better place to heal, versus those whose fathers abandoned them. Those who lose their fathers in death have some sort of closure whereas those abandoned are uncertain about whether the father will return (Simon 2001). In addition to the reason for paternal absence affecting how the son copes, the son’s age when the absence occurs has been found to play a role in how the son will cope.

Low Self-esteem and Identity

Among the internal variables mentioned above is self-esteem, defined as “holding a good opinion of one’s-self” (Webster’s online dictionary). Self-esteem is extremely important during early childhood because it contributes to healthier attitudes toward foundational learning. (Baumeister, Cambell, Krueger and Vohs, 2003). Negative opinions toward self can be detrimental to an individual’s ability to function and develop socially and emotionally. Low self-esteem of
a child can have an impact that extends well into adulthood with confusion about oneself, lack of confidence, or even the inability to assess situations realistically (Kevorkian, 2010).

There are several factors which can contribute to developing low self-esteem in young men without fathers. Single-parent households are more likely to be impoverished because there is only one income contributing to the family’s needs. Children growing up in homes without their biological fathers are more likely to live in poverty and deprivation, have emotional or mental health problems, trouble in school, trouble getting along with others, higher risk of health problems, and greater risk of suffering various forms of abuse (O’Neill 2002). This means that a boy growing up in a single-parent household is at a disadvantage early on. When a boy experiences any of these risks, his self-esteem can be drastically changed, and is almost always lowered.

Often a child’s perspective on a situation is directly impacted by society and the adults in that child’s life. This is important when discussing males without father figures because the support or stigma that can come with the absence of a father affects the child’s perspective on the situation as well himself. If the father is absent due to death from a health complication or service to the military, there seems to be less of a stigma and more support. But if the father is absent due to incarceration or because he has abandoned the family, there seems to be more of a stigma and less support. Such stigmas affect the son’s ability to cope with that male figure’s absence and tend to reduce his self-esteem (Balcom, 1998).

According to Balcom, “Abandoned sons can have sustained damage to their sense of worthiness throughout their lives” (1998, p.2). Feelings of shame can be experienced by abandoned sons early on. This can lead to a shame-based identity, which is often accompanied by a sense of inadequacy and ultimately low self-esteem as a man.

Many studies conducted regarding the delinquent behavior of young men show a correlation between the way the individual feels about himself, and the likelihood that he will engage in risky behavior, such as illegal drug use. Literature also shows that young males who lack a paternal presence are more likely to engage in risky behavior.

In a research study conducted at Florida State University, it was found that, young male children showing evidence of low self-esteem, or who did not hold themselves in high regard, were more likely to be dependent on drugs by age 20 than boys who did not display signs of low self-esteem.

This study was conducted during a nine-year period with interviews of the participants at four times during the period. Among all the young men, those who had extremely low self-esteem during middle school, specifically sixth or seventh grade, were 1.6 times more likely to be drug-dependent later in life than other young men. (Stoppler C. Melissa, 2006). It is important that researchers begin to look at paternal absence as well as low self-esteem in the investigation of young males engaging in risky behavior.

Emotional Attachments

A father in the home contributes immensely to the overall emotional development of the child. Another area affected by the lack of a male figure in the life of young men is their emotional attachments. Children raised in a single-parent home, whether headed by the mother or father, are without the benefits provided by the secure emotional haven of two parents (Weiss, p. 2). This may result in young men who grow up in single-parent households seeking security and emotional attachments somewhere else. For the young men without an older male role model this security is often sought in their peer group (Jenday, 2007). This can be positive but does not provide the security of a father present in the home.

A study conducted on Norwegian children suggested that the ability of children to interact and build relationships with their peers is related to their identification with those of the same sex. This could affect young males’ ability to build relationship with their peer males because children get their perceptions of gender roles from the examples in their life provided by their parents (Lauer & Lauer, 1994; Santrock, 1994; Kaplan, 1991). When the father is absent, a boy’s idea of his gender is not based on a father, but instead on the mother or other models. If boys are given free time in school and the majority of them have fathers who play with them aggressively, they will identify with their fathers, modeling them and also playing aggressively. Such behaviors may not have been exhibited by the mothers so playing aggressively may be a foreign idea (Eccles, Jacobs, & Harold, 1990). This may cause separation early on if those without a male figure cannot identify with the interests and/or behaviors of those with fathers.

Lack of emotional attachment may lead to feelings of abandonment. Likewise, feelings of abandonment lead to a lack of emotional attachment. It can be difficult for a fatherless boy who has matured to adulthood to develop bonds with his children or spouse without an example from his father of how to do so. Males growing up without fathers may also be impaired in their ability to initiate (Bartholomew, 1990) as well as sustain intimate relationships (Bying-Hall, 1991)

---

with their spouses and other family members. Men who have been abandoned by their fathers habitually have relationship difficulties with their partners, siblings, parents, and children.

Heterosexual milestones such as engagement, planning for a wedding, pregnancy, childbirth may cause anxiety in abandoned sons because each involves an increase in the demand of intimacy. These milestones may lead to an intensity of feelings, in which the male may disconnect by leaving the relationship emotionally or being physically present, but not participating. Of the milestones, childbirth is one of the more difficult transitions for sons abandoned by their fathers. For the new father, the task of parenting may be overwhelming because he has no example from his father on how to parent. Also, the infant’s needs take priority over that of the husband. Lastly, childbirth may arouse memories and emotions for the abandoned son of his own father’s lack of fathering (Balcom, 1998).

Emotional reactivity is the emotion experienced by the son due to the father’s absence. This reaction leads to the son’s rejection of the importance of his father’s absence, which leads to denial and unresolved grief. The son can remain in a state of turmoil regarding himself as well as his intimate relationships until the longing and unfulfilled needs resulting from the absence of his father are acknowledged. Sons may also over-identify with the absent father. This results in the worship and idealization of the absent figure. Even though the father has an apparent lack of feelings, contact, interest, or commitment in the son’s life, the son worships and fantasizes about the father he once had (Balcom, 1998).

Isolation and Abandonment

Those who have consistent experiences with parents characterized by care, predictability, and warmth clearly have a more positive emotional adjustment as well as higher quality peer relationships (O’Koon, 1997). But the inability of fatherless sons to develop relationships with his peers may lead to feelings of rejection or isolation. A feeling of isolation is often a predictor of negative emotions and subsequently delinquent behavior.

Those raised in single-parent households reported problems with making friendships three times more than those in two-parent households (Cockett and Tripp, 1994). Those raised in paternal-absent households may not have experienced an example of how to engage in healthy relationships with other people. Also, children from one-parent families are more likely to engage in antisocial behavior or have behavioral problems (Ferri, 1984; Taylor and Butler, 1985). Such antisocial behavior may lead to isolation. Because of the fear of rejection or fear of abandonment, common in young males abandoned by their fathers, they may not respond to attempts by peers and other family members to develop relationships, thus leading to self-isolation.

According to the literature, there are a number of external factors that may lead to isolation and feelings of abandonment in fatherless young men. Poverty is a huge factor which affects the lives of, and further impedes the ability of children in single-parent households to develop healthy relationships. Compared to the 75% of children living in two-parent households, children in single-parent households were two times more likely to fall into the bottom 40% household income distribution (Department for Work and Pensions, 2002). This lack of financial means may put additional stress on the mother and sons, causing tension for the mother-son relationship and leading to more isolation on the part of the son.

Hope et al. (1999) say that single mothers are 2.5 times more likely than married mothers to experience high levels of psychological distress. If financial hardship and other factors are controlled for, lone mothers are still 1.4 times more likely to have psychological distress.

In addition, the son may experience isolation or rejection by peers or teachers because he is more likely to have conflict with his teacher (Cocket and Tripp, 1994). The reasons for peer rejection may vary, the cause may stem from behavioral issues in class. For example, teacher may become annoyed and therefore physically isolate the child by setting him in a corner or away from the other students. Peer rejection may also be due to the abandoned son’s inability to relate to the other children in his class because of a practice or discussion he is unable to engage in due to not learning about it from his father as the other students did.

Unfortunately, abuse is another factor more common amongst children growing up in single-parent homes that can lead to isolation. Young individuals are five times more likely to have experienced emotional abuse and physical maltreatment if they grew up in a single-parent household compared to those growing up in a two-parent household, according to data from the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children (NSPCC; Carson, 2002). Based on a national survey of almost 1,000 parents, it was found that only 4.2% of children living with both biological parents had been abused sexually compared to 7.4% of the children who lived with only one parent (Horn and Sylvester, 2001). Abused children who lack secure attachment tend to learn unworthiness and abandonment. Such insecure attachments may also lead to a general fear of others in the maltreated child, resulting in an avoidance of peer relationships and further isolation. (Lewis and Schaeffer, 1981)

Many men who were sexually abused as boys by women feel deeply ashamed of themselves, their sexuality,
and their gender. Sadly and mistakenly, they believe that there must be something profoundly wrong with them that they were abused in this way. Some men defend against feeling this way by being in a constant state of anger or rage, one of the few emotions that are socially acceptable for men. Many male survivors cope with the abuse by drinking, using drugs, living recklessly, avoiding intimate relationships, numbing their feelings, dissociating, and becoming depressed, anxious or angry. (Munro, 2002).

The anger of abandoned boys, says Larson (2002), may eventually lead to delinquent behavior and hatred for authority. Moreover, if they experience rejection early on, the anger may run deeper. An abandoned son may feel wronged by his absent father, by society, or by another significant individual in his life, or he may be grieving for his absent father, which may lead to the emotion of anger. In some cases, the anger may not be initially experienced but rather develops as the young man responds to the various feelings and situations brought on by his father’s absence. Anger is also linked to depression or may be the result of an unfulfilled expectation (McCrary, 1998). And the young man may also experience depression as a result of his anger.

A study based on young African American males examined the emotions and behaviors of two groups from low social economic backgrounds. One group had a father present in the home, and the other group did not. It was found that those without a paternal presence exhibited more aggression than the other males. Also, the young men who lacked father figures were more likely to accept violence, aggression and gun usage. The study also concluded that young men without fathers experienced more conflicts with their peers, more mood problems, and greater difficulty experiencing pleasurable activities (Gerring, Gerson, and Passley, 2006). According to the authors, males without fathers in the home had more mood problems, behavioral conflicts, and difficulty in relationships.

The emotion of anger may be what leads to the delinquent behaviors among males without father figures. If more detection and intervention of anger takes place, society may benefit in fewer delinquent crimes by young men. The other internal variables discussed in this literature review may be important, not only inherently, but also because they may lead to anger and delinquent behavior.

Conclusion

The literature review presented here was based on a number of journal articles about males with and without father figures. Most of the articles focused on the behaviors of abandoned young man rather than the internal variables that affect them. This researcher isolated each of the variables and researched the literature on how and why these variables affect abandoned sons. The lack of a father figure in a son’s life is a subject that is vital to our society today as more and more children are being born into or raised in fatherless households. Past research shows that males who are abandoned by their fathers are more likely to engage in risky and violent behaviors. However, knowing that abandoned males are more likely to engage in such behaviors does not prevent them from happening.

By looking at internal variables, such as low self-esteem, identity, emotional attachments, isolation, abandonment, and anger toward authority, that affect males without father figures, there is a way to intervene at the beginning of the problem rather than trying to deal with the full-blown problem. Likewise, in the lives of young men without fathers, if the deep internal factors contributing to risky behaviors are addressed, such problems as illegal drug use may be significantly less likely to occur. Many of the internal issues which affect fatherless young men could be addressed early on in life so that the risky behaviors do not become an issue.

References


Biller, B. Miller. (1970). Father Absence and the Personal-
African Pentecostal Movements: Inspiring a Collective Ethic

Chelsea Norman

Ida Fadzillah Leggett
Department of Anthropology

By 2050, estimates Grant Wacker, most of Africa will be Christian and most of those Christians will be Pentecostals. This theory is based on Pentecostalism’s perceived characteristics of inherent mobility, transcendence, and autonomy of its churches. The current preliminary study seeks to examine the appeal of Pentecostalism in order to more fully understand its phenomenal growth. Furthermore, this research will highlight specific examples of Pentecostal teachings to demonstrate how they are apparently altering the African ethic. Finally, I conclude that the Pentecostal movement could be having a negative effect on African societies and, as a result, should be more closely studied to predict its effects within an already vulnerable African continent.

According to Grant Wacker of Duke University, since 1970 the number of Pentecostals in Africa has increased from 18 million to 156 million individuals, and by 2050 he suggests the majority of the continent will be Pentecostal (Miller L., 2008). At first glance, Wacker’s projection is surprising considering North Africa’s allegiance to Islam; however, Pentecostalism’s ability to reconstruct religious paradigms makes Wacker’s theory plausible. Furthermore, this research determines that Pentecostalism is, indeed, pervading African culture and eclipsing religious norms, thus creating an ambiguous environment for Africa’s melting pot of religions.

Pentecostalism’s success, I argue, owes to its ability to splinter and scatter among nations. In fact, Pentecostalism’s indefinable nature has created a significant challenge to this research. Within the vast amount of literature on the topic, there are many definitions of what Pentecostalism actually is. The multitude of Pentecostal denominations and sects are likely the cause of this labeling dilemma. As has been suggested, Pentecostalism consists of a series of “pentecostalisms” — schisms within the movement resulting from doctrinal discrepancy, financial woes, and mundane worship services (Kalu, 2008). These “schisms” led to the renaming of the movement (into labels such as Charismatic, Neo-Pentecostal, Revivalist) but did not give rise to fundamental doctrinal changes. Therefore, it may be argued that Pentecostalism consists of any Christian denomination that places a particular emphasis on charismata or “the gifts of the spirit,” a concept I addressed in subsequent paragraphs.

Forms of Pentecostalism, such as Charismatic movements and Neo-Pentecostal divisions, began to enter mainstream Christianity in the early 1960s (Smidt, 1988). In the literature, the word ‘charismatic’ is often used to describe Pentecostal elements within traditional Christian churches. For instance, a Baptist church that exhibits more outgoing worship would be considered a Charismatic Baptist church. Ruth Marshall claims that, in Nigeria, Pentecostals worship in mainline Christian churches, especially Methodist and Baptist, because mainline churches have been profoundly affected by the Pentecostal message and style of worship (Marshall, Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria, 2009). Variance in beliefs and cultural syncretism led to the creation of Neo-Pentecostalism, which consists of new Pentecostal formations that adhere less strictly to Pentecostal teachings. Neo-Pentecostalism includes, but is not limited to, the following: Assemblies of God, The Church of God in Christ and the Church of Jesus Christ, and African Independent Churches.

Before addressing the relationship between Pentecostal schisms and the appeal of the movement, it is helpful to describe the primary contributor to the movements allure. According to many Pentecostal scholars, the most appealing aspect of the movement for Africans is the outgoing and enthusiastic worship style exhibited by Pentecostal churches within Pentecostal gatherings. A spectacle is created by presence of the Holy Spirit, or God in pneumatic
form. Manifestations of the Spirit are most certainly captivating and entertaining, oftentimes unexplainable. Elements of the Holy Spirit include what is referred to as the charismatas. Charismatas include speaking in tongues (glossolalia), prophesying, “laying on” of hands, healing, miracles, spiritual slaying, and energetic outbursts. In short, experiencing the Holy Spirit is thought to be the driving force behind Pentecostalism’s appeal. Pentecostal churches provide quintessential environments for people to express their inner selves via enthusiastic behavior.

Aside from their ecstatic and outgoing worship, Pentecostal churches are seen as appealing because they act as remedies to the damage that colonial missionaries imposed (Anderson, 2000; Marshall, 2009). Previous Western cultural forms of Christianity (mainline denominations) were regarded as “superficial and out of touch with many realities of existential life.” Because the radically new form of Christianity, Pentecostalism, is anti-colonial and relevant to the needs of the African people, its popularity flourishes (Anderson, 2000). Pentecostalism is perceived as anti-colonial for many reasons. For example, Pentecostal churches are most often African initiated so, by nature, anti-colonial. Furthermore, Ogbu Kalu claims that Africans were receiving the Holy Spirit prior to Western missionary impositions (Kalu, 2008). In fact, though Pentecostalism is noted for its American origin, many scholars suggest that the movement was present in indigenous African forms long before it surfaced in the United States. This thought gave birth to the idea that Pentecostalism was initially a creation of African culture (Kalu, 2008). Finally, Pentecostalism has evolved into a modern movement full of modern ideas. It is perceived as radically new, relevant, and accepting of an ever changing world. Pentecostalism is able to absorb the rapid developments of the present times whereas colonial churches appear static and forceful in nature.

Today, mainline Christian churches such as Baptist, Methodist, and even Catholic churches, are viewed as quasi-colonial governments. Not so, Pentecostal churches (Marshall, Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria, 2009). Furthermore, African Pentecostals are leading their own churches, emulating Western televangelists to create their own Pentecostal structures (Anderson, 2000). Ultimately, because most of the Pentecostal churches in Africa are African-initiated, the appeal of the movement increases.

A third reason for Pentecostalism’s success in Africa is the perception that it caters to the needs of the African people. Tetsuano Yamamori says that Pentecostalism “scratches the itch” in African lives (Miller & Yamamori, 2007). Churches are involved in developmental aid and services. If anyone lacks a necessity, they are can come to the church for help. By helping, the church finds itself in a position to spread its message. In short, Pentecostal churches exhibit intense methods of evangelization. Though other Christian denominations contribute to developmental aid as well, Pentecostal churches appear to be more active, aggressive and appealing.

The Material Appeal of Pentecostalism

In tandem with the theoretical appeal of Pentecostalism is the tangible allure of the movement, promoted by the media. In fact, during my stay in Tanzania from May to August of 2009, I was surprised by the amount of Pentecostal teachings that permeated the media. The Muslim children in my home, with a limited knowledge of English, knew significant Pentecostal phrases in spite of their Islamic upbringing. Television had taught the children in my host family how to worship the Christian God in an outgoing manner. The children would oftentimes shout Pentecostal proclamations, making it clear they were imitating both African and American Pentecostal televangelists.

Ruth Marshall refers to the media transcendence of Pentecostalism by labeling it as “mediatization.” She notes that audiotapes and videos are used to distribute the Pentecostal message. Not only that, but Pentecostals have been able to promote their public opinion via airwaves (Marshall, Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria, 2009). Paul Gifford claims that the “Pentecostal sector is the strand of Christianity most closely linked to the media (Gifford, Christianity, Politics, and Public Life in Kenya, 2009). Gifford describes the situation in Kenya and says that Kenyan Pentecostal stations eventually merged with the American Trinity Broadcasting Network. This collaboration increased funding of Kenyan stations and allowed the Pentecostal message to cover most of the nation. Rosalind Hackett, quoted in Ogbu Kalu’s, “African Pentecostalism,” jokes, “Africans had more radio stations than portable water (Kalu, 2008).” This striking jest highlights the importance of the media in spreading the Pentecostal message.

Pentecostal Churches and African Cultures

Finally, Pentecostal churches gain further momentum through cultural syncretism. Indeed, the theoretical and material appeals of Pentecostalism are linked through cultural syncretism. Syncretism occurs when two cultures collide and interchange ideas. In some cases, the exchange results in alterations to either one or both parties. In this case, Pentecostal churches, and various African cultures unite to form a collectively new culture. Adopting African char-
characteristics enables Pentecostal churches to draw in African crowds. However, some literature suggests that cultural syncretism is only a temporary arrangement (Robbins, 2004).

Pentecostal churches view the traditional culture of the area as the primary hindrance to modernization (Marshall, Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria, 2009). Thus, Pentecostalism transforms everything traditional into a representation of the devil (Robbins, 2004). Opposing religions, witchcraft, and ritual practice are portrayed as demonic; in fact, anything resulting in a negative outcome is proposed as a result of demonic activity. David Maxwell builds on this point when he states that the Pentecostal movement “accepts local enchanted cosmologies only to attack them; thus profoundly altering the way they are understood” (Maxwell, Christians and Chiefs in Zimbabwe: A Social History of the Hwesa People, 1870-1990, 1999). The Church’s initial acceptance of traditional cultures results in the gathering of more followers, and the subsequent rejection of that culture yields a new African ethic. In sum, growth of the Pentecostal movement across the continent is directly related to the movement’s metamorphic capabilities. That is, Pentecostal churches are highly malleable and thus temporarily alter themselves to permeate African groups.

After Pentecostalism rejects traditional norms, why do Africans remain followers of the Pentecostal church? Scholars suggest that religious experiences may play a role in both establishing and revitalizing religious institutions (Poloma & Pendelton, 1989). “Religious experiences … involve the supernatural connection one receives from God. These experiences are, oftentimes, visible within church services. Moreover, Pentecostalism is a faith based on experience. Believers cannot obtain salvation without first receiving the Holy Spirit. The Holy Spirit must be followed by an element of charismata (typically glossolalia) as confirmation that the person is actually saved.”

In collaboration with the supernatural appeal of Pentecostalism are the ideas of modernity. Marshall Berman sums modernity up this way: “to be modern is to find ourselves in an environment that promises us adventure, power, joy, growth, transformation of ourselves and the world — and, at the same time, that threatens to destroy everything we have, everything we know, everything we are. Modern environments and experiences cut across all boundaries of geography and ethnicity, of class and nationality, of religion and ideology: in this sense, modernity can be said to unit all mankind. But it is a paradoxical unity, a unity of disunity: it powers us all into a maelstrom of perpetual disintegration and renewal, of struggle and contradiction, of ambiguity and anguish” (Berman, 1982).

It is modernity’s unifying abilities that make Pentecostalism highly influential. In regards to African Pentecostalism, modernity is fueled by ideas of Western capitalism, individualism and technological advancements. Pentecostalism is not merely stripping a culture of its practices and leaving them destitute. Proselytes trade in their old African selves to receive new modern selves and new practices. These new practices, I will argue, are consumed with material and financial success. In short, exchanging poverty for God’s riches seems to be the tradeoff that is wooing unbelievers into the movement.

Defining Pentecostalism

Syncretism not only alters culture but it also creates problems for scholars seeking to define Pentecostalism. The constant interchange of ideas has led to a multitude of Pentecostal offspring, all of which acquire names. For example, Charismatic and Neo-Pentecostal formations, being derived from Pentecostalism, still retain Pentecostal ideas. Thus it is difficult to determine how these movements are different. Perhaps they are simply rebranded. While I was in Tanzania, a friend informed me that he was not a Pentecostal but rather a follower of the Assemblies of God, which is a branch within Pentecostalism. Though my African counterpart may have self-identified differently, he was still inherently influenced by Pentecostal ideas.

The Prosperity Doctrine

Though Pentecostal churches display an array of teachings, one message is prominent in the literature: The Prosperity Doctrine. In the 1980s, Pentecostal teachings became focused on “health, wealth and prosperity.” Prior to this shift, individual material possession and excessiveness were viewed as demonic and unbiblical. Merely driving a car larger than a Volkswagen suggested that you had “backslidden” or fallen from Christ (Marshall, Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria, 2009). The idea of demonic material possession was short-lived, and self-promotion and financial success became central to Pentecostal teachings. “Name it and claim it” became the driving force behind the new Pentecostal mentality whereby believers would claim they owned an object in order to receive it. This idea was promoted by insisting that God’s will is to supernaturally give believers anything they ask for. Evidence of being reborn a Pentecostal extended outward from merely spiritual proof; followers who exemplified material and financial success were seen as Holy in the eyes of God (Marshall, Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolu-
tion in Nigeria, 2009). No longer was God a god of judgment, wrath, justice, mystery and punishment, says Paul Gifford, but rather a god of health, wealth and riches (Gifford, Christianity, Politics, and Public Life in Kenya, 2009).

The Prosperity Gospel spawned the Pentecostal movement’s affiliation with the marketplace. Using this doctrine, churches began focusing on gathering customers and church profit. In other words, Pentecostal churches morphed into monopolies that avidly sought consumers for the sake of monetary success. This shift is notable, especially considering the effort made by churches to accommodate this new doctrine. That is, Pentecostalism is rooted in the belief that all non-believers must be converted before the end of days. Biblically, converts will become a collective group taken to live with God. Therefore, assumedly, churches would work together in order to edify God’s church and expand the Kingdom. However, literature suggests otherwise.

Expounding on this argument is Ruth Marshall’s concept of “stealing sheep,” in which converts (sheep) are wooed away from their regular congregations by other church bodies (Marshall, Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria, 2009). Non-believers are fought over and churches find themselves mutual rivals. However, if the sole priority of all Pentecostal churches is to gather followers for God, why would churches focus on who catalyzes the rebirth? Certainly, there must be more involved within this mentality than mere Pentecostal conversion. Competition must be thriving on more than the notion of “gaining souls.” The conclusion of many scholars is that church competition is fueled by the need for financial gain. If churches, as players, were really on the same team (God’s team), no such “stealing” and discrepancy would exist. Instead churches, as businesses, are battling each other to stay afloat. Followers produce profit, and profit feeds the system.

Another aspect that is strongly emphasized in the Prosperity Doctrine is the concept of tithing. “Ten percent” resounds in African Pentecostal services. Churchgoers are informed that, in order to receive blessing from God, considerable amounts money must be given to the church. Typically, believers give at least ten percent of their income. They are persuaded that God wants them to give further or, “sew a significant seed.” In secular terms, one must give money (a seed) in order to reap the wonders that God has to offer. Sometimes these blessings are tangible; sometimes spiritually received. Pentecostals seem to tie the irrational amounts of money, so much so that their survival sometimes becomes dependent on divine intervention (faith).

Believers provide the church with large offerings in hope that God will reciprocate in a large way. C. Mwakasege, an African Pentecostal preacher, promoted this principle in the following statement: “To give offerings is not part of your daily expenses. It is part of your capital that you invest in the company of Lord Jesus. God does not want you to give offerings as a part of your daily expenses … Those of you who understand stocks and shares know that they are not part of your expenses; they are your investment … When you continue giving this way, the Lord Jesus continues making profit and will return back to you (Mwakasege, 2003).” In short, tithing is a biblical concept but with the Prosperity Gospel tithing serves as a compulsory sacrifice and a strategic marketing endeavor.

The Prosperity Gospel also gave rise to the marketing of church memorabilia. Books, cassettes, and clothing items are just a few of the products churches offer. Pentecostal salvation can hardly be maintained without purchasing a CD full of sermons and advice. Paul Gifford, in his book titled “Ghana’s New Christianity: Pentecostalism in a Globalizing African Economy,” states that many Ghanaian Pentecostal pastors claim a message cannot be understood or “owned” until it is listened to at least six times (Gifford, Ghana’s New Christianity: Pentecostalism in a Globalizing African Economy, 2004). Furthermore, Pentecostal commodities are transformed into divine necessities — items needed to maintain righteousness and improve a relationship with God. In short, Pentecostals have received the reputation of “Junk Jesus merchants” whose Christianity has been denatured by forces of an increasingly secularized world (Coleman, 2004). If secularism continues to contaminate Pentecostalism, and Pentecostalism is inspiring a new ethic, what may we expect in the future? Will the African continent be ablaze with commodity fetishism and debt? Or, will the presence of Pentecostalism be advantageous? These are questions that require future research.

Conclusion: The Future of Africa

Scholars argue that Pentecostalism could be detrimental in many ways. For instance, because the movement originated in the West, scholars claim that American capitalism intruded into the Pentecostal movement. Also, because of Western influence within African Pentecostal churches, there is debate over the intended spread of Western mentality and culture via evangelists and funding. It has also been suggested that Pentecostalism promotes individual prosperity and conservatism (Coleman, 2004). Despite Pentecostalism’s professed good intentions, the argument here is that Pentecostalism is contributing further to the problems it seeks to eliminate. Instead of promoting rejection of the world, Pentecostalism is promoting accept-
Pentecostalism as described by Miller and Yamamori (2007) strategizes social change through a “trickle up” methodology. According to this methodology, when Pentecostals with “strong moral values move into positions of authority, the institutions they lead will gradually change.” Following this lead, I will conduct fieldwork in Africa in which I will visit Pentecostal churches to determine the effects of individuals on institution building. I plan to ask the following questions:

1. Are Pentecostal and governmental leaders complicit?
2. Do church leaders play a role in elections? If so, what is the outcome and influence?
3. How are Pentecostal leaders becoming involved with the government? Are they running for office?
4. Are governmental leaders playing a role in the church by influencing the people with political ideologies?
5. What effect will a political Pentecostalism have on African ethics?

Another potential implication resulting from Pentecostalism is violence. Ruth Marshall states that in southern Nigeria, “Pentecostalism constitutes the single most important socio-cultural force” that has “played a central role in the increasing political cleavage and violence along religious lines” (Marshall, Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria, 2009). She says that “religious others,” in particular Muslims, are demonized in “Born Again” Pentecostal discourse. However, this demonization is not about the contemporary threat that “traditional” religion poses in terms of religious competition, but is rather fueled by Islam’s history that “failed to provide the moral grounding for a good society in the present (Marshall, Political Spiritualities: The Pentecostal Revolution in Nigeria, 2009).” Using Wacker’s theory that the entire African continent will be Pentecostal by 2050, I assume that religious conflict will come into play. Moreover, scholars suggest that the growing popularity of the Pentecostal movement is putting added pressure on Islamic evangelization. Therefore, an examination of potential violence is necessary.

Finally, scholars theorize that Pentecostalism is inherently denying the need for Africa to be educated. For example, a popular trend in Africa is the desire to be a Pentecostal preacher. Because God provides the necessary training (via supernatural means) to those who are called, prospective preachers do not feel they need higher-level education. The result is astonishing. International Christian Ministries conducted research in which they found that 80 percent of pastors in Africa were untrained or were not formally educated. This statistic led to the opening of a seminary school in which they educated local pastors (Gifford, Christianity, Politics, and Public Life in Kenya, 2009). But is the Pentecostal educational experience equivalent to the typical educational experience in Africa? Are seminaries further contributing to the new ethic I have described in this research? Can Pentecostal structures exist as centers for education or are they designed merely for emulation? I will address these questions in future research.

Arguably, the Prosperity Doctrine, though designed to increase Christian morale, is actually promoting the contrary. The doctrine is composed of modern ideas and is a contributor to globalization. Furthermore, globalization may ultimately result in secularization of the communities which are affected. With that said, I argue Pentecostalism is defeating itself. The current Pentecostal values will serve as a catalyst for social change and will prepare followers for a society where the divine is no longer central. Pentecostalism will likely continue to spread across the African continent, sewing the new Pentecostal ethic, but it may very well become secularized.
Bibliography


Snow White: A Cinematic Study

Joseph Quarles

With changed perceptions of sexuality have come changed roles for women in film. One of the most radically revisioned female roles is the animated character of Snow White, which has transformed numerous times in the 20th century. From adolescent to mature, from innocent to complex, Snow White has taken on many of the roles women themselves have enacted in society.

With the rapid changes in perceptions about sexuality and maturation in relation to women’s roles in the world that occurred during the 20th century, views on women’s roles in film also appear to have shifted. How these roles are conceptualized depends on the audiences and times for which they were produced. One of the most radically revisioned cinematic fairy tales concerning the behavior of women is Snow White. For example, an early version of Snow White, with the animated character of Betty Boop in the title role, is a comedy produced predominantly for working class male immigrants in early 1930s New York, and contained burlesque elements. Michael Cohn’s more recent live action film, Snow White: A Tale of Terror, is a horror film that portrayed graphic violence, while the roles of women portrayed in the film are a study of sophisticated female conflict and infighting.

An intensive study of the story of Snow White in film can show the changes in perceptions of sexuality and gender role expectations of women represented in the 20th century cinematic versions of this fairy tale. In the ensuing discussion of film versions of the tale, I will be applying seminal film critic Laura Mulvey’s “male gaze” theory which considers how women on screen are seen through the eyes of the male viewer. I will also consult feminist critics Sandra Gilbert and Susan Gubar, who view the evil queen’s magic mirror both as a representation of the voice of a patriarchal culture in which the male approval is all important, and as a representation of the internal struggles with aging and sexuality that women typically experience in such a culture, which in turn often lead to a generation conflict between younger and older women. Finally, I will be using feminist folklorist Marcia Lieberman’s argument concerning rewards for heroines in fairy tales for beauty, domesticity, and passive behavior as a reinforcement of the male ideals for women.

In order to understand the root causes of the evolution of women’s roles in film, one must look at the early film industry and the audiences the films catered to. With the advent of the visual medium of motion in the 1880s, the idea of cinema became reality. Amelia Holberg’s study on the early advent of film in New York states that shortly after the turn of the century, as cinema began to develop, nickelodeons (theaters that showed numerous cheap film shorts) became predominant as a form of entertainment for the early audiences of the working class inner-city populations (293). As the nickelodeon theaters became more prolific, lurid fare became available to the masses of the poor immigrants settled in the densely populated low-rent areas in (particularly) New York, and “consisted largely of vulgar exhibitionism” (Holberg 293). At best, the nickelodeon films were, as noted by Robert Armour, “monotonous and unimaginative, often dealing with crime, a chase, or adultery” (114), and had titles such as Beware My Husband Comes, Gaieties of Divorce and The Female Highwayman. The earthy humor contained in such short films became an escape for the average immigrant worker who toiled in sweat shops and lived in horrid tenement housing. Unfortunately as a side effect, the portrayal of women in the nickelodeon films began the cinematic objectification, exploitation and determination of women’s sexuality and roles for voyeuristic and commercial purposes in film.

During the early years of cinema’s evolution, several silent film versions of Snow White did exist. Starting in 1902, seven such films were released by 1916. Of particu-
lar interest is the one released in July 1916 and directed by J. Searle Dawley. The emphasis in the film is especially focused on the issue of beauty and the jealous queen’s reactions to the beautiful Snow White. Because the Dawley film version of Snow White has no sound, like all black and white films of the period, visual presentation is especially important. In this particular version of the Snow White story, after the evil queen’s mirror is broken, she is revealed to be hideously ugly in a dramatic onscreen moment that has a strong visceral effect on the viewer and thus generates sympathy for the sweet and lovely young Snow White. The Dawley film sheds light on how early male-dominated cinema had begun to push beyond the traditional literary presentations of women’s roles in fairy tales by using the impact of visual imagery to characterize and stereotype women by their looks and age. However, until the arrival of the Fleischer brothers, Snow White presentations in film were for the most part forgettable and have been consigned to the dusty halls of archival graveyards.

Out of the rapidly growing cinematic perfect storm of creativity, exploitation, and sensationalism that defined the period of the nickelodeons, the Brothers Fleischer, Dave and Max, appeared and made their mark in cinema, particularly in animation. Amelia Holberg notes that the Fleischers became notorious for using “overt sexuality and often grotesque imagery” (291) in their films. The Fleischer brothers not only had adult themes in their animated film shorts, they also created the first rotoscoping techniques, which allowed them to portray actual human movement on the screen, rather than the unrealistic and jerky movements of earlier cartoon characters (Holberg 299). This technique allowed the creation of one of the first visually sexualized characters, Betty Boop, the innocent, liberated flapper. Betty Boop was an extension of the ribald humor that had saturated the burlesque and risqué films of women in nickelodeon films. For all intents and purposes, the Fleischers’ depiction of Betty Boop as a sexualized Snow White could even be considered a return to the bawdy comedy that characterized most European oral tales of earlier times.

Directed by Dave Fleischer and produced by Max Fleischer Studios, Betty Boop’s 43rd cartoon, Snow White, a comedic interpretation of the tale of Snow White, premiered. A predecessor to the seminal Disney version of the fairy tale, this film was released in 1933. Many of the changes that the Fleischer brothers made to the traditional story by the Brothers Grimm that became such a ubiquitous part of children’s literature in the 19th century are adult in nature or are flights of whimsy. Some of the more noticeable changes in the story include eliminating the childhood of the Snow White character and adding comedic touches, such as Betty bouncing down a hill immersed in a snow ball and erupting out of an icy pond encased in a block of ice, as well as scenes with dancing ghosts and skeletons in the background.

As the story begins, Betty has come to visit her “step-mama,” the queen. After the magic mirror tells the queen that Betty is the fairest in the land, she immediately orders Betty’s execution. Then Betty is taken outside to be executed by the two men-at-arms, played by Koko the Clown and Bimbo the dog, two longtime cartoon characters often paired with Betty. Betty loosens her bonds and tries to run away. She then trips into a snow bank and begins rolling down a hill, becoming immersed in an enormous snow ball. In a whimsical nod to the traditional story aspect of the coffin (Snow White placed in a funerary display in the woods with the dwarfs mourning her) the now juggernaut snow ball containing Betty slides into a frozen pond, causing her to pop out the other side completely encased in an ice coffin. Gilbert and Gubar have posited that the consistent use of the coffin in different versions of Snow White is a form of display for the benefit of males (207). The encased Snow White is reduced to an object, “to be displayed and desired,” making her the ideal woman waiting to be rescued (207). Betty’s encasement in an ice coffin is satirical in that she is displayed as an object, but totally frozen, locked in permanent stasis and unobtainable to the male suitor, perfect and immortalized.

Other strange events, more grotesque than whimsical, dominate the film throughout the rest of the story. The strangest moment in the film is when the queen transforms the sidekick character of Koko the Clown into a morphing ghost that sings “St. James Infirmary Blues.” As he floats down a cave tunnel meant to be Betty’s tomb, the background shows grim scenes of skeletons and bizarre creatures enacting lines from the song, such as a poker game, a bout of drinking at a saloon, and a funeral. The sequence is closer to an early version of a music video, but a solid example of the grotesqueness the Fleischers were known for.

Although the Fleischer version of the Snow White tale does touch on the traditional aspect of the evil queen being an older woman completely obsessed with her looks and in direct conflict to the beautiful and younger Snow White, the film version goes far beyond the earlier literary versions. Betty and the queen are sharply contrasted by their looks. The queen is already presented as being homely, and later in the film is shown as an absolute witch. Feminist critic Laura Mulvey notes that the continued use of such a visual contrast of beauty in film is determined by what is called the “male gaze,” the male determining how the female should look on screen (841). The male gaze “projects fantasy onto the female figure” (841), and as a result of this determination, the appearance of the woman is “coded for strong visual
and erotic impact” (841). The male gaze’s influence in the visuals of the Fleischer version is most apparent in their depiction of Snow White, elaborated on by Betty’s looks and her figure in opposition to the queen’s sticklike body and enormous nose. Betty is certainly a pin-up girl figure, a man’s fantasy, and as a cartoon, easily sexualized, invoking sympathy from the audience as she is pursued by the queen.

The traditional role of the mirror as support for the queen’s ego is implemented in the film, but in a far more insulting manner. Initially the mirror supports the queen’s ego and does follow the first part of Gilbert and Gubar’s mirror theory, the mirror as a symbol of male approval, “the patriarchal voice of judgment that rules the Queen’s – and every woman’s – self-evaluation” (202). When it sees Betty, it immediate capitulates to her beauty. The mirror then cajoles and insults the queen, giving her a raspberry. After the queen believes she has killed Betty, she asks the mirror who is the fairest in the land. The mirror rejects the queen, the mirror aspect of male approval rejecting her for her looks, and accepting Betty for hers.

The male characters in the film do follow the traditional male roles as presented in earlier versions, in which all the men – the huntsman, the dwarfs, and the prince – deferred to Snow White’s beauty. When Betty Boop arrives at the castle, all the men-at-arms along the walls bow to her as a continuous wave as she walks toward the queen on her throne. Her sidekicks Bimbo and Koko cannot harm Betty because of her looks and innocence (as per the huntsman in the original story), and fake her death. The grieving dwarfs carry Betty’s body to a cave to entomb her, but their time on screen is brief and strictly supportive. As a whole, all the male characters treat Betty differently and are taken by her appearance, thus reinforcing the theory of male approval by their actions.

In all fairness to the Fleischers, their films were simply reflections of the humor of the underbelly of American society in that time period. Although Betty was certainly a product of male fantasy in all of her films, the Fleischers made her empowered and more than capable of defending herself, as well as fending off her many male suitors. However, as Holberg states, her sexuality came under fire from censorship boards, and eventually she was toned down considerably, to the point of being a children’s innocuous cartoon character that was constantly in need of being rescued by handsome men (233). The Fleischers satirizing Snow White in an adult-orientated parody, and with an established animated sex symbol, was brilliant on their part. They broke away from the literary tradition of using fairy tales for conditioning with their characterization of Snow White. However, Disney then pulled back the Fleischer’s portrayal to a more conservative one, which then set the precedent for most of the 20th century film versions of fairy tales.

By the 1930s, films had become respectable entertainment for the most part, and watching such adult themes as those the Fleischer’s created had become stigmatized. As Holberg notes, no middle class family would have taken their children to see such a film in theaters associated with drinking and vulgar behavior (293). In contrast to the low-brow humor of the first decade of film as mass entertainment, the more conservative film companies began to fundamentally change cinema by producing family-oriented films for the affluent middle class, setting the stage for Walt Disney. Disney in turn began to craft artistic endeavors on an enormous cinematic scale, with a method of storytelling that was infused with conservative values. His version of Snow White set the new archetype for all modern interpretations of fairy tales by creating an industry standard for storytelling, a template that constantly reinforced the idea of the pure maiden suffering through trials and being rewarded with marriage at the end of the tale. Eventually, the Disney archetype eclipsed the Betty Boop version of Snow White and other fairy tale retellings, and is still in use today.

A good example of the influence of Disney can be found in Shelly Duvall’s Faerie Tale Theatre, a running series of film shorts with each episode retelling a classic fairy tale. The “Snow White and the Seven Dwarfs” episode premiered on HBO on July 16, 1984, and was directed by Peter Medak. In this Snow White episode, Duvall introduces the tale and then briefly plays the mother of Snow White. The beginning of the story is to the letter of the original Grimm Brothers’ version, with Duvall pricking her finger while sewing one wintery afternoon while looking out of a castle window. She then wishes for a child with hair as black as a raven, skin as white as snow, and lips as red as the blood she sees on her finger. From that point on, the film has some interesting diversions from the original story, as well as some subtle satire.

When she appears in the story, Snow White, as played by Elizabeth McGovern, is much older than in the original literary versions and not even remotely sexualized. However, the queen, as played by Vanessa Redgrave, is far more memorable as a character. She is not so much a villain as a self-involved victim of her own ego. In her analysis of the film, Maria Tatar notes that instead of a frightening antagonist, Duvall uses humor and exaggeration to turn the queen into a buffoon (273). She becomes “the laughing stock of the story” rather than a character that inspires terror (237). She simply cannot accept the advance of time, and she surrounds herself with luxurious items, decadent food and jewelry, as she constantly brushes her hair and at times caresses the mirror in an erotic languorous manner, obviously seeking male approval and support.
Duvall’s version of the mirror is played by Vincent Price, and his stentorian voice and screen appearance certainly creates a memorable impression. His face is literally a part of the main arch of the triptych mirror the queen constantly seeks reassurance from. In a twist, as the queen constantly admires herself in the mirror and queries it on her timeless beauty. In response, the mirror often offers advice to the queen on aging gracefully and accepting life for what it is, rather than constantly bolstering her ego and giving her the approval she so desperately desires. That is, he is “the patriarchal voice of judgment that the queen, and every woman’s, self-evaluation” (Gilbert and Gubar 202) comes from.

The dwarfs are far more noticeable in Duvall’s version, as opposed to the Fleisher version where they barely appeared on screen. They reflect the Disney fairy tale standard of the dwarfs embodying characteristics of children. As Duvall presents them, they are also simply another version of male stereotyping, boys needing to be taken care of, thus defining Snow White as a mother. They cling to Snow White, and when they encounter the prince, who asks about the missing princess, they lie and try to keep their “mother” to themselves. The prince, as the other male role in the tale, is a hapless and clueless version more worthy of being rescued, as the traditional maidens were in other fairy tales, than doing any rescuing himself. He spends his entire time on screen strumming an out-of-tune lute at a crossroads, and the only way he encounters Snow White is when the dwarfs drop the coffin right in front of him.

Another part of the Disney standard formula for fairy tale retellings is the inherent use of the reward system found in early literary fairy tales, bolstered even more so with visual images. Marcia Lieberman notes that in many literary versions of fairy tales, the heroine at the end of the story receives the reward of a handsome man from a class equal to or greater than the niche she occupies, and also receives wealth and fortune for her suffering (386). Lieberman also posits that young girls are taught to seek males with money and to want to be a mother and to be domestic, in a form of subtle cultural conditioning in early fairy tales (384). Duvall, despite her experimentation with the story paradigm, does fall for the romanticized, traditional view of women’s roles, and rewards her suffering, girlish Snow White with the prince and immediate bliss. Her film reinforces some of the old values in a subtle message to young girls: submission to marriage, cheerful domestic subservience and happiness at motherhood.

The animated Happily Ever After, directed by John Howley in 1993, contains what appears to be a new twist to the tale of Snow White. Howley tells the story of Snow White and her adventures after the initial story of her defeat of the evil queen. The story includes female relatives of the dwarfs from the previous tale, and the brother of the deceased evil queen, Lord Maliss. Snow White, as she is presented by Howley, is more of a teenager riddled with self-doubt rather than a girlish adolescent. She is presented visually in the Disney classic form of a raven-haired, pale young woman with dark red lips. The plot picks up shortly after Snow White and the prince ride off into the sunset. As they are traveling through the woods, they encounter Lord Maliss, the vengeful brother of the deceased queen. He takes the form of an enormous dragon, then swoops down and snatches Snow White off the prince’s horse. After she is hurled into the woods, the prince attempts to defend her. Maliss severely injures the prince, and flies away with him. Snow White then begins what initially appears to be a journey of self-discovery and empowerment. The first part of her journey has her returning to the home of the dwarfs to seek their assistance in rescuing her prince and defeating Maliss.

At the dwarf’s cottage, Snow White encounters the Dwarfelles, the sisters of the dwarfs, rather than the dwarfs themselves, who have left the valley to mine other mountains. Each Dwarfelle is a different color and controls an aspect of nature, such as sunshine or earth, and the smallest Dwarfelle, Thunderella, is in charge of storms. Snow White is shown attempting to convince the Dwarfelles to face Maliss as a unified team. She does eventually convince them to work together, and they begin the long journey to the ruined castle of Maliss in a spirit of feminine camaraderie. She also begins mothering Thunderella, bolstering the tiny but volatile Dwarfelle’s fragile self-esteem and encouraging her to believe in herself. The Snow White in this tale is in the mother role, but unlike the more traditional versions with the male dwarfs needing support and never being responsible, she is presented as attempting to empower the female aspect of the Dwarfelles.

As there is no queen, and the mirror simply serves to inform Maliss of his sister’s death and the reason for her demise, rather than serving as a symbol of male approval. The only other strong antagonist within the story is Maliss, the only dominant male character in the story. The figure of the prince is secondary at best. Maliss’s visual aspect is even more terrifying than the Disney version of the antagonistic evil queen, and as far away from the Duvall comedic presentation of males as one could get. Disney’s queen was presented as coldly beautiful, but Maliss is almost demonic with gray skin, red eyes and exaggerated, pointy ears. His impact on screen heavily contrasts with the constant comedic element of Snow White attempting to teach the Dwarfelles to work together. As the representative of males, Maliss is actually shown as embodying all the negative aspects of
men. He is portrayed as vicious, abusive, power hungry and willing to use his physical strength to get what he wants.

The film not only uses extreme visual contrast between Snow White and Maliss; the lands Snow and Maliss come from seem to also reinforce the positive female aspect and the negative male aspect the film strives so hard to elabo-
rate on. The lands the Dwarfelles and Snow White journey from are lush, vibrant and filled with blooms of flowers, often considered the symbols of reproduction and fertility. Maliss’s homeland is as desolate as a moonscape and is shown filled with landslides, trenches and sharp stone precipices, as well as being cloaked in eternal night. Mulvey’s male gaze does not apply in this version of Snow White. There is no sexualizing at all. If anything, the male aspect is repeatedly painted as violent and irredeem-
able and determined to eradicate the female presence.

The all-female group goes through a transition throughout the story. The Dwarfelles learn to work together as a team, using their elemental abilities to maximum effect. Snow White also goes through a transformation; she becomes more self-reliant and even ends up rescuing the prince in the end. But, the retelling is deceptive and the Disney conservative paradigm rears its head in the finale. Snow White is still shown as a maternal figure, mothering the whole group, especially the character of Thunderella. As a negative, Snow White also falls back into the domestic trap. After being conditioned once again to be a mother, this time with young females, she immediately capitulates to the prince, the Lieberman reward system appears again, and they ride off into the sunset, presumably to the final “everafter.”

Snow White: A Tale of Terror, director Michael Cohn’s 1997 gothic re-visioning of the Snow White tale, not only borders on the realm of horror, but also brings to bear the atmosphere and dark side of the fairy tale genre. Cohn’s film, also known as Snow White in the Black Forest, has a veritable cornucopia of visual imagery. Beautiful realistic locations, masterful lighting, and impressive costume and set design all serve to pull the viewer in to this unusual Renaissance period retelling of Snow White. Cohn’s version also makes good use of color and imagery, as well as new interpretations of the classic symbols in the earlier Snow White tale. For instance, the mirror is shown as an evil artifact that uses the reflected image of the stepmother (Lady Claudia Hoffman, played to exquisite maliciousness by Sigourney Weaver) to control her.

The main character of Lillian, the Snow White child played by Monica Keena, is more forthright and not a shrinking child needing rescuing as in earlier versions of Snow White. She initially starts out as a princess who is at constant odds with her stepmother and is at times disagreeable and selfish. She can be just as aggressive as the
turned miners, and begins to change considerably as she adjusts to living a difficult life in the forest, in an abandoned church. Here she encounters the true “prince” of the tale, a roguish miner named Will, played by Gil Bellows. The men are rough and dangerous, not caring at all for Lillian. They do not show interest in her beauty, and in fact they reject her as a symbol of the upper class. She does help around the camp, but there is no mothering or cheerful domestic servitude. Her commodified attributes of beauty and servility are of no use, Lieberman’s reward system is not applicable, and Mulvey’s male gaze theory is refuted. Lillian has to fend for herself.

The ending is especially dark and breaks from the traditional cinematic “into the sunset” retellings of Snow White. After a bloody and bizarre confrontation at the castle with the stepmother, Lillian’s betrothed, the good doctor, is killed in a bumbling attempt to save her life. Lillian’s harrowing accidental murder of her stepmother, caused by smashing the mirror in an attempt to defend herself, is a bit of a return to the earlier versions of Snow White, in which the aggressive queen causes her own death by her repeated attacks on the passive younger woman. The breaking of the mirror, the destruction of the male voice of approval, destroys the queen, causing her to turn to dust, as she cannot exist without such approval and attention. The castle then burns to the ground. Lillian and Will barely escape the conflagration while carrying her nearly dead father into the inky darkness of the forest.

The film’s dark look and visuals harken back to the early fairy tales of Europe. Not everything in life ends on a happy note, and the movie certainly proves that point. The strong Lillian, the self-involved Claudia, and the unusual Prince Charming in the guise of a scarred bandit make for a fascinating non-traditional tale of true horror. There is no obvious reward, or male gaze sexualizing the female characters. The story is a version of female conflict, but not one of domesticity or mothering, and overall, Cohn’s film is a strong deviation from the established Disney archetype.

The more recent film, Snow White: The Fairest of Them All, directed by Caroline Thompson, was shown in Europe and the Middle East in 2001. The film is a most unusual retelling of the Snow White tale and includes many minor and not so minor changes. Some of the changes include the male characters being just as predominate as the female characters in the story. The dwarfs are actually gnomes that are each named for a day of the week, although, as a group, they are funny and more like children, as per the Disney model. Snow White does care for them, fulfilling the typical domestic role that is part of the story, but she also is more adult in behavior and somewhat empowered in this retelling.

Despite the fact that the story is a retelling of Snow White, the film contains many examples of fantasy and deviates from the Grimm and Disney versions considerably. The radically different beginning starts out with a widowed woodsman named John, played by Tom Irwin, and his newborn daughter Snow White. When the mother, Josephine, dies, the couple must leave their small cabin for sustenance to survive. After they become lost in the snowy woods, John collapses on a frozen lake. His tears of frustration fall onto the ice, melting it and freeing a powerful spirit. The seemingly benign forest spirit, named “The Green-Eyed One,” offers to grant John three wishes: nourishment, a kingdom, and a queen for a wife. John does not believe the spirit and flippantly agrees to the wishes. Suddenly he is a king in a great hall with no memory of how he arrived there.

Kristen Kruek portrays the character of the adolescent Snow White as winsome and mischievous, while maintaining the traditional innocence. In one of the major divergences from the story paradigm, the back story of the queen, Elspeth, played by Miranda Richardson, is shown. In the traditional literary and film versions of Snow White, the queen is initially taken as a wife by the widowed king, or was simply already in charge. But, this queen has a back story.

After the lake spirit grants the wishes to John, he flies away to visit a gruesomely ugly woman, his sister, a witch named Elspeth. The film presents a strong visual presentation of the queen-to-be, Elspeth, as hideous, unlike the earlier film presentations where the queen is initially shown as coldly beautiful. In an attempt at rehabilitating his wayward sister, to cause her to take on the passive attributes of Snow White, the spirit shows her an enormous mirror with her reflection peering back at her as a beautiful woman. Lieberman has noted that not only are heroines traditionally rewarded for beauty, but also passivity (386), two traits that men expect to find in the perfect woman. In this case, beauty is Elspeth’s reward for changing her behavior. The lake spirit asks her to be John’s husband, becoming in effect an extension of male approval, telling her she can remain forever beautiful, if she attempts to better herself, to put aside her destructive use of magic, and to agree to his test of humbleness.

The other major deviation from the Snow White paradigm is the power of the mirror. Not only is the mirror a reflection of the queen’s desires, it also functions as a powerful tool for her. After the lake spirit has convinced Elspeth to marry John, she shatters the mirror, and the shards rain down like snow on the kingdom. In a reference to Hans Christian Andersen’s “The Snow Queen,” a tiny small piece of the mirror falls into the king’s eye, discoloring his view of reality for years to come and causing him to ignore Snow more and more as time passes by.

The remaining piece of the mirror can be summoned by Elspeth and sent flying through the air to spy
on and kill her enemies. Interestingly enough, the queen breaks into tiny shards and is absorbed in the mirror when she needs to fly. She not only desires beauty and seeks constant male approval, she deconstructs her image, herself, to force her will on others for the sake of her ego and in protection of her status with male approval.

The lake spirit, the Green-Eyed-One, could also be considered another aspect of the mirror, separate from Elspeth’s shard. In the beginning of the story, John’s tears awaken the frozen spirit. The now awakened aspect of male approval’s response to John’s predicament is to give him a wife, and reward him for being a self-sacrificing man, in a reverse of Lieberman’s reward theory. At the end of the film, the spirit takes back Elspeth’s beauty, admonishing her for using it for vanity and self-aggrandizement. The male voice does not approve of her aggressive behavior or ego; she does not fulfill her male-approved role and is punished, as all the older aggressive women are in the Snow White tradition.

The film is a well-executed retelling and a complete flight of modern fancy and fantasy, with changes in the roles and strengthening of female characters. Visually, both Snow White and Elspeth are shown as beautiful, but Elspeth in particular is shown as sexualized and aggressive throughout the entire story, almost a vamp. Ultimately though, the male ideals of passivity win in the end with Snow White, and end up being the downfall of Queen Elspeth.

All the films discussed here reflect the influence of the earlier versions of Snow White. Fleischer and Disney were simply two sides of the coin in their early portrayals of Snow White, independent sexuality and conservative behavior. They both were cognizant of Snow White’s image in their versions. Disney was most aware of how his Snow White moved and comported herself on screen, very much the cultured young lady, whereas Fleischer’s Betty Boop Snow White was a buxom young woman who was highly sexualized. Later on, with the expansion of the Snow White film corpus in the latter half of the century and the awareness of feminist criticisms influencing films, directors like Michael Cohn brought to light the harsh realities of aging, a failed marriage, and a story with no real heroes. Caroline Thompson’s film played with female generational conflicts and regulated the male roles to the periphery of the story. Unfortunately, films such as Happily Ever After continue to reinforce conventional values and beliefs concerning roles and expectations for young women in a patriarchal society through depicting older, powerful women in a negative light.

Each of the films chosen for the qualitative analysis in this paper contained elements reflective of reinforced gender roles for women, positive or negative. The history of early film shows the initial sexualization of women and the powerful reinforcement of visual imagery in the aggrandizement of beauty and youth, while touting the myth of undesirability and the effects of aging in older women. Many later films have fallen into line with the established conservative Disney paradigm, essentially creating an industry of fairy tale retelling gradually aimed at and heavily marketed toward young girls. The effect of the visual reinforcement of the stories, the perpetuation of the male approval and ideal roles, coupled with modern marketing has had an effect on modern generations of women. In the 1970s, Kay Stone did numerous interviews for her article “Things Walt Disney Never Told Us,” and she found that many young girls were heavily influenced by characters such as Snow White in literature and especially in film, and openly wanted to “imitate them, especially their ability to obtain a man and a suburban castle without much effort” (21). There have been shifts with the younger generations, with young girls and adolescents rejecting the established film versions of fairy tales and seeking more empowered and interesting heroines. The film archetypes persist though, despite attempts at diversity and initially proactive heroines, such as in the Disney films Pocahontas and Mulan. The Disney film archetype is now an entrenched part of cinema and culture within the United States, complete with male approval and controlled female sexuality.

Works Cited


Works Consulted


Snow White and the Seven Dwarfs. Dir. William Cottrell.

Walt Disney Studios, 1937.


Creating a New Tradition: Perspectives on Foreign Policy Theodore Roosevelt and Woodrow Wilson

Ana Valenzuela
Dr. Robert Hunt
History Department

From Theodore Roosevelt’s days as Assistant Secretary of the Navy to Woodrow Wilson’s own Presidency, foreign policy in the United States began to take a new shape. Through the efforts of these men, the United States would step away from a policy of anti-entanglement and carve a true path for itself in international affairs. Roosevelt and Wilson would have a great influence on foreign policy, but both approached international affairs from greatly different perspectives. Looking at the careers of both Roosevelt and Wilson allows one to see the complicated relationship that existed between them and their personal perspectives on life that affected their foreign policy ideas. With this relationship in mind, there still exists a particular role that the United States achieves that sets it apart from rival empires at the time.

In 1796, GEORGE Washington began to draft what would become his farewell address to the nation. After deciding to step down from the office of the presidency, he wished to leave the country with a bit of lasting advice. With the help of Alexander Hamilton, he drafted a thirty-two page address that among other things warned the country against the overwhelming spirit of a two party system and the danger of foreign alliances. Over the next century, Washington’s ideas on foreign entanglements remained a prime factor of United States foreign policy. The young nation acted within international affairs, but government curtailed policy to avoid these so called dangerous foreign alliances. Though extremely aware of the outside world, the United States placed its main focus within its own borders and towards westward expansion.

By the end of the 19th century, the United States had experienced a tremendous amount of industrial growth, which made it exceedingly difficult for the country to continue down its present foreign policy path. At the time, other countries such as Britain and France were extending their borders to far corners of the earth creating vast and powerful empires. Considering America’s past with Britain, many Americans felt uncomfortable with the idea of imperialism that had come so closely associated with Europe. During the Cuban intervention, laws such as the Teller Amendment ensured that the United States would not be able to take control of another country. However, the fact remains that an immense growth had occurred within the country since Washington’s farewell address and the United States could no longer stand idly by. The country was now on a higher international platform whether she wanted to be or not.

Theodore Roosevelt and Woodrow Wilson realized the responsibilities that would come with this new power. Recognizing the unique opportunity that the international stage could allow, Roosevelt and Wilson seemed to construct a tangible American notion of the role of liberator. Global political power was shifting dramatically and in order to find a proper place within the current imperialist status quo both men understood that they must take action even if it was active neutrality. Though through the concepts of liberation and democracy, the United States set itself apart from imperialist neighbors. The role of liberator offered a creative solution to competing with other rising nations and embodied what many Americans at the time would have seen as the country’s true nature.

Both Roosevelt and Wilson agreed on securing a more
active role within the international sphere perhaps while performing the role of liberator, but they differed greatly on the details of accomplishing these goals. The added complication on this new path of foreign policy remains the complex relationship that existed between these men. The definition of world power and the characteristics that it encompassed did not hold the same meaning for Roosevelt and Wilson. Coming from a post Civil War generation into a world of progressive thinking and a wave modernism, Roosevelt and Wilson’s perspectives were keenly shaped and ultimately affected their foreign policy initiatives. The diplomatic intelligence and overall bellicosity of the cowboy clashed with the equanimity of a great academic political scientist. Ultimately, a rapidly evolving society swept up in a dramatic shifting of world balance, forced these men to construct through their own perspectives a unique mobilization of American power that produced liberators by two different paths.

Generally, historians perceive Roosevelt and Wilson in extremely distinct ways as if they both existed on opposite poles. Roosevelt is most often characterized as the cowboy or the imperial president who possesses, as Edmund Morris puts it, a quite “irrational love of battle”. However, underneath the fanfare of rhetoric and the voracious personality there existed an intelligent statesman who knew what was necessary to put the United States on the world stage. On the other hand, Wilson is generally perceived as the composed intellectual or as an idealist locked in the ivory tower of academia. Though Wilson’s ideas were praised and scorned by many for their idealistic overtones, he realized just as well if not more so than Roosevelt the delicacy and power of world politics and attempted to achieve what Arthur S. Link referred to as a “higher realism”. Roosevelt and Wilson’s true characters underline the complex issues that surround them and their own perceptions of foreign policy. As John Milton Cooper states in his book *Warrior and the Priest* these perceptions immediately drove a political and ideological wedge between two people that were not all that different. As Cooper explains, Roosevelt and Wilson experienced two incredibly heroic childhoods, which affected them greatly in their later careers. In their young lives, Roosevelt and Wilson both faced and overcame the odds of illness and disability. For each boy the father’s influence helped him through his difficulties and shaped personal characteristics that followed them throughout life. In the shadow of the Civil War, Roosevelt and Wilson started an ideological journey that created the chaotic path that each followed to success.

As a child, Theodore Roosevelt was continuously plagued with illness. He suffered mainly from asthma and a nervous digestive system, which made it difficult for him to lead a normal life. His symptoms were so severe that some family members speculated on whether or not young “Teedie” would make it past his fourth birthday. However, the problems seemed to subside for a short time when his father, Theodore Roosevelt Sr., returned from assisting—in the Union war effort. Though Roosevelt’s symptoms would continue for many years, the presence and influence of his father helped him combat the issue.

By his twelfth birthday, Roosevelt had become incredibly bookish and obtained a great love of bugs. Due to his asthma and other ailments, the boy had turned to books for entertainment, which provided a place for his imagination to roam. From there, he discovered the realm of natural history. The intelligence that young Roosevelt gained from his new hobbies pleased his father. However, his frailty was disconcerting. Theodore Sr. approached his son one day stating, “you have the mind but you have not the body, and without the help of the body the mind cannot go as far as it should”.

At this time, Roosevelt began his journey of perseverance through masculine activity, and his life changed drastically. He went to the gym every day to lift weights and eventually started boxing. Roosevelt committed himself to putting himself to rigorous training in hopes of escaping his frailty. By age seventeen, he had become wiry and muscular with a healthy glow about him. He still had the occasional asthma attack, but the strenuous workouts seemed to have made them manageable. Roosevelt had transformed himself from a frail asthmatic into a man.

Throughout the rest of his life, Roosevelt placed himself in physically demanding situations in order to overcome issues. From early in life death stole his loved ones. At nineteen, he suffered the loss of his beloved father, and six years later he lost his mother and young wife on the same day. In both cases, Roosevelt was utterly devastated; he responded with physical exertion. When his father died, he wished more than anything to be worthy of the man he admired most and for the rest of his life seemed to find the

---


6 Ibid., 77.
need to prove himself.\textsuperscript{8} After the death of his wife, Roosevelt traveled west in hopes of escaping the agony of his loss.\textsuperscript{9} The frontier provided a place for him to deal with issues and for the remainder of his life adventures such as the Spanish American War and African safari’s provided this release.

Ultimately, Roosevelt had overcome many hardships and transformed himself, becoming what Cooper calls a self-created character. Roosevelt gained “an openly avowed obsession with physical matters and a spirit of perpetual youthfulness.”\textsuperscript{10} Through physical exertion, he as the individual persevered and overcame problems. His understanding of himself as a self-created character became part of his principles and is seen repeatedly throughout his career. Roosevelt attempted to inspire the people with this concept, giving himself as an example of how individuals could overcome the odds and in their new-found power give strength to the nation. In this respect, living and citizenship became a form of war. As Roosevelt said, “The qualities needed to make a good soldier, in this final analysis, are the qualities needed to make a good citizen; and the qualities needed alike by a soldier in time of war and by all citizens in time of peace are those which in their sum make up the characteristics that tell for great and righteous people.”\textsuperscript{11} For Roosevelt, personal strength created with national strength, and this produced international power.

Roosevelt’s obsession with personal prowess defined his understanding of America’s role in the world. His self-created character, translated into a lasting form of youth, masculinity, foreign policy.\textsuperscript{12} In the context of Roosevelt’s world, the question of masculinity had come to the forefront of society. A wave of modernism had brought about the New Woman, an independent individual who no longer needed or wanted to bend to the will of man. Men in the late 1800s were trained as gentlemen in a Victorian society, which placed women in a role of submission. However, the emergence of the New Woman skewed the proper balance of gender roles within society in the late 1800s. As the dread of effeminate tendencies took hold, men no longer knew where they stood.

As Sarah Watts states in her book \textit{Rough Rider in the White House}, Roosevelt connected the masculinity crisis to the future and well being of the nation.\textsuperscript{13} Greatly due to the influence of Roosevelt, the “cult of the cowboy soldier” swept the nation’s men into a frenzy of violent activity.\textsuperscript{14} Only by living a strenuous life could boys earn the rite of passage into manhood. Bodybuilding, hunting, and a variety of other sports provided an acceptable venue for a show masculine violence.

This reasserted form of masculine exertion allowed men to gain a renewed sense of control within the nation. With this in mind, the cult of the cowboy took a step unto the world stage. The Spanish American War called for a self-created tough guy who embodied the spirit of western expansion. Watts argues that the emergence of the cult of the cowboy and the aggression that it embodied correlates directly with Roosevelt’s aggressive foreign policy. Before the turn of the century, Roosevelt argued the United States had to take control of its international future lest it fall to other rising nations. From his appointment as Assistant Secretary to the Navy onward, Roosevelt’s career gained momentum, and he created a unique brand of foreign policy that he owned as the imperialist president and as the self-created man.

As a child, Woodrow Wilson experienced a different set of challenges than young Roosevelt. Cooper argues that Wilson was dyslexic. Apparently, the youth did not master the alphabet until age nine and could not read fluently until age eleven.\textsuperscript{15} With support from his parents and through his own determination, Wilson overcame the disability. He would never be the voracious and extensive reader that Roosevelt was, but with extreme focus and concentration Wilson formed an incredibly capable mind. As a teenager, he taught himself shorthand to make writing easier. Later in life, just a few simple shorthand notes aided him in constructing well organized and moving speeches, much of which he had already formed in his mind.\textsuperscript{16}

As with Roosevelt, Cooper underlines the influence of Wilson’s childhood. Cooper argues that overcoming the odds of this disability gave him the determination, patience, and composure that mark him in the future. Cooper notes that the experience isolated him in “solitary tendencies” that would destroy his legacy.\textsuperscript{17} For both men, childhood and adolescent struggles presented a challenge of sorts that ultimately marked them for life. However, disability or illness did not remain the single great influence in Wilson or Roosevelt’s life.

When the Civil War came to his doorstep, Wilson learned about the destruction of war at an early age.\textsuperscript{18} Wil-
son’s parents both from the North moved to Staunton, Virginia from Ohio and then moved later to Augusta, Georgia. Some of Wilson’s earliest recollections concerned the election of Abraham Lincoln and the imminent conflict between the North and the South. Wilson’s devout Presbyterian family split from family in Ohio and his father, Joseph Wilson, would not remain in touch with the other his family in the North after the war. The Southern Presbyterians also split from the national church, and Joseph Wilson offered his church for the new meeting place of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church of the Confederate States of America, which he remained the clerk over for thirty-three years.

Roosevelt, too, dealt with a great divide within his family during the Civil War. His father was a Northerner and his mother a Southerner. One had been raised in a prestigious Northern family the other on a wealthy Southern plantation. Both remained loyal to their respective areas and young Roosevelt felt the tension between them more than a few times during his childhood. Roosevelt’s mother and aunt showered him with Southern nostalgia of great heroics and chivalry, which perhaps contributed to his obsession later in life. However, the greatest impact of the war seems to be Theodore Sr.’s lack of participation. He never took up arms against the Confederates, and Roosevelt was ashamed. For the remainder of his life Roosevelt did not shy away from doing, what he knew was his father’s duty to his country.

The true impact of the war hit home with the Wilsons when wounded Confederate soldiers started to arrive in the city. In 1863, the government took control of Joseph Wilson’s church to use as a hospital and as grounds for a temporary prison camp. At the end of the war, young Wilson saw the destruction of Sherman’s March to the Sea and watched Jefferson Davis taken prisoner and paraded through the streets by Union soldiers. Unlike Roosevelt, Wilson experienced first hand the defeat and utter destruction that would consume the South.

The was not the greatest or most lasting influence in Wilson’s life. Religion not war, was the foundation of Wilson’s thought throughout his political career. He was the son, grandson, and nephew of Presbyterian ministers, and more than one historian including Arthur S. Link, John Milton Cooper, and Thomas Knock have speculated over the significance and influence of this background. As with Roosevelt, Wilson’s father was major force in his son’s life and it is this influence that uniquely shaped Wilson’s character and foreign policy perspectives.

Joseph Wilson did not fit the traditional picture of a disciplined and strict minister of the times. He was aggressive and outspoken, enjoyed smoking and the occasional drink, and was interested in contemporary orator. He taught rhetoric and so knew and appreciated contemporary issues, passing this same appreciation and interest to his son. During his adolescence, Wilson and his father spent many hours together and the son later recalled what a magnificent teacher he had been. With the help of his father, Wilson began to hone the skills that he would utilize to write and present the beautiful rhetoric he produced during his presidency. On his days off, the elder Wilson helped his son with rhetoric and writing, teaching him to craft words into concise and organized sentences with just the right punch. Conversations revolved around politics, and given that, his own ambitious career pursuits had been dashed, Joseph Wilson placed many of his own ambitions onto his son.

As the youth’s career took shape, traces of his father’s contemporary perspectives and faith became more evident. His father’s progressivism kept him from the sweeping rhetoric of William Jennings Bryan. He would also avoid the idealist and self-righteous ventures to which both Bryan and even Roosevelt were prone. Wilson placed a great deal of weight on morality and, from a Christian standpoint, wished to live according to God’s will and make the world a better place. However, he was careful to abstain from publicly speculating on the nature of God’s will.

But, as Thomas J. Knock puts it in his book To End All Wars, Wilson did believe that Christianity had created a foundation for international law. Faith established a brotherhood, producing “common principles of ‘civilization’ and education.” Wilson also emphasized the concept of international law based on the idea of God as the father, which makes all mankind a brotherhood producing “natural bonds between nations.” From these standards of Christianity in combination with international relations, Wilson formed the basis of his revolutionary foreign policy. Arguing that Chris-

20 Cooper, Woodrow Wilson, 17.
22 Ibid., 38-41.
23 Cooper, Woodrow Wilson, 17.
24 Knock, To End All Wars, 3.
25 Cooper, Warrior and the Priest, 16.
26 Ibid., 15.
27 Cooper, Woodrow Wilson, 14.
28 Cooper, Warrior and the Priest, 21.
29 Cooper, Woodrow Wilson, 22.
30 Cooper, Warrior and the Priest, 19.
31 Ibid., 21.
32 Knock, To End All Wars, 8.
33 Ibid., 8.
tianity created an international community, Wilson developed principles that in his mind could be used to provide collective security, self-determination, and a morality for all.\textsuperscript{34}

For both Roosevelt and Wilson, childhood struggles and adolescent influences shaped characteristics and perspectives that would determine their later understanding of foreign policy. Roosevelt overcame the odds of childhood illness and, with the strong masculine influence of his father, led the life of a cowboy. His masculine aggressiveness and belief in the perseverance of the individual drove him during the peak of his career and structured a distinctive foreign policy that placed the United States on a new tier in the order of world power. For his part, Wilson also overcame childhood difficulties, but with much more composure and patience than Roosevelt. From the progressive and contemporary influence of his father to his underlining faith, Wilson formed creative ideas on international relations through a Christian rationale that led him to believe in a world community fighting for the rights of all mankind. As children of the Civil War and the evolving world, afterwards both saw in later life their adolescence. “A boy never gets over his boyhood, and never can change those subtle influences which have become a part of him.”\textsuperscript{35}

* * *

At the beginning of Theodore Roosevelt’s career as Assistant Secretary to the Navy, the world had already begun to experience a major shift in power. France and Britain had reached the peak of global domination, while nations such as Germany and Japan were establishing themselves within the world order. Over the next decade, the United States assumed a more active role within world politics and meanwhile constructed a distinct American foreign policy. The Spanish American War acted as symbolic rite of passage for the United States, providing the first occasion for the U.S. to style itself as liberator. Roosevelt’s commanding role in the war followed quickly by his presidency and solidified this new foreign policy.

As Assistant Secretary of the Navy, Roosevelt aided in revolutionizing the United States Navy. Establishing himself as an “ardent expansionist” Roosevelt made several strategic maneuvers in order to push his superiors, such as President McKinley, to improve the service.\textsuperscript{36} In the 1890s, the naval strategist Alfred Thayer Mahan produced a book underlining what he thought would be the only way to achieve global dominance. As he saw it, only the greatest naval power on earth could manage such a feat. A staunch supporter of Mahan, Roosevelt lined up other expansionist supporters to better position the country for a naval build up.\textsuperscript{37} Aware of Germany and Japan’s growing power, Roosevelt began to put into works his own vision of U.S. foreign policy.

In his first speech to the Naval War College on June 2, 1897, Roosevelt made his case for expansion by validating the necessary cause for war. As Roosevelt stated, “it is too late to prepare for war when the time for peace has passed.”\textsuperscript{38} Roosevelt’s major theme, as seen in this quote, revolved around the idea that only in preparing for war can one affectively promote peace.\textsuperscript{39} He laid out all the facts citing exactly how long it would take the United States to build a powerful fleet if threatened with war. Unfortunately with the new and complicated nature of navy war craft, it would take the United States more than six months to defend themselves and another eighteen months to go on the offensive.\textsuperscript{40} Ultimately, this speech underlines the most substantial aspects of Roosevelt’s foreign policy character.

In a predetermined effort to jump-start the Spanish American War, Roosevelt attempted to inspire the Naval College and the nation with his rhetoric. Reiterating the importance of the national duty and identity Roosevelt stated that, “cowardice in a race, as in an individual is an unpardonable sin.”\textsuperscript{41} Likewise, he continued, it was “through strife, or the readiness for strife, that a nation must win greatness.”\textsuperscript{42} The nation, just as an individual, must lead a strenuous life just as he had done in order to overcome the odds and achieve greatness.

The Naval War College speech sent shock waves through the McKinley administration. Roosevelt had not only meant to inspire the nation, but to outline and create his own foreign policy.\textsuperscript{43} Over the next year, he did all that was in his power to force the United States into a war with the Spanish. The Navy Department began to develop a new war plan including the liberation of Cuba and further language on possibilities of liberating and controlling the Philippines. With the new plan in the works, Roosevelt realized that certain maneuvers were necessary to influence or avoid all together people who did not wish to expand the nation’s influence. Using his influence in the absence of his superior Secretary John D. Long, Roosevelt secured a position for a vital confidant and expansionist.

\textsuperscript{34} Knock, To End All Wars, 8-9.
\textsuperscript{35} Ibid., 3.
\textsuperscript{36} Morris, The Rise of Theodore Roosevelt, 567.
\textsuperscript{37} Ibid., 574-575.
\textsuperscript{38} Ibid., 570.
\textsuperscript{39} Ibid., 569.
\textsuperscript{40} Ibid., 570.
\textsuperscript{41} Morris, The Rise of Theodore Roosevelt, 569.
\textsuperscript{42} Ibid., 571.
\textsuperscript{43} Ibid., 572.
Commodore George Dewey. Over the next few months, Roosevelt gained further recognition and national respect, while also gaining the attention of President McKinley. While lining up these crucial relationships, the idea of liberation became the centerpiece of national attention.

In January 1898, a riot erupted in Havana, Cuba, after Spanish officers destroyed the presses of four local newspapers who were understandably displeased with the occupation of the Spanish Army. As tensions grew, Roosevelt made it known that if war broke out he would be the first to take up arms against the Spanish. Confident that Dewey could gain important assets such as the Philippines in the Pacific, Roosevelt wrote a memorandum again stressing the importance of strengthening the Navy. Secretary Long went one step further and suggested the Maine be sent to Havana as a sign of support for the Cubans.

On February 15, 1898, the Maine exploded in the Havana harbor obviously causing great outrage in the United States. In the absence of his superior, Roosevelt started to make plans. Should war break out with Spain, Dewey was positioned too assure that the Philippines would fall into the hands of the United States. Everyone was now on high alert and by the time Secretary Long returned from a short vacation, the Navy Department was in such an uproar that it took several days to reign in Roosevelt’s workings. Secretary Long, however, did not retract any of Roosevelt’s orders including the message to Dewey preparing him to take the Philippines. Although Long was able to reign in the insubordinate Roosevelt, the campaign for a war with Spain obtained further momentum, especially the ideas of liberation.

Liberation was not a new entity within American ideas. Our ancestors arriving in the New World, found the Native Americans, and as they saw it introduced them to civilization “liberating” them from their savage ways. The Union during the Civil War wished to free or liberate the slaves. Like many citizens of the Union, the United States began to cry for the liberation of Cubans. Roosevelt along with the McKinley administration upheld this idea of liberation, and through legislation such as the Teller Amendment, which prevented the U.S. from annexing Cuba, reassured isolationists that their motives were not of an imperialist nature. Entering a war against the Spanish in Cuba’s favor became an exercise of a truly American mission, which involved as Paul T. McCartney puts it the validation of “the highest ideals of the United States.”

Roosevelt eager to engage the Spanish whole-heartedly accepted the role of liberator. He understood quite well the political and global ramifications of defeating the Spanish, but also realized that the United States held a responsibility as an emerging world power to protect and defend smaller nations. With soaring rhetoric that he was so accustomed to use, Roosevelt pronounced, “we will have this war for the freedom of Cuba.”

President McKinley attempted to contain the combative nature of some American citizens, but with Roosevelt’s popular influence and the growing support for the liberation of Cuba, McKinley finally called for war in April 1898. At the beginning of May, Commodore Dewey defeated the Spanish Asiatic Squadron and took over Manila Bay. This victory accomplished, Roosevelt resigned his position and join the armed forces. His fervor or what some, including Secretary Long, considered insanity drew him to the glory that he knew war would provide.

Lieutenant Colonel Roosevelt and the Rough Riders took up the banner for Cuba Libre along with their masculine bellicosity and swiftly defeated the Spanish. Roosevelt experienced his crowded hour exclaiming, “All men who feel any of joy in battle know what it is like when the wolf rises in the heart.” Bestowed with all the glories of war, Roosevelt stormed up San Juan Hill and secured his hero status. With the tools of war, the United States took the Philippines, freed the Cubans from their Spanish oppressors, and passed into the realm of global power. For Roosevelt all the moments of his life had led him to this war, and on his return to the United States hundreds gathered to cheer for “Teddy and the Rough Riders”.

The bovish recklessness that became a staple of Roosevelt’s character continued throughout the rest of his career. As the hero of American perseverance and masculinity, Roosevelt created a world for himself where killing a man was justified if only done by the righteous. These characteristics internalized in Roosevelt’s perspectives fluctuated from reckless and youthful bellicosity to the actions of a world-class statesmen. His tendency towards insubordination never left him. Though he appointed a talented and willful Secretary of State in John Jay, Roosevelt took it upon national identity, the War of 1898, and the rise of American Imperialism (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University Press, 2006), 106.

44 Ibid., 567.
46 Ibid., 593-596.
47 Ibid., 596-600.
48 Paul T. McCartney, Power and Progress: American
himself to handle foreign affairs bringing the United States into further international entanglements. As he had tested the constraints of his position as Assistant Secretary to the Navy, so did he test and perhaps go beyond the powers of the Constitution and the office of President of the United States.

Force and strength generally remained in the forefront of Roosevelt’s, but diplomacy acted as a key component in his skills of persuasion. Nowhere is this more evident than his mediation of the Russo-Japanese War. As Edmund Morris puts it, Roosevelt possessed a “lifelong obsession with balance.” 55 Knock realized that it was in the best interest of the United States to participate in a mediation of peace between Russia and Japan. As Roosevelt stated, “I would like to see the war ending with Russia and Japan locked in a clinch, counterweighing one another, and both kept weak by the effort.” 56 He recognized the danger of Russia accepting an overwhelming defeat. This would tip the scales in favor of Japan perhaps allowing them to take a place ahead of United States on the global power scale. Roosevelt recognized Japan as “a civilized, modern power” and as Morris points out “civilization, to him, being synonymous with strength.” 57

With this in mind, Roosevelt negotiated a peace that allowed both a defeated Russia and an economically depleted Japan to save face. For this, one of the most youthful and aggressive statesmen claimed the Nobel Peace Prize.

By the end of his presidency, Roosevelt had proven the diplomatic and military might of the United States. Through his youthful aggressiveness, Roosevelt placed the United States on a distinct foreign policy path that promoted renewed military strength and the security of smaller and weaker nations all while gaining a strong foothold on the international stage. The commission of the Great White Fleet acted as the final great act of Roosevelt’s presidency and characterized his love of strength, which for him encompassed the tools for the ultimate success.

On January 22, 1917, Woodrow Wilson began to lay the groundwork for his construction of an international community. In this speech to Congress just a few months before the declaration of war against Germany, Wilson asked for a “peace without victory” that he insisted must take place between equals, for that was the only means of a lasting peace. 58 This address among many others demonstrated the exceptionally keen foresight that Wilson possessed in foreign policy matters. Although he started out in 1912 with little foreign policy experience especially in comparison to Roosevelt, Wilson learned quickly and developed a very personal policy style that Thomas J. Knock classifies as progressive internationalism. 59

Wilson’s policy differed greatly from Roosevelt’s style. Overwhelming force did not characterize his thought and he once commented, “I do not know how to wield a big stick, but I do know how to put my mind at the service of others for the accomplishment of a common purpose.” 60 With the start of World War I in 1914, Wilson struggled to stem the tide of aggression that flowed so easily from people such as Roosevelt. From his childhood, Wilson had gained and internalized the principles of Christianity, which laid in concert with his ideas on foreign policy and prevented an aggressive reaction. 61 Unlike Roosevelt, who wished only to fight for a balance of power that tipped in favor of the United States, Wilson wished to completely reinvent the meaning of balance.

From the start of World War I, Wilson realized the gravity of a catastrophe that was ravaging mankind. As Knock lays out in To End All Wars, Wilson believed in the balance-of-power system, but recognized the industrial brutalization that was born in a new age. As Wilson wrote, “War before this one used to be a sort of national excursion…with brilliant battles lost and won, national heroes decorated, and all sharing in the glory accruing to the state.” 62 However, Wilson had further doubts and continued by asking, “can this vast, gruesome contest of systemized destruction…be pictured in that light…wherein the big, striking thing for the imagination to respond to was untold human suffering?” 63 This depth of understanding led Wilson to ask for a “peace without victory” and eventually to create a revolutionary international system that recommended the liberty and equality of all nations.

Possessing a different background than Roosevelt, Wilson represented an alternative perspective produced by a post-Civil War generation. As Knock reiterates over and over and in his book To End All Wars, Wilson had for a time the support of progressives and socialists. Roosevelt originally possessed the support of the progressives, however Cooper sheds light on the true relationship that existed between them. As one reporter stated, “They were crusaders; he was not.” 64 As Cooper argues, Roosevelt was not the crusader that progressives of the late 1800s wished to be.

With the start of his new administration, Wilson began to take advice from progressives outside of the Democratic Party and created a bridge between them and

55 Knock, To End All Wars, 51.
56 Cooper, Warrior and the Priest, 236.
57 Knock, To End All Wars, 6.
58 Knock, To End All Wars, 112.
59 Ibid., 107.
60 Ibid., 107.
61 Cooper, Warrior and the Priest, 189.
championed their ideas with his Fourteen Points message and later the construction of the League of Nations. Wilson’s hopes of achieving peace through mediation gained great support in both Europe and the United States, but he ultimately realized the precarious situation of maintaining neutrality. Certain events drew the United States further into the crisis, causing some to support involvement, but still more to deny it. As Wilson faced poor peace prospects, the position of neutrality versus belligerency loomed overhead.

The sinking of the Lusitania, forced many Americans to question neutrality. For his part, Roosevelt began crying for war, but, as Knock explains, the former president remained an extreme. Though the majority of Americans were disheartened or confused by the murder of innocent American civilians, they still wished to stay out of Europe’s problems. Wilson reflected America’s feelings, commenting that “there is such a thing as a nation being so right that it does not need to convince others by force that it is right.”

After the sinking of the Sussex, which had led to four American deaths, Wilson demanded that Germany restrict their undersea warfare or he would be “at last forced to the conclusion that there is but one recourse [that the United States] can pursue”—severing all diplomatic ties with the German empire.

Receiving this angry response from Wilson, Germany yielded and began to follow restricted submarine warfare.

Wilson now realized that the United States could no longer depend on neutrality, and began to prepare the public for an intervention in Europe. He preached military preparedness, but in a way that Americans felt a duty to the civilization of the world. Throwing off the traditional George Washington precepts, Wilson stated, “We are participants whether we would or not, in the life of the world. The interests of all nations are our own also.” He listed the aims of American foreign policy as sovereignty, equality, and liberty free from aggression. These American ideals he was sure should be spread around the world, but in order to do this military preparedness might be necessary.

As Knock explains, Wilson completely transformed the meaning of preparedness and therefore altered more than a century’s worth of foreign policy ideology. Public opinion had now been altered in such a way that even Progressives and Socialists understood the overwhelming necessity of military preparation.

Wilson attempted to hold onto neutrality in hopes of

---

65 Knock, To End All Wars, 30.
66 Ibid., 30.
67 Knock, To End All Wars, 48.
68 Ibid., 144.
70 Knock, To End All Wars, 60.
71 Ibid., 60.
72 Brose, A History of the Great War, 208.
73 Ibid., 208.
74 Knock, To End All Wars, 76.
75 Ibid., 77.
leading peace talks as the only non-belligerent, but due to miscommunications with his vital aid Colonel Edward M. House, Britain and France were pushing Wilson to join the war. House misled Wilson about many of the talks with Britain and France where he had claimed that it would be only a matter of time before the United States would join the war, which Wilson had no intention of doing. He even went so far as to make an agreement with Great Britain called the House-Grey Memorandum that promised the intervention of the United States if Germany did not show up to or act reasonably at a peace conference. Wilson obviously was not prepared to enter the war and certainly had reservations about allying with Britain or France. Wilson blamed all of Europe for the catastrophe. “It may be found before long that Germany is not alone responsible for the war, and that other nations will have to bear a portion of the blame in our eyes.”

Ultimately, due to Germany’s revival of submarine warfare and the reception of the Zimmerman note Wilson decided to join the war. It had become obvious that Britain and France had no intentions for peace before winning, and Wilson worried that without military assistance he would lose his place at the peace table. However, Wilson stated that America’s aim was, “the principle of justice to all peoples and nationalities and the right to live on equal terms of liberty and safety with one another, whether they be strong or weak.” In his Declaration of War against Germany, Wilson restated this theme. “We are but one of the champions for the rights of mankind.” Wilson had constructed a revolutionary path of foreign policy that set the United States out to be the liberator of all.

When the war ended Wilson had his chance to mediate a peace that he intended to mean the end of all wars. In the end, Wilson was forced to concede ground on his prescribed League of Nations, which to him was brutal blow. European powers were of course concerned with the prospect of freedom of seas and self-determination. At the time, Britain was a great naval power and both France and Britain possessed empires made up mostly of colonial territories. They did not seek a peace between equals and therefore wished to claim crippling reparations from Germany. In order to maintain the general structure of his league, Wilson conceded on several points, which made the fight for ratification in the United States extremely difficult. After suffering a stroke, Wilson’s demeanor changed dramatically and refused any compromises.

Historians have several theories on Wilson’s failure. Knock insists that the President did not educate the public enough on the league. This along with the betrayal of staunch Wilson supporters through the suppression of civil liberties with the Sedition and Espionage Acts, Knock argues the league failed. Another Wilson historian, Lloyd Ambrosius, argues that Americans could not accept global interdependence. The United States was not willing to join an alliance that would cause the country to go to war for another nation. Ultimately, Wilson sought for a revolutionary foreign policy that fought for human rights around the world. According to Arthur Link, Wilson—though seemingly an idealist—possessed a “higher realism.” In a time of confusion, Wilson maintained composure and through Christian faith sought to form a brotherhood that in reality was in the best interests of the entire world.

Ultimately, the legacies of both Roosevelt and Wilson have lived on. They have created a standard of choices—idealist vs. realist, reactionary vs. progressive, and internationalism vs. isolationism—that set the definition of foreign policy paths well after their time. It is important to remember that each man at different moments could fall into several different foreign policy categories. Roosevelt was more prone to aggressive and sometimes-irrational action and for this was viewed as the realist. With all his standards of peace, Wilson was seen as the idealist. Contrary to this portrait Cooper claims that Roosevelt was the idealist (Warrior-Cooper 218). While Link argues that Wilson actually possessed a “higher realism.” Though it is important to realize these contradictions and maintain the important complexity of the situation, it remains obvious that both men served their country in the best possible manner according to the time. Roosevelt strove to bring the United States out onto the international stage, while maintaining democratic principles and upholding a strong idea of liberty. Wilson continued this journey, but attempted to reinvent the system in hopes of spreading freedom and along with the vital properties of liberty. Even with the failure of the League of Nations, an enormous precedent was set, one that remains to be striven for today. The underlining factor here remains the characterization and emergence of this country’s role as liberator. Among their many differences, the efforts of both men helped to

76 Ibid., 73.
77 Ibid., 35.
78 Ibid., 107-108.
79 Ibid., 144.
80 Ibid., 216.
create an American ideal that with all its contradictions and complexities has produced an epic American standard.

Bibliography


Perspectives of Refugee Resettlement Experiences in Middle Tennessee

Kamryn Warren
Dr. Meredith Dye
Sociology and Anthropology

Each year the United States resettles tens of thousands of refugees from all over the world. Since the first refugee legislation was passed in 1948, policy and programming benefitting this population has improved. However, there remains a need for the understanding of the refugee perspective. Middle Tennessee has recently become home to an increasing refugee population, and the aim of this study is to identify their experiences within the resettlement process. Qualitative, open-ended interviews allow for a closer look into the lives of refugees resettling in the middle Tennessee area. Focus is given to religion, cultural practices, education, employment, and family structure within daily activities and obligations. Explored within the findings are themes present in multiple interviewing sessions and the similarities and differences among them. The individual perspective on resettlement is anticipated to aid in the development and restructuring of programs and services designed to benefit the refugee community of middle Tennessee.

OFTEN TIMES THE VOICE OF individual refugees is overlooked and their narratives, which are crucial to gaining a holistic understanding of the resettlement process, are lost. In fact, some refugees reveal that years have gone by without having been asked their personal experiences with resettlement. Some equate a refugee’s receipt of federal funding to a standard of acceptable experiences, but resettlement narratives range from extreme fear and dismay at one end of the continuum to integration and acceptance at the other end. The emphasis being that whether positive or negative it is the actual perspective and experience of the refugee that is important.

The lack of reflectivity in United States refugee resettlement policy forces refugees to conform to popular representations of what refugees should be and how they should act (Sowa 2009). Refugees often find themselves adopting cultural practices they perceive as American in order to ease their transition into a new society. By speaking to refugees firsthand, the resettlement experience can be more fully understood. What are the adaptation and assimilation processes experienced by individuals who identify as refugees? What are the similarities and differences in cultural practices, family structure, religion, education, language and employment before and after resettlement?

Asking these questions and documenting the refugee prospective will shed new light on the experience of resettlement. An ultimate goal of this research is to use the refugee perspective as an influence to create more comprehensive services. This paper will discuss the history of the refugee in the United States as well as narratives of individuals resettled in Tennessee.

Background

Definitions

When researching issues such as refugee resettlement, it is necessary to define certain labels or categories. For the purposes of this research the definition of refugee is provided by the United Nations High Commissioner’s Office for Refugees in accordance to revisions of Article 1 in the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees: a refugee is a person who, “owing to a well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group, or political opinion, is outside the country of his national-

1 Personal communication during an interview with a Sudanese refugee revealed that in the nine years of resettlement experience the individual was never asked to share his personal story with anyone. See also Warren St. John’s book Outcasts United.
ity, and is unable to or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country” (UNHCR 2010). This definition is used in the research because it is the operational definition used by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees and serves as a qualifier and eligibility requirement for federal government assistance programs and many volunteer agency services.

It is also important to note the differences between refugees and immigrants and asylum seekers. Asylum seekers apply for protection once they have arrived at a U.S. port of entry. Immigrants make a conscious decision on an international move for a myriad of reasons.

**U.S. Refugee Policy**

Seeking asylum and refuge is, of course, not a new phenomenon in global politics. People have always sought refuge and sanctuary, but the “refugee” as a specific social category and legal problem of global dimensions did not exist in full modern form before World War II (Malkki 1995). The first refugee legislation in the United States was the Displaced Persons Act of 1948 which brought over 200,000 Eastern Europeans to the United States. Refugee-related legislation includes the Refugee Relief Act of 1953 which provided for admission of persons fleeing Communist regimes in Hungary, Poland, Yugoslavia, Korea, China, and Cuba. Other legislation includes the Refugee-Escapee Act of 1957, the Cuban Adjustment Act of 1966, and the Indochinese Refugee Adjustment Act of 1977. The Refugee Act of 1980 provided the first systematic procedures for the admission and resettlement of refugees in the United States. Under the act, refugees entered the United States under a statutory status that met the generally accepted international definition of refugee (Rytina 2005). New legislation is continually drafted and revisited to encompass the needs of the refugee demographic in the United States.

**Refugees in Middle Tennessee**

Over the past several decades, a number of refugee groups have been resettled in the Middle Tennessee area. The most well-known group of refugees in this region is the Kurdish. The first Kurdish individuals were resettled in Nashville in the 1970s and now make up the largest Kurdish population in the United States. ² Middle Tennessee is also home to several Laotian, Vietnamese, Cambodian, Chinese and Somali refugees, among numerous others. In 2007, the United States government agreed to host the resettlement of 60,000 Bhutanese refugees. To date there are over 500 Bhutanese that have been resettled in middle Tennessee and 27,000 nationwide. Given that refugees make up a substantial part of the local demographic, the need arises to give voice to the experiences of thousands of individuals in the process of resettlement as well as those who have acquired citizenship.

**Resettlement Processes**

It is estimated that there are 17-25 million refugees and other forced migrants worldwide; 2.2-2.5 million reside in the United States (Goetz 2005). Refugees arrive seeking protection and stability in a foreign place. Often they have few English language skills but many elementary perceptions of American culture and social life. The refugee’s burden of starting a new life in an alien environment usually includes a lack of immediate family and familiar faces. Unlike immigrants, refugees are settled with government aid and placement by volunteer agencies, resulting in their having little to no autonomous choice in where they initially reside.

Volunteer agencies comprise hundreds of nongovernmental organizations, most structured along ethnic and racial lines and dedicated to increasing the flow of their own countrymen as asylum seekers or refugees (Barnett 2002). Not all agencies operate with such an agenda and not all refugee migrants have access to ethnically specific services. Refugees are now more likely to be resettled to the United States from refugee camps by the United Nations High Commissioner on Refugees (UNHCR) than was previously the case. Government workers known as circuit riders are sent by the U.S. to refugee camps to look for candidates to come to America as refugees. Selected individuals then begin the paperwork and waiting periods that lead up to actual relocation. In a 2002 study, Barnett noted, however, that within the past 10 years the process of receiving refugee status has become more rigorous and extensive in an attempt to combat terrorism. Once accepted for placement goals for resettlement are instilled (e.g., economic independence).

Previous refugee resettlement experiences have been studied and analyzed far too much in reference to economic advancement and employment statistics (Barnett 2002). Studies involving refugee participation are geared toward weaning them off of federal assistance and being integrated into the U.S. work force. Resettlement agencies typically provide an eight-month maximum of services, noting a fear that the refugees will develop “dependency syndrome,” the fear that the refugees will become reliant on assistance (Sowa 2009). It is also the UNHCR’s practice that refugee camps maintain the minimum services to protect life in order to avoid turning
a camp into a permanent settlement. Federal assistance is not structured so that it focuses on preserving cultural traditions or maintaining family structures because the assistance is for mere survival. The United States resettlement programs have in the past split large families into two or three sub-family groups and relocated them to separate places (Kasumi 1995). The extent to which economic independence impedes the preservation of culture and family is an area of research that needs to be explored and documented through refugee narratives. An end goal is to integrate first-hand experiences of refugees into the formulation of services they receive.

**Literature Review**

*On Being “American”*

There is ongoing debate about what a successful resettlement entails exactly, and many terms are used to describe this process, including assimilation, adaptation, and cultural pluralism. Often refugees are expected to assimilate completely into American culture, which entails relinquishing previous customs and traditions and adopting the cultural traditions and social boundaries of a new setting. Adaptation involves adjusting to a new environment to the extent of successful navigation of the host society but includes maintaining prior cultural practices. Cultural pluralism is viewed as a functional medium between two cultures. That is, one can learn a new language and social system while traditional cultural norms and practices are adhered to simultaneously. In the eyes of federal assistance agencies, however, successful resettlement requires only one thing: employment. Having a steady job increases the likelihood of economic independence allowing for a successful transition into the American life. It is argued by some that the most successful resettlement experiences are those that foster cultural pluralism and involve a host community free of ethnocentric views of foreigners. The debate is not entirely about defining a successful resettlement but about whichever form will yield the best results for a life in a new culture.

**Cultural Factors: Education and Religion**

Education has been the focus of refugee studies in an effort to document access to resources and motivations for academic achievement. In the majority of resettlement cases refugees are placed in urban or suburban communities. These areas usually have, within reasonable distance, schools and community amenities. When refugees move from the community where they were initially settled it can become detrimental to their educational outcomes. Palladino (2008) studied twice-migrated Sudanese refugees’ educational needs, and his findings included children acting as parental translators and having trouble adjusting to American youth. At the very beginning the students were subdued, yet tempted by the new sense of freedom. By the end of their first year they embraced the mass culture. They were influenced by their fellow classmates and by mass media campaigns, and they began to neglect their studies.

Educational institutions are the settings in which many of the hopes of refugee youth materialize, and can perform an important role in orientating them to the culture of the host country (Joyce 2010). For refugees that are of primary or secondary education ages, it is crucial to provide integrative services. Refugees who are at a post-secondary potential should be informed of educational opportunities within their community.

Studies have also focused on religiosity and its impact on assimilation and adaptation processes (Burwell, Hill, Van Wicklin 1986). The tendency to sacrifice traditional religious practices as an assimilation technique into U.S. Christian culture is documented in the refugee literature. Often refugees find it necessary to assimilate to the religion of the dominant culture in order to operate within society without feeling ostracized. Ironically, this practice often leads to feelings of isolation. One study found that 70% of refugees changed their religious views upon arrival to the United States with the majority of cases from non-Christian to Christian. Despite this trend, there have been a few successful resettlement communities with unique approaches to receiving refugees which promote religious and cultural pluralism. For example, in Utica, New York one in every six community members is a refugee. The community flourishes with ethnic diversity and encourages cultural pluralism through festivals, religious diversity, community service events, education, and a unique approach of taking into consideration not only what the community has to do for the refugee but the potential that the refugee has for the community (Smith 2008). Raising cultural awareness reduces ethnocentrism in host communities. One of the attributes of success Utica has demonstrated is the attention paid to individual refugees, their stories, and their current involvement.

**Narrative Refugee Research**

In her 2007 study of Iranian refugees, Ghorashi indicates the importance of life stories in understanding and researching refugees. She argues that without the firsthand accounts of life stories, refugees are not given the oppor-
tunity to be accurately represented in research. Rather, understanding the refugee experience is best understood through life stories and personal accounts of interacting with social systems and groups. Methods which emphasize surveys and statistical analysis of population data or satisfaction with resettlement only allow for the presentation of a problem. Ghorashi’s methodology consists of life story collection in one-on-one settings. She views identity as an “unsettled space” in order to capture the sense of changing identities and experiences among her participants.

Sowa (2009) conducted mentoring work with Burundian refugees and greatly emphasized his ability to garner life experiences and immediate needs from the individuals as a result of face-to-face conversations in normal settings. He observes that the mere act of inquiry about one’s personal experiences can account for genuine interest leading to the development of conversations that yield in-depth information about one’s life. Similar practices need to be implemented in order to develop the most comprehensive services and programs for the refugee community by drawing attention to the refugee narrative. Few studies have attempted to do so.

Methodology

This study used convenience sampling to recruit participants, first through university faculty and second via local social services agencies. This sampling method resulted in interviews with two participants for a pilot study. Participants were selected on the basis of being 18 years of age or older, English speakers, and who identify socially and legally as refugees living in middle Tennessee. Participants then referred friends and family members for participation in subsequent study.

In-depth interviews were conducted with each participant after obtaining informed consent. Each participant was given a copy of the consent form and briefed about what to expect from the interview and informed that they were allowed to terminate the interview at anytime free of penalty. With participants’ permission, interviews were audio recorded and consisted of open-ended questions conducted in an informal conversational manner. A loose structure of questions and probes were used to direct focus back to a specific topic or to steer the conversation in a particular direction.

The lack of firsthand account in the recent resettlement research made this method particularly relevant to the study. The in-depth interviewing served as a means for refugees to share their experiences in a manner free of judgment or discrimination. Confidentiality assurance also encouraged participants to express personal views and opinions on experiences with social service agencies without fearing severance from services or benefits. Open-ended questions gave the opportunity for participants to speak freely on a variety of issues and to focus on experiences they were inclined to relay or expand upon.

Once interviews were conducted they were transcribed into word-processed documents for analysis. This pilot study of two interviews was conducted to serve as a point of reference interview protocol and technique refinement for future study. Participants who volunteered for the pilot study come from different backgrounds and resettlement experiences, but both are male refugees living in the middle Tennessee area. The length of residency was almost nine years for one of them and a year and a half for the other. Participants were assigned pseudonyms, Rajiv and David which are referred to in their narratives and descriptions of their resettlement experiences.

Results

Initial Relocation

Rajiv reported being resettled in a central geographical location in close proximity to other refugees of the same ethnic background, including others from the same refugee camps.

I don’t know what it is like for people of other ethnic backgrounds or communities but to the people from our ethnic background as I have seen, we live in the same complex and most of the residents are Bhutanese. That has really, really been helpful in times of need or in celebration or times of meetings. Like we seek help and share our help in decision making or in moving in apartments so that has really, really been helpful to everybody.

He reported benefits from having a close-knit community where language, food, and traditions are freely practiced. Benefits of the surrounding community also include shared transportation, job references, and companionship with others in a foreign world.

David’s experience stood in stark contrast to Rajiv’s. His initial relocation took place with no friends or family, and he was relocated into a dormitory type apartment facility where he occupied a single bedroom. Severe isolation was reported in the lack of familiarity with other ethnic groups. Refugees were housed in the complex but had varying ethnicities and extreme communication barriers. The resulting isolation impeded success in adaptation to the new environment. He commented on how he witnessed the interactions of those who could not communicate effectively in English.

For people who do not speak English it is very hard for them, it is just like putting someone in the jungle by him or herself and you don’t know where you
are. There is no GPS to find anyone, you are all alone. This is interesting to note because David was resettled in the previously mentioned community of Utica, where a substantial amount of the population are refugees and where integration is considered successful. But in David’s case, he lacked confidence in his resettlement agency and his ability to connect to the locals. Even though he shared the dominant religion of Christianity and spoke English he suffered from severe isolation.

**Interaction with Service Agencies**

Rajiv was very fond of the agency that helped in his resettlement process. He felt it provided every opportunity he needed to successfully transition to life as an American. Overall, the agency left a good impression on him, so much so that now he is employed by a local resettlement agency. This participant is an advocate for other refugees and encourages prolonged interaction with social service agencies. He views agencies as a beneficial resource in resettlement. He has also worked with resettlement programs to create ethnically specific media.

Again, David’s experiences differed. He expressed satisfactory experiences except for his initial feelings of isolation. After federal assistance ceased, he had no further interaction with agencies for a period of a few years. He reported a lack of English-language skills and lack of funding that accompanied the agency which aided in his relocation.

*I cannot blame them because they don’t have money of their own. They go and beg people to give them money. They do a great job and I commend them for that. There are things I can say that they need to fix or improve on but those are minor issues.*

While he expressed gratitude for the assistance he received upon his arrival he reports no need for further contact with service agencies. The only benefit being the ability to use agencies to locate groups who share his ethnicity.

**Employment Experiences**

In both cases, the participants obtained employment within three months of their arrival. Rajiv and David both obtained jobs working in food production companies. This was the only line of work they found available to them given that they had not yet been issued Social Security numbers. Subsequent jobs varied for each individual. Rajiv was hired as a case worker for a resettlement agency and David is a master’s student in biostatistics and is currently completing an internship.

Although employment was secured shortly after arrival for both participants they also reported it as one of the harder parts of relocation. Not having contacts or family/friends to network with made it harder for job hunting. Transportation was listed as one of the determining factors in securing employment. When jobs were found transportation was also a barrier to maintaining employment. Both participants reported instances when commuting to their place of employment took no less than five hours per day. As David said:

*At my first job it started at 12:30 and I had to leave three hours early to get to work on the bus. Another downside is the bus services were from six in the morning until twelve at night but at my work there was a starting time but no end time. So there were days when we had to work until 3am so we would have to try and find other ways home.*

**Religious and Cultural Practices**

Inquiry about religious practices yielded differing results. Rajiv continually strayed from discussing personal religious practices but spoke strongly of the religious tolerance of his people in dealing with tension in the religious community. Religious conversion to Christianity was not viewed as an often-occurring event, and other specific religions were not mentioned. A wedding ceremony was vaguely described but tolerance was quickly emphasized over anything else, possibly the result of a notorious religious divide within the community. The biggest religious difference post-resettlement was the ability to perform traditional religious ceremonies.

*We still do some kind of religious performances at home here we are in a kind of crowded apartment and back home we had our own space. We could just dance or play a loud music or perform some of the religious performances with cows or some religious song. We used to do in a very big way but here, owing to the city life and that we are living on someone else’s property, that is why we have to do the religious things within a room and that is a kind of change.*

In contrast, David spoke fervently about his Christian conversion and diligent practice of the religion, citing it as one of the contributing factors of his resettlement success. Several times Christianity was credited as the reason or outcome of certain events. He goes to great lengths to maintain religious activity with others of the same ethnicity, often driving over 100 miles weekly to make contact. When asked about cultural barriers, David said that rather than barriers he experienced cultural differences.

*The way we do our dating is different. Sometimes a girl will paint two of the guys fingers so when I came here I had my two fingers painted by one of my friends. When I went to the center there were some Bosnian girls who looked at my hand and then she jumped up and ran off. I didn’t understand so I asked someone who had been here longer and they said*
it meant I was gay, but I didn’t know what gay meant so I had to look up homosexual. So I went home and I scratched it off.

While David did not mention experiencing any barriers to practicing traditional ceremonies or religious services, he did witness the extreme cultural differences here in the United States. While the resettlement agency provided shelter and food there was a lack of effort to produce cultural integration. David mentioned this but clarified that he did not blame the agencies because of their lack of funding. Cultural education and exposure for refugees is imperative for a successful integration and revealing these experiences will help to aid in the creation of services.

In discussing social relationships and bonds that helped them resettle, each of the participants referenced having an experience with who the participants refer to as the “other.” In these cases they were defined as white individuals who took the time to aid in their resettlement. These “white others” as they are defined by the participants maintained religious affiliations and were both involved in transportation efforts.

I had this white lady who was my case worker at Catholic Charities. She was nice. She lived very far away. She would drive to come and pick us up from work at three o’clock in the morning in another city and then drive back home. She did this for two months and then I started looking for a car.

Rajiv’s experience also included financial assistance from the “other” benefactor.

I found a very generous white man. I met him in a church and he knew about the new Bhutanese community. He came to our apartment complex and he asked if we needed any help. I told him I was having issues with transportation and he told me he would teach me how to have driving lessons. He is actually a doctor. He gave me a lot of driving lessons and he paid for them and took me to DMV and helped get a license and I got a license.

While both individuals were affiliated with local religious organizations, neither apparently made any attempts at proselytizing. Both benefactors played an integral role in the successful resettlement of the participants, and did so without government support. Their help was remembered fondly by both refugees, and the white benefactors were credited with selflessly easing a burden of the newly arrived.

Discussion and Conclusion

Within the pilot study there were similar reports of hardship and success. Overall, there was a general feeling of resilience conveyed by the participants, especially when their struggles were viewed in retrospect having been forcefully moved quite literally around the world. Initial expectations were that extreme differences in cultural habits and daily activities such as practicing religion, eating, and socializing would be the largest obstacles to successful resettlement. On the contrary, these were among the smaller hindrances in adapting to a new life.

Cultural barriers were limited in the realm of religion. Sharing land and space was an issue during cultural celebrations and festivals but freedom and ease of access to practice a whole spectrum of religions was reported. This could be in part due to the fact that many of the nongovernmental resettlement agencies are faith-based and are organized along religious lines, and in an effort to initiate positive relations with refugees often displaced because of religious reasons, religious freedom is prolific in their mission statements. Another aspect of resettlement that seemed to yield little to no discrepancy were the men’s dietary habits. Given the close proximity of ethnically diverse groceries, all of the familiar food staples were readily available for the continuation of a traditional diet.

The major obstacles that the refugees in this pilot study reported were issues with transportation and obtaining employment. As they both spoke English it was easier for them to secure a job, and they were both initially placed in entry level positions as factory workers in overnight food-processing plants. The issue of uncoordinated transportation is recurring and could be due to the lack of budgeting governmental funding. The assistance received in the first six to eight months of resettlement is not commonly applied to transportation; these funds are for clothing, food, and basic necessities. There are often no extra finances to save for a vehicle. However, an interesting theme arose from the interviews regarding community collaboration on transportation.

Once an individual or family obtained a vehicle they would proceed to act as a carpool for many fellow refugees and families. Since this communal support system was mentioned more than once by both individuals it is worth exploring in subsequent interviews to see how communal support and proximity to members of like ethnic groups positively affects resettlement.

One aspect of refugee resettlement that has been researched is the individual’s mental health and well-being post-migration. Unfortunately, this issue was not a topic of discussion in the pilot study but will be addressed in future research. Refugees are at a high risk of developing mental health problems due to a variety of factors that increase their vulnerability. These factors can be present both pre- and post-resettlement. Present-day conflicts intentionally involve civilian populations and the massive human rights violations that occur impose serious risks on millions of people. The cognitive, emotional and socio-economic burden imposed on individuals, the family
and the communities are enormous. It is estimated that, on average, over 50 percent of refugees present mental health problems ranging from chronic mental disorders to trauma, distress, and great deal of suffering (WHO 2005).

There are several different models of mental health utilized by professionals today, but the most common is the medical model. This model focuses on the diagnosis of pathological conditions or disorders, epidemiological studies, and the treatment of symptoms through pharmacological or other psychotherapeutic interventions (Ryan 2008). However, arguments opposed to this model based exist. Continuously tagging refugees as trauma victims leads to stereotypes of refugees as “sick” and plagued by PTSD (Carlson Rosser-Hogan 1991). Trauma discourse focuses on high-impact situations that occur pre-migration and it tends to overlook the needs of refugees in daily life during resettlement.

In future studies, interviews should be structured in a way that probes further into the causes and repercussions of hardships. Doing so will aid in the creation of more comprehensive services. Although refugee resettlement is federally funded, the direct experiences of these individuals needs to be documented in order to better allocate funds and properly serve these populations. An in-depth study with more participants is currently underway at the writing of this report and will follow this pilot study in publication sequence.

References


Democracy and Crime in the International System

Chris Young
Dr. J. Douglas Heffington
History Department

Three perspectives have been used to analyze the impact of democratization on crime. The civilization perspective predicts that crime will go down as democracy civilizes people. The modernization perspective predicts that crime will rise during the democratic transition but that it will eventually recede. The conflict perspective predicts that crime will rise as democracy accompanied with market forces creates more inequality leading to crime. The evidence thus far shows that the conflict and modernization perspectives to be most accurate. While many countries have experienced the modernization perspective, many others have seen inequalities rise with crime becoming a staple in their society. This research hypothesizes that as education levels rise that crime will go down hoping to provide a link between why some countries have modernized while others remain in conflict.

The end of the 20th century saw a rapid transformation of political regimes unparalleled in human history as many governments shifted from authoritarian to democratic forms of government. This period came to be known as the “third wave” (Huntington 1991), beginning in Southern Europe in the 1970s, spreading to Latin America and parts of Asia in the 1980s, and then moving on to parts of Sub-Saharan Africa, Eastern Europe, and the Soviet Union in the late 1980s and early 1990s (Potter et al. 1997).

This period of democratization coincided with a rise in violent crime across the world. Lafree and Drass (2002) found that homicide rates doubled during the last four decades of the 20th century with evidence pointing specifically toward recently democratized states experiencing a drastic rise in violent crime in Latin America (Diamond 1999), Sub-Saharan Africa (Reza, Mercy, and Krug 2000; Daniel, Southall, and Lutchman 2005) and Eastern Europe (Barak 2000; Backman 1998).

Some scholars suggest that this can be explained by modernization theory. Durkheim (1947) presumes that crime rises when older values conflict with newer, modern societal roles. This view is supported by Lafree and Drass’ study (2005) which found that 70 percent of industrializing countries had experienced homicide “booms” (defined as rates that increase rapidly and exhibit a positive sustained change in direction) during this period compared to fewer than 21 percent of industrialized countries. This suggests that violence is most prevalent during the transitional phase.

The conflict perspective states that capitalist, democratic societies increase inequalities, unemploy- ment, and social disorder (Chambliss 1976; Bohm 1982). This conflict theory is often combined with similar predictions from world systems theorists who describe the world as divided between “core” countries that prosper by exploiting raw materials and low-cost labor in “peripheral countries” (Wallerstein 1979). This suggests that the global system constrains development in “periphery countries,” preventing them from attaining decent housing, social services, and living wages while at same time introducing rising crime rates. Cebulak (1996) noticed this trend emerge in Eastern Europe with a rise in crime after democratization.

Contrary to this viewpoint is the civilization perspective (Elias 1938, 1979) which asserts that modernization allows states to legitimately monopolize the use of violence and put a greater emphasis on legality when conflict arises. The civilization perspective also maintains that growing economic development greatly lowers the incentive for nations to go to war as they become economically interdependent. But Eisner’s (2001) study of seven Western European countries displays a rise...
in crime rates after 1950, indicating that perhaps democratic, modernized states are just as likely to experience high homicide rates domestically after democratization.

While most states have experienced rising homicide rates after democratization, many others that initially saw a rise in murder rates have seen their homicide rates level out. This perhaps suggests that the modernization perspective is the trajectory that most states take. Despite this, many other countries like Brazil and South Africa have seen their homicide rates increase, leading others to believe that the conflict perspective is more accurate. Interestingly, in countries that have seen their homicide rates drop, literacy rates have first risen before GDP levels rise. This study analyzes qualitatively why Russia, Brazil, and South Africa appear to be on the trajectory to tempered homicide rates.

**Russia**

For much of the 20th century, Russia operated under an authoritarian model maintaining strict ownership over economic enterprises by regulating prices, taxes, investments, and interest rates, and the entry and exit of enterprises (Oglobin 1997). But during Russia’s transition from a communist economy to a market economy, these economic norms were demolished by the state.

Under Stalinist Russia, all basic property rights were under the control of the state, along with the rights to profit from them. But as communism continued, the state’s ability to monitor performance lessened as the security police’s role declined and corruption spread. This allowed for profits to be fabricated and left little incentive to maximize profits due to absence of privatization.

Despite this, communist Russia was a very educated society focusing initially on Marxist-Leninist philosophy. Before 1917 when the communists came to power, only 30 percent of Russia’s population was literate with only 105 higher learning institutions operating in the country (Sweeney 1994). This changed significantly as Lenin quickly implemented an educational system that “established four years of compulsory primary education in the countryside and seven years of education in the towns” (Sweeney 1994). As a result, 81 percent of Russian children over the age of nine became literate.

With the intent of cultivating communist consciousness and industrial production, Stalin rid Russia of the liberal teaching methods that had been instituted during the late 1920s and 1930s in Russia. He instead put in place a rigid curriculum stressing “obedience, industriousness, and loyalty, teaching just facts” (Sweeney 1994). Ideally, this was supposed to produce the new “Soviet man” full of industriousness and communist ideals. Lenin stated “the entire purpose of training, educating, and teaching the youth of today should be to imbue them with communist ethics. The school apart from life, apart from politics, is hypocrisy.”

Communist Russia relentlessly socialized its society in collectivistic fashion, stripping away individualistic ideals by embedding in society the love of one’s labor regardless of the rigors involved in the occupation. From the beginning of their lives, Russian citizens were taught these ideals along with atheist teachings adhering to Marxist principles stating that religion supported the elites in society. While Russia’s educational system formed a strong base for a communist society, it failed in its ability to teach its citizenry to act independently and creatively.

Despite increasing the effectiveness of Russia’s education system during communism, it did not maximize its capacity as an engine for the Russian economy. Overshadowed by communist principles, economic development in communist Russia stagnated as it transitioned into a market economy. After the transition, “governments were compelled to accelerate the pace of creating not simply large, but also efficient, educational systems which were differentiated according to the educational demands of the market economies. They were less able to supply the quantities of education that had previously been supplied” (Borevskaya and Bray 2001).

Before the economic transition, much of Russia’s educational system operated under a high degree of government centralization, leaving little room for flexibility. As a result, after the fall of communism lower levels of bureaucracy were unprepared for the financing of education to a mass populace. This led to mass geographic and social disparities within Russia (Micklewright 1999). Coupled with globalization, the surge in private enterprises near the end of the 20th century increased the cost of business, leaving Russia woefully unprepared for the surge in education costs (Green 1997).

Simultaneously, education in Russia became more accessible to the masses as more variation in educational services was provided (Micklewright 1999). But as noted in a policy review in the OECD: (1) Increased choice in Russian education paradoxically diminished educational opportunities for many children, especially those who were rural, less affluent, or well-connected—regardless of individual merit. … As Russian society became increasingly stratified in terms of wealth, Russia became increasingly stratified in terms of opportunity (OECD, 1998).

The sudden privatization of the Russian educational system burdened Russian citizens economically as the decentralization of the Russian economy led to a “collapse in investment, declining industrial production, and hyper-
inflation” (Galbraith & Krytynskaia & Wang 2003). Between the years of 1992 and 1994, economic GDP fell an average of 12 percent per year (Brainerd 1998). After the fall of communism, Russia experienced negative growth rates for more than a decade (Fan, Overland & Spagat 1999). Fan, et al. noted that incentives for Russian young people to acquire human capital were poor for two main reasons:

First, the Russian educational system, to a first approximation just a deteriorating version of the Soviet system, does not currently serve as an efficient tool for market-oriented human capital investments. Rather it is still geared toward teaching the skills demanded by the Soviet economy.

Second, Minicerian returns to the human capital that is obtaining within the Russian system are not particularly high (Fan, Overland & Spagat 1999).

Links between earnings and education in 1992 of Russian wages in transitional economies were relatively low according to many scholars. In one study, Brainerd (1998) argue contrarily that the returns to education increased significantly between 1991 and 1994. But Nesterova and Sabirianova (1998) find a strong reversal in these findings from 1994 to 1996. Oglobin (1997) shows that returns to human capital weakened at the end of 1996 preceding the market crash of 1998. This in turn resulted in many young people trading school for work as taxi drivers, street vendors, or in organized crime.

Jones (1994) finds that just three years after the fall of communism in Russia that the number of young people in higher education had fallen by 10 percent as class attendance and school performance at all levels dropped precipitously. As a result, Kitaev (1994) noticed a sharp increase in children deeply involved in criminal activity in Russian society. In the same way that the decentralization of Russia’s economy affected its educational system, a similar impact spread across Russian society as crime increased drastically. Los (2003) states that diverse forms of state privatization opened enormous new opportunities for theft, unlawful profit, corruption, illicit pressure on the legislature and executive bodies, organized extortion and protection rackets, violent turf wars, and more.

With the implosion of the old economy, the race to pick up the pieces went on simultaneously with the formation of the rules of the new economy.

Los observes that the new state of Russia “formed from the beginning as an entity hospitable to criminal schemes and compatible with unfettered looting of the national economy and subordination of the market to narrow interests” Before privatization, Russia’s Communist Party controlled all of the state’s financial resources. Such centralization allowed criminal activity to surge after communism (Handleman, 1994). In the waning day of Russia’s Communist Party, political elites consolidated economic power by acquiring private businesses while maintaining power over state property (Timofeyev 1992).

As this occurred, “corruption and crime gradually became re-conceptualized as a market phenomenon, making political influence just another commodity to be bought in agreement with the laws of supply and demand” (Los 1998). Along with this, homicide rates rose drastically as Russia’s victimization rate of about 30 per 100,000 residents was five times higher than in the United States (Kim and Pridemore 2003). Kim and Pridemore also find that regional homicide rates increased by nearly 14 per 100,000 between 1991 and 2000, representing a greater than 80 percent increase.

Despite this evidence, it does not fully explain Russia’s surge in crime and homicide after democratization. During this period, alcohol consumption and urbanization also rose, leading some to believe that democracy alone could not be blamed for the surge in crime. Gilinskiy (2006) points to Russia’s geography, its culture of despotism, and its bad economy as contributing factors to the surge in crime.

Chervyakov, McKee, Pridemore, and Shkolnikov (2002) see a link between educational attainment and homicides committed. In 1990, most Russians committing homicide had completed secondary education. By 1998, the number of Russians committing homicide having completed specialized secondary education had declined noticeably. This surge in crime occurred simultaneously as Russia experienced a steep economic decline after the fall of communism. Between 1991 and 1998, Russia lost an estimated 30% of real gross domestic product while also experiencing high rates of inflation. Along with this, disposable income declined 25% in real terms between 1993 and 1999 as the ruble collapsed due to inflation, leaving many Russian citizens without savings.

At the same time, the homicide rate started to rise. The homicide rate jumped from 1990 to 2001 as Russia was becoming a less educated society. In recent years, though, homicide has started to go down. In 2006, the homicide rated declined by 10% from 2005. This pattern continued as murder continued to drop precipitously.

Despite the significant drop in the homicide rate, a clear relationship to educational achievement cannot be made. The data provided, however, do show that educational achievement was lower as homicide rates in Russia started to rise. It can be assumed that economic hardship makes it harder to educate society due to the financial constraints on society. This perhaps suggests that crime becomes increasingly incentivized during times of economic crisis, perhaps explaining Russia’s rapid crime surge after its transition to a market economy.
Brazil

After experiencing military rule from 1964 to 1984, Brazil transitioned into a democratic form of government after a very gradual, controlled process initiated by General Geisel (Amadeo 1993). Following Geisel, General Figueiredo continued to slowly move Brazil to a democracy, finally culminating in 1985 with the election of a civilian president. While under military rule, Brazil’s economy performed extremely well, greatly reducing poverty. During this period, Brazil became fully industrialized and transferred which were quite regressive” (Amadeo 1993).

Brazil’s fiscal policies implemented during the 1970s did much to reduce poverty in all income groups. Despite this, Brazil’s economic success did little to reduce economic inequalities. Its policies instead exacerbated inequalities with regards to the “structure of social expenditures, subsidies and transfers which were quite regressive” (Amadeo 1993).

Under military rule, Brazil attained an 11 percent annual growth rate and became an economic miracle in the Latin American region (Wynia 1990). Yet, Brazil’s economic woes manifested during the 1980s, due in large part to the oil crisis of the 1970s which increased the cost of imports significantly. In an attempt to continue economic growth, Brazil borrowed money from the international market made available by the increased investment of OPEC nations. It had borrowed $40 billion by 1979 at floating interest rates (Wynia 1990).

Soon after, interest rates on the money borrowed quickly doubled as Brazil’s government was compelled to borrow more money to make past payments, increasing its foreign debt to $100 billion. Elites quickly started to pressure the government as Brazil’s economy faltered under its large debt burden. As a result, basic human rights were restored and new political parties were formed as the military dictatorship started to loosen its firm grip on power (Wynia, 1990).

In 1985, Brazil elected president Jose Sarney, officially making Brazil a democracy. The country’s transformation to a democratic country occurred while in the midst of an economic malaise. Following the 1982 debt crisis in Brazil, the annual growth over the next two decades reached only one-third of the 1960-1980 average (Adrogué, Cerisola, and Gelos 2010). Barro (2003) says a sharp increase in government consumption can be blamed for Brazil’s poor economic performance during the 1980s, noting that government consumption tends to be associated with low-efficiency and a larger tax burden of the private sector.

Bacha and Bonelli (2004) instead blame the economic slowdown on Brazil’s lack of capital formation, believed to be a result of the post-war import substitution development strategy pursued by Brazil. The economic slowdown internationally during the 1980s showed the vulnerability of low-income countries.

Brazil’s economic malaise continued into the 1990s with sluggish annual per capita growth from 1980-1998 of 0.28 percent, significantly below the 4.25% between 1950-1980 (Bugarin, Ellery, Gomes, and Teixeira 2002). But during this period, Campos suggests the “supply side” economic reforms reduced regulatory intervention and increased competition through privatization, deregulation, and trade liberalization, helping to lift productivity growth. Campos believes much of Brazil’s economic success is to be attributed to the economic reforms made during this period. Bonelli (2005) notes that privatization during the 1990s made Brazil attractive to foreign investors and led to greater productivity and investment.

As Brazil struggled economically after democratization, homicide rose drastically, especially in the larger cities. Between 1979 and 1997, the homicide rate increased from 11.5 to 25.4 murders per 100,000 inhabitants. Or 120 percent (Bittencourt, 2002). In 1996, the homicide rate in Brazil was 47.3, rising drastically from 1981 when it was 14.62 (Caldeira and Holston 1999). By 2001, Brazil led the world in percentage of murders committed by firearms with firearms causing 78 percent of all homicides committed that year (2002 UNESCO Report). In Rio de Janeiro alone, 2,050 homicides occurred between January and November 2002. In 2001, there were 2,227 homicides; in 2000, there were 2,050; and in 1999, there were 1,898 (Nucleo de Pesquisa e Analise Criminal 2002, www.nvapolicia.rj.gov).

In an attempt to curb crime, Brazil has implemented many policies at the state and federal levels. In the state
Table 1 Recorded crimes, offenders and convicted persons in Russia 1980-2005. Part A.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Recorded Crimes</th>
<th>Rate per/100,00</th>
<th>Recorded by Police</th>
<th>Convicted Persons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>1,028,284</td>
<td>742.2</td>
<td>880,908</td>
<td>645,544</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>1,087,908</td>
<td>779.7</td>
<td>919,001</td>
<td>682,506</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>1,128,558</td>
<td>803.1</td>
<td>988,946</td>
<td>747,865</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>1,398,239</td>
<td>988.1</td>
<td>1,007,802</td>
<td>809.147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>1,402,694</td>
<td>984.4</td>
<td>1,123,351</td>
<td>863,194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>1,416,935</td>
<td>987.5</td>
<td>1,154,496</td>
<td>837,310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>1,338,424</td>
<td>929.9</td>
<td>1,128,439</td>
<td>797,286</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>1,185,914</td>
<td>816.9</td>
<td>969,388</td>
<td>580,074</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>1,220,861</td>
<td>833.9</td>
<td>834,673</td>
<td>427,039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>1,619,181</td>
<td>1098.5</td>
<td>847,577</td>
<td>436,988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>1,839,451</td>
<td>1242.5</td>
<td>897,299</td>
<td>537,643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>2,173,074</td>
<td>1463.2</td>
<td>956,258</td>
<td>593,823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>2,760,652</td>
<td>1856.5</td>
<td>1,148,962</td>
<td>661,392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>2,799,614</td>
<td>1887.8</td>
<td>1,262,737</td>
<td>792,410</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>2,632,708</td>
<td>1778.4</td>
<td>1,441,568</td>
<td>924,754</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>2,755,669</td>
<td>1862.7</td>
<td>1,595,501</td>
<td>1,035,807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>2,625,081</td>
<td>1778.4</td>
<td>1,618,394</td>
<td>1,111,097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>2,397,311</td>
<td>1629.3</td>
<td>1,372,161</td>
<td>1,013,431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>2,581,940</td>
<td>1759.5</td>
<td>1,481,503</td>
<td>1,071,051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>3,001,748</td>
<td>2051.4</td>
<td>1,716,679</td>
<td>1,223,255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>2,952,367</td>
<td>2028.2</td>
<td>1,741,439</td>
<td>1,183,631</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>2,968,255</td>
<td>2039.2</td>
<td>1,644,242</td>
<td>1,244,211</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>2,526,305</td>
<td>1754.9</td>
<td>1,257,700</td>
<td>859,318</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>2,756,305</td>
<td>1926.2</td>
<td>1,236,733</td>
<td>737,371</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>2,893,810</td>
<td>2026.5</td>
<td>1,222,504</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>3,554,738</td>
<td>2499.8</td>
<td></td>
<td>1,297,123</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Homicide

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Homicide Rate (per 100,000 inhabitants)</th>
<th>Grievous Bodily Harm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>28.5</td>
<td>19.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986</td>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>14.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>13.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>18.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>25.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>27.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>27.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>15.5</td>
<td>36.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>45.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>45.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>41.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>19.9</td>
<td>36.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>19.9</td>
<td>31.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>20.1</td>
<td>30.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>21.3</td>
<td>32.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000</td>
<td>21.9</td>
<td>34.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>38.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>22.4</td>
<td>40.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>22.1</td>
<td>39.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>22.1</td>
<td>40.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>21.7</td>
<td>40.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Brazilian Economic Growth from 1931 to 2000.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Periods</th>
<th>GDP</th>
<th>Physical Capital</th>
<th>Labor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1931-50</td>
<td>5.14</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td>0.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1951-63</td>
<td>6.88</td>
<td>2.60</td>
<td>0.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964-80</td>
<td>7.79</td>
<td>2.69</td>
<td>0.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981-93</td>
<td>1.64</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994-00</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>0.69</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 2. Breakdown of Labor Force According to Education Level Achieved, 1950 to 2000.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Illiterate</td>
<td>48.3%</td>
<td>41.4</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>13.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower Basic (0-4)</td>
<td>43.9</td>
<td>50.5</td>
<td>54.6</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper Basic (5-9)</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>32.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate (10-12)</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>14.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College (13-17)</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>18.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


of Ceara, the government created the Secretariat of Public Security and Defense of Citizenship, which unified the command of the state police system and initiated reform based on three criteria: behavioral change, structural reform, and community and operational integration. Bittencourt notes that this allowed the system to “modernize its communications, establish an integrated management structure and operations center, create community partnerships, and implement new training programs that were consistent with established general guidelines.” As a result, crime dropped in Ceara. Many of their policies were duplicated in the Brazilian states Minas Gerais and Sao Paulo.

Despite this, crime continues to persist throughout Brazil leaving it a very insecure state. Firearms are widely available as the number of registered guns purchased in the metropolitan region jumped from 9,832 in 1983 to 66,780 in 1994, up 580 percent (Caldeira and Holston 1999). In Sao Paulo, police reports of illegal possession of guns grew an average of 9.5 percent a year between 1981 and 1996. This rise in illegal gun possession directly correlates with the rise in homicides in Brazil. Souza (1994) notes that homicides by firearm constituted 14.8 percent of the total homicides in Sao Paulo in 1980; in 1989, 31.2 percent.

This rise in homicides occurred right as Brazil democratized in the midst of a struggling economy. Democratization in Brazil occurred at a time when inequalities in education were actually narrowing. But this is a deceiving statistic due to the still-high illiteracy rate in Brazil. While more people completed post-secondary education, Brazil remained at the time of its democratization extremely unequal in terms of
education. From this, it can be assumed that equal access to education declines during times of economic malaise further incentivizing homicide as a means of economic survival.

South Africa

Contrary to Brazil and Russia, homicide rates were already a significant problem in some sectors of South African society as democratization neared. Between 1976 and 1977, 122 blacks were murdered by other blacks and 136 whites by whites (Super 2010). Super notices similar trends with other violent crimes, finding that 101, 916 blacks were assaulted by other blacks, 12, 244 whites by whites and 8, 245 assaults across racial lines.

As the struggle against apartheid intensified during the 1980s, violent crime continued to surge in South Africa. In a form of resistance, many black South Africans made cities and townships ungovernable by

- unrest (petrol bomb incidents; arson; fire damage; looting; hand grenade incidents; persons killed by others; injured by others; killed by security forces; injured by security forces; killed by development board officials); unrest at and the boycott of teaching institutions; events in the field of labor; acts


As the turmoil continued, says Glaser (1998), it became difficult to distinguish between acts of political unrest and criminality. Glaser observes how this phenomenon of violence was oftentimes deemed a “public act of symbolic revenge.” He also notes that gangs further complicated the situation by often working in coalition with protesters in acts of criminality.

While many view the 1994 political transition away from apartheid in South Africa as a time of heightened criminal activity, statistics show that violent crime became increasingly problematic in South Africa in 1986 (Shaw, 1995). As Super (2010) notes though, the dismantling of apartheid simply allowed for likely offenders, who were typically young black men, to criminalize and victimize easier as their presence increased in white neighborhoods.

South African Economy

After apartheid, South Africa experienced modest economic gains, reversing the negative growth experienced during the waning years of apartheid as evidenced by the accompanying chart. South Africa experienced

![South African Economy](chart.png)

World Bank, WDI database on line, and OECD estimates.
modest growth the first 10 years after democracy as well as a gradual decline in global market share (OECD Economic Assessment of South Africa, 2008). In addition, the OECD report shows that the size of labor force has exceeded employment capacity, perhaps incentivizing crime as an alternative method for economic well-being.

Nonetheless, many economists herald the growth in South Africa during its democratic transition because of how poorly it performed during apartheid in the 1960s (du Plessis and Louw 2005). In the 1990s, South African GDP continued to recede. In 1993 at the end of the apartheid, South African wealth was extremely unevenly distributed with one of the highest Gini coefficients in the world at 0.65 (Whiteford 1995). During this time period, significant surges in crime occurred in many townships and cities across the country.

While crime rates have fallen in South Africa since the end of apartheid, crime remains out of control. In 2008, the murder rate was 37 per 100,000 inhabitants. Simultaneously, the UNDP (2003) found that the absolute number of poor people had grown but the proportion of people living in poverty declined slightly. This, however, coincided with a drop in the homicide rate, unlike in Brazil and Russia where poor economic growth resulted in a surge in homicide.

After apartheid, a notable increase in black enrollment occurred. This higher rate of school enrollment supports the thesis that homicide goes down as societies become more educated. But South Africa is an exceptional case due to its remarkable societal inequality and extremely low levels of school enrollment after apartheid. It must be noted that while South Africa has seen its homicide rate fall, human security remains extremely vulnerable.

Despite the higher levels of school enrollment in South Africa, it remains remarkably unequal in terms of educational attainment. Van der Berg (2007) notes that 70 percent of whites above age 26 had completed matric education or more with almost 15 percent having a degree. In contrast, only 19 percent of blacks over 26 years old had completed matric or more with only 1.4 percent having graduated. This
In contrast, Russia was remarkably egalitarian before its democratic transition. Its troubles arose out of an over-centralized bureaucracy woefully unprepared to finance education. As was the case with Brazil and South Africa, Russia saw its homicide rate surge as it transitioned into democracy. But in all three cases, homicide rates have gone down steadily as economic prospects improved and society became more educated. Transition states in the future may experience a similar trajectory.

There are limitations to this study. There is clear correlation between education levels and homicide rates but it does not account for other factors such as rapid urbanization, mass immigration, and social inequality that might have contributed heavily to the rise in homicide after democratization. Transition states in the future may experience a similar trajectory.

In each of the three case studies, homicide rates jumped drastically after democratic transition. While different in scope, they all suffered similar plagues after democratization. In the cases of Brazil and South Africa, both suffered from tremendous social and economic inequalities creating huge disparities. The transition to democracy in these countries left them both over-burdened in financing education due to the low levels of human capital.

In contrast, Russia was remarkably egalitarian before its democratic transition. Its troubles arose out of an over-centralized bureaucracy woefully unprepared to finance education. As was the case with Brazil and South Africa, Russia saw its homicide rate surge as it transitioned into democracy. But in all three cases, homicide rates have gone down steadily as economic prospects improved and society became more educated. Transition states in the future may experience a similar trajectory.

There are limitations to this study. There is clear correlation between education levels and homicide rates but it does not account for other factors such as rapid urbanization, mass immigration, and social inequality that might have contributed heavily to the rise in homicide after democratization.

While the conflict perspective initially proved to be most accurate, it appears that as government and societies become more stabilized that homicide rates begin to recede in Russia, Brazil, and South Africa. In all

### Table 3. South African Education: Student Enrollment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>Colored</th>
<th>Indian</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>2134</td>
<td>956</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>296</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>2373</td>
<td>1093</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>408</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>2430</td>
<td>1269</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>695</td>
<td>456</td>
<td>2326</td>
<td>1324</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td>930</td>
<td>575</td>
<td>2468</td>
<td>1391</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992</td>
<td>1081</td>
<td>809</td>
<td>2481</td>
<td>1461</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993</td>
<td>1256</td>
<td>1038</td>
<td>2290</td>
<td>1345</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>1764</td>
<td>1544</td>
<td>2297</td>
<td>1326</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>2106</td>
<td>2082</td>
<td>2360</td>
<td>1462</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>2119</td>
<td>2378</td>
<td>2078</td>
<td>1386</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997</td>
<td>2291</td>
<td>2747</td>
<td>2136</td>
<td>1416</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

three states, homicide rates appear to be leveling off after the initial surge, suggesting that the modernization perspective may provide the most explanatory power.

Works Cited


Bonelli, Regis. (2005). Productivity Performances in Developing Countries. UNIDO.


Potter, D., D. Goldblatt, M. Kiloh and P. Lewis, eds.  


