The Middle Tennessee State University

McNair Research Review

Volume II, Summer 2004
While the McNair Program staff has made every effort to assure a high degree of accuracy, rigor, and quality in the content of this publication, the interpretations and conclusions reached in each paper are those of the authors alone and not of the McNair Program. Any errors of omission are strictly the responsibility of each author.

The Middle Tennessee State University Ronald E. McNair Post-Baccalaureate Program is a Federal TRiO Program that is funded by the U.S. Department of Education under a $226,105 annual TRiO grant.
From the Director

As I draw near the end of my first year of service as director of MTSU’s McNair Scholars Program, I am both proud and amazed at the work that has been accomplished by the scholars, faculty mentors, and program personnel. The program’s second cycle of funding began on October 1, 2003. As a university community, we extend a special thank you to the U.S. Department of Education in Washington, D.C., for its continued support of the McNair Scholars Program.

Later in the journal, we recognize members of the Advisory Board for this cycle of funding. Service as an Advisory Board member is outside one’s assigned workload. Thus, the scholars and program staff are deeply appreciative of the encouragement and advice provided by this group of supporters.

A new academic coordinator started January 1, 2004. Dr. Mary Enderson is an associate professor in the department of Mathematical Sciences and is a valuable member of the McNair Management Team. The award for this funding cycle will support twenty-two scholars and their faculty mentors each year. Dr. Enderson will be working with both students and members of the faculty to make sure that scholars receive the support they need to reach their academic goals.

This publication is a product of the efforts of many people. The scholars and their faculty mentors are co-authors of the papers. Dr. Mary Enderson contributed editorial comments. Ms. Linda Brown and Ms. Cindy Howell shared their experiences from publishing Volume I of the McNair Research Review. The journal is designed, produced, and printed by Publications and Graphics and Printing Services at Middle Tennessee State University. My sincere appreciation goes to all who helped make Volume II a reality.

Sincerely,

L. Diane Miller
Director, McNair Scholars Program
To Our Readers

On behalf of the staff of the McNair Scholars Program at Middle Tennessee State University, we are thrilled to share with you the outstanding research efforts of our scholars and their faculty mentors. This is the second volume of our journal and we believe it illustrates the growth and development our scholars have made in the process of becoming researchers in their respective areas.

We would like to congratulate our scholars and thank the dedicated faculty mentors who supervised and guided the high quality research projects found in this journal publication. Many hours have been committed to these rather impressive projects and we believe readers will find the results and conclusions quite interesting.

Since the McNair Scholars Program is open to all disciplines, the journal is interdisciplinary in nature. One may observe some minor differences in the papers since each area has its own approach to professional writing and presentation. We view this as a strength of the journal and a strength to help prepare scholars for future work in their respective area.

The journal was designed, produced, and printed by Publications and Graphics and Printing Services at Middle Tennessee State University. Our sincere appreciation goes out to everyone who helped in the publication process. This volume is a tribute to all of the McNair Scholars and to their faculty mentors for their dedication, professionalism, and accomplishments.

Linda D. Brown
Program Coordinator

Mary C. Enderson
Academic Coordinator
Ronald E. McNair Post-baccalaureate Achievement Program  
(McNair Scholars Program at MTSU)

Advisory Board  
2003-2007

Anantha Babbili, Ph.D.  
Dean, College of Mass Communication

Gloria Bonner, Ed.D.  
Dean, College of Education and Behavioral Science

Jim Burton, Ph.D.  
Dean, Jennings A. Jones College of Business

Robert Carlton, Ph.D.  
Interim Vice Provost for Research and Dean, College of Graduate Studies

Thomas J. Cheatham, Ph.D.  
Dean, College of Basic and Applied Sciences

James C. Floyd, J.D.  
University Counsel and Assistant to the President

John Harris, M.S.  
Director, Disabled Student Services

David L. Hutton, M.S.  
Director, Financial Aid

John McDaniel, Ph.D.  
Dean, College of Liberal Arts

Ralph Metcalf, Ed.S.  
Director, Multicultural Affairs

Debra Sells, Ed.D.  
Associate Vice President, Academic Support Services

Forrestine Williams, Ed.D.  
Director, Equal Opportunity-Affirmative Action

Program Staff

Director  
L. Diane Miller, Ph.D.

Program Coordinator  
Linda D. Brown, M.B.A.

Academic Coordinator  
Mary C. Enderson

Administrative Assistant  
Cindy K. Howell
History of the Federal TRiO Programs

The history of TRiO is progressive. It began with Upward Bound, which emerged out of the Economic Opportunity Act of 1964 in response to the administration’s War on Poverty. In 1965, Talent Search, the second outreach program, was created as part of the Higher Education Act. In 1968, Student Support Services, which was originally known as Special Services for Disadvantaged Students, was authorized by the Higher Education Amendments and became the third in a series of educational opportunity programs. By the late 1960s, the term “TRiO” was coined to describe these federal programs.

Over the years, the TRiO Programs have been expanded and improved to provide a wider range of services and to reach more students who need assistance. The Higher Education Amendments of 1972 added the fourth program to the TRiO group by authorizing the Educational Opportunity Centers. The 1976 Education Amendments authorized the Training Program for Federal TRiO Programs, initially known as the Training Program for Special Programs Staff and Leadership Personnel. Amendments in 1986 added the sixth program, the Ronald E. McNair Postbaccalaureate Achievement Program. Additionally, in 1990, the Department created the Upward Bound Math/Science program to address the need for specific instruction in the fields of math and science. The Upward Bound Math/Science program is administered under the same regulations as the regular Upward Bound program, but it must be applied for separately. The Higher Education Amendments of 1998 authorized the TRiO Dissemination Partnership program to encourage the replication of successful practices of TRiO programs. Finally, the Omnibus Consolidated Appropriations Act of 2001 amended the Student Support Services (SSS) program to permit the use of program funds for direct financial assistance (Grant Aid) for current SSS participants who are receiving Federal Pell Grants.

The legislative requirements for all Federal TRiO Programs can be found in the Higher Education Act of 1965, Title IV, Part A, Subpart 2.

Ronald E. McNair, Ph.D.

Born October 21, 1950, in Lake City, South Carolina, Ronald McNair achieved early success as both a student and an athlete at Carver High School, Lake City, South Carolina. He graduated in 1967 as valedictorian of his high school class. Afterwards, he attended North Carolina A&T State University where he graduated magna cum laude in 1971 earning a B.S. degree in physics. He went on to earn a doctor of philosophy in physics from Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) in 1976, where he specialized in quantum electronics and laser technology. As a student, he performed some of the earliest work on chemical HF/DF and high-pressure CO lasers, publishing path-breaking scientific papers on the subject.

After completing his Ph.D., he began working as a physicist at the Optical Physics Department of Hughes Research Laboratories in Malibu, California, and conducted research on electro-optic laser modulation for satellite-to-satellite space communications.

In January 1978, NASA selected him to enter the astronaut cadre, making him one of the first three Black Americans selected. Dr. McNair died on January 28, 1986, when the Space Shuttle Challenger exploded after launch from the Kennedy Space Center.

About McNair Scholars and Program

The following information was taken from http://www.ed.gov/offices/OPE/HEP/trio/triohistory.html

Middle Tennessee’s McNair Scholars Program

Middle Tennessee State University Ronald E. McNair Post- baccalaureate Achievement Program is designed to serve first-generation and low-income students as well as students from groups underrepresented in doctoral level studies. Our program encourages talented students to pursue a doctoral degree by providing participants with a mentored research experience, study groups for crucial areas of discipline, and seminars and workshops on topics germane to the pursuit of graduate education. Participants gain experience in presenting their research at professional conferences where they have the opportunity to meet others in their discipline and exchange ideas. Participants attend graduate school fairs and visit university campuses to gain information on the possibilities for future attendance in graduate school.

The MTSU McNair Program comprises academic year and summer research programs. Participants are required to complete a series of assignments and research that prepares them to be choice candidates for graduate schools. The MTSU McNair Scholars Program is funded through a grant from the U.S. Department of Education under the Higher Education Act of 1965, Title IV, Part A, Subpart 2 and Middle Tennessee State University.
# Table of Contents

About McNair Scholars and Program ................................................................................................................. 6

Interaction of *Legionella pneumophila* with Human Macrophage-like Cell Lines  
Jason K. Alexander and Dr. Anthony L. Farone, Biology .......................................................................................... 9

Lipid Class Distribution of Sterols and Fatty Acids in the Marine Dinoflagellate *Oxyrrhis marina*  
Amanda K. Buckmaster and Dr. Jeffrey D. Leblond, Biology .................................................................................. 12

Heroes, Villains, and Cute Little Animals: How Children’s Media Influences Society’s Views of Disability and Difference  
Stephanie Renner and Dr. Dorothy Valcarcel Craig, Educational Leadership ............................................................ 17

Social Critique Through the Detective’s Eye: Ruth Rendell’s *From Doon With Death*  
Kirsten Boatwright and Dr. Peter M. McCluskey, English ....................................................................................... 22

*Una Lectura Entrelíneas*: Latin American Women’s Subversion of the Conventional Order  
Janet Awokoya and Dr. Oscar A. Diaz-Ortiz, Foreign Languages and Literatures ....................................................... 24

The Influence of Mentoring on College Students Working with At-Risk Adolescents  
Nikayla Boga and Dr. Catherine D. Stogner, Human Sciences .................................................................................. 30

Was Marx An Environmentalist?  
Ryan S. Husak and Dr. Michael Principe, Philosophy ......................................................................................... 38

Name Stereotyping and Job Selection  
Tameika McLean and Dr. William Langston, Psychology ....................................................................................... 46

Child Labor in the Brazilian Amazon: Exploitation or Ethnocentrism?  
Monte Hendrickson and Dr. Richard Pace, Sociology and Anthropology ............................................................... 54

Crisis Communication: A Critical Analysis of Tactics, Processes, and Theoretical Context Utilized at Middle Tennessee State University During the 2002 Budget Impasse  
Sharon Dowling Caton and Dr. Sharon Seaton Smith, Speech and Theatre ............................................................ 60
Interaction of Legionella pneumophila with Human Macrophage-like Cell Lines

Jason K. Alexander
Dr. Anthony L. Farone
Department of Biology

Abstract
Legionella pneumophila is the causative agent of Legionnaire's disease, a severe pneumonia that was the cause of a famous outbreak during a bicentennial American Legion convention in Philadelphia. The aim of this study is to characterize the ability of this organism to survive and grow inside two macrophage-like cell lines as a model to further characterize pathogenesis mechanisms. Macrophages are immune cells that engulf and kill microorganisms that enter the lungs. Two human cell lines, THP-1 and U-937, were treated with L. pneumophila AA100 to determine the potential for infectivity and to assess the virulence of the organism upon these cells. Both monocytic cell lines were differentiated with phorbol 12-myristate 13-acetate (10^-7M) for 48 h prior to treatment with L. pneumophila or media alone. The cells were harvested at 24, 48, and 72 h post-infection. Cell viability, cell number, and viable bacteria/ml were determined at each time point. It is hypothesized that both cell lines will show decreased viability as compared to control and that colony counts will demonstrate L. pneumophila's ability to replicate in both human cell lines.

Introduction
Legionella pneumophila is a gram-negative bacterium that the Center for Disease Control identified as the cause of an outbreak of pneumonia at a 1976 American Legion Convention in Philadelphia, PA. As recently as 1999, it was responsible for 231 illnesses and 21 deaths at the Westfriese Flora show in the Netherlands. This illness has been termed legionellosis (Ornston, et al, 2000). L. pneumophila can be described as an opportunistic pathogen, as it most often causes disease in immuno-compromised individuals, such as smokers, the elderly, and organ transplant recipients (Joshi, et al, 1999). Infection is most often acquired through inhaling aerosols of contaminated water droplets (Ornston, et al, 2000). The bacterium lives freely in aquatic environments (Byrne, et al, 1998), but also flourishes in fresh water as a parasite of amoebae and has evolved mechanisms that enable it to escape the degradation associated with the lysosome pathway (Hammer, et al, 2002). Once inside the lungs it may infect human alveolar macrophages, the component of the human immune system that engulf and kill microorganisms that enter the lungs (Janeway, et al, 2002). Once inside the cell, genes that were evolved to enable it to parasitize amoebae are activated, allowing it to inhibit acidification and maturation of the human macrophage's phagosome (Sturgill-Koszycki, et al, 2002).

The aim of this research was to characterize L. pneumophila's ability to survive and grow inside macrophage-like cells as an indication of their disease causing potential. Two cell lines were differentiated into macrophage-like cells, THP-1 and U-937. It is hypothesized that both cell lines will demonstrate a reduction in total host cell number, decreased host cell viability and successful replication of the bacteria as compared to controls. These studies will also evaluate the THP-1 cell line's usefulness as a model for interactions between L. pneumophila and human macrophages.

Materials and Methods
Cell Line Maintenance
Both human monocytic cell lines (THP-1 and U937) were obtained from American Type Culture Collection (TIB-202 and CRL-1593.2, respectively, ATCC Rockville, MD). Both cell lines were maintained in suspension cultures in complete medium [RPMI 1640 (Gibco BRL, Gaithersburg, MD) supplemented with 10% fetal bovine serum (FBS; Gibco BRL), 0.05 mM 2-mercaptoethanol (Fisher Chemical, Fair Lawn, NJ) and 1.0 mM sodium pyruvate (Sigma Chemical Co., St. Louis, MO)]. Both cell lines were maintained in suspension cultures in complete medium [RPMI 1640 (Gibco BRL), 0.05 mM 2-mercaptoethanol (Fisher Chemical, Fair Lawn, NJ) and 1.0 mM sodium pyruvate (Sigma Chemical Co., St. Louis, MO)]. Both cell lines were grown in 25 cm² tissue culture plug seal cap flasks, (Corning Inc., Corning, NY) and diluted 1:5 every seven days to maintain the cell lines. Incubation was at 37°C and 5% CO₂. A canthamoeba polyphaga cultures were a generous gift from Dr. S. Berk (Tennessee Technological University, Cookeville, TN) and were
maintained in tryptic soy broth (Becton Dickinson, Sparks, NJ) at 25°C. L. pneumophila was also a generous gift from Dr. S. Berk and maintained on Buffered Charcoal Yeast Extract (BCYE, Becton Dickinson) agar at 30°C.

**Lysate Preparation**

Cocultures of A. polyphaga and L. pneumophila were set up by inoculating a 3-day old colony into a confluent monolayer of amoebae and incubating at 25°C for 96 h. After 96 h the amoebae were lysed by the bacteria and 0.1 mL of lysate was added to the appropriate experimental wells.

**Monocyte Differentiation**

Monocytic cells were differentiated using phorbol 12-myristate 13-acetate (PMA). The 6-well tissue culture plates (Corning, Inc.) were set up to contain 1 mL of either THP-1 or U-937 cells at 10⁶ cells/mL and 1 mL of complete medium and 2 µL of 0.1 mM PMA.

**THP-1 / U927 Infection**

Each well, containing 10⁶ cells, was treated with 0.1 mL of L. pneumophila lysate or remained untreated as control. The cells were incubated at 37°C for 2 h to allow for engulfment of the bacteria. The medium was then removed and the cells were washed once with medium to remove extracellular bacteria. After washing, 2 mL of complete medium with 100 µg of gentamicin was added to each well. The cells were then incubated for 1 h at 37°C and 5% CO₂. The medium was again removed and the cells were washed. Fresh complete medium was added and the cells were returned to 37°C and 5% CO₂.

**THP-1 / U937 Colonization**

At each time point the medium was removed from the cells and saved in dilution tubes. Trypsin (0.3 mL) was added to each well and incubated at 37°C and 5% CO₂ for 10 min to loosen the adherent cells. The wells were then scraped, the medium returned to their respective wells and cells were collected for counting.

**Cell Counting and Viability**

Cell counts were performed by trypan blue (Sigma) exclusion to determine cell number and cell viability in each well at each time point (0h, 24h, 48h, and 72 h). Equal amounts of cells and 0.08% trypan blue in phosphate buffered saline (PBS, Sigma) were mixed, vortexed and incubated at 37°C and 5% CO₂ for 5 min. Cells were counted on a hemacytometer cell counting chamber (Fisher). Dividing the number of unstained, viable cells by the total number of cells counted and multiplying by 100 determined percent viability. Cell concentration per well was determined by multiplying the total number of viable cells in ten grids on the hemacytometer by 1000 and a dilution factor of 2 to yield number of cells per ml.

**Colony Counts**

Prior to serial diluting in sterile spring water (Carolina Biological Supply Company, Burlington, NC), cells were lysed by drawing the suspension through a 27-gauge needle 4 times to release intracellular bacteria. Bacterial colony counts were then performed using 10-fold serial dilutions of the infected cultures that were then plated in duplicate at each time point. Following an incubation of 3 days at 30°C, the appropriate dilution was counted (containing 30-300 colonies) and the average CFU/mL calculated by multiplying the number of colonies by the appropriate dilution factor and volume.

**Staining and Slide Preparation**

Prior to passage of cells through a 27-gauge needle, 0.2 mL from each infected and control group at each time point was applied to a microscope slide using a cytocentrifuge at 800 rpm for 3 min. Cells were then fixed with methanol and stained for 45 min in the following stain: 1mL Geimsa stain (EM Industries, Gibbstown, NJ) and 2 drops Triton-X-100 (Fisher) and 40 mL water. Slides were then washed in tap water, allowed to dry overnight and then mounted with Cytoseal (Stephens Scientific, Rivertale, NJ).

**Result**

Preliminary results demonstrate both the THP-1 and U-937 macrophage-like cells supported successful replication of Legionella pneumophila at each time point (see Figure 1). Overall infected THP-1 and U-937 macrophage viability decreased over the time span of the experiment as compared to the controls (see Figure 2A and 2B). Total cell concentration for the infected THP-1 cell line demonstrated a greater decrease only at the 24 and 48 h time point as compared to controls (see Figure 3A), while the infected U-937 cell line demonstrated this trend at the 0 and 72 h time points (see Figure 3B).

**Conclusions**

It was found in this study that Legionella pneumophila AA100 can successfully replicate in human macrophage-like cells originating from THP-1 and U-937 cell lines as indicated by colony counts. Both cell lines demonstrated an overall decrease in cell concentration and viability. Their results for the U-937 cells are largely consistent with prior published literature (Byrne, et al, 1998; Joshi, et al, 2000 Condusions, con’t 1999; Ormston, et al, 2000 and Sturgill-Koszycki, et al, 2002). However, these trends were not consistent over all time points. This may be due to differences in the efficiency of cell scraping. Further trials are necessary to confirm these results and will be performed. It can be concluded from these preliminary results that the THP-1 cell line can serve a model for the study of interactions between Legionella pneumophila and human macrophages.
**Figure 1:**
Viable bacteria (CFU/mL x 10^5) vs. time (h) as determined by colony counts. At each time point (0, 24, 48, and 72 h post-infection) medium was removed and saved, cells were trypsinized, scraped and a sample passed through a 27 gauge needle to lyse cells and release intracellular L. pneumophila. Medium was then serially diluted in sterile spring water and placed on BCYE plates in duplicate for 3 days at 30º C. The means of CFU's of one experiment performed in duplicate are shown.

**Figure 2 (A):**
THP-1 control and infected macrophage viability (%) vs. time (h) as determined by trypan blue exclusion stain and cell counting on a hemacytometer. Cell collection performed as described in Fig. 1. The means of data of one experiment performed in duplicate are shown.

**Figure 2 (B):**
U-937 control and infected macrophage viability (%) vs. time (h) as determined by trypan blue exclusion stain and cell counting on a hemacytometer. Cell collection performed as described in legend of Fig. 1 without passage through 27 gauge needle. The means of data of one experiment performed in duplicate are shown.

**Figure 3 (A):**
THP-1 viable control and infected macrophages (cells/mL x 10^5) vs. time (h) as determined by trypan blue exclusion stain and cell counting on a hemacytometer. Cell collection performed as described in Fig. 1. The means of data of one experiment performed in duplicate are shown.

**Figure 3 (B):**
U937 viable control and infected macrophages (cells/mL x 10^5) vs. time (h) as determined by trypan blue exclusion stain and cell counting on a hemacytometer. Cell collection performed as described in Fig. 1. The means of data of one experiment performed in duplicate are shown.

**References**


Lipid Class Distribution of Sterols and Fatty Acids in the Marine Dinoflagellate Oxyrrhis marina

Amanda K. Buckmaster
Dr. Jeffrey D. LeBlond
Department of Biology

Introduction

Dinoflagellates are among the most abundant organisms in the water column. This widely diversified class consists of photosynthetic, heterotrophic, and mixotrophic species. These microorganisms can be found in every marine environment from the arctic to the tropical and from freshwater to oceanic waters (Tomas, 1997).

Current taxonomic systems rely on morphological or physical characteristics and cytological traits for the placement of species within the class. Organisms within the class Dinophyceae are distinguishable from other classes of microalgae by the presence of two dimorphic flagella, continually condensed chromosomes within the nucleus, and unique thecal coverings. Dodge (1966) was the first to term the species of Dinophyceae “mesokaryotic” because dinoflagellate nuclei lack histones and nucleosomes, and their nuclei remain condensed during mitosis in a manner similar to prokaryotes. However, they do possess many characteristics typical of eukaryotes such as mitochondria, golgi bodies, and chloroplasts in the photosynthetic species (Tomas, 1997).

The taxonomy of this class is unclear and varies from discipline to discipline. Both botanists and zoologists claim this classification within their disciplines, and several classification schemes have been implemented in the past (Rein and Barrone, 1999). The origins of the class are also widely disputed. Some researchers believe the armored species evolved first, later dividing and losing the armored plates surrounding the thecal layer (Loeblich, 1976). Others speculate that the unarmored species developed first and the more complicated armored layers arose as the species evolved (Tomas 1997). Spector (1984) asserted his belief that, because of its biochemical, cytological, and reproductive features, O. marina is the ancestor of the dinoflagellates.

Several unique sterols and fatty acids characterize the dinoflagellates. According to Volkman et al. (1998), some species of the class Dinophyceae are known to contain lipids that are rarely observed in other classes of algae. For example, novel C28 polyunsaturated fatty acids, 4-methyl sterols, steroid ketones, and sterols with fully saturated ring systems have been observed. Dinosterol, a 4-methyl sterol which has traditionally been considered a steroidal biomarker for the class Dinophyceae, has recently been observed in an extensive survey of armored and unarmored dinoflagellates to be present in approximately half of the species examined (Leblond and Chapman, 2002).

Materials and Methods

Dinoflagellate culture and growth conditions

The following isolates of the heterotrophic dinoflagellate Oxyrrhis marina were obtained from the Provasoli-Guillard Center for the Culture of Marine Phytoplankton (CCMP): CCMP 604, CCMP 605, CCMP 1739, CCMP 1788. The food source for all O. marina cultures was Dunaliella tertiolecta (CCMP 1320). All cultures of O. marina were grown via periodic feeding on D. tertiolecta in f/2 medium at 21 °C and a day/night cycle of 14/10 hours with a light intensity of approximately 100 mE. Cultures were allowed to reach volumes of two liters before harvesting. Cultures were harvested by filtration through...
precombusted 12.5-cm-diameter glass fiber filters (Whatman 934-AH, 1.5 im pore size).

Lipid Extraction and Fractionation

Glass fiber filters were extracted using a modified Bligh and Dyer method (Guckert et al. 1985). The total lipid extracts were separated into five fractions on columns of activated Unisil silica (1.0 g, 100-200 mesh, activated at 120°C, Clarkson Chemical Co., South Williamsport, PA) using the following solvent system (Leblond and Chapman, 2000): 1) 12 mL methylene chloride (sterol esters); 2) 15 mL 5% acetone in methylene chloride with 0.5% acetic acid (free sterols, di- and triacylglycerides, free fatty acids); 3) 10 mL 20% acetone in methylene chloride (monoacylglycerols); 4) 45 mL acetone [monogalactosyldiacylglycerol (MGDG), digalactosyldiacylglycerol (DGDG), ulfoquinovosyldiacylglycerol (SQDG)]; and 5) 15 mL methanol with 0.1% acetic acid (phospholipids). Each fraction was collected in separate dark glass vials and the elution solvent was removed under a stream of dry nitrogen. Dry samples were transferred to autosampler vials using five 300 mL rinses of the corresponding eluting solvent (minus acetic acid for fractions 2 and 5).

Derivatization and Gas Chromatography/ Mass Spectrometry Analysis

For the analysis of sterol composition, one-third volume each of Fractions 1 and 2 (F1, F2) of each sample was dried under a stream of nitrogen and processed according to the methodology of Leblond and Chapman (2002). The samples were saponified by heating at 80°C C for 2 h in a solution of 1.9 mL of 5% KOH in 80% methanol and 0.1 mL toluene. After cooling the samples to room temperature, 0.5 mL of glacial acetic acid was added and the samples were vortexed, followed by the addition of 1 mL of deionized water to each sample. Nonsaponifiables and free fatty acids were removed with three 2-mL extractions using 1:1 hexane/ methyl-tert-butyl ether (MTBE). The hexane/ MTBE phase was evaporated under a stream of dry nitrogen. The sample was redissolved with 1-mL hexane/MTBE and added to a column containing 0.5 g of aminopropyl-bonded silica (Bondesil NH2-HF, Varian Inc., Palo Alto, CA, USA). Nonsaponifiables were eluted free of fatty acids with 15 mL of 1:1 hexane/MTBE. Solvent was reduced to a volume of 1 mL. Trimethylsilyl ether derivatives were formed by adding 0.5 mL N,O-bis(trimethylsilyl)trifluoroacetamide (BSTFA) containing 1% trimethylchlorosilane (TMCS) at 80°C for 0.5 h. The reagent was fully evaporated from the sample under a stream of dry nitrogen and redissolved in 40 mL of 1:1 hexane/MTBE.

For the characterization of fatty acids, one-third volume of F2, F4, and F5 of each sample was evaporated under a stream of dry nitrogen and processed according to the methodology of Leblond and Chapman (2000). Fatty acid methyl esters (FAMEs) were formed by heating the samples at 80°C for 1 h in a 2-mL mixture of 1:1 toluene/BF3-methanol (14% in methanol, Sigma Chemical, St. Louis, MO, USA). FAMEs and nonsaponifiable compounds were extracted using three 2-mL volumes of 1:1 hexane/MTBE after quenching the reaction with 1 mL deionized water. The upper phase was removed and the reagent was dried down under a stream of dry nitrogen. The FAMEs and nonsaponifiables were treated with BSTFA + 1% TMCS for 0.5 h at 80°C in order to derivatize any free hydroxy groups.

Sterols and FAMEs were characterized by gas chromatography/ mass spectrometry analysis (GC/MS). For sterols, GC/MS analysis was performed at 70 eV with a scanning range of 50-550 m/z and a cycle time of 1.0 sec using a Finnigan Magnum ion trap mass spectrometer interfaced to a Varian 3400 gas chromatograph with a DB-5MS column (30 m x 0.25 µm inner diameter, 0.25 µm film thickness, J&W Scientific Incorporated, Folsom, CA, USA). The temperature gradient was 1 min at 50°C, 10°C per min to 170°C, and 5°C per min to 300°C with a final hold for 10 min.

For FAMES, the following temperature gradient was used: 0.5 min at 50°C, 10°C/ min to 170°C, 2°C/ min to 210°C, and 5°C/ min to 300°C with a hold of 10 min.

Suggested structures for the lipids were arrived at by comparison of the mass spectra to those of commercially available standards, relative retention times, library entries, and/or published GC/MS values. Peak areas were used to determine the relative proportions of sterols and fatty acids on both an inter- and intrafraction basis.

Results and Discussion

Fatty Acid Composition

By analyzing and comparing the fatty acid compositions of both O. marina and D. tertiolecta, it was possible to derive whether the observed lipids originated from the food source, or whether O. marina synthesized them. In Figure 1, representative chromatograms of the glycolipid-associated fatty acids (Fraction 4 from CCMP 605) and phospholipid-associated fatty acids (Fraction 5 from CCMP 604) from O. marina are shown. The chromatograms are similar in types of fatty acids found, but not in the relative percentages of lipids in the different fractions (See Tables 1 and 2). In Fraction 4, O. marina yielded 14:1, 16:1, 18:1, and 22:6 fatty acids, while D. tertiolecta samples contained mainly 16:1 and 18:2 fatty acids. Most of the material that was found in this fraction was derived from the food source. This was expected because O. marina does not possess the chloroplasts that are associated with the lipids of this fraction. It is,
however, worth noting that the *O. marina* cultures contained 14:1 and 22:6 fatty acids while the food source showed no evidence of these lipids. Thus, it appears that *O. marina* may modify the glycolipids from *D. tertiolecta* after ingestion of the prey. This may occur by chain elongation to form 22:6. It is unlikely that *O. marina* synthesizes glycolipids de novo since it lacks chloroplasts.

The phospholipid fraction also produced interesting results. This fraction of *O. marina*’s lipids contained 16:1, 22:6, and 18:2 fatty acids, while the food culture consisted of high concentrations of 16:1 and 18:1. Most notably, the food source’s lack of any 22:6 lipids indicates that *O. marina* is the source of these particular lipids; this synthesis may be either de novo, or the result of chain elongation and unsaturation of *D. tertiolecta* phospholipid-associated fatty acids. *Oxyrrhis marina* did not show any evidence of synthesis of 28:8 lipids. This lipid is solely associated with the dinoflagellate class, and, while the lack of the lipid does not exclude *O. marina* from the class, it does not provide any evidence that would conclusively place the species within the class (Leblond and Chapman, 2000).

Five distinct sterols were found in this survey. The variety of sterols contained within Fraction 2 was far less than that of Fraction 1. This indicates that *O. marina* produces more sterol esters than free sterols. This is unusual for the class Dinophyceae; most dinoflagellates produce the majority of their sterols as free sterols (Leblond and Chapman, 2002). The primary sterols found in this survey are described in Table 3. Very importantly, the food culture of *D. tertiolecta* was not observed to possess any sterols in measurable densities. Although data was limited, the results closely correlated with the results published by Breteler et al. (1999). In their publication, they found cholesterol and brassicasterol as the most abundant sterols for *O. marina*. They also found only trace amounts of sterols in the food source. It is important to note that no 4-methyl sterols were found in the cultures of *O. marina*. Cholesterol and brassicasterol are often found in other classes of algae. Although *O. marina* produces sterols that are commonly found in the class Dinophyceae, it does not produce 4-methyl sterols that are commonly considered as limited to dinoflagellates. Thus, *O. marina* cannot be excluded from the class Dinophyceae on the basis of its lipid composition, and its hypothesized ancestral relationship to modern dinoflagellates cannot be disproven. Further studies that correlate our lipid data to ribosomal rDNA sequence information will be needed to better ascertain the true phylogenetic position of *O. marina*.

### Table 1:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Culture Collection Number</th>
<th>604</th>
<th>605</th>
<th>1320</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14:1</td>
<td>19.39</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:1</td>
<td>21.27</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:x</td>
<td>24.40</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td>19.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:0</td>
<td>25.06</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:1a</td>
<td>26.10</td>
<td>36.4</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:1b</td>
<td>26.24</td>
<td>59.2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:1</td>
<td>29.55</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:3</td>
<td>29.16</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:1a</td>
<td>1911</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:1b</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>32.2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:2</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>10.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22:x</td>
<td>2545</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>17.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

R<sub>r</sub>, retention time in min. Blank spaces = not detected. ##:x indicates ambiguity in the number of double bonds.
Table 2.

Relative abundance in % total peak area of fatty acid methyl esters (FAMEs) derived from the phospholipid fraction (Fraction 5).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Culture Collection Number</th>
<th>FAME R/&lt;_1&gt;</th>
<th>Scan #</th>
<th>604</th>
<th>605</th>
<th>1788</th>
<th>1320</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14:1</td>
<td>19.39</td>
<td>1179</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:0</td>
<td>21.29</td>
<td>1289</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:1</td>
<td>22.39</td>
<td>1359</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:1a</td>
<td>26.09</td>
<td>1569</td>
<td>30.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:1b</td>
<td>26.21</td>
<td>1581</td>
<td></td>
<td>66.5</td>
<td>37.4</td>
<td>68.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16:2</td>
<td>26.31</td>
<td>1591</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:1a</td>
<td>31.41</td>
<td>1901</td>
<td></td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Trace</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:1b</td>
<td>32.46</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:2</td>
<td>33.03</td>
<td>1983</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18:3</td>
<td>33.48</td>
<td>2028</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20:x</td>
<td>37.51</td>
<td>2545</td>
<td>46.7</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22:x</td>
<td>42.25</td>
<td>2545</td>
<td>46.7</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Trace FAMEs comprise less than 0.5% of the total peak area of the sample. R<sub>t</sub>, retention time in min. Blank spaces = not detected. #x indicates ambiguity in the number of double bonds.

Table 3:

Sterols found as sterol esters in O. marina.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Carbon #</th>
<th>Sterol #</th>
<th>MW</th>
<th>Suggested Structure</th>
<th>% Total Peak Area*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>456</td>
<td>Cholesta-5,22Z-dien-3β-ol (cis-22-dehydrocholesterol or 27-zor-24-methylcholesta-5,22E-dien-3β-ol (occelasterol)</td>
<td>57.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>458</td>
<td>Cholest-5-en-3β-ol (cholesterol)</td>
<td>23.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>470</td>
<td>24-ethylcholest-5-en-3β-ol</td>
<td>Trace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>472</td>
<td>23,24-Dimethylcholesta-5,22-dien-3β-ol</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>???</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>486</td>
<td>unknown</td>
<td>14.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MW, Molecular Weight of TMS Ether. *Sample described is CCMP 605.
References


Heroes, Villains, and Cute Little Animals: How Children's Media Influences Society’s Views of Disability and Difference

Background

Children today are bombarded with images, symbols, and stories from several different mass media outlets. The Annenberg Public Policy Center (1997) found that children spend a great deal of time watching television, second only to sleeping. This survey of over 1,000 parents showed that children between the ages of 2 and 17 spend an average of 2.1 hours per day watching television and 1.1 hours per day watching videotapes. The use of VCRs and DVDs enable children to view favorite programs and movies repeatedly and give them access to a wider variety of titles. For children with disabilities, the ever-present and increasing media could be an important tool for education and socialization (Sprafkin, 1992). However, a lack of sufficient role models and inappropriate portrayal of disabled persons signifies a larger problem.

Physical disability has been historically portrayed in film and television as either an indication of an evil personality at worst, or the stereotypical exploitation and dramatic portrayal of “courage” and the “miracle cure” at best. Critics and observers have repeatedly pointed out the lack of accurate portrayals of disabled life (Klobas, 1998; Norden, 1994). Even with the increased sensitivity realized since the enactment of special education legislation in 1975 and The Americans With Disabilities Act of 1990, the focus of the stories told about individuals with disabilities tend to follow the clichés in the vein of ‘an inspiration to those similarly afflicted’ (Enns, 2001; Quicke, 1985). Therefore, the purpose of this study is to specifically examine films created for young audiences to determine whether disability is adequately addressed, and if so, how is it portrayed to this impressionable audience.

There are approximately 54 million Americans living with some type of disability. According to the National Organization on Disability, the majority of those people do not fully participate in our society. They make this assertion because of the responses that they receive on their Harris Poll of persons with disabilities, which they have been conducting since 1986. For example, they report that 22% of Americans with disabilities do not graduate from high school compared to only 9% of the non-disabled population.

Images of disabled individuals in children’s media have a two-fold effect on young people: they serve as role models for the disabled population, and they influence non-disabled peers view children who are different from themselves. In the first instance, research has shown that children seek out and learn more from characters that they closely resemble (Greenberg, 1986; Harwood, 1999; Sprafkin, 1992). This indicates the importance of accurate models in developing an understanding of self and learning to identify with a particular social group or society.

For non-disabled peers, the appearance of disability in film enables them to draw conclusions and form opinions regarding disability and difference. This has become increasingly important in recent decades. With the implementation of special education reforms, more and more disabled children are being included in regular education classroom settings. Allowing non-disabled peers to see depictions of this type of social inclusion could foster acceptance. The use of main characters in recurring roles would greatly impact all children.

Theory

In an attempt to understand how these impacts occur, the social theory of symbolic interactionism was investigated. This theory, stated by Herbert Blumer, examines the ability of human beings to interact with each other and their power to create their own definitions of objects based on their usefulness to each individual. The three core principles of SI are meaning, language, and thought.

These three principles are simply defined as follows. The meanings of objects are suggested to be specific to individuals or societies based upon the goals associated with that object. Language is
very important in determining the goals for each object. We use language to communicate the meanings of objects and symbols to each other. Thought is described as the process that each individual uses to interpret the assigned meanings and look at situations from points of view other than our own.

This principle can be easily verified by imagining a picture of the American flag. When we, as adult Americans, see this symbol, we automatically have thoughts about its assigned meaning. We think of the words flag, America, stars and stripes, or perhaps Old Glory. If the actual flag was presented to a small child, he or she might assign the definition of ‘blanket’ considering the child’s interaction with colorful pieces of fabric. That would be the use that his or her parents’ would have offered to the child so far. On the other hand, the mere sight of this symbol would create a much more emotional reaction, especially in these times of international conflict, to anyone in the armed services, or their family. Words and feelings of honor, duty, and patriotism would be overwhelming.

To reveal how the media can influence this process, we can look at another set of symbols – two hats, one white, and one black.

**Figure 1:**

Media Symbols

These two objects may appear, to someone who has never watched an American western, as just two hats. Their definition may only include the goal of protection from the elements or perhaps stylish accessories. But even as youngsters we are exposed to images in the media that alter those definitions. When seen together, or as part of similarly colored outfits on men, we automatically make assumptions of character. Our intellectual minds may understand that clothing does not ‘make the man,’ but our unconscious self automatically sees a ‘good guy,’ and a ‘bad guy’. We may not remember where or when we learned this as it just becomes instinctual. The question then becomes, is it possible that the media plants a seed of definition in children’s minds that grows and eventually becomes instinctual within us as adults, thus perpetuating the issues of discrimination and exclusion.

**Methods**

A sampling frame of 560 films that were created for children and families was gathered. Subjects were obtained from reference books on films as well as Internet sites for various film studios. Only films with the ratings of G or PG were utilized. Films with ratings such as PG-13 were excluded in order to focus on younger audiences. The films range in date from Walt Disney’s “Snow White” in 1937 to the latest Disney channel original films released within the last few months.

The films were then divided into four categories: Disney animated, Disney family, Disney Channel originals, miscellaneous animated, and miscellaneous family. This was done in order to eliminate the possibility of Disney films being over represented, and allow all media outlets to be studied. The random table method was used to select 25% of each category for a total of 134 films for review. A single reviewer watched each film and entered data into a pre-coded work-sheet, which was then transferred into a database for storage and analysis.
Results

The results are both expected and thought provoking. As for the number of disabled characters, they are expectedly low. Only eight percent of the films had main characters with either a physical or mental disability. These characters were usually depicted as either the villain or as principle in a story regarding the obstacles and plight of disabled persons. They were not typically seen as a person who just happens to have a disability. One notable exception was seen in the 1988 film “Mac and Me.” This movie is about an alien who accidentally comes to earth and befriends a child who happens to be in a wheelchair. The child’s disability does not play any part in the actual story line, and is in fact never discussed. Eric is merely portrayed as a child who finds an alien.

The most intriguing discovery that was made during this study was the number of films that address the idea of difference and working together for a common goal. Nearly half of the movies reviewed showed some type of difference between characters. These differences included issues caused by race, social class, education, and ability; some depicted by realistic characters, and some by artificially created aliens.

What is interesting about this fact is that the film industry has obviously invested a great deal of effort into pointing out the way similarities can be used to overcome any perceived difference. If this perspective were to be utilized in the area of disability, the results could be significant. Some of the differences that were portrayed were obvious vehicles on which the movie depended, or in other words, it was exactly what the movie was about. In some films however, the differences were part of the background of the story. They were not overbearing, but shown as a normal part of everyday life.

Implications

Extensive sociological investigation has been conducted regarding the power of the media to reflect and create perceptions of individuals and behavior. A great deal of this research has been aimed at understanding the power of television to influence children’s aggressive behavior and influence the development of race, class, and gender roles (Signorielli, 1985). Studies have shown how the increased salience of television and film continue to influence what children believe about themselves and the world around them. (Durham & Kellner, 2001; Huntmann & Morgan, 2002). As Huntmann and Morgan (2002) reveal,

"Every exposure to every media model provides a potential guide to behavior or attitude, a potential source of identification, a human exemplar we may use – whether in accordance with the model or explicitly contrary to it, and whether consciously or not – to define and construct our identities." (p.310)

In addition to the important work being conducted in the realm of multiculturalism regarding race, gender, and class, particular attention should be paid to the images of disability that our children are exposed to every day.

This study also points out how important it is to communicate with children about those images that they see on television and film. If children associate physically or mentally handicapped people as the villains they portray, without adult interaction and alternative definitions to influence their thoughts, they may be learning to associate all disabled people with evil or fear just as instinctively as we associate the man with the black hat as the ‘bad guy’ in Western fiction.

Lastly, it is important to note that the majority, if not all, of the characters that define disability for our children are fictitious, cartoon images, or non-disabled actors portraying disabled persons. This ‘outsider’s’ view of disability is predictably flawed and understated. Parents and educators must join together in an attempt to alter the subconscious definitions of physical and mental difference that our children will likely carry with them into adulthood.

Future Research

Additional research is indicated in the field of children’s media. Qualitative inquiry into the affects of particular images on different audiences may yield important results. Conversely, cultivation theory may an important aspect that needs further investigation. This theory, as described by Nancy Signorielli and Michael Morgan (1990), is “designed to understand gradual, long-term shifts and transformations in the way generations are socialized (not short-term, dramatic changes in individuals’ beliefs or behaviors)” (p. 19). This approach may be essential to understanding the current discrimination and exclusion that people with disabilities face, and become a useful tool for policy makers and film creators to enable the segregation to diminish with future generations.

Note: For extended list of movies reviewed, please contact the MTSU McNair office or the first author of the paper.

References


Implications

Extensive sociological investigation has been conducted regarding the power of the media to reflect and create perceptions of individuals and behavior. A great deal of this research has been aimed at understanding the power of television to influence children’s aggressive behavior and influence the development of race, class, and gender roles (Signorielli, 1985). Studies have shown how the increased salience of television and film continue to influence what children believe about themselves and the world around them. (Durham & Kellner, 2001; Huntmann & Morgan, 2002). As Huntmann and Morgan (2002) reveal,

"Every exposure to every media model provides a potential guide to behavior or attitude, a potential source of identification, a human exemplar we may use – whether in accordance with the model or explicitly contrary to it, and whether consciously or not – to define and construct our identities." (p.310)

In addition to the important work being conducted in the realm of multiculturalism regarding race, gender, and class, particular attention should be paid to the images of disability that our children are exposed to every day.

This study also points out how important it is to communicate with children about those images that they see on television and film. If children associate physically or mentally handicapped people as the villains they portray, without adult interaction and alternative definitions to influence their thoughts, they may be learning to associate all disabled people with evil or fear just as instinctively as we associate the man with the black hat as the ‘bad guy’ in Western fiction.

Lastly, it is important to note that the majority, if not all, of the characters that define disability for our children are fictitious, cartoon images, or non-disabled actors portraying disabled persons. This ‘outsider’s’ view of disability is predictably flawed and understated. Parents and educators must join together in an attempt to alter the subconscious definitions of physical and mental difference that our children will likely carry with them into adulthood.

Future Research

Additional research is indicated in the field of children’s media. Qualitative inquiry into the affects of particular images on different audiences may yield important results. Conversely, cultivation theory may an important aspect that needs further investigation. This theory, as described by Nancy Signorielli and Michael Morgan (1990), is “designed to understand gradual, long-term shifts and transformations in the way generations are socialized (not short-term, dramatic changes in individuals’ beliefs or behaviors)” (p. 19). This approach may be essential to understanding the current discrimination and exclusion that people with disabilities face, and become a useful tool for policy makers and film creators to enable the segregation to diminish with future generations.

Note: For extended list of movies reviewed, please contact the MTSU McNair office or the first author of the paper.

References


References, continued


Appendix: Charts and Graphs

Figure 2:
Characters with Disabilities in Films

Figure 3:
Film Characters with Disabilities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Examples of Movies where Main Characters have a Disability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Movie Title</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 Amy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Mac and Me</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Hunchback of Notre Dame</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Toy Story 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Miracle in Lane Two</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Return to Never Land</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Treasure Planet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Tru Confessions</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1:
Percentage of Disney films vs. Other Films Reviewed for this Project

Total Reviewed

Disney 66%

Misc. 34%
Social Critique Through the Detective’s Eye: 
Ruth Rendell’s From Doon With Death

In 1964 journalist Ruth Rendell published her first novel, From Doon With Death, which appears, at first glance, to be a conventional example of detective fiction. A woman disappears, the police are called, an investigation is undertaken, wherein clues are examined, and conclusions are reached ultimately resulting in the resolution of a crime. However, while using some of the standards common to detective fiction, Rendell also takes aim at the very conventions that make the genre popular.

By 1953, the popularity of detective fiction was matched only by the intensity of its detractors. British author V.S. Pritchett said of the detective novel that it “…is the art-for-art’s sake of our yawning Philistinism, the classic example of a specialized form of art removed from contact with the life it pretends to build on.” Just ten years after Pritchett’s assessment, Ruth Rendell released From Doon With Death, the first of Rendell’s Inspector Reginald Wexford series, is the creation of a novice author working in an established genre, but the novel still manages to break new ground in the area of social critique and allows the author to hone her craft. The novel centers on the investigation into the disappearance and murder of housewife, Margaret Parsons. All evidence points to “Doon,” a mysterious person from her past. As a teenager, Margaret “Minna” Parsons had been the object of desire for her classmate, “Doon,” who had declared an undying love for Parsons through gifts of original poems and books such as the Oxford Book of Victorian Verse and Whitman’s Leaves of Grass (58-59). Following Mrs. Parsons’ disappearance, it becomes apparent that she and Doon have rekindled some kind of relationship that has resulted in murder. Rendell challenges the assumptions of readers when she reveals an unexpected motive for this murder: an unrequited lesbian love. Just two chapters from the end of the novel, Inspector Wexford’s simple declarative statement, “Doon is a woman,” forces readers to examine one of the most controversial issues of contemporary British law (144). It is too late for homophobic readers to feign repulsion at this “forbidden” love affair, for they have already been affected by Rendell’s creation of a recognizable and sympathetic character. It is this psychological affection that Rendell uses to address same-sex desire and homophobia.

The author shows a true devotion to characterization, and it is her character portrayals that help to guide her readers to comfortable, predictable, and all too often incorrect conclusions. In 1977, Don Miller described Rendell’s ability to portray accessible personalities: “Her insight into human behavior and psychology bring a degree of depth to her characters.” In From Doon With Death readers are first introduced not to the main character Chief Inspector Wexford, but to his subordinate Mike Burden. And yet, in many ways we are not introduced to Burden at all. Instead of focusing on, or even relating Burden’s personality traits, disposition, or character, Rendell uses him to characterize other individuals. Although readers know nothing about Burden, they assume that he is the thread that will weave them through this story; hence, human nature demands they accept his perceptions as accurate.

Using an omniscient narrator, Rendell allows her readers access to Burden’s thoughts about his place of employment and his boss:

Not for the first time the place irritated Burden. It was as if the personal fate of the men and women who diate connection with the person reading this detective novel. Mr. Parsons’ love of crime novels also serves to make him a most plausible suspect causing Inspec-
Our murder victim is also easily recognizable as the consummate suburban housewife. While Mrs. Parsons is already dead when the novel begins, she is no less identifiable to the reader because of this status. We first get to know the character through descriptions of her former surroundings. Once again, Inspector Burden acts as interpreter:

The step was whitened, the brass kerb above it polished. [. . .] The front room looked as if nobody ever sat in it. With some dismay [Burden] noted its polished shabbiness. [. . .] The cupboard was empty and inside it the paper was peeling from the wall, but there were no spiders. Mrs. Parsons was a house-proud woman. (4-8)

In 1964, Mrs. Parson represents the majority of women in Britain. For these women, the world revolves around their husband and their home. Psychologically, as well as socially, the worth of a married woman is tied to the home and Rendell uses this psychological tie to create another connection with readers.

Of course the most important bond between reader and character must be with Chief Inspector Wexford. While this first novel in the series is haltingly irregular, Rendell lays the foundations for a likeable, respectable, believable, and ultimately relatable main character. Of course Rendell has purposefully postponed introducing readers to the Chief Inspector in order to make their connection to Burden that much stronger. However, unlike the detached characterization the author renders for Inspector Burden, our introduction to Wexford includes a detailed description of his physical features that plays directly to the readers' expectations:

He was taller than Burden, thick-set without being fat, fifty-two years old, the very prototype of an actor playing a top-brass policeman. Born up the road in Pamfret, living most of his life in this part of Sussex, he knew most people and he knew the district well enough for the map on the butterscotch-yellow wall to be regarded merely as a decoration. (14)

The description is effective. While it relies heavily on preconceived notions of what fictional detectives should look like, the description fulfills a reader's need for the familiar. Between the omniscient narrator's look into Burden's mind and the welcoming comfort of the well-worn characterization of Chief Inspector Wexford, the reader is easily motivated to follow where led.

Once these connections between characters and readers are created, Rendell turns her attention toward guiding her audience to various plausible, albeit faulty conclusions. The author avoids employing overt deception to fool her readers, opting instead to lead readers to their sheltered comfort zones. This aspect of Rendell's work is perhaps the most prescribed in that the plot itself adheres to the standard formula described by Larry Landrum: "The detective story presents life as agreeable, reassuring, simple, understandable, meaningful, and secure" (85).

From the moment Wexford discovers the love poems from long ago, readers are led to assume that Doon, the author of the rediscovered poems, is the murderer; "It all points to Doon being the killer, sir," Burden said" (84). Along with this assumption goes the equally plausible and certainly expectable belief that Doon is a man. Doon is referred to by both Wexford and Burden as "he." Despite proof that another woman was present at the murder scene, all theories offered in explanation of such an occurrence are indicative of a heterosexual liaison. Rendell plays upon the preconceptions of her readers, presenting an implied syllogism: a woman is murdered by her lover; women take male lovers, therefore hermurderer is male.

Where Rendell departs from the formulaic nature of earlier detective novels is in her plot resolution, the solution to the puzzle. Unlike her predecessors, Rendell's detective story does not have a "simple solution" (85). As Chief Inspector Wexford explains, the solution to this murder is the perfect love as presented by the perfect lover, with one vital exception:

Doon was rich and clever and good-looking . . . Doon could give her things she could never have afforded to buy and so for a time Doon could buy her love or rather her companionship; for this was a love of the mind and nothing physical entered into it . . . You know that Doon, in spite of wealth, the intellect, the goods looks, had one insurmountable disadvantage, a disadvantage greater than any deformity, . . . that no amount of time or changed circumstances could alter . . . at four o'clock this morning I learnt something else . . . I learnt exactly what was the nature of Doon's disadvantage . . . Doon is a woman. (141-144).

The real problem has been defined. From Doon With Death is not about murder; it is about the emotional, psychological, and physical reality of same-sex attractions.

Once Rendell has exposed this very controversial societal issue, she gives voice to the very society upon which she makes comment. In one suspect's words, "I wouldn't have a disgusting . . . a revolting thing like that for another woman! I hate that sort of thing. It makes me feel sick!" (147). Although many readers in 1964 might have embraced this homophobic attitude earlier in the novel, by now they have become psychologically invested in both the character of Doon and the story of her love for Minna Parsons. Fortunately, as readers of detective fiction have come to expect, the Inspector acts as the voice of reason. "This was love," he said quietly. "It wasn't disgusting or revolting. To Doon it was beautiful" (147). To prove his point the Chief Inspector turns to Doon's poetry:

If love were what the rose is;
And I were like the leaf,
Our lives would grow together
In sad or singing weather . . .
Blown fields or flowerful closes,
Green pleasure or grey grief . . . (148)
Doon herself finishes the poem, “If love were what the rose is, and I were like a leaf” (148).

Throughout the novel readers have gotten to know Doon as Mrs. Fabia Quadrant. Although Rendell does not expose these characters as one and the same until Quadrant finishes the poem, she also does little to hide the fact from readers. Fabia Quadrant is married to a very successful businessman and it is he who gives the first clue as to her real identity. When, in the course of the investigation, Wexford and Burden visit two couples having dinner, Wexford asks to speak to one of the gentlemen’s wives: ‘I’m afraid we’re intruding again, sir,’ Wexford said to Missal, his eyes lingering on [Mr.] Quadrant. ‘I’d just like to have a talk with your wife if you don’t mind.’ [. . .] Then Quadrant did a strange thing. He took a cigarette out of the box on the table, put it in his mouth and lit the cork tip. Fascinated, Burden watched him choke and drop the cigarette into an ashtray. (64)

This seemingly innocuous act has no place in detective fiction except as a clue. Mr. Quadrant, Doon’s husband, has offered readers a clue as to her true identity. But, as readers of detective fiction, we are all too willing to follow the professional sleuths as they lead and this telling moment is either forgotten or misinterpreted as Mr. Quadrant becomes the prime suspect for professionals and amateurs alike.

Ruth Rendell effectively shows a lack of disparity where love is concerned. Through Wexford, she espouses a belief that love, in any form and without regard to gender, is not abhorrent, rather it is a natural form of beauty. Considering that homosexuality was still a crime in 1964, Ruth Rendell is taking a bold stand with her first novel. It is because she knows her audience’s psyche and is able to exploit that psyche that From D oon W ith D eath works so well.

Three years after the publication of From D oon W ith D eath, the British Parliament overturned laws prohibiting acts of homosexuality that had been in existence, in some form, since 1533. This is not to suggest that Rendell’s novel helped change these laws, but to observe that her work reflects, and perhaps helped shape, changing attitudes toward homosexuality. Her choice of subject matter is timely and her work breaks new ground in detective fiction. Her writing is not art-for-art’s sake, but for the sake of the society as whole.

As critic Jane Bakerman explains, Rendell “treats well-known human problems and reexamines established responses to them in fresh ways, neither echoing the professional habits of other authors nor repeating herself” (128). A biographical sketch of the author notes, “Rendell has little love for the [detective fiction] genre as a whole, arguing that it generally lacks convincing psychological complexity, one of the hallmarks of her own work” (Graham 471). Nevertheless, Rendell continues to perfect both her writing of detective fiction and the genre as a whole.

While From D oon W ith D eath suffers from the imperfections most often associated with a first novel, Rendell creates believable characters whose authenticity has allowed for 19 installments over the past forty years. All the while, Rendell continues to employ a form of psychoanalysis on both her characters and her readers. And she has continued to offer social commentary through her work. Rendell’s Inspector Wexford series, as a whole, offers scholars a unique opportunity to study the effects of the changing field of psychological theory and its effects on one specific literary genre. My own study of this unique writer and her works continues.

References
Una Lectura Entrelíneas: Latin American Women’s Subversion of the Conventional Order

Janet Awokoya  
Dr. Oscar A. Diaz-Ortiz  
Department of Foreign Languages and Literatures

Latin American women writers use literature to divulge the deeply embedded convictions, the antiquated social patterns, and the aberrant traditions that have marginalized their positions in their societies. They offer new perspectives of cultures previously defined by patriarchal writers who described and interpreted their views of the world inside and outside of the home. In the novels Como Agua Para Chocolate: Novela de Entregas Mensuales Con Recetas, Amores y Remedios Caseros (Esquivel, 1989) and Aves Sin Nido (Turner, 1889), the authors present characters that use manipulative strategies to judge, negotiate, and criticize patriarchal society. In the literatures, the female protagonists admirably challenge the ascribed roles of women by employing their second-class positions to their advantage. They use their dexterous abilities to transgress gender boundaries in an effort to subvert the rules of the patriarchal society. The purpose of this investigation is to analyze how these Latin American authors allow their female characters to use food and the literary technique of lying rhetoric to influence the actions, emotions, and thoughts of male figures within their societies.

The literary writing styles of men have influenced and dominated the literary world. For centuries, female authors’ writings have been undervalued in comparison to their male counterparts. Women were labeled as inexperienced and uneducated in their opinions and ideas about political, cultural, and religious matters. Although women eventually entered the intellectual spheres long reserved to men, the male dominance of literary culture endured.

During the 19th century, to write meant to enter a system which had already determined a limited set of stories worthy of telling and had fabricated a scenario where men were the Subject while women remained as the Other. (Cunningham, 1990, p. 6).

In order to have their works acknowledged and published, women erased their own personal experiences and histories and recreated them in a manner that fit into the male-defined literary canon of their time. To protect themselves and simultaneously diffuse information, many female intellectuals reappropriated their texts by creating masculine pseudonyms such as George Sand, George Elliot, or Fernan Caballero. Cunningham further explains that, “These pseudonyms are, in fact, the powerful visible sign of the intrinsic complexities of women’s writing within a social context where language and the different interpretations of the world were manufactured mainly by men” (p. 5). The use of these masculine pseudonyms allowed their works to be published and further gave them the opportunity to maintain good standing within society.

Clorinda Matto de Turner, author of Aves Sin Nido, began her writing career using the pseudonym Carlote Dimont to avoid direct confrontations from the society in which she lived; however, she used her creative and inventive writing ability to reveal her society’s problems. In her book, Aves Sin Nido, Turner provides “insight to the importance of class, gender, race, and political affiliation in 19th century Peru” (Mujica, 1997, p. 61).

In the many perceptive literary critiques and evaluations of this novel, discussions revolve around Turner’s bold attacks on the exploitation of the Indians, on priestly celibacy, and on the lack of education in Peruvian society. Furthermore, De Mello contends that “it is quite clear, in the novel, that Turner believes the corrections of these social problems would help the Indians reach their salvation” (p. 199). Although other critics note that Turner’s criticisms of social problems in the novel are evident, the manner in which she made them, considering the time in which the book was written is unclear. In other words, how does Turner use female characters to reveal social conflict and simultaneously show her discontent with society, without directly “pointing the finger” at herself? Therefore, this section of the research will revolve around exploring this idea and analyzing Turner’s use of lying rhetoric in the novel Aves Sin Nido.

Lying rhetoric is a subtle and indirect literary device used by Latin American women writers to reveal certain thoughts and emotions through the actions of the characters. The reader must
actively participate in order to see the employment of certain characteristics that are involved with this mechanism. According to Lillian Zuccotti (1994), women’s use of lying rhetoric helps them avoid the condemnation from the masculine canon of their time. Lying rhetoric functions by producing a social image that praises the patriarchal society without openly revealing the writers’ criticisms. In order to accomplish this technique, it is necessary for the writers to lie. The writers mask the lie using the art of kindness and courtesy while hiding the outlandish and scandalous disapproval of the writers (p. 99). Zuccotti continues by stating that women writers could not fully place their trust in others, “’además, la amabilidad, la generosidad, y el halago, todo esto debemos dar a la gente a manos llenas y de pleno corazón: pero confianza, ni una gota’” (p. 99). (Kindness, generosity, praise are given to the people with full hands and plenty of heart, but without a drop of confidence.)

This establishes that it is necessary to read 19th century texts between the lines because they perfectly fit into the practice of defending and promoting the social system.

Turner’s use of lying rhetoric develops around the main female characters of the novel. Lucia Marin and Margarita Yupanqui. Joanna O’Connell, author of Prospero’s Daughter: The Prose of Rosario Castellanos, considers these two women to be “the moral center of Matto’s alternative vision” (p. 18). Even though the women were not given authoritative roles in the novel their influence on men is their only means of pursuing change.” In the novel, Lucia and her husband, Fernando Marin, are new members of the fictional city of Killac who unintentionally create ill will from the local powers during an attempt to help an Indian family out of their financial difficulties. The story begins with a meeting of two very different cultures.

Lucia Marin’s personal involvement and problems begin with her attempt to help Marcela Yupanqui. She arranges a meeting in which she seeks to persuade the local authorities to release the Yupanqui family from their debts. However, it is during this meeting with certain male characters that we see how Turner uses Lucia’s character to illustrate lying rhetoric.

Before Lucia’s meeting, Turner asserts a detailed description of the character. From this passage, the reader may assume that Lucia’s future discussion with the authorities would yield to be a successful one:

Lucia was no ordinary sort of woman. She had received quite a good education, and her keen intelligence was able to reach the light of truth by observing the world around her and making comparisons. She was tall and of that darkish complexion, that in Peru we call “pearl color.” Her lovely eyes looked out from under thick lashes and soft eyebrows; and she possessed that special womanly charm, heavy long hair that, when loosened, cascaded over her back like a drape of wavy and shining tortoise-shell. She had yet to reach the age of twenty, but marriage had stamped her features with that mark of the great lady so becoming to the young woman who knows how to couple an amiable character with a serious manner. Since coming to Killac with her husband a year earlier, she had lived in “the white house,” which also served as the headquarters for the silver mining operations in the adjoining province. Don Fernando Marin was the chief shareholder in this enterprise and its current manager. (p. 13)

From the passage, one may assume that Lucia possesses all the necessary characteristics for persuading others during this period such as her education, her marriage to a wealthy man, her beauty, and her charm. Furthermore, the passage also reinforces the idea that since she comes from a position of authority, other people with authority would respect and fulfill her requests.

Nevertheless, Lucia’s lucid attempt to discuss the Yupanqui matters with the authorities is fruitless. This particular situation is one of the clearest examples of lying rhetoric found in the novel. Turner expresses her conscious awareness of women’s lack of power possessed through Lucia’s character. Lucia’s failure illustrates the lack of direct influence and power women had during this period. She therefore keeps Lucia’s character and influence alive by allowing her to berate the city of Killac and the members of its society. It is through Lucia’s relationships, actions, and thoughts that Turner reveals her own opinion of that which is unjust, corrupt, and exploitive in society.

After Lucia’s unsuccessful meeting with the authorities, and the realization of her inability to change matters single-handedly, she seeks the help of her husband. In this scene, we see the manipulation Lucia uses to coerce her husband to do as she wants. Lucia’s character understands that the direct, candid demeanor that she used with the authorities cannot be used with her husband. Critic Lucia Cunningham (1990) supports this idea when she writes, “In order to conform to the cultural and behavioral codes imposed by patriarchal power, to be a woman has traditionally required the act of exerting self-censorship upon one’s own language, adopting instead, the discourse men have attributed to women” (p. 10). When Lucia Marin requests a favor from her husband, she is passive and submissive, which persuades him to do as she wishes: “his mind was awash in a sea of sweet thoughts, born of his wife’s childlike requests” (p. 21). Lucia’s relationship with her husband survives because she understands and cooperates with the assigned behaviors for women. She willingly undertakes the role of a woman in need of her husband’s aid, but does so without informing him of her intentions. In this case, Don Fernando had been gone for many weeks, and Lucia, knowing that her husband had missed her, uses this opportunity to request his help. Seductively, she requests that her husband give her money on the condition that she present...
herself to him as beautiful as she was on their wedding day. At this time, the en-
amored Don Fernando is unaware of his financial involvement with the Yupanqui family; however, he unknowingly yet will-
ingly falls into a trap of manipulation that many women in the Peruvian society are trained to use: “His wife’s childlike re-
quests confirmed his belief in the power of the habits that Peruvian women, who as a rule are docile and virtuous, acquire in their childhood home” (p. 21).

Later, Lucía uses the money to re-
lieve the Yupanqui family of their debts. Tragically, her aid results in the burning of her home and the death of Marcela Yupanqui and her husband Juan Yupanqui, leaving their two children or-
phans. Margarita’s character—the older of Marcela’s two children—also repre-
sents resistance to the patriarchal soci-
ety as with Lucía, but in a different man-
er.

Margarita’s introduction to the novel occurs when Marcela returns to Lucía’s house to collect the money for her debts. Marcela proudly bestows the title of god-
mother on Lucía who later, after Marcela’s death, takes custody of Margarita. All the characters who en-
counter her constantly address Margarita’s striking beauty and speak only of her physical appearance. Turner uses others’ comments about Margarita’s beauty to demonstrate one of the tech-
niques used by the patriarchal system to create a weak image for women. Com-
paring women to fragile, superficial, materialistic items that need to be cared for and protected accomplishes this intent. As long as Margarita accepts her compliments and does what is required of her, she has no problems with those who admire her beauty. However, it is later revealed that when Margarita be-
gins to openly question Lucía, and edu-
cate herself with the help of Manuel, her beauty is no longer relevant. She moves from a male-centered world that prohib-
its the development of her personality and personal goals and transcends into a world that allows her to develop her-
self intellectually. By doing this, she chal-
enages the authority figures in her life. For example, when Margarita attempts to inform Lucía of the mutual love be-
tween her and Manuel, Lucía hastily dis-
closes that Manuel is the son of her par-
ents’ murderer. She furthermore reveals her disapproval of Margarita’s relation-
ship with Manuel. After exposing her pain caused by this revealed information, Margarita leaves her godmother’s presence bitter and upset. It is then that a more rebellious Margarita emerges.

Margarita is involved in a learning process where she learns the menial daily activities of women in her position and tests her limits with the authority figures in her life. She therefore easily falls into a trap of victimization because she is unfamiliar with the rules set by the patri-
archal system. It is to Margarita’s ben-


Another manipulative device found in Latin American literature is food. Tra-
ditional masculine thought, which limits the space of women to the kitchen and bedroom, has long been challenged and rejected by feminists. Nevertheless, the tradition survives in many patriarchal soci-
eties in which women are the provid-
ers and creators of the food without the help of men. This tradition is so deeply rooted in many cultures that men who participate in the “assigned roles of women” are insulted and labeled weak. For example “in one African society, cooking was defined explicitly as a woman’s work to such and extent that men were looked upon as transvestites if they used the cooking pots—the pots belonged to the woman” (Furst, 1997, p. 442).

In literature, feminists have encour-
gaged female writers to move away from themes that circulate around domestic situations. Jean Franco (1989) affirms this statement when she writes, “It is important for contemporary women novelists not only in Mexico but all over Latin America to move beyond the con-
fines of domesticity” (p. 186). Franco applaus the many female writers who have successfully made this transition and encourages other women to do the
same. She concludes by stating, “It is not “daddy, mummy and me” who dominate their novels, but precarious and often perilous alliances across generations and social classes (p. 186). However, many women writers continue to use the domestic life as the backbone of their novels and do so successfully.

Laura Esquivel (1989) recognizes the relationship between women, food, and power in the novel Como A gua Para Chocolate N ovela de Entregas Mensuaes con Recetas, A mores y Remedios Caseros. “On the cover, she insists that the book is actually a novel, but subverts this code of reference by adding a lengthy subtitle that recalls and imitates the particular realms of popular culture that are associated with women” (Bibbija, 1996, p. 151). Esquivel transforms the traditional space of women into an area that empowers the woman and her work in the kitchen. The protagonist, Tita, uses food to control love, lust, and liberation within the household. Her premature birth, in the beginning of the novel, begins her experience and familiarity with the food: “Tita made her entrance into this world, prematurely, right there on the kitchen table amid the smells of simmering noodle soup, thyme, bay leaves, and cilantro, steamed milk, garlic, and, of course, onion” (pp. 5-6).

The abundance of tears that follows Tita as she emerges foreshadows her unhappy life as servant for her mother. Yet, her relationship with other members of the household is based upon her position within the home. After Nacha’s death, Tita becomes the primary provider of the family’s food. Tita’s rise to this position occurred after a series of events that were mostly provoked by her mother.

Mama Elena’s problematic relationship with her daughter begins with her inability to breastfeed Tita. “Problematic feeding can lead to personality disturbances in children and children’s eating problems may erupt in dysfunctional families” (Counihan, 1999, p. 18). The powerful bond that creates trust, assurance, and security between mother and child is never acquired in this mother and child relationship. After the sudden death of her husband, Mama Elena is unable to breastfeed her child. Her inability to provide food for Tita begins the sequence of disasters within the relationship.

Tita’s malnourishment from her mother’s breasts forces her to rely on the teas and gruels prepared by Nacha, the house cook. “Nacha, who knew everything about cooking, offered to take charge of feeding Tita. She felt she had the best chance of “educating the innocent child’s stomach” (p. 6). Although Nacha did not have children of her own, she was able to provide for Tita the love, care, and food that Mama Elena could not provide physically and refused to provide emotionally. Therefore, the mother-daughter bond flourishes between Nacha and Tita, assigning the role of surrogate mother to Nacha.

Mama Elena’s role in the novel contradicts the role of the women in Mexican society. She is presented as the patriarch in the tale by upholding male characteristics. Jean Franco (1989), in the book Plotting Women says: “Often, Mexican women were slow to challenge the domestication of women and often fearful of taking a step into areas where their decency would be put into question” (p. 93). Nevertheless, Mama Elena’s husband dies in the beginning of the novel, which leaves her the ability to assume the role of patriarch within the family. She uses familial traditions and social expectations to control the members of her home, especially her daughter, Tita. The most ridiculous of these traditions, which is forced upon the youngest child, forbids the youngest daughter to marry. Tita, who is the youngest daughter in the Garza family, must uphold this familial practice until the death of her mother.

In an interview with Salon Magazine, Esquivel discusses with Joan Smith the theme of destiny in her novels: “Tradition is an element that enters into play with destiny, because you are born into a particular family— Jewish or Islamic, or Christian or Mexican— and your family determines to some extent what you are expected to become.” She goes on to explain the conflict between ‘the outer reality and the inner voice’ and the importance of paying attention to the inner voice in order to “discover your mission in life and develop the strength to break with whatever familial cultural norms are preventing you from fulfilling your destiny” (interview).

Tita’s method of discovering her inner voice means addressing her tyrannical mother in the realm of the kitchen. Her first realization of her power occurs during a childhood game with her sisters. The game involved splashing water on a hot griddle and watching it “dance.” Tita’s sisters, Rosaura and Gertrudis, had in the past been reluctant to participate in activities involving the kitchen, but had been persuaded by Tita on this particular occasion. Gertrudis breaks away from her reluctance after observing Tita and joins in the game. On the other hand, Rosaura’s attempt to join the game ends in her burning herself and Tita is punished for she was forbidden to play with her sisters in her own world” (p. 8).

Tita’s power and control “in her world” originate from the emotions she encounters during the preparation of food. While cooking, she subconsciously transfers her love, sorrow, pleasure, and anger. An example in the novel occurs during the preparations for Rosaura’s wedding. Tita’s mother, while upholding the family tradition, allows Rosaura to marry Tita’s love, Pedro. She further punishes Tita by forcing her to organize and prepare all of the culinary necessities for the occasion.

Janice Jaffe, in commenting on Mama Elena’s dominance over Tita’s life, states that “Cruel rigor typifies Mama Elena’s management of Tita’s life, in and out of the kitchen” (Jaffe, 1993). She is errorless in her ability to “partir, desmantelar, desmembrar, desolar, destetar, desjarretar, desbaratar o desmadrar” (p. 97).
‘divide, dismantle, dismember, desolate, detach, dispossess, destroy, or dominate’. Mama Elena finds it difficult to cook according to instinct and constantly scolds Tita in her creative attempts. Nevertheless, Tita avoids her mother’s treacherous wrath with her culinary talent and the adaptations that she makes on the recipes.

While preparing for Rosaura’s wedding, Mama Elena becomes upset with Tita’s inability to correctly castrate a bird and slaps her. Tita remains cautious and appears to work hard while mixing the cake to avoid further upsetting her mother. She wildly beats the eggs into the cake “as if she wanted to end her martyrdom once and for all” (p. 28). After her mother retires to bed, Tita begins to cry non stop. He releases all of the suppressed pain she had endured since the announcement of Pedro’s engagement to Rosaura. The mixing of the tears in the cake and meringue batters changes the consistency of the pastry. Nacha later tests the flavor of the icing to taste whether or not Tita’s tears have affected the flavor. Although the flavor was not affected, the food’s exposure to Tita’s pain “poisons” it. Unfortunately, Nacha is the first to experience this poison, which kills her with the fatal nostalgia of remembering a past love. During the wedding celebration, the guests also undergo the “strange intoxication” (p. 39) that leave them ill from the memories, which the poison evokes.

Another example of Tita’s subversion of her mother’s authority through food occurs during the preparation of Codornices en pétalos de rosas, [Quail in Rose Petal Sauce]. In this scene, Pedro gives Tita roses to celebrate her new position as house cook. Hurt by his foolish act, Rosaura runs from the room crying. Mama Elena motions for Pedro to leave. Mama Elena then makes Tita discard the flowers. Leaving, Tita excitedly clutches Pedro’s gift tightly to her chest and inadvertently pierces her skin, an act that turns the pink roses red with her blood. Not wanting to dispose of the flowers, she decides to use them to prepare a recipe she hears dictated by Nacha.

During the preparation Tita’s excitement over receiving the flowers allows her to carefully, and lovingly prepare the meal. All of the ingredients were prepared correctly; however, the combination of Tita’s blood with the flowers results in a stimulating effect. At the table, all the members experience a sexual arousal that causes each one to shift restlessly in the chair and sweat profusely. However, it is Tita’s sister, Gertrudis, who experiences the most peculiar effects. Esquivel (1989) describes this experience when she writes, “With that meal it seemed they had discovered a new system of communication, in which Tita was the transmitter, Pedro the receiver, and poor Gertrudis the medium, the conducting body through which the singular sexual message was passed” (p. 52). Unable to escape the overwhelming sensation occurring between Tita and Pedro, Gertrudis runs to the shower in an attempt to cool down. However, the heat radiating from her body is so profound that it ignites a fire in the shower stall. She then runs through the field naked, mounts a horse with a passing soldier, and rides away to extinguish her sweltering body. This act, encouraged by Tita’s food, empowers Gertrudis to pursue her own desires. In the article, “Verbal and Visual Representation of Women: Como A gua Para Chocoloate and A ves Sin Nido”, author Maria Elena de Valdes (1995) observes Gertrudis’ empowerment when she states, “After leaving her mother’s home and authority, Gertrudis escapes from the brothel where she subsequently landed, and becomes a general of the revolutionary army, taking a subordinate as her lover and later, husband. When she returns to the family hacienda, she dresses like a man, gives orders like a man, and is the dominant sexual partner.”

Tita’s preparation of ‘Quail in Rose Petal Sauce’ helps to liberate Gertrudis and places her in a position where she is in control. Unbeknownst to her mother, it is with this meal and many others that Tita communicates and enters Pedro’s body, “voluptuous, aromática, calurosa, y completamente sensual” (p. 51) ‘hot, voluptuous, perfumed and totally sensuous.’ She is therefore able to avoid her mother’s watchful eye.

In the novels Como A gua Para C hocolate and A ves Sin N ido, the writers bring their interpretations of their societies to life with vivid scenes, with memorable characters, and with ceaseless conflicts intertwined to produce captivating stories. They address the depletion of spirit and the revival of hope, the betrayal within families, the death of loved ones, unwanted solitude, and the unfilled love in order to give meaning and direction to the lives of characters. Although the expectations of the protagonists in the novels are to fulfill roles assigned by the patriarchal society as well as carry the weight of unjust traditions or misfortunes, they survive by subverting and at times rejecting these roles. It is through the characters’ use of food and lying rhetoric that negotiations with the masculine world emerge.

References


The Influence of Mentoring on College Students Working with At-Risk Adolescents

Nikayla Boga
Dr. Catherine D. Stogner
Department of Human Sciences

Background and Review of Literature

Some adolescents between the ages of 10 and 17 are at risk of school failure, substance abuse, delinquency and teenage pregnancy (Astroth, 1999). Given the prevalence of these risk factors, it is no wonder that older individuals often feel that adolescence is a socially incurable disease (Astroth, 1999). Research has shown that adolescent psychiatric admissions have increased from between 250 and 400 percent over the past twenty years. Six thousand teens kill themselves annually. Furthermore, individuals feel that adolescents are undisciplined, disrespectful and just plain unfriendly (Astroth, 1999; Tolman, 2001). Many Americans think that teens and children are lazy and irresponsible (Tolman, 2001). Less than half of adult Americans believe that the next generation will make America a better place (www.publicagenda.org). Thus many individuals have a negative outlook about adolescents.

Wide-spread negative attitudes have affected adolescents’ attitudes towards themselves. According to researchers, adolescents “react to their uncertain futures by abandoning hope, leading them to engage in high levels of risk behavior” (Bolland, 2003, p. 145). Adolescents in poverty-stricken areas tend to abandon the idea of going to college since they often expect death at an earlier age (Bolland, 2003). This sense of hopelessness appears to result in abandoning goals for the future. McLaughlin, Miller, and Warwick (1996) suggest that a person’s sense of hopelessness can be seen through negative beliefs about themselves and their futures (Bolland, 2003). According to Tolman (2001) negative perceptions and low expectations shape young people’s experiences in that they shape the expectations of roles that are available to them (Tolman, 2001). These negative perceptions make adolescents feel as if they are a problem to be fixed (Tolman, 2001). These attitudes and beliefs in turn reinforce the negative perceptions of individuals about adolescents and a full cycle of negative attitudes can result. Thus, negative cycle continues.

One solution to overcoming the loss of hope in adolescents’ attitudes and the negative perceptions of adults, may be through adult mentoring programs. Mentoring is a relationship between a youth and an adult where the adult provides the young person with support (Jekielek, 2002). According to Beier and associates (2000), “adolescents who have an adult mentor would be less likely to engage in high-risk behaviors than those without an adult mentor” (p.327). In their study 294 adolescents in a health service suburban area received a questionnaire about risk behaviors such as smoking cigarettes, drinking alcohol, using drugs, violence, and sex. Beier’s questionnaire asked subjects if they had any adult to whom they could turn when they needed help or advice, thus representing a mentor. Researchers found that the students who answered “yes” were significantly less likely to carry weapons, use illicit drugs, have sex with more than one partner or smoke five or more cigarettes per day. Basically, students who had an adult mentor were less likely to show signs of high-risk behavior (Beir, 2000).

Similar research by Susan Jekielek and associates (2002) tested whether or not adult mentoring affected at-risk youth from poor, struggling, sometimes single-parent homes, and who lived in neighborhoods with few positive resources. After researching several mentor/adolescent relationship studies, researchers found that youth participating in mentoring relationships experience positive academic returns. They also found that mentoring approaches show promise in the prevention of substance abuse, and mentoring relationships appear to reduce some negative youth behaviors. Further, participating in mentoring promotes positive social attitudes and relationships with young people who are the most disadvantaged or at-risk seeming to benefit the most from mentoring.

If individuals know that these mentoring programs are beneficial to at-risk youths who have lost hope, then they should be more apt to participate in mentoring programs. However, this
may not be true because of the negative attitudes about adolescents. Individuals may not want to get involved because of the negative perceptions of adolescent behavior. Rather than allowing such apprehension to serve as a road block to working with adolescents, individuals should be willing to break the cycle of fear since mentoring has the potential to positively influence adolescents and mentors. Intuitively, it would seem that mentors would benefit from mentoring programs, especially when it comes to dispelling negative attitudes and unfounded fears. However, there appears to be little evidence to document this belief. Therefore, the present research will examine if the adult mentors working with adolescents experience a change in attitude about adolescents. We expect that if given a chance to work with adolescents in a mentoring relationship that adult mentors will develop more positive attitudes during the course of the relationship.

Research questions
1. Do individuals going into a mentoring experience with adolescents begin with negative attitudes about working with adolescents?
2. If so, what are some of the initial fears or apprehensions that individuals have about working with adolescents?
3. If given a chance to work with adolescents, do such attitudes change and fears diminish?

Hypothesis
We hypothesized that individuals would initially express negative attitudes and fears; however, the attitudes will become more positive and the fears reduced as time spent with adolescents progressed.

Methods
Thirty-six college students majoring in Child Development and Family Studies and enrolled in a required adolescent development class participated in this study. The subjects were 100% female ranging in age from 20 to 53 and with an average age of 23. The students were Caucasian (84%) and African American (16%). The majority of the class consisted of single women (77%) with no children (86%). Students participated in a three-week program where they mentored 10th grade African American at-risk adolescents.

A combination of quantitative and qualitative methodology was used. Subjects were asked to complete a pre-test questionnaire during a week of training and prior to the arrival of the adolescents. A post-test was completed at the conclusion of the program. The test consisted of 43 items using a four-point Likert Scale (Strongly Agree = 1 to Strongly Disagree = 4) (See Appendix). The statements addressed adult attitudes towards adolescents such as: It is easy to work with adolescents and I like spending time with adolescents. An additional two items asked what age groups the adults preferred working with (e.g. rank in order 1=first choice to 8=last choice; birth to one year, pre-school, etc.) and why? A factor analysis was performed but failed to yield any identifiable factors. Therefore, individual variable pre-test and post-test scores were compared using paired T-tests.

Qualitative analysis included subjects keeping daily journals and reflecting on each day’s experience with the adolescents. They were asked to discuss their experiences as well as reflect on these experiences. They were also asked to discuss how they felt before the adolescents arrived, when they actually met them, and how they felt at the end of the program. Subjects were asked to relate the journal entries to classroom lectures on adolescent development. Thirty-six journals were collected weekly and coded by two researchers. The researchers read the journals separately and then discussed recurring themes such as apprehension, fear, or intimidation. If there was a disagreement between the two researchers a third researcher was used. The researchers then reviewed the journals to further refine the process and to identify any themes that corresponded with the quantitative aspect of the research.

Results
As noted earlier, the quantitative phase was analyzed using paired T-Tests to compare pre and post-test scores. For consistency, some items were recoded from negative to positive attitude changes. Of the thirty-six items, four demonstrated statistically significant changes. It is easy to work with adolescents t(34)= 3.417, p<.01 (2-tailed). A dolesscents are more demanding than children t(34)= 2.380, p<.05 (2-tailed). I wouldn’t want to work with adolescents because adolescents are more likely to question my authority t(34)= 2.144, p<.05 (2-tailed). I like spending time with adolescents t(34)= 3.679, p<.001 (2-tailed). Two items were close enough to statistical significance to warrant noting. A dolesscents are friendly t(34)= 1.968, p=.058, and it is fun to talk to adolescents t(34)= 1.961, p=.058.

In the initial coding of the journals, researchers identified five themes that corresponded with the concepts identified in the quantitative analysis. Journal entries that are related to it is easy to work with adolescents are: amazement at how adolescents influenced mentors and pleasure in dealing with them. These entries indicated the mentors enjoyed working with and learning from the adolescents. Journal entries related to adolescents are more demanding than children were: adolescents were independent and had great self-esteem. These ideas are related because mentors found that the adolescents were not as demanding as they thought. They were, instead, more independent. The entries connected to I wouldn’t want to work with adolescents because they question my authority are: self-doubt about being a mentor and wanting to make a positive impact on the adolescent. The individuals felt as if they would not be respected and sometimes questioned if they would
be good mentors. Entries related to I like spending time with adolescents included: excitement about seeing the adolescents and feeling a connection by the third week. As the time progressed the mentors were more excited and some had developed friendships with their adolescents. Common themes for adolescents are friendly included: surprise at the connection on the first day and the attachments that were made. The mentors were shocked at how quickly they got along. They were at first apprehensive because they did not feel that the adolescents would be friendly or open. Journal entries relating to It is fun to talk to adolescents are: adolescents have unique personalities and sense of humor. Initially, the mentors doubted that working with adolescents would be enjoyable, but their perceptions changed from negative to positive.

In this study, several research questions were asked. We wanted to know if people going into a hands-on experience with adolescents began with negative attitudes about the adolescents. Based on the research questionnaire and the journal entries the adults did not expect the adolescents would be easy to get along with. They were very apprehensive and fearful. They felt that the adolescents would be too demanding and unfriendly. Secondly, we wanted to know what some of the initial fears were. We found that they were afraid of not being good mentors. The individuals were also intimidated by the perceived lack of communication from the adolescents. Again, they felt that the youths may have been unfriendly or that they would question the authority of the adult. If given a chance to work with adolescents do attitudes change? The questionnaire showed that some of the attitudes did change positively based on the results and the statistical significance. The journals also showed that some of the attitudes changed positively because the adults admitted to having some preconceived stereotypes and intimidation and nervousness but by the end of the three weeks friendships were formed.

Discussion

We wanted to find out if people going into a hands-on experience with adolescents began with a negative attitude. According to Astroth (1999) and Tolman (2001) individuals feel that adolescents are undisciplined, disrespectful and unfriendly, and according to this study adults did start out more negatively when asked if they believed that it would be easy to work with adolescents. However, by the end of the three-week program, the mentors had significantly changed their attitudes and came to believe that the adolescents were in fact easier to work with, were friendly and showed respect towards authoritative figures. The individuals may have been negative in the beginning because some of them had never worked with adolescents or were just recently leaving the period of adolescence themselves. Also, according to numerous journals the mentors had preconceived notions or stereotypes about the adolescents because they were at-risk African American teenagers. The majority of the mentors were Caucasian.

We also wanted to know some of the initial fears that the mentors had about working with adolescents. We found that several mentors mentioned the words fear and apprehension in their journal entries. The mentors questioned whether or not they would be able to relate to the adolescents and if they would be able to have a positive influence on the youth. This again tied in with the statement from the questionnaire It is easy to work with adolescents. The individuals began by questioning themselves and how well they could relate to the children but changed significantly after the three-week period. The individuals' questioning of their abilities may have been because of the differences in the cultural and even financial backgrounds. The apprehension may also have resulted from the negative connotation given to the title adolescent, which goes back to Astroth (1999) and the idea that adolescents are undisciplined. According to journal entries the adults were actually shocked at how well they meshed with the adolescents.

Adolescents in poverty-stricken areas tend to give up hope and often abandon the idea of attending college (Bolland 2003). This idea was refuted according to some of the journal entries. Mentors found that the students had great self-esteem despite their neighborhoods and were remarkably independent regardless of losing parents, close relatives, and friends. Also, mentors, after taking the pre-test, felt as if the adolescents were more demanding than children. However, the mentors changed that idea and stated that they were surprised at how independent the adolescents were. The individuals might have felt that the adolescents would be more demanding possibly because they thought that the relationship would be more of a dependent relationship rather than a friendship.

We hypothesized that the individuals working with adolescents initially expressed negative attitudes but those attitudes would change over time. In some areas the attitudes did become more positive. However some of them did not. One of the questions asked the mentors to rank whether or not they would prefer working with adolescents. Prior to the three-week program more people did want to work with adolescents than did after. This may be in part because the average age of the subjects was 23 years. While reading the journals we found that the mentors sought the approval of the adolescents more than anything. They were more concerned about being recognized for their achievements rather than helping the adolescents to achieve. This is most likely due to age because 23 years is not far removed from adolescence which ends at about the age of 19. In fact, the subjects seemed to be more self-centered than the adolescents.
who are supposed to be self centered. Another problem may have been that the program was only three-weeks. More time might have changed the results. For further research, older mentors should participate and the mentoring program should be implemented for a longer period of time.

References
Beir, S., Rosenfeld, W., Spitalny, K., Zansky, S., Bontempo, A. (2000) The potential role of an adult mentor in influencing high-risk behaviors in adolescents. Adolescent Medicine, 154, 327-331
www.publicagenda.org/specials/kids/kids.htm

Appendix
Adolescent Research Questionnaire

Demographic Data

Four Digit Number ___ ___ ___ ___

1. What is your age? ___________ years

2. What is your race?
   A. Caucasian
   B. Black
   C. Spanish
   D. Oriental
   E. Native-American

3. What is your sex?

4. What is your marital status?
   A. Single
   B. Married
   C. Divorced or separated
   D. Widow

5. How many children do you have?
   A. None
   B. 1
   C. 2
   D. 3
   E. 4 or more

6. Are you currently employed?
   A. No
   B. Part-time
   C. Full-time

7. In what area do you work?
   A. Health-related
   B. Clerical
   C. Sales
   D. Other _______
Instructions:

The following are some statements about working with adolescents. Please circle the response that best represents your opinion.

KEY: SA - Strongly Agree, A - Agree, D - Disagree, SD - Strongly Disagree

8. It is easy to work with adolescents.
   
   SA   A   D   SD

9. Adolescents are more demanding than children.
   
   SA   A   D   SD

10. It is difficult mentoring for adolescents because they are always rebellious.
    
   SA   A   D   SD

11. Adolescents complain more than any other age group.
    
   SA   A   D   SD

12. Children make fewer demands than adolescents.
    
   SA   A   D   SD

13. It would depress me to work with an adolescent.
    
   SA   A   D   SD

14. It is more rewarding to provide mentoring to a child than to an adolescent.
    
   SA   A   D   SD

15. I get more involved emotionally working with children than with adolescents.
    
   SA   A   D   SD

16. I wouldn’t want to work with adolescents because adolescents are more likely to question my authority.
    
   SA   A   D   SD

17. It is difficult to teach adolescents new information about life.
    
   SA   A   D   SD

18. It is worse for an adolescent to die than a child.
    
   SA   A   D   SD
19. I like spending time with adolescents.

   SA   A   D   SD

20. Adolescents are always rebelling against social norms.

   SA   A   D   SD

21. Adolescents get mad easily.

   SA   A   D   SD

22. Adolescents are friendly.

   SA   A   D   SD

23. It is fun to talk to adolescents.

   SA   A   D   SD

24. Adolescents are the same as adults.

   SA   A   D   SD

25. Adolescents have a happy life.

   SA   A   D   SD

26. Adolescents are mean.

   SA   A   D   SD

27. Adolescents can teach me new things.

   SA   A   D   SD

28. Adolescents like to boss everybody.

   SA   A   D   SD

29. Adolescents do not do much.

   SA   A   D   SD

30. Adolescents are stubborn.

   SA   A   D   SD

31. Adolescents do not talk too much.

   SA   A   D   SD
32. I think that adolescents are funny.
   SA   A   D   SD

33. Adolescents are in trouble all of the time.
   SA   A   D   SD

34. Adolescents are very intelligent.
   SA   A   D   SD

35. Adolescents are sweet.
   SA   A   D   SD

36. Adolescents are full of energy.
   SA   A   D   SD

37. Adolescents laugh a lot.
   SA   A   D   SD

38. Adolescents should be less demanding.
   SA   A   D   SD

39. Adolescents should be allowed to express their own opinions.
   SA   A   D   SD

40. Adolescents should have their privacy.
   SA   A   D   SD

41. Adolescents need to be told what to do most of the time.
   SA   A   D   SD

42. Adolescents do more harm than good.
   SA   A   D   SD

43. I come into contact with adolescents often.
   SA   A   D   SD
44. Rank your preference for working with the following clients with numeral 1 representing most preferred and 8 representing least preferred.

A. infant birth to 1 year ___
B. preschooler 2-4 years ___
C. school age 5-12 years ___
D. adolescent 13-19 years ___
E. young adult 20-39 years ___
F. middle adult 40-55 years ___
G. older adult 56-74 years ___
H. elderly adult over 75 years ___

45. Briefly write your reason for selection of the most preferred.
Was Marx an Environmentalist?

Ryan S. Husak
Dr. Michael Principe
Department of Philosophy

Introduction
The heavy participation of environmental organizations in the recent struggles against globalization indicates that there is a direct link between the exploitation of human beings and the exploitation of nature. Institutions such as the World Trade Organization and foreign policies such as the North American Free Trade Agreement work at once to lower the standards of working conditions as well as environmental regulations, particularly in the Third World. While environmentalists are coming to agree on the incompatibility between capitalism and a sustainable ecology, their search for a 'new vision,' a political economy compatible with ecological sustainability, is quite scattered. Their reluctance to align themselves with the thought of Karl Marx is often the result of a misconception of his analysis, whereby it is held (inaccurately) that Marx himself made no effort to include rational ecological thinking in his critique of capitalism. Marx has also been charged with adopting a Promethean view of history under which productive forces are preferred to natural constraints. Some of his more sympathetic critics have argued that his writings are disproportionate, claiming that ecological views are reflected in his early works but disappear later in his career. The aim of this essay is to criticize the arguments advanced in favor of the above positions by looking at Marx's notion of metabolism and the 'metabolic rift.' I will not attempt to green Marx or demonstrate how his thinking is relevant to and can be used in understanding the particular ecological problems plaguing the world today. Rather I will show that Marx himself was to a great extent an ecological thinker his entire career and that, in fact, his thinking became more ecological later in his career. It is hoped that after reading this essay the environmentalist will approach Marx with a different attitude and will then seek to discover the degree to which Marx's ecological thinking can be applied to today's ecological crisis.

Marx's Notion of Metabolism and the Metabolic Rift

The most important of Marx's early writings are the Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844. These manuscripts represent Marx's first draft of his economics and are most noted for the theory of alienation advanced in the first of the four manuscripts. With these manuscripts, Marx details the ways in which the worker is estranged from his labour in the capitalist mode of production. First, he is alienated from the object of his labour and relates to it as an alienated object. Second, the worker is alienated from himself through his production. He does not feel at home in his
labour or views it as part of his ‘real life.’ Third, the worker is alienated from his “species-being,” his transformative, creative human capacities. And fourth, he is alienated from other people.

What is central here for us is the effect that this alienation of labour, according to Marx’s conception, has on the relationship between human beings and nature. It will be argued that Marx believed that as human beings become more alienated from their labour in the capitalist mode of production nature becomes more alienated from them both internally and externally. What is crucial is that we first understand the role nature plays for human beings in their physical and intellectual life.

Beginning with the Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844, until his death, Marx regarded nature, insofar as it enters into the life of human beings through their labour, as humanity’s “inorganic body”:

The universality of man appears in practice precisely in the universality that makes the whole of nature into his inorganic body in that it is both (i) his immediate means of subsistence and also (ii) the material object and tool of his vital activity. Nature is the inorganic body of a man, that is, in so far as it is not itself a human body. That man lives from nature means that nature is his body with which he must maintain a constant interchange so as not to die. (81)

In this passage Marx makes two distinct points. First, humanity depends upon nature the same way that a person depends upon the existence and function of certain bodily organs. This relationship between human beings and nature is mediated through labour not only in production but also in the creation of tools, machines, equipment, and the like, which makes production possible. Elsewhere in the 1844 Manuscripts, Marx argues that nature provides the substance for human beings’ intellectual practices. We cannot do science, architecture, or art without nature since nature provides, according to Marx, the object of “human consciousness” (81).

Second, Marx notes that the relationship between humanity and nature is dialectical. We do (and must) transform nature through our labour, but in so doing nature transforms us, and the ways in which we structure our society and practices. Nature is not passive according to this idea; it has effects on us that we may not anticipate, and we must therefore remain in a “constant interchange” with nature adjusting our practices at times to sustain this interchange.

In his later works, Marx formalizes this idea of a dialectical relationship between humanity and nature by introducing his notion of “metabolism.” For Marx, all human labour involves an unavoidable material exchange with and transformation of nature. What is central to Marx’s conception of metabolism is that human beings must govern this metabolic relationship in a rational way through their labour, which he believed was impossible under the capitalist mode of production. We will see presently why Marx believed that a rationally governed ecology could not co-exist with capitalism. However, in order to fully understand Marx’s late critique of capitalism it is important to understand the role alienation plays in the capitalist productive process.

The four modes of alienation, which together constitute Marx’s theory of alienation of the worker, must be viewed, according to Marx, as being inseparable from the alienation created in capitalism between humanity and nature. Since the worker is alienated from the labour process and the transformative role of nature therein, it follows that nature is related to the worker as an alienated object of which he has no control or transformative say. Marx makes this point explicit in his discussion of the differing roles of production between human beings and non-human animals in the 1844 Manuscripts when he writes, “when alienated labour tears from man the object of his production, it also tears from him his species-life, the real objectivity of his species and turns the advantage he has over animals into a disadvantage in that his inorganic body, nature, is torn from him” (82-83).

The advantage/disadvantage about which Marx is speaking is an aesthetic one. Animals, Marx holds, produce only to satisfy their immediate needs, whereas human beings can produce freely and in accord with the “laws of beauty” and thus aspire to attain a value in their labour beyond the mere satisfaction of immediate needs (1844 Manuscripts, 82). However, under capitalism the worker, as a wage-earning labourer rather than the owner of the objects of production, is reduced to the labouring status of an animal since he, like the animal, produces only to satisfy his immediate needs. This is evident from the fact that when the worker’s immediate needs are met, Marx writes, “labour is avoided like the plague” (1844 Manuscripts, 80).

What is pertinent in Marx’s analysis of alienated labour is that the worker not only spends his time and energy—i.e. His physical existence—engaged in a labour process over which he has no control, but his intellectual and creative abilities are also torn from him in this process and, therefore, is his ability to relate to nature in a creatively meaningful manner. Hence, the alienation of the worker is at one and the same time the estrangement from his labour activities as well as his creative essence and his transformative role of nature, as Marx puts it, “alienated labour... alienates from man his own body, nature exterior to him, and his intellectual being, his human essence” (1844 Manuscripts, 83).

Thus far we have discussed alienation as if it were only a working class phenomenon. Yet, should we accept that the alienation of the worker is to be taken as a set of relations between people and nature, then it would seem that the observable traits of this alienation would extend to other classes. Marx himself believed that the alienation of the worker is not an estrangement unique to the worker, but rather a social phenomenon:
"E very self-alienation from man from himself and nature appears in the relationship in which he places himself and nature to other men distinct from himself" (1844 Manuscripts, 84).

Marx's concern with alienation indeed is disproportionately directed at the working class for the very reason that it is the working class that comprises the majority of human beings and thus the interest of society at large. It is therefore not surprising for Marx to write, "general human emancipation is contained in [the workers'] emancipation" (1844 Manuscripts, 85). On the other hand, Marx did attempt, but only briefly, to analyze the capitalist's state of alienation in the following passage:

The first remark to make is that everything that appears in the case of the worker to be an activity of externalization, of alienation, appears in the case of the non-worker to be a state of externalization, of alienation.

Secondly, the real, practical behaviour of the worker in production and towards his product (as a state of mind) appears in the case of the non-worker opposed to him as theoretical behaviour.

Thirdly, the non-worker does everything against the worker that the worker does against himself but he does not do against himself what he does against the worker. (1844 Manuscripts, 87)

It is at this point that the first of the four sections of the 1844 Manuscripts breaks off unfinished, and so we are not given a detailed account of Marx's thoughts on the alienation of the capitalist (i.e. the non-worker). However, a few remarks concerning the above passage can still be made. The capitalist's relation to the worker's product places him in a state of alienation. Marx sets clear throughout the 1844 Manuscripts that the relationship between the worker and the capitalist becomes hostile in the capitalist mode of production. Take, for example, the following passages:

The alien being to whom the labour and the product of the labour belongs, whom the labour serves and who enjoys its product, can only be man himself. If the product of labour does not belong to the worker but stands over against him as an alien power, this is only possible in that it belongs to another man apart from the worker. (84). Moreover, the relationship of man to himself [i.e. the worker] first becomes objective and real to him through his relationship to other men. So if he relates to the product of his labour, his objectified labour, as to an object that is alien, hostile, powerful, and independent of him, this relationship implies that another man is the alien, hostile, powerful, and independent master of this object. If he relates to his own activity as to something unfree, it is a relationship to an activity that is under the domination, oppression, and yoke of another man. (1844 Manuscripts, 94)

Since alienated labour creates hostility between the worker and the capitalist, the worker cannot have human relations with him, and therefore, he cannot have human relations with the worker. Thus, Marx's fourth mode of alienation applies equally to the worker as well as the capitalist.

The capitalist's state of alienation shows up elsewhere in the labour process than simply in the relationship between other human beings and himself. The object of the worker's labour activity is viewed only as an object to be sold in the market to make a profit. With his eye on a product's exchange-value, rather than solely on its use-value, the capitalist does not relate to the worker's product meaningfully. He is as indifferent to the use and users of the product as he is about the process by which it came. Furthermore, the capitalist's active role in the labour process is also alienated. The labourer, by not actually owning the objects of production, as have seen, works "unfreely" and contributes nothing of his own in the labour process. In this sense, the products themselves dominate him; he cannot create them or employ them as he chooses or sees fit. The capitalist, on the other hand, is not directly dominated by the objects of production as is the worker; but rather he is forced, by competition and various other social conditions demanded in the market, to sell, exchange, and produce his products according to external demands existing independently of his own will and desire. He therefore, like the worker (albeit differently), relates to the objects of production externally. He sees them not as something that can be produced to satisfy a particular use, but only as objects that can be manufactured and turned into profit.

Thus alienation is not simply a working class phenomenon. It is a state of humanity existing in both of the capitalist economic strata: the working class and the owning (capitalist) class. We have seen that the worker's alienation from nature develops out of his alienation of the labour process and the transformative role of nature therein. What the above analysis of the capitalist's state of alienation shows is that the capitalist himself (and thus the whole of humanity in capitalist society) relates to nature as an alienated object since the producers as well as the owners of the objects of production must manufacture according to the demands and function of the capitalist market, which for Marx can never constitute 'free' labour. "Free trade," Marx says, "is not the freedom of one individual in relation to another, but the freedom of capital..." (Speech on the Question of Free Trade, 463).

In his late (mature) writings, Marx systematically lays out the way in which the capitalist appropriates surplus value (i.e. profit) from the workers' labour, and in so doing, he advances his most important analysis of capitalist economics, namely the theory of exploitation. Classical economists, such as David Ricardo, according to Marx, erroneously believed that the exchange-value of a commodity was measured by the cost of raw materials plus labour time (Theories of Surplus Value, 399-400). This formula of exchange value was then taken to be an axiomatic law of nature, a necessary economical truth. Put briefly, the classical
economist's analysis runs as follows: If the wood and tools cost $100, say to build 10 chairs, and the worker's pay is $10 per hour and 10 workers (of the same pay) are required, each working a total of 20 hours, then the cost (exchange-value) of the ten chairs equals $2100 (10 workers × $10 per/hr × 20hrs + $100 of raw material = $2100), or $110 per chair.

Marx argues that the above formula is too simple since it does not show from where or how the capitalist makes his profit. If the classical economists were merely describing the market of former, pre-capitalist societies, then their analysis would be correct, Marx held, since a commodity's use-value was the important factor then. A worker may exchange his product directly (for another useful commodity) or indirectly for money. However, in capitalism a new value is introduced where the sole aim of production is to turn a commodity into money, and thus the division of a commodity's exchange-value is expressed over its use-value. In order for the capitalist to maximize a commodity's exchange-value and make a profit in so doing, the capitalist must require his labourer to work "unpaid" labour time. Hence, the theory of exploitation is developed.

If a capitalist is to make a profit from his worker's labour, then the wages of the labourer must have a smaller exchange-value than the exchange-value of the object he produces. This can only be achieved if the capitalist requires his worker to work longer than is sufficient to embody in his product the value of his labour power. For instance, if a worker's essential needs, including some extra money for entertainment and the like, amounts to, say, $50 per day, then the capitalist will require that the worker's labour power embody a value of $50 for the first, let us say, four hours of his work day and then the rest of his day's labour will be given to the production of surplus-value. In this case the surplus value will amount to $50 assuming the labourer works an eight-hour shift.

Marx's early economical writings, as shown in our discussion of the 1844 Manuscripts, demonstrate the way in which human beings become separated from their labour in the capitalist mode of production. By advancing the theory of exploitation Marx explains the mechanisms that sustain this separation. The capitalist by exploiting his workers accumulates large amounts of wealth with which he can buy more property and capital to further exploit (and alienate) wage laborers. This should be viewed not as an act of greed—though some capitalists are indeed greedy—but as an inherent law of the capitalist mode of production. In volume three of Capital, Marx argues that the rate of profit decreases as competition, technological advancements, and the like increase in capitalism. Thus, in order for the capitalist to maintain his surplus value, he must constantly expand and find new labourers to exploit. "The capitalist production process is essentially," Marx writes, "a process of accumulation" (Capital Vol. III, 324).

It was during the period in which Marx advanced his mature analysis of capitalism that his most acute and profound ecological insights were also developed. Recall that in the 1844 Manuscripts Marx showed that in capitalist society the whole of humanity relates to nature as an aliened object, at least insofar as this relationship is predicated on labour, and that it is necessary for humanity to maintain a "constant interchange" with nature. Although it is obvious from these manuscripts that Marx deemed the relationship between humanity and nature important, he did not at the time of writing them have enough scientific knowledge and background to demonstrate how (or even that) humanity's interaction with nature under the capitalist mode of production could ultimately lead to an unrecoverable environmental crisis. However, as we will see, Marx became deeply concerned with the ecological toll from the capitalist agribusiness and eventually believed that the nature of capitalist agriculture was unsustainable.

Throughout the 1850's and 1860's Marx became intensely interested in the works of the 19th Century German chemist Justus von Liebig who provided a scientific explanation of the degrading soil conditions resulting from capitalist agriculture in both Europe and North America. In a letter to Friedrich Engels (1866), Marx wrote, "I had to wade through the new agricultural chemistry in Germany, especially Liebig and Schönbein, who are more important in this matter than all the economists put together" (Selected Correspondence, 204). What Marx developed from the writings of Liebig was a complete refutation of the renowned 'population presses on the means of subsistence' thesis advanced by the classical political economist Thomas Robert Malthus. Malthus argued that the cause of ecological crisis is overpopulation and that human beings will eventually overpopulate the world to the extent that the maintenance of adequate food production will cease to be possible. Both Marx and Engels attacked the Malthusian view of overpopulation early on in their careers, but by the time of writing Capital volume III, they had become convinced that agriculture could be sustained to meet human needs if, as Liebig argued, it were "rationally governed."

In his late works Marx employed the term "metabolism" to refer to the material exchange with and transformation of nature through human labour. In Capital Marx writes:

Labour is, first of all, a process between man and nature, a process by which man through his own actions, mediates, regulates and controls the metabolism between himself and nature. He confronts the materials of nature as a force of nature. He sets in motion the natural forces that belong to his own body, his arms, legs, head, and hands,
in order to appropriate the materials of nature in a form adapted to his own needs. Through this movement he acts upon external nature and changes it, and in this way he simultaneously changes his own nature... The labour process... is the universal condition for the metabolic interaction [Stoffwchsel] between man and nature, and it is therefore nature-imposed condition of human existence, or rather it is common to all forms of society in which human beings live. (283, 290)

However, from the writings of Liebig, Marx came to recognize an emerging “irreparable rift” in this metabolism as a result of the separation produced in capitalist society between town and country:

... large landed property reduces the agricultural population to an ever decreasing minimum and confronts it with an ever growing industrial population crammed together in large towns; in this way it produces conditions that provoke an irreparable rift in the interdependent process of social metabolism, a metabolism prescribed by the natural laws of life itself. The result of this is a squandering of the vitality of the soil, which is carried by trade far beyond the bounds of a single country. (Liebig, Capital V d. III, 949)

The conceptual analysis of the relationship between humanity and nature advanced in the 1844 Manuscripts is quite similar to the conception of metabolism Marx employed later in his life. However, the idea that Marx contributed nothing more to his ecological thinking from his early to his late works is certainly false. As we saw, Marx added to the human-nature relationship a “nature-imposed condition,” which was completely absent in his early works. Thus, Marx’s conception of metabolism encompasses his early notion of the labour process, as involving a necessary material exchange with, and mediation of, nature, while recognizing the fact that nature has imposed limitations. Furthermore, this recognition of a “nature-imposed condition” led Marx to develop his concept of a ‘rift’ in the metabolic relationship between human beings and nature, which is, for both Marx and Liebig, the human violation of nature’s ecological limitation and thus the causing of irreparable, ecological damage.

Nor does Marx abandon the critical role of human alienation in his post-1844 ecological thinking. In the Grundrisse, for example, Marx writes:

It is not the unity of living and active humanity with the natural, inorganic conditions of their metabolic exchange with nature, and hence their appropriation of nature, which requires explanation or is the result of a historic process, but rather the separation between these inorganic conditions of human existence and this active existence, a separation which is completely posited only in the relation of wage labour and capital. (489)

However crucial alienation may be in Marx’s ecological thinking, it was not until he developed his mature analysis of capitalism that he was afforded the resources to advance a strictly-speaking environmental critique of capitalism. We have already seen the two most central concepts involved in his late critique of capitalist economics. First, there was the theory of exploitation, which for Marx constitutes a “robbing” of the worker (by the capitalist) of the surplus value produced by his (the worker’s) labour. Secondly, we saw that the logic of capitalism is to expand, namely that it is essentially “a process of accumulation.” What is central to Marx’s critique of capitalism, though it is often overlooked, is his attempt to tie these two concepts together with his notion of metabolism. In effect, Marx has deliberately produced a systematic critique of capitalism from an environmental standpoint. This will become clear when it is shown that Marx employs the same language and concepts in his discussions on the environment and its alterations under the capitalist mode of production as he does in his discussions on the worker in capitalist society. Furthermore, I will show that Marx recognized a tension between the ecological sustainability of the earth’s integrity and the expansionist logic of capitalism.

In Chapter 15 of Capital, Marx states:

“all progress in capitalist agriculture is a progress in the art, not only of robbing the worker, but of robbing the soil” (638). It robs the worker of his independence to produce and operate in accord with his traditional ways of farming by substituting for him the wage-labourer. It robs the soil in a similar manner in that the large-scale intense farming methods of capitalism destroy the “long-lasting sources of [the soil’s] fertility” by robbing the soil of its “constituent elements” (Capital, 638, 637).

Small-scale farming requires constant crop rotation and a particular acuteness of weather and season fluctuations, which for Marx run counter to capitalist agriculture since it “is oriented towards the most immediate monetary profit” (Capital Vol. III, 754).

In a letter to Engels (1869) Marx illustrates the tendency of capitalist agriculture to exhaust the land so thoroughly that it must then find new land in order to maintain its production. “The settlers in Virginia exploited the land suited both in situation and fertility to their chief product, tobacco, so abominably that they had to move on to Ohio, where the land was less good for this product” (Sämtl. Correspondenz, 272).

What Marx’s letter-to-Engels suggests is that the Virginia settlers produced a ‘rift’ in their metabolic relationship with nature in their cultivation of tobacco. Marx certainly believed that this was only an example of his theoretical concept of a rift and not a mere mishap in their cultivation. Speaking in more general terms, Marx writes in Capital:

Capitalist Production collects the population together in great centres, and causes the urban population to achieve an ever-growing preponderance. This has two results. On the one hand it concentrates the historical motive power of society; on the other hand, it disturbs the metabolic interaction between man and the earth, i.e. it prevents the return
to the soil of its constituent elements... hence it hinders the operation of the eternal natural condition for the lasting fertility of the soil. (637)

The tendency of capitalist production to exhaust the soil is for Marx the result of capital's expansionist logic. Since the capitalist mode of production is first and foremost driven by the acquisition of immediate profit, Marx did not believe that the large-scale agriculture industries would be able to apply the developing agronomic methods (such as the self-sustaining soil management of Liebig) to their production. Marx observed, for example, that in England (during the 1850's) capitalist agriculture needed to rely on imported guano. The result of this was twofold for Marx: first, capitalism becomes global in character, and second, it has ceased to be self-sufficient, that is, it "no longer finds the natural conditions of its own production within itself, naturally arisen, spontaneous, and ready at hand" (Grundrisse, 527). In other words, since the capitalist must produce more quickly and in quantitatively higher volumes than his competitors, he cannot preserve the integrity of the soil at the risk of slowing his production rate down. "The same blind desire for profit," Marx writes in Capital, "that in the one case exhausted the soil had in the other case seized hold of the vital force of the nation at its roots" (348).

In what may be the most influential essay written on ecological Marxism, "The Second Contradiction of Capitalism," James O'Connor attempts to supplement Marx's account of the central contradiction of capitalism with a recognition of a second contradiction, distinct, but analogous to, the former. The central line of argument in Marx's account is as follows. Since competition in the capitalist market demands that the capitalist increase his rate of productivity, so as not to be replaced by his competitors, the capitalist will therefore employ machinery and other technological advancements to increase his level of productivity. This in turn will tend to increase unemployment and decrease the workers' wages, generating an economic crisis of overproduction. As a result, Marx believed that this crisis might prompt a restructuring of the forces and relations of production in the direction of a growing socialization of productive forces.

What O'Connor points out is that there may be two distinct routes to socialism, where the first engenders a labour movement, as Marx notes, and the second, an environmental (social) movement. O'Connor argues that the environmental degradation produced under the capitalist mode of production may undermine the capitalist's ability to continue manufacturing commodities for sale at a reasonable (affordable) price, and thus a social movement may develop with an aim to socialize productive forces in an effort to ensure better environmental planning and management. In this sense, O'Connor's account of the contradiction of capitalism is similar to Marx's since the idea that capitalism tends to impair or destroy the conditions of its own sustainability is central to both. For O'Connor, however, Marx never went so far as to discuss how an environmental movement might develop with a socialization of the productive forces in mind as a result of capitalism's environmental contradiction.

Although O'Connor is correct in stating that Marx gave no systematic analysis linking an environmental movement with the contradiction(s) of capitalism, Marx did hint at such a movement (to which O'Connor admits). In Capital, for example, Marx writes:

Capitalist production... only develops the techniques and the degree of combination of the social process of production by simultaneously undermining the original sources of all wealth—the soil and the worker. (638)

Moreover, Marx argues that the development of capitalism in the "sphere of agriculture" contains "a more revolutionary effect than elsewhere" (Capital, 637). He even by the time of writing Capital Volume III believed that a rationally governed ecology stood in contradiction to the capitalist mode of production:

... [t]he way that the cultivation of particular crops depends on the fluctuations in the market prices and the constant changes in cultivation with these price fluctuations—the entire spirit of capitalist production, which is oriented toward the most immediate monetary profit—stands in contradiction to agriculture, which has to concern itself with the whole gamut of permanent conditions of life required by the chain of human generations. (754)

To say the least, Marx certainly believed that the contradiction between a rationally governed ecology and the capitalist mode of production would become more apparent as the capitalist market expanded. It is not surprising then for Marx to argue that the solution to the environmental crisis is identical to the solution of the worker's exploitation and alienation, namely the transformation of capitalism—the abolition of wage-labour—toward a creation of society of associated (communist) producers and communal ownership of the means of production. "The moral of the tale," Marx writes in Capital, Volume III,

... is that the capitalist system runs counter to a rational agriculture, or that a rational agriculture is incompatible with the capitalist system (even if the latter promotes technical development in agriculture) and needs either small farmers working for themselves or the control of the associated producers. (216)

Nowhere, however, does Marx guarantee that nature will undergo a rationalization (and hence a solution to the developing ecological crisis will be discovered) with the creation of a society of associated producers. Rather, Marx sought only to show that under the capitalist mode of production human labouring activities are governed by the eternal demands of the capitalist mar-
ket, which runs counter to ecological considerations, rather than by decisions freely chosen. Moreover, Marx believed that human labour is truly free only when the decision-making process regarding nature is collectively and rationally made. 

“Freedom [in the realm of natural necessity] can consist only in this, that socialized man, the associated producers, govern the human metabolism with nature in a rational way, bringing it under their collective control instead of being dominated by it as a blind power” (Capital V ol. III, 959).

A socialist, environmental theorist, and a critic of Marx, Ted Benton, argues in “Marxism and Natural Limits: An Ecological Critique and Reconstruction” that Marx’s emphasis on the collective control of the associated producers in governing the metabolic relationship between humanity and nature suggests an “underlining antagonism” between human beings and nature: “either we control nature, or it controls us!” (169). However, Benton makes no reference to Marx’s insistence on the need to rationalize this metabolism so as to live in harmony with nature (rather than in a state of alienation) and to protect its natural integrity by sustainable management, et cetera. Moreover, Marx believed that human beings have a particular (almost a moral) obligation to nature, to protect and to improve it. In Capital Vol. III, for example, Marx writes: From the standpoint of a higher socioeconomic formation, the private property of particular individuals in the earth will appear just as absurd as the private property of one man in other men. Even an entire society, a nation, or all simultaneously existing societies taken together, are not the owners of the earth. They are simply its possessors, its beneficiaries, and have to bequeath it in an improved state to succeeding generations, as boni patres familias [good heads of the household]. (911)

Having traced Marx’s ecological thinking from his early to his late works, showing that it remained central in his critique of capitalism throughout his entire career, it would be difficult to accept the thesis expressed in Alfred Schmidt’s The Concept of Nature in Marx. As noted above, Schmidt set out to show that “Marx wanted to achieve something qualitatively new: mastery by the whole society of society’s mastery over nature.” He furthermore argued that Marx fell prey to a Promethean view where “[t]his mastery would certainly still depend on the functions of instrumental reason” (13). While it is true that nature is central to human labour, that without it, labour, science, society, humanity, and everything else could not exist, Marx’s late critique of capitalism necessitates that we not violate nature’s ecological limitations. In this sense, then, the human relationship with nature is predicated on a mutual interdependence and is not merely instrumental. We do use nature in our productive processes, but it is central that these uses not become exploitative. We may use nature but only insofar as we ensure protection of its ecological integrity.

Conclusion

With this essay, I have shown that Marx’s critique of capitalism from his early to his late works has consistently involved an ecological dimension. Indeed, Marx was overwhelmingly concerned with human liberation and sought to show how the capitalist mode of production structurally undermines this realization. Much of the literature in contemporary environmental ethics is devoted to the debate between whether nature has instrumental or intrinsic value, and similarly, whether nature’s value should be viewed from an ecocentric or an anthropocentric standpoint. Nowhere will one find in the writings of Marx a solution to these debates. This does not, however, render Marx’s thinking passé. By contrast, Marx’s emphasis on human freedom entails a ‘practical’ platform on which these debates may continue. It makes no difference whether the environmentalist can prove that nature is intrinsically or instrumentally valuable or whether we should view nature from this or that perspective. If we are not free as a society to act in accordance with these conclusions, then what good are they? Marx’s has therefore pointed out what took almost one hundred-and-fifty years for the environmentalist to discover (and still not all have done so): that the earth’s ecological crisis is not a crisis of nature but rather a crisis of society. Unless we are truly free to change our interaction with nature, then our theoretical debates will avail us nothing. Freedom to act is therefore the presupposition to every environmentalist.

At minimum, the above analysis demonstrates that the charges made against Marx for adopting a Promethean view of history under which productive forces are preferred to natural constraints, indicate an inadequate understanding of his thought. Moreover, it has been shown that Marx’s thinking became more ecological later in his career with the recognition that under capitalism the earth crosses critical thresholds of ecological sustainability. Today few people can doubt that the earth is approaching an unprecedented environmental crisis. While green and organic shopping, recycling, responsible household management of water and electricity, et cetera are becoming prevalent in today’s society, these practices are shaped in such a way as to make environmental progress synonymous with the sustainable development of capitalism. If Marx’s analysis is at all correct, then it follows that these practices may only at best delay, not remedy, the environmental crisis. What is demanded from the environmentalist is a commitment to transform the major social bases of environmental degradation, namely capitalism, and not merely tinker with its minor technical bases.
Notes

1. See pp. 21-22.
2. Similarly O’Connor never goes so far as to show how a labour movement may develop as result of capitalism’s environmental contradiction. If we accept the premise that the capitalist mode of production may undermine the capitalist’s ability to manufacture commodities for sale at an affordable price, then it would follow that the wages of the workers may be reduced in an effort to maintain either the manufacturing of affordable commodities or the rate of surplus value. Either way, with the reduction of the workers’ wages, it is not difficult to see how a labour movement may ensue.
3. It is interesting to note that in his early works, especially the 1844 Manuscripts, Marx tended to argue that self-realization and liberation is to be achieved in the productive process; however, with his late works, Marx seems to have shifted this tendency whereby human liberation and hence self-realization is to be achieved through a reduction of necessary labour time rather than a transformation of its character. Nonetheless, Marx has consistently maintained the view that human beings are truly free only when their labour is unalienated and through which they can exercise free choice.

Works Cited


Name Stereotyping and Job Selection

A person's name is the first identifying mark in their life and most people have to live with the consequences of their birth names. While some names are universal and given to people of different races, some names are also associated with people of particular races. With first names now signaling race and gender, they may allow people to quickly access stereotypes they may have. Stereotypes are created in order to sustain loyalty to the in-group, which is a biological predisposition, and suspicion of the out-group being a result by default or by feared defeat (Fiske 2000). The chances of an out-group member being selected for a job seem pretty slim. The question I set out to answer was whether an applicant with an African-American name will be considered less qualified for a job than the same resume with a white sounding name. There have been few studies that have examined the effect of race and job selection.

Research conducted by Terpstra and Larsen (1980) found that blacks received higher hirability and salary assignment rating than whites for the black-typed job, while whites were rated more favorably than blacks for the white-typed jobs. In their study a black-typed was a building custodian, which was determined by the estimated percentage of job incumbents that were Black in the Southeast. A lathe operator was considered a white-typed job and was also determined by the estimated percentage of white incumbents in the Southeast. The research set out to answer why blacks were under-represented in professional and technical positions. Terpstra and Larsen hypothesized that black job applicants would receive less favorable hirability ratings and starting salary assignment ratings than equally qualified white job applicants when the job in question was seen as being a white-held job. For their study they used 72 graduate students, 26 females and 46 males, in management classes at a large southeastern university.

The participants evaluated the resumes of twelve fictitious job applicants with respect to their qualifications for three types of jobs. The four resumes evaluated per job were a high qualification black and white applicant and low qualification black and white applicant. The researchers chose three types of jobs for the participant to evaluate a 'black-held' job, a 'white-held' job, and a job that was neutral with respect to perceptions of racial occupancy. The three jobs that were selected were those of lathe operator (white-held), warehouseman (neutral), and building custodian (black-held). Participants were then asked to give each applicant a rating of hirability on a seven-point scale. They were then asked to use another seven-point scale to state which starting salary would be most appropriate for each applicant assuming that applicant had been hired. Terpstra and Larsen used multivariate analysis of variance and found that there was a significant interaction between race and type of job. They found that for the black-typed job, participants were more willing to hire black applicants than equally qualified white applicants. Also participants were more willing to hire the white applicant for the white-held job than black applicants. However for the neutral job the mean hirability rating for black applicants did not differ from the mean hirability rating assigned to white applicants.

Stewart and Perlow (2001) conducted a study examining an applicant's race, job status, and evaluator's attitude toward blacks as possible predictors of unfair selection decisions. In their study, the researchers posed two hypotheses. The first hypothesis proposed that the hiring decision is a function of the interaction between applicant race, job status, and racial attitude. Those more racially biased evaluators should be more likely to recommend the black applicant for the low status job and white applicants for the high status job than less biased evaluators. The second hypothesis proposed the more racially biased evaluators would be more confident in their decision to hire the black applicant than the white applicant for the low status job than less biased people. They also felt that more racially biased people would be more confident in their decisions to hire the white applicant for the high status job than the black applicant. For the study, 181 undergraduate stu-
students participated in using a 20-item Attitudes Towards Blacks Scale, with a 7-point Likert scale where higher scores suggested more positive attitudes towards blacks. Another scale used was a hiring decision scale, which refers to the probability of hiring the candidate for the job. They also asked participants to rate the confidence in their hiring decision on a one-item scale, with one (1) being not at all confident and seven (7) being extremely confident. Participants then rated applicants on a seven-point scale of job dimension with one (1) being definitely did not possess and seven (7) equaling definitely did possess, using a Specific Job Dimension Evaluation Scale. Lastly, the researchers used a Global Evaluation Rating in which participants made an overall judgment of applicant’s qualifications using a one-item Likert type scale. After doing the racial attitude scale the participants completed the Manifest Needs Scale. They then read a job description for either the low or high status job and reviewed a resume for either a white or black applicant.

Stewart and Perlow found that applicant race was related to the global evaluation score and also that job status was related to the hiring decision. Further analysis indicated that evaluators were likely to hire the black applicant for the low status job and the high status job. They were also likely to hire the white applicant for the low status job and the high status job as well. Since there were no differences between hiring decisions, the study failed to support their hypothesis. However, evaluators with more negative attitudes towards blacks reported higher confidence in their decision to hire the black applicant for the low status job compared to the confidence of evaluators with more positive attitudes.

Mullins (1982) investigated the relationship between racial attitudes of interviewers and applicant’s race along with the applicant’s quality ratings. Mullins found that black applicants were rated higher for applicant quality than white applicants but that high quality applicants were rated highly regardless of race. Mullins also found that low quality black applicants were rated higher than the low quality white applicant. For the study, Mullins used 176 white students who majored in business administration at a large urban university. Each participant watched one of four videotapes of a stimulated job interview, along with a resume, and was asked to rate the applicant’s interview performance. The applicants on the video were either a black male with low or high quality script or a white male with low or high quality script. After watching the videotape, the participants completed a Multifactor Racial Attitude Inventory, which consisted of 12 Likert-type questions where the higher the score on an item, the more positive the attitude towards blacks. Upon running an analysis of variance, it was found that there was a main effect for applicant quality and applicant race. However, Mullins predicted that white applicants would be rated higher than black applicants, but once the data were analyzed Mullins found that black applicants were actually rated significantly higher than white applicants. Mullins also found that highly prejudiced subjects were more likely to give higher ratings to the black applicants than were their less prejudiced counterparts, which accounted for the main effect reported for applicant race.

Most recently, in 2002, Bertrand and Mullainathan found that resumes with ‘black names’ were less likely to be called back for interviews compared to resumes with ‘white names.’ For their study, Bertrand and Mullainathan sent a random selection of 5,000 qualified resumes to 1300 job openings for positions in sales, clerical, and management jobs. For one set of resumes the names given to the applicants were names common now in black culture such as, Kareem, Keisha, and Kenya, and the other set was given typical white names. Ten percent of applicants with ‘white names’ were called in for interviews compared to only 6.7% of ‘black named’ applicants. They also found that ‘white named’ applicants were selected 50% more often than ‘black named’ applicants with the same qualifications.

I designed the present research to test the relationship between an applicant’s name, which implies race, and their being selected for a management job. My hypothesis was that resumes with ‘black sounding’ names would be considered less qualified for job selection regardless of qualification. My independent variables were the names on the resumes and the status of the applicant. My dependent variables were the applicant’s qualification, fit, trainable, and manager ratings and racial attitude of evaluators. I predicted that the ‘black named’ applicant would be rated as less qualified regardless of qualification than the ‘white named’ applicant.

Method
Participants
The participants in my experiment were 74 Middle Tennessee State University students with four at the graduate level. Of the 73 reporting gender, 45 were female and 28 were males. The ages ranged between 18 and 46. Of the 72 reporting their race, 60 were Caucasian, 9 were Black, 2 were Hispanic, and 1 was Asian. They participated in the experiment on a voluntary basis.

Materials
The participants were given two questionnaires, a job qualification survey and a racial attitude scale. The racial attitude scale was created by T. F. Pettigrew and R. W. Meertens (1995). I combined the blatant and subtle prejudice scales Pettigrew and Meertens created into one continuous survey. I created the job qualification survey, which consisted of five questions: whether the participant would hire the candidate, yes or no, and four 10-point Likert scale questions. The questions dealt with how qualified the candidate was for the job, how well the
candidate would fit into the company, if the candidate could be trained for the position, and if the candidate would be a good manager.

To measure racial attitudes, a Likert scale was used. For questions 1-7 and 11-18, the scores were added together. However for questions 8, 9, 10, 19, and 20 the responses were reversed and then added together. Both sets of totals were then added together. Scores can range from 20 to 93, the higher the score; the more negative a person's feelings towards Blacks. Both scales are included in the Appendixes.

**Procedure**

The procedure used in this experiment was that all participants received a consent form first and were asked to read it carefully and sign the form before receiving further information. Once the consent forms were collected, the participants were then given a packet with a resume with either ‘Matthew Adams’ or ‘Terrell Washington’ on top, and the applicant was either highly qualified for the job, medium qualified, or under qualified. The participants reviewed the resume and completed the questionnaires. The participants were then thanked for their participation and told once again of the contact information if they had any questions.

**Results**

The data were analyzed using four two-way ANOVA tests. The independent variables were the name of the applicant and the status of the resume. The dependent variable for the first ANOVA was how qualified the participant rated the applicant. Using a family wise alpha of .05, the two-way ANOVA indicated there was not a significant interaction between name (Matthew, Terrell) and status (high, medium, under qualified) in relation to how well the applicant would fit into the company, F (2, 68) = .319, M SE = .311, p = .710 but the main effect test for status was significant, F (2, 68) = .139, M SE = .311, p = .710, but the main effect test for status was significant, F (2, 68) = 19.708, M SE = 43.944, p < .001. The results of Post Hoc comparisons were that the overqualified and medium qualified applicants did not differ and both were rated significantly higher than the unqualified applicant. The fit data are illustrated in Figure 2.

For the second ANOVA, the dependent variable was how well the applicant could be trained. Using a family wise alpha of .05, the two-way ANOVA indicated there was not a significant interaction between name (Matthew, Terrell) and status (high, medium, under qualified) in relation to how well the applicant could be trained, F (2, 68) = .425, M SE = 2.131, p = .656. The main effect test for name was not significant, F (1,68) = .568, M SE = 1.21, p = .454 but the main effect test for status was significant, F (2, 68) = 14.62, M SE = 1.491, p = .001. The results of Post Hoc comparisons were that the overqualified and medium qualified applicants did not differ and both were rated significantly higher than the unqualified applicant. The trained data are illustrated in Figure 3.

For the third ANOVA, the dependent variable was how well the applicant could be trained. Using a family wise alpha of .05, the two-way ANOVA indicated there was not a significant interaction between name (Matthew, Terrell) and status (high, medium, under qualified) in relation to how well the applicant could be trained, F (2, 68) = .425, M SE = 2.131, p = .656. The main effect test for name was not significant, F (1,68) = .568, M SE = 1.21, p = .454 but the main effect test for status was significant, F (2, 68) = 14.62, M SE = 1.491, p = .001. The results of Post Hoc comparisons were that the overqualified and medium qualified applicants did not differ and both were rated significantly higher than the unqualified applicant. The trained data are illustrated in Figure 4.
Discussion

The experiment I conducted failed to support my hypothesis, which was that people would rate the ‘black named’ applicant as less qualified, regardless of qualification, than the ‘white named’ applicant. The hypothesis may have failed for a number of reasons.

First unlike Mullins’ (1982) experiment that used videotape of a black and white applicant, this study relied on the participant to gauge the race of the applicant based on their name only. The names used in the experiment may not have implied race as intended, and therefore may not have activated the stereotypes people may hold about Black people. Also, the name was only mentioned once in the whole study and after reading more information on the applicant the participants may have forgotten the name of the applicant. Also in Terpstra and Larsen’s (1980) experiment, all of their participants were in management courses and had training in how to select candidates for a job. In my study, however, only one participant majored in Business while a large number majored in Education or Criminal Justice and had no training in selecting personnel.

Another problem with the study was that a Black evaluator conducted the study and therefore may have caused a demand characteristic in the participants. Because the questions on the Racial Attitude Scale concerned one’s belief about Black people, the participants may have felt the need to appear less racist because a Black person would be evaluating their information. This may explain why the average racial attitude score was much lower than expected. The participants may have also realized what was being studied when they began the Racial Attitude Scale and therefore answered differently in order to show that they did not discriminate in their rating scores.

The most important implication of the study suggests that possibly people’s attitudes towards Blacks have changed. Race may no longer be a deciding factor in whether or not a person is hired for a job. This would explain why the results, in this study, were similar to both Mullins (1982) and Stewart and Perlow’s (2001).

Since Terpstra and Larsen’s experiment took place in 1980 and now 24 years later people have become more aware of name discrimination and not basing hiring decisions solely on race. While further study on the topic is needed, it is reassuring to know that job selection may not be based on the name of an applicant.

References

Appendix A
Job Qualification Survey

1. Would you hire this candidate for the job listed above? (Yes/ no)

2. How qualified do you believe this candidate is for the job listed?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Very</th>
<th>Somewhat</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. How well do you feel this candidate will fit into the company?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Very</th>
<th>Somewhat</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Do you believe this candidate could be trained for the position?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Definitely</th>
<th>Somewhat</th>
<th>Can’t be trained</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Do you feel this person would be a good manager?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Very good</th>
<th>Somewhat</th>
<th>Very bad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Short questions about yourself. Please answer the following:

Gender:

Age:

Classification:

Major:

Race:
Appendix B
Racial Attitude Survey

1. Black people have jobs that the white people should have.

   Strongly agree  Strongly disagree
   5  4  3  2  1

2. Most black people living here who receive support from welfare could get along without it if they tried.

   Strongly agree  Strongly disagree
   5  4  3  2  1

3. White people and black people can never really be comfortable with each other, even if they are close friends.

   Strongly agree  Strongly disagree
   5  4  3  2  1

4. Most politicians in America care too much about black people and not enough about the average American person.

   Strongly agree  Strongly disagree
   5  4  3  2  1

5. Black people come from less able races and this explains why they are not as well off as most white people.

   Strongly agree  Strongly disagree
   5  4  3  2  1

6. How different or similar do you think black people living here are to other American people like yourself in how honest they are?

   Very different  Very similar
   5  4  3  2  1

7. Suppose that a child of yours had children with a person of very different color and physical characteristics than your own. Do you think you would be very bothered, bothered, bothered a little, or not bothered at all, if your grandchildren did not physically resemble the people on your side of the family? (Circle One)

   Very bothered  Bothered  Bothered a little  Not bothered

8. I would be willing to have sexual relationships with a black person.

   Strongly agree  Strongly disagree
   5  4  3  2  1
9. I would not mind if a suitably qualified black person was appointed as my boss.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. I would not mind if a black person who had a similar economic background as mine joined my close family by marriage.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

11. Black people living here should not push themselves where they are not wanted.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. Many other groups have come to America and overcome prejudice and worked their way up. Black people should do the same without special favor.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13. It is just a matter of some people not trying hard enough. If black people would only try harder they could be very well off as white people.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

14. Black people living here teach their children values and skills different from those required to be successful in America.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Strongly disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

How different or similar do you think black people living here are to other American people like yourself? (very different, somewhat different, somewhat similar, or very similar) Circle one for each question:

15. In the values that they teach their children?

- Very different
- Somewhat different
- Somewhat similar
- Very similar

16. In their religious beliefs and practices?

- Very different
- Somewhat different
- Somewhat similar
- Very similar
Racial Attitude Survey, continued

17. In their sexual values and sexual practices?
   Very different    Somewhat different    Somewhat similar    Very similar

18. In the language that they speak?
   Very different    Somewhat different    Somewhat similar    Very similar

Have you ever felt the following ways about black people and their families living here?
(Very often, fairly often, not too often, or never)
Circle one for each question:

19. How often have you felt sympathy for black people living here?
   Very often    Fairly often    Not too often    Never

20. How often have you felt admiration for black people living here?
   Very often    Fairly often    Not too often    Never
International child labor abuse has recently become a major topic of concern in Western societies. In part, this is because Western ideals of child labor have changed so dramatically since the passing of the Fair Labor Standards Act in 1938. Today, countries in which children work are viewed as deficient and there is a need to intervene. According to Western ideals, children who work are viewed as having no real childhood, resulting in a loss of innocence, and are forced into labor because of poverty.

The research presented in this paper focuses on child labor in Brazil and the small Amazon town of Gurupá. It is supported by ethnographic data gathered during an ethnographic field school in the summer of 2003. It will demonstrate that Western interpretations of child labor form an inaccurate and distorted understanding of local life (at least in the case of Gurupá), which, in turn, can lead to problems when developing intervention policies.

**Literature Review**

Before my arrival to the field site and in order to develop my initial theory on child labor and intervention policy, literature from many different organizations associated with child labor was reviewed. I found that much of the literature was similar in terms of suggested intervention, but it was obvious that without an in-depth cultural understanding of a particular region, especially one such as the Amazon, intervention policies could possibly do more damage than good. Olga Nieuwenhuys (1996) points out that organizations such as International Labor Organization, United Nations Children’s Fund, World Health Organization, as well as Defense of Children International, Save the Children, and Anti-Slavery International all present similar views on child labor and its intervention. In addition, she says that in these groups’ publications, there “is a moral preoccupation with abolition through legislation and a zealous belief in the desirability of extending Western childhood ideals to poor families worldwide” (p. 241). Considering that many of these organizations are strong leaders in enacting legislation and a zealously believed in the desirability of extending Western childhood ideals to poor families worldwide (Nieuwenhuys, 1996, p. 246). In addition, the advocates of child labor often misinterpret the lives of the children that they are trying to help due to a Westernized attitude, which view children who work as abnormal. Often, the campaigners for children’s welfare have no conception of a child’s reality. They adamantly declare child labor is a moral evil in need of removal and attempt to ban child labor through legislation (Green, 1999). Although legislation would appear to be a step in the right direction for the eradication of child labor, there are many examples of counterproductive legislation that have had detrimental effects on children. The most illuminating example comes from Bangladesh.

During the 1990’s, the garment factories in Bangladesh were growing into the leading export industry. However, because many of the industries were using child labor, the United States felt pressure not to buy garments made by children. When the U.S. Congress threatened to pass legislation preventing imports of garments made by children under the age of 14, the garment industry fired 50,000 children (Green, 1999, p. 6). Upon first glance, this would appear to be a positive move in the abolition of child labor. However, events such as this are prone to create more problems for children, in addition to erroneous interpretations of their labor. For example, DeGregori (2002, p. 1) comments that he remembers when “children were begging in the streets, engaging in prostitution and other crimes, or doing hard labor” be-
fore the garment industries came. He points out that the "garment industry created better paid, less arduous jobs for children" and although "far from ideal, those jobs were vastly superior to what the children had previously" (DeGregori, 2002, p. 1). Although his argument appears plausible, in essence, he is placing children's labor and well being into very specific localities and ignoring other alternatives. The ILO and UNICEF attempted to help by providing "school places for some 10,000 children" (Green, 1999, p. 6). However, the remaining 40,000 children were without support and had few options. It was because of a lack of understanding of the Bangladesh situation that 40,000 children returned to the streets. At this point, one must question what is worse: a child working in a factory or a child working in the streets because legislation prevents her/him from working in a factory? Without a clear picture of what is really happening, intervention policies can easily misinterpret situations and inadvertently make them worse.

What most do not understand and often overlook is the fact that there are cultural variations in the understanding of childhood. Childhood is not a universal concept. In fact, the term is more accurately defined as a cultural construct. For example, some cultures do not expect young teenagers to take care or be responsible for themselves, while in other cultures children as young as six are expected to care for themselves, their siblings, and perform various household chores (ILO 2002, p. 13). Ideals of children's roles in Western society began to change in the late 19th century along with the formation of the Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children (Green, 1992, p. 35). Previously, during the industrial revolution, many regarded child labor as a necessary and extremely cheap method of production. Laura Greene (1992, p. 20) points out that through the utilization of child labor, companies were able to keep production costs down, therefore making the nation more competitive abroad. In addition to the competitive edge that was provided by the work of children, Western society also reinforced this type of labor through the justification that "child labor kept parents from becoming dependent on public charity" (Greene, 1992, p. 20). This notion was supported by the belief that work was good for children and kept them out of trouble (Greene, 1992, p. 19). However, not everyone considered child labor an ideal institution and many critics frowned upon the practice. For example, the NCLC began to promote the idea that "children merited a healthy and happy childhood and that if they entered the work force too young, they would be denied the opportunities that every American deserved" (Green, 1992, p. 37). Childhood was no longer a chronological period in a life span, but transformed into "a mythic walled garden of play and study, free from the pain and responsibilities of adult life" (Green, 1999, p. 6). Ironically, working children throughout the world have been the norm, "barring the last century or so of European and North American history" (Green, 1999, p. 6).

Gurupá Research

If, as the ILO stated in the 2002 International Labor Conference (Global Report 2002, p. 1), "child labor is detrimental to individual children, preventing them from enjoying their childhood, hampering their development and sometimes causing lifelong physical or psychological damage," then what kind of problems might occur in the small rural Amazon town of Gurupá. In order to gather information on child labor and perspectives of the Gurupáuense (people from Gurupá), I participated in a three-week ethnographic field school conducted in the town of Gurupá. The journey to the field location began in the city of Belém on July 9, 2003 when I boarded the Rodrigues Alvaz Navigação IV. This boat, small in comparison to what I had imagined, would take me 33 hours up the Amazon River to the small Amazon town of Gurupá. I arrived at the field site on July 11, 2003 at 2:30 AM. I was exhausted and disoriented, in culture shock, and facing three weeks of learning to conduct ethnographic research in a remote location where virtually nothing was familiar. Although my proposed research was the focus of my experience, I realized that before any research was possible, before any notes or interviews took place, I had to adjust to a different culture and climate.

I was still recovering from the hectic flight schedule from the US, sleep deprived, learning to use a language in which I had very little training, and beginning to realize what I had gotten myself into when I boarded the boat. I thought that I had prepared myself as well as I could for what to expect, but it quickly became clear to me that the boat would serve as a transition to what awaited me in Gurupá. Within one hour after boarding, I discovered that I did not know how to eat or drink, among many other things, in a culturally acceptable manner. Little things, such as drinking straight from a bottle or not offering to share with those around you, were pointed out to me as being culturally rude and impolite. It became apparent that in order to blend in I had to learn as quickly as possible how to act like those around me. This included consciously avoiding many of my common behaviors, such as speaking in a certain manner and trying not to show my frustration in certain circumstances. Anthropologists Stephen Schensul, Jean Schensul, and Margaret LeCompte (1999, p. 72) put it most accurately when they state that the researcher must "learn how it is to 'not be me' in a physical setting that is 'not mine' with rules and guidelines for verbal and physical behavior that 'I do not know' and may understand only in a limited way." This was my task in learning to be culturally competent. I felt as if I was taking a crash course in learning participant observation on the boat, and although it was very clear how crucial
this would be to my research, it was often overwhelming. At times, I felt as if the boat was a culture trap with no way to escape but to the minimal comforts of my cabin. I had nothing familiar to guide or comfort me in the parade of mistakes that I was making except for five other students who were experiencing the same thing. At this point, I began to wonder how I would ever be able to gain any sort of understanding of child labor when learning how to act in a non-obtrusive manner drained much of my energy.

I arrived after midnight to the sleeping town of Gurupá only to discover that it was much larger than I had imagined. I had more emotions at that moment than I thought possible and had spent the previous three hours trying to find solitude away from reality in order to deal with what was to come. I was once again sleep-deprived, frustrated, and about to meet the family that I would be living with for the next three weeks. Culturally competent or not, it was time to sink or swim.

As we walked toward my new family's house, the town was dark, but had streetlights to my surprise. The houses were unlike anything that I had ever seen before and the streets sloped downward and were made of sand or pavement. We were alone in the streets as we followed a man who pulled a large wooden cart fully loaded with our luggage. Dogs were barking from every direction and every step I took toward my homestay was forced. However, upon my arrival and to my contentment, I found out that we had indoor plumbing, a ceiling fan, and beds waiting. Sleep was my only escape, but I was deterred from it temporarily because my roommate had decided to read!

The next morning I awoke to the sounds of children running through the house screaming at the top of their lungs and music blasting from somewhere. Although it was only 10am, I was sweating and the reality of the Amazon heat was beginning to set in. Something inside my head kept repeating “we are not in Kansas anymore.” I forced myself out of the bedroom to see where I lived in the daylight and was immediately approached by a young woman speaking to me in Portuguese. She clearly had expected my language skills to be much better than they were, but did not lose her patience with my slow understanding. I later found out that she was the maid and also lived in the house. I walked outside into the street for the first time to find two men standing on each side of the entryway of my house. They did not speak and their identities remained a mystery to me for the next several days, although they were both inside the house much of the time. In addition, I soon realized that I was not only the observer but also the observed.

The people in my Gurupá home, especially the children watched intently with every movement that I made for the first few days. Although they were obviously curious about me, it took 3 days before any of them began asking questions beyond basic information. During this 3-day period, I was extremely glad to have a roommate to help absorb and confer about the culture shock that I was enduring. It seemed that every time I turned around, I had made some type of cultural mistake, did not know how something operated, or had misunderstood or not been able to understand what was being said to me in Portuguese. However, I found that laughter has no cultural boundaries and it seemed as if my first few days in Gurupá were spent either being laughed at or laughing at myself. Whoever said that laughter is the best medicine clearly had participated in an ethnographic field school. It seemed that the more mistakes that I made, which were inevitable, the more we laughed and the more relaxed the members of the house became with my presence.

In addition to adjusting to my private sector of Gurupá, I also had to adjust to the public sector, the town itself. I immediately discovered that I was also not only being observed inside my home, but outside of it as well. Walking through the streets of Gurupá during the first few days made me feel like everyday was a parade and I was the main attraction. The Gurupáenses would often literally stop what they were doing and stare. I realized that for them I was the exotic creature who dressed, spoke, and acted differently. This transition period required constant attention and left me drained and feeling foolish at first. However, although it was something that never really went away, it became easier to deal with as time passed. It was at this point that I actually was able to start thinking about my research. The novelty of my presence, at least at home, wore away and I partially had begun to grasp some of the culture in which I was living. Most importantly, through all of these experiences in the public and private realm, I had begun to build an essential building block of ethnographic research: rapport.

Building rapport within the community and especially at home was very important aspect of my research. Without the connections and trust of at least a few members of the community, questions and perspectives pertaining to child labor would have remained hidden. In addition, because of the rapport that I had established I was able to find the second essential element of ethnographic research: a key consultant.

On the second day in Gurupá, I met a young man whom I assumed to be culturally competent and very knowledgeable about the town of Gurupá. I learned that he was related to members of my household and because of this, he came to my house everyday to have lunch and dinner. Consequently, I was able to spend quite a bit of time talking with him during these visits and he often accompanied me when I would walk through the town. He appeared to be very familiar with the layout of Gurupá and we often passed several people on the streets that he appeared to know well. However, it was only to my dismay, several days later, to find out that he was not from the town
of Gurupá. Most surprisingly, I discovered that this was his first trip to the town and he had ironically arrived on the very same boat that I had. In a sense, my first attempt at finding a key consultant was a failure because I had spent a lot of time with him under the impression that he knew Gurupá well, never thinking to ask the most obvious question of all: do you live here? However, because of the report that I had built with him and his unending patience with my elementary Portuguese, I was able to communicate with members of the community through his assistance.

In order to gain a more in-depth understanding of the Gurupaense perspective on child labor, I used methods of open-ended observations, open-ended unstructured and structured interviews, and semi-structured interviews. Through these methods, a cultural perspective began to emerge that conflicted with the rhetoric of many of the child labor organizations and laws. To be specific, it became apparent to me that the people of Gurupá do not view working children as a moral evil in need of abolishing. The Gurupaenses have their own cultural construct of childhood that is vastly different from that of Western ideals.

In order to confirm this perspective, a local research assistant working for the field school administered several semi-structured interview questions on child labor to a non-random sample. The research assistant interviewed 24 members of the Gurupá community. Although the results from the interviews were not concrete (too small of a sample due to time constraints), they did provide information that unstructured and semi-structured observations could not. Although the Brazilian Constitution prohibits children under the age of 16 from working unless under apprenticeship, I learned from the interviews that the mean age to begin work is 13 for boys and 14 for girls. However, in this same interview, all agreed that children from the ages of 6-11 should help their parents. More specifically, the boys were to help their fathers and the girls were to help their mothers inside the home performing domestic tasks. At the age of 12, fourteen respondents to the survey out of twenty-four agreed that boys were to work with their fathers or independently outside of the home. In contrast, twenty-three out of twenty-four people agreed that girls at age 12 and beyond were to work in the home with their mothers performing domestic labor.

Due to this information and observations throughout the town, patterns of gender appropriate work roles became apparent. Girls and boys in Gurupá had very specific roles that they were to fulfill. Consequently, through this emerging image of Gurupaense views on gender appropriate work, it was evident that the Gurupaense views could possibly conflict within the rhetoric of many labor organizations, specifically in terms of domestic work for girls. The World Bank cites domestic labor as an occupation that can cause "serious psychological and social adjustment problems" (Fallon & Tzannatos, 1998, p. 4). UNICEF supports the view by adding, "child domestic workers are the world's most forgotten children" who are possibly the most exploited, vulnerable, and difficult to protect (Green, 1999, p. 3). Specifically, the 2001 Brazilian Human Rights Report states that girls are 20 times more likely to work in the domestic sector (Hilbig, 2001, p. 181). In addition, girls also work in their own homes caring for siblings and performing the household duties, often times so that the mother can work for wages (Green, 1999, p. 3). In opposition to the labor organizations, the Gurupaenses view domestic work as normal and necessary for girls. Unfortunately, an interview can only elucidate so much information and due to the lack of time to build strong rapport, this hidden domestic work remained beyond my view during the three weeks I spent in Gurupá. However, the work of boys was much more open and observable.

Each day in the town I observed young boys performing a variety of tasks. For example, over the course of two days I observed a 6-year-old boy assist his father in the building of a maloca, which is similar to a gazebo. Although he sat often and look bored most of the day, there were times when he had specific and necessary tasks assigned to him by his father. His workday began at 7am and ended at approximately 6pm, with an extended lunch break during the hottest part of the day. This observation supports the response in the semi-structured interview in which 22 out of 24 people thought that boys at this age should help their father or parents in certain tasks. One Gurupaense man stated that in order for children to gain skills and knowledge about the world, they must work. He referred to his own childhood and said that he began working at the age of six doing various jobs such as collecting firewood and working in the garden. He went on to say that children who grow up not working, finish school and have little or no work skills. To test this man's theory, I observed a young man, age 20, who appeared to be constantly involved in some type of work at my host family's house. Although he did attend school, his knowledge and ability to perform multiple tasks were far beyond what I have observed in the United States. In the course of four weeks, I observed him assisting in the building of a maloca, sharpening and using a machete with expert precision, pouring cement, installing iron work, installing plumbing pipes, cleaning and preparing fish for cooking, and working on a boat engine all with little or no instruction. He explained to me that there is not always work for him to do, but when it is available, he takes the opportunity. His work hours and young boy's work hours were similar. In all the observations of both, I never saw either one complain or protest about the work.

Each day in Gurupá boys could also be observed in town selling picolé, which is the equivalent of a Popsicle, in addition to roasted meat and bread. There was a group of 4-6 boys who possessed
manufactured freezer carts and a few others that carried ice chests with shoulder straps attached. They would sell their goods at the dock and in the praca (plaza). Often, I observed that the boys with ice chests also carried a container of meat in a plastic bowl. Although these boys were visibly working, they did not appear to be very concerned with sales. I often observed them racing with their carts and laughing, while it was also observed by others in my field school cohort that they were more intent on fighting and bullying among themselves than “hustling up business.”

During one hot afternoon I encountered one of these boys while sitting under a tree at the praca. I took advantage of the opportunity to ask questions. He told me that he was 13 and had lived in the town of Gurupá his whole life. He also told me that he worked every day and did not appear to find this fact unusual or strange. On another day late in the afternoon, I encountered a different boy outside my house. He was pushing a wheelbarrow and selling spices, women's skin tightening cream, and pepper sauce. He told me that he was 14 but would say little else. Once he discovered that I was not going to buy anything, he moved up the street to a house that was selling roasted meat in their front yard and stayed there for a while before moving on.

In contrast to children in the town, the children in the interior have different tasks to perform. While attending a meeting at the Casa Familiar Rural (Rural Family House) school of the river Ururi, those who had actually grown up in the interior explained children's work. They explained that the main work of children is to go with their parents to work in the roça (agricultural plot). Some of the students of the school said that they started doing this as early as 5 years of age. One student from a hamlet called Jocojó said that he remembers his earliest job was to carry a canteen of water to the roça and then to help with what ever he could, learning and doing more as he matured. Other students said that parents take their children with them because they do not want to leave them at home alone. While they are at the roça, the parents are there to make sure that the children stay out of danger, such as using a knife that is too big or wandering off into the forest alone. The director of the school pointed out that it is necessary for the children to learn skills in agriculture because most of the knowledge that they need cannot be learned in school.

In addition to working in the roça, the director also pointed out that boys, usually between the ages of 8-10, climb trees to get the açaí fruit (a palm berry). Several of the boys at the school agreed and said that they used to do it. However, when asked about injuries from falling, the director said that he had never heard of any, although he had heard of several adults injured from falls. In addition, the director said that climbing trees to get açaí is a sport for many boys. He referred to his own past and said that his passions during childhood were soccer, swimming, and getting açaí. Considering that açaí is a staple food of the Amazon, there is a constant need for its retrieval.

In opposition to this view, the rhetoric of the child labor organizations would consider activities such as retrieving açaí and working in the roças too dangerous for children. Organizations could respond to these instances of children working as a violation of the children's safety and rights. The ILO-IPEC (2003, p. 2) define many forms of child labor as “work situations where children are compelled to work on a regular basis to earn a living for themselves and their families” and in which work conditions are “damaging to their health and to their physical and mental development.” However, all 24 people in the survey agreed that, if necessary, children did need to work for wages in order to maintain the stability of the family.

Conclusion

One must question if there really are child labor violations occurring in Gurupá. Although much of the child labor organization's rhetoric espouses a mythical image of how a childhood should occur, many organizations have begun to investigate different alternatives to the strict enforcement of laws and the eradication of child labor. The ILO and UNICEF have both changed their strategies in terms of identifying the difference between child labor and child work. Child labor is defined as mentioned above, but child work is now being considered to have a role in child socialization (Hilbig, 2001, p. 183). UNICEF now expresses the view that "work can be good and useful for physical, social, and moral development, if it does not affect school development, rest, and repose" (Hilbig, 2001, pp. 183-184). In addition, Brazil is working with these organizations to try to alleviate the need for children to give up school in order to fulfill familial obligations.

For example, two successful programs have helped to alleviate the need for a child to work in Brazil. One is Bolsa Escola (school grant), which provides educational grants enabling families to send their children to school (Jeronimo Oliveira Muniz, 2001, p. 11). Although the program has helped many young Brazilian children stay in school, there are problems with the program. The World Bank cites that "the practical problems with this approach includes cost and sustainability" in addition to only affecting "those households already considering sending their children to school" (Fallon & Tzannatos, 1998, p. 11).

The second approach is the Goats-to-School program. It is sponsored by the Union of Rural Workers in Retirolandia and is "designed to provide families with assets that they could use to support their children in school rather than send them to work" (Drusilla Brown, 2001, p. 14). The program gives
families a goat and instructions for tending and rearing goats. However, the problems with this program are that few children are actually helped due to the limited resources of the program. Also there is no real method of ensuring that those families that receive goats comply with the program directives. Nonetheless, this approach appears to be more culturally relevant to the needs of families and tries to address the reasons creating child work.

Returning to Gurupá, those interviewed all agreed that there were several instances where it was necessary for a child to leave or quit school. The most prevalent reason was that a child’s assistance might be necessary at times in order to help their family through a tough situation. In addition, all those interviewed stated that some children in Gurupá were not able to attend school because they had to work.

In my own perspective, I arrived to Gurupá expecting to find child labor to be a prevalent problem. Because I had reviewed a large quantity of child labor rhetoric and attempted interventions, I assumed that child labor had to exist in such a place. I brought my own Westernized view to the town and was forced to examine and reexamine my own perceptions of childhood, child labor, and family as if I was seeing them for the first time. I often found myself in the first two weeks wondering if I would get any real evidence that child labor even existed in Gurupá. Through frustration and lack of extensive data, I concluded that a three-week study was not long enough to acquire answers to the questions that I was asking. I was forced to transform my formative theory into questioning what Gurupanese children do according to gender and age in the area of work/labor. However, this approach was also hampered due to the hidden work of girls. I discovered that in order to ask the delicate questions that were necessary for an accurate view of the child labor climate and the activities of children, I needed better language skills and more time to build rapport within the community. Although the information gained during the field school did provide an overall cultural perspective, the real value of the experience will be that in future ethnographic settings, I will know what to expect, therefore enabling me to conduct a more thorough research study.

References


Crisis Communication:
A Critical Analysis of Tactics, Processes, and
Theoretical Context Utilized at MTSU
During the 2002 Budget Impasse

Sharon Dowling Caton
Dr. Sharon Seaton Smith
Department of Speech and Theatre

Introduction

Tennessee state fiscal year begins on July 1 and expires on June 30. During the summer of 2002 Tennessee state legislative deliberations failed to produce a fiscal year budget funding state operations. This event was a historical first for the state and forced a partial shutdown of government operations and severely limited operations for many organizations including public colleges and universities.

Middle Tennessee State University (MTSU) was among those organizations affected by the partial shutdown. Communication of relevant factual information became of utmost importance to MTSU administrators, faculty, staff, and students. The state’s decision to fund only “essential” state operations and personnel forced a crisis within the MTSU community necessitating immediate communication response, planning, and implementation. The subject of this study is an exploration and analysis of crisis communication methods, tactics, and processes utilized by Middle Tennessee State University during the partial government shutdown.

Literature Review

Implementation of a crisis communication plan for MTSU became the overriding focus for administrative officers, faculty, and staff. After Tennessee state officials announced a partial government shutdown on July 1, 2002, the Tennessee Board of Regents, MTSU looked first to that entity for procedural guidance to initiate the partial shutdown plan of action. Rhetoric and theory provide strong frameworks for crisis communication planning along with ways to effectively convey clear messages to target audiences in a timely manner. Experts in the field of crisis response add validity to theoretical frames through application of theory to real-world scenarios.

Former Clinton political strategist James Carville says, “I happen to believe the old saw [that] three things are acceptable” in crisis response, “The truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth,” (Ries). The article by author Eric Ries specifically addresses school emergency crisis communication and outlines the detailed components of successful crisis communication plans. Foremost on the agenda is to, “Develop a crisis plan,” that identifies, “who does what, in what order,” when a crisis emerges. The article mirrors accepted communication practice with advice to, “Designate a single spokesperson,” to ensure clear, uncontested messages. Further advice addresses issues of “anxiety and tension” experienced during a crisis, the potential for misinformation, interaction with the press, and the need for clarity, proactive response, and honesty (Ries).

Issues of organizational survival, team strategies, and ethical communication practice were stressed in a December 2002 article appearing in the Journal of Business Ethics. Placing the responsibility for organizational response squarely on the shoulders of “senior officials,” the article further stated the survival of an organization is dependent on its ability to “effectively respond in a crisis” (King). Citing a team approach to crisis communication and management, the study defined the differences between the two and then proposed several methods to ethically communicate and manage crisis decisions to those most affected by an event.

Authors Shearlean Duke and Lynne Masland tout the development of “textbook crisis planning,” and further identify a crisis as, “any non-routine event that could be disruptive to business operation” (Duke). Outlining the potential risks associated with crisis situations further supports crisis planning as solid management and organizational practice. Media interaction is a given in this age of instant communication capability. Taxpayer concerns over perceived budget mishandling add intensity to the focus on all governmental agencies to become good stewards of public monies. These potential risks are:

- Escalation
- Scrutiny by the media
... 

The effective crisis communication model according to this article starts with prediction of "worst case scenarios; activation of the organization's "telephone tree," and "a gathering of crisis teams members to a designated place pre-specified in the organizational crisis plan" (Duke). The goal of this meeting is to "provide accurate and timely information," usually in the form of a press release. Rapid initial response will serve to minimize "speculation and rumors" and allow crisis managers to establish "control of the flow of information" (Duke). The article outlines the "four basic stages" of crisis communication:
• Crisis preparedness
• Initial response
• Maintain ongoing corrective actions and reactions
• Evaluation and follow-up

The model identifies the necessary steps for each of the basic stages and the communication tactics employed during each. The overarching theme of the study places emphasis on preparation and planning.

Many organizations invest in training for crisis management personnel to better enable them to respond during an unexpected event. During April of 2002, crisis management expert Vincent Covello headed a crisis communication conference for 400 officials in Portland, Oregon. Covello stated that crisis communication is, "about understanding upset people and communicating with upset people" (Lawton). Communication during crisis situations "can mean the difference between panic and calm, anger and understanding" (Lawton). Covello's advice of, "listening and showing empathy," to gain trust, "never lying to the public," never saying, "No comment," and "never holding town meetings because information is... difficult to control and emotions run... high," is standard crisis communication fare (Lawton).

Identification of stakeholders impacted by and vested in the outcome of a crisis situation is crucial to post-crisis organizational survival. Questions asked often strive to identify which group or individuals will be most affected by the crisis, followed by a plan to quickly convey pertinent information to those identified. Author Cindy Rayburn's study focused on how organizations can retain legitimacy with their stakeholders during a crisis. Citing consistent crisis responses and type of organization [generalist as opposed to specialist], as the factors most relevant to retention of organizational legitimacy, Rayburn suggests that often repeated, centralized messages strengthen positive organizational perceptions by stakeholders (Rayburn).

Another article suggested that "brainstorming sessions" help with the identification of and response to "what could go wrong around here," (Hoffman) and provide a framework for construction of the definitive crisis communication plan. Ten "key points," comprise the essence of the framework:
• Act with calm
• Be clear
• Be concise
• Be consistent
• Be cooperative
• Be credible
• Keep current
• Demonstrate caring and concern
• Demonstrate competence
• Provide control

Other suggestions address follow-up crisis communication in response to stakeholder questions. Commission of "must air" messages to memory ensure that crucial information gets to those affected even when the "right questions" are not asked and admonitions to practice the crisis communication plan at least once a year weigh in. Role-play exercises with crisis management team members based on "worst case scenarios" uncovered in the initial response phase are "invaluable" in revealing "problems, gaps in policy, and misunderstandings of procedure," (Hoffman). Robyn D. Clarke's article "A crisis of communication," addressed the necessary components of the spokesperson's communication mastery during a crisis. Reminders that:
• Communication is a two-way street
• Credibility is crucial; integrity mandatory
• Spend time one-on-one; don't rely on e-mail or memos as main method
• Information should be used to "protect and serve" the stakeholders

Clarke identified the difficulty in effectively communicating an intact message through electronic or paper-based methods, without listening to feedback from the audience, if integrity is compromised, and without consideration of the negative impact on the stakeholders.

Thematic variations in crisis communication plans reflect discipline specific research and advice. Emergent central elements of crisis communication are: pre-planning, identification of crisis team members, pro-active or rapid response, consistency of message, centralized message center, singular spokesperson or messenger, and attention to stakeholder concerns and feedback. Each of the elements contributes to the legitimacy of the message and the survival of the organization after the crisis passes. Planning and implementation details addressed before a crisis occurs help to ensure control over the message and ultimate outcome for the organization. Adherence to expert advice facilitates planning and implementation and translates into the best-case scenario... preparedness.

Theoretical Framework

Birkland's Focusing Events Approach

Thomas Birkland's perspective on crisis communication is predicated on a "Focusing Events" approach. Core ele-
ments include “agenda-setting functions” and “public policy implications” of crisis communication events (Fishman). Birkland’s contention that “sudden, unpredictable events” are pivotal in the instigation of public-policy discussions clarify public response to crisis situations. These so-called “focusing events,” serve as vehicles to bring issues to “the public’s attention and in creating acceptance for the issue in the public-policy arena” (Fishman). Birkland further states that “agenda-setting is the process by which problems and alternative solutions gain or lose public and elite attention” (Fishman). While a “focusing event” may not precipitate a policy change, it garners attention for a period of time to provide a “window of opportunity” for legislative action to take place. These events differ from “normal” and “routine” political business as usual because they require policy makers and the public at large to form immediate reactions to an unexpected circumstance without “the pre-screened filters provided by special interest groups to control an issue amidst an atmosphere of widespread public indifference” (Fishman).

Birkland’s theory espouses two types of focusing events. The first, are “normal focusing events,” i.e., natural disasters. Birkland observes, “These events occur sufficiently often to allow us to isolate events and model their influence on the agenda” (Fishman). Recent tornadoes in Tennessee and the tornadoes during the last several years are examples of “normal focusing events.”

The second are “new focusing events.” Birkland explains, “A new focusing event is an event that has never happened before or, alternatively, happened so long ago as to have faded from memory” (Fishman). The 2002 Tennessee state budget impasse and the subsequent partial shutdown of governmental operations is an example of “new focusing events.”

New focusing events, “violate expectations, upset norms, create uncertainty,” and bring about “unpredictability.” They signify a, “striking departure from the routine and pre-planned activities,” that are the focus of both media and stakeholder attention. Type Two focusing events are, “neither routine nor pre-planned, and open a symbolic arena where various groups struggle to interpret and construct a differing social reality either with a new attitude, new standards of conduct, or new legislation” (Fishman).

Public perception of the situation as a Type Two focusing event turns, “attention to the voluntary acceptance of responsibility for an event or to the more coercive process of fixing blame” (Fishman). Type Two focusing events center upon blame and responsibility, and they, in turn, trigger the taxonomy of crisis strategies that Benoit identified. Type Two focusing events are unique in the galvanization of legislative action and the influence on public focus resultant from their occurrence.

This theory provides a strong contextual framework for discussion of crisis communication methods and messages utilized by Middle Tennessee State University and the subsequent stakeholder, public, and media discussions of the events. Author Fishman provides historical acceptance and support to Birkland’s theory by stating:

Birkland relies heavily upon the work of Stone (1997) and Edelman (1964) in providing the methodological apparatus for a focusing events study, Stone (1997), for instance, contends that symbols are an important form of persuasion in a collective decision-making process, and that a dramatic news event can be crystallized to represent a symbol. Consequently, the symbolic representation of the event becomes a vital part of the political reasoning employed to justify a decision or policy outcome. In addition, the public often relies extensively upon these “symbols” and “narrative stories” to explain complex ideas and to dramatize a cause. In this sense, policy decisions can be viewed as a form of symbolic enactment, where individuals and groups utilize symbols and images to obtain “specific” and “tangible benefits” (Fishman).

The examination of communication methods, tactics, and processes utilized by Middle Tennessee State University using Birkland’s “new focusing event” theory reveal their impact on and connection to legislative action and the crisis communication model.

**Discussion**

The inability of the Tennessee State Legislature to pass a budget on or before June 30, 2002 created a ‘never before’ scenario in this state. Middle Tennessee State University (MTSU) had no institutional communication plan in place to address this particular occurrence and leapt into action to meet it head on. The analysis, interpretation, and recommendations resultant from this investigation could provide a framework for future crisis communication for this and other organizations. This investigation explored and analyzed crisis communication tactics used by a large, regional university, (Middle Tennessee State University) during the state of Tennessee budget impasse of 2002.

Central to the investigation were the examination of communiqués, press releases, meeting minutes, and interviews with administrators, faculty, staff, and students of the university. Utilization of a “four basic stages” crisis communication analysis model: crisis preparedness, initial response, maintenance of ongoing corrective actions or reactions, and evaluation and follow-up, provide the operational framework to examine the events (Duke). Utilization of Birkland’s Type Two ‘Focusing Events’ crisis communication perspective, provided the theoretical framework to examine the crisis response and outcomes of the stages.

Interviews with various administrators, including Dr. Sidney McPhee, president of MTSU, revealed contingency meetings took place in the last ten days of
June between the president and Dr. Robert Acker, Dr. Diane Miller, and Mr. Tom Tozer from MTSU News and Public Affairs. The overriding agenda for each meeting concerned planning for and implementation of a partial shutdown of the university in the event the Tennessee state legislature did not pass a fiscal budget by the June 30 deadline. Various communication decisions made during the meetings were:

- Identification of “stakeholders” [students, staff, faculty, administrative personnel, vendors, contractors, clients, etc.]
- Identification of “essential” and “non-essential” personnel as defined by the Tennessee Board of Regents [the governing agency for MTSU and twelve other institutions of higher learning in Tennessee] and the state legislature in preparation for a shutdown.
- A determination that e-mail sent to students, staff, and faculty in conjunction with a posting on MTSU’s main Web page, phone calls to MTSU vice presidents, and press releases to local news agencies would constitute the first notification of the shutdown.
- Consultation with news and public affairs personnel and administrative advisors for the purpose of drafting a university press release.
- Establishment of a “communication tree” for the purposes of notifying stakeholders in the event of partial shutdown.
- Establishment of a “centralized location” and “singular spokesperson” for the purposes of disseminating information.

Each of these decisions aids in formulating the first “basic stage” of a crisis communication model, preparedness. Addressing the central question of “if this happens, how will MTSU respond,” led to the “identification of those who needed to be notified [stakeholders] and answered, “two important questions— who would need to know about this?” and “who can help with this type of situation?” (Hoffman). Gathering this information helped to frame communiqués and coalition personnel best suited to construct and deliver the message, in this case, top administrative officials at MTSU including:

- Dr. Sidney McPhee, MTSU President
- Dr. Robert Eaker, MTSU Interim Executive Vice President and Provost
- Dr. Duane Stucky, MTSU Vice President of Business and Finance
- Dr. Robert Glenn, MTSU Vice President for Student Affairs and Vice Provost for Enrollment Management
- Ms. Lucinda Lea, MTSU Vice President for Information Technology and Chief Information Officer

Pre-planning becomes important in determining how to reach those who need to know and those who are best suited to accomplish the task. Contact information, methods of delivery best suited to a particular crisis (i.e., e-mail, telephone, letter, public address, etc.) form crucial components of the process. During his interview, MTSU President Sidney McPhee, stressed the fact that input was solicited from “multiple sources” to formulate a contingency plan that would provide clear, bulleted information to students, faculty and staff if the partial shutdown materialized. Consistently vocal and adamant on his vision of a “student-centered campus,” McPhee related that “minimizing impact on students enrolled in summer session classes,” was the primary focus of initial crisis planning (McPhee, Interview).

The second “basic stage” of an effective crisis communication plan is evidenced in the initial response of the organization to the failure of the Tennessee state legislature to pass a budget by the fiscal deadline and the subsequent necessity to implement a partial shutdown of state government and MTSU. In the case of MTSU, the initial response was delivered via e-mail to all students, staff, and faculty. Dr. Miller, Dr. Huddleston, and Dr. Glenn, each expressed agreement with the decision by Dr. McPhee that he become the “university spokesperson,” to deliver pertinent information to the students. The message delivered was concise, timely, and carefully worded. In his interview, Dr. McPhee stated, “The university webpage posting and e-mail sent out to the MTSU community were short, almost bulleted in design,” in order to, “minimize misinterpretation and anxiety the students and staff might feel” (McPhee, Interview).

Interviews with Dr. Diane Miller, Dr. Robert Glenn, and Dr. Sherian Huddleston reveal consistent concerns with the impact the shutdown would have on, “the academic progress of summer session students” (Glenn, Interview), and the need to “do the best thing for the students, including those looking to graduate in the summer” (Huddleston, Interview). Dr. Miller remarked that, “The president and the other vice provosts involved wanted to notify everyone as soon as possible,” and “there was a great deal of thought given to reaching everyone we could” (Miller, Interview). Dr. Huddleston commented on the rapidity with which the message was delivered to those affected by the partial shutdown saying, “I think the university did a wonderful job in letting everyone know what was going on and in sending that message out very quickly” (Huddleston, Interview). Dr. McPhee with assistance from Tom Tozer of MTSU News and Public Affairs framed a press release during the late hours of June 30, 2002 (Tozer, Interview). The press release was designed to inform the general public about, “the impact the partial shutdown was having on the university, its students, faculty, and staff” (Tozer, Interview). Second stage initial response sets the crisis communication tone and seeks to identify “gaps in the communication process,” (Hoffman) as it seeks to alert the public to a need for public policy change [the legislature to enact a budget] and the issues facing higher education.
Third stage crisis communication consists of the, “maintenance of ongoing actions and reactions,” (Hoffman) to the problem at hand. During this stage, administrators were looking for breakdowns in the communication process and those not informed by the “initial response” stage. Dr. Diane Miller identified one such glitch in the process, stating, “I felt that we had covered everyone in the phone tree, but we missed the people who were both faculty and directors of departments or programs” (Miller, Interview). E-mails to students, staff, and faculty directed them toward other means of communication. Reminders to check the MTSU main webpage daily became one of the “must air” (Hoffman) messages for the university.

Some administrators, including the MTSU Financial Aid office Director David Hutton, chose to speak to staff in a face to face meeting. He placed emphasis on his commitment to, “letting people know what is happening, and what their role would be during the shutdown” (Hutton, Interview). Also mentioned was the fact that he was unable to notify several student workers who ultimately showed up for work on the following Monday. Mr. Hutton remarked, “We just couldn’t think of everybody, and we missed some of them” (Hutton, Interview). Dr. Hutton, as did others, expressed concern over the terminology used by the state legislature to identify those who would continue to work as “essential” and “non-essential” personnel. He felt this led to negative interpretations that, “Their job is unimportant and that they are not ‘essential’ to the operation of the university” (Hutton, Interview).

Sarah Sudak, MTSU Director of Housing and Residential Life, perceived the initial response by administrators to the crisis was swift and adequate when asked, “Did the communication process work well in notifying you of the partial shutdown?” She replied, “Yes, I was off campus, but got a phone call from Dr. Sells on Sunday night telling me we would go to a partial shutdown. We immediately notified our staff by phone and began discussions on how to best implement the process” (Sudak, Interview). When asked the following question, “Did you discover any problems after the first notification?” She replied, “Yes, we had to figure out how to implement the shutdown, who would be affected and what would happen to the students living in on-campus housing” (Sudak, Interview). Citing delays in state legislative and Tennessee Board of Regents in determining what services MTSU could continue to operate, Sudak said, “We sent a letter to the students in an attempt to let them have as much information as possible, as soon as we had it. Once we had a plan, things happened very quickly and the students were notified immediately” (Sudak, Interview).

President McPhee referred to the letter as an example of, “Communication that was an attempt to get as much information as possible to the students, but unfortunately was written in a way that they [students] did not read past the first part. Had the information in the last part of the letter been in the opening sentences, there would have been no problem” (McPhee, Interview). He added that the letter was not sent from his office and was not part of the ‘centralized message’ of the university. Reaction to the letter precipitated a meeting between students residing on campus, Vice President Robert Glenn, Dr. Debra Sells, other housing staff, and the press. In a swift response following the meeting, the MTSU website update contained a message from the President that, “There are no plans to remove students from on-campus housing” (McPhee, Website Posting). Press coverage of the plight of MTSU students focused attention on the impact the shutdown had on their educational pursuits and placed pressure on the legislature to act. Tennessee House Speaker Jimmy Naifeh commented on the house floor, “We need to get this budget passed. There are some MTSU students in family housing that are going to get kicked out if we don’t” (Naifeh, WSMV).

Another program impacted by the shutdown was the Federal Trio McNair Scholars Program. Director Linda Brown noted the impact evidenced in ways the staff and university had not anticipated. In a response to the question, [Were there any hiccups, so to speak, in the summer program?] Ms. Brown replied, “Very much so. The students were involved in research. Several of them were in labs, the labs were not open, libraries were not open…” (Brown, Interview). Pointing out another issue created by the shutdown, Ms. Brown remarked, “…for instance it was the time of year we would have been carrying our scholars to a conference,” [Annual SAE O P/ UTK McNair Scholars Research Conference]. “Our communication over the conference became ‘Is it on? Is it not? What are we going to do?’ I would e-mail the scholars, let the scholars know, or Miss Cindy [TRIO program secretary identified as essential employee] would e-mail the scholars…” (Brown, Interview).

The identification of services closed to students in summer school and the efforts by the administration of this university, Tennessee Board of Regents, and the state legislature to minimize the educational impact served as stage three ‘maintenance of ongoing corrective actions and reactions.’ The updates on the website by Dr. McPhee, response of Dr. Diane Miller and McNair program staff, the meeting with Dr. Glenn and Dr. Sells, and the letter from MTSU Housing Director Sarah Sudak are all examples of ongoing reactive and corrective actions. Each instance presented new ‘worst-case scenarios’ and the need to respond in ‘clear, concise’ language designed to “provide accurate and timely information” to those impacted by the situation.

With each press release, e-mail, interview, and letter there was a concerted effort on the part of the university staff to “do the best thing for the students
first, and of course the faculty and staff” (Sells, Interview). Each of these actions demonstrates the ‘ten key points’ of the definitive crisis communication plan. The administration and staff accomplished that goal through:

- Expressions of concern/compassion
- Cooperative demeanor
- Immediate response to concerns
- Avoiding evasive behavior
- Staying abreast of the situation
- Providing guidance
- Consistent statements
- Short clear statements
- Confident competence
- Remaining calm

Proactive statements helped, “lessen misinterpretation of information,” and “focus attention where it needed to be, on the budget issue” (Cheatham, Interview). Negative consequences for the students, faculty, and staff of this university were largely perceived by these groups and the general public to be the responsibility of the state legislature. Public outcries for the legislature to ‘do the job they were elected to do’ became commonplace news story coverage. The aftermath of this event and the resultant “fine tuning,” (McPhee, Interview) are the fourth ‘basic stage’ of MTSU’s crisis communication analysis.

After the state legislature passed the state budget, there were many unresolved issues for this and other government agencies. MTSU, like its counterparts throughout the state, made an immediate assessment of the crucial areas of concern. Primary was the re-opening of classes for graduating seniors, followed by the need to revise and adjust class syllabi to incorporate the loss of class time, and the re-opening of campus services for all students. Another issue that surfaced was the implementation of the new budget and the subsequent time crunch to render it operational by the beginning of fall semester. Limitations on enrollment tied to funding cuts created the need to re-examine admissions policies. Freshman customs tours cancelled by the shutdown were quickly rescheduled and various university facilities opened to students, staff, and faculty.

Not immediately evident were the long-term consequences for MTSU. Changes in deadlines for admissions, stiffer admissions policies, making accommodations for students denied classroom access, and negative consequences for Regents Online Degree Program (RODP) students evidenced after most normal operations resumed. An interview with Dr. Rosemary Owens, Dean of the Continuing Studies Program, revealed the RODP issues. When asked how RODP students were notified Dr. Owens remarked, “We house an RODP program here at MTSU, but we had no control over the RODP programs of other universities. Some students were not notified in a timely manner due to the fact that even though they are a student at MTSU, their RODP class may be coming from another institution. I think we need some sort of communication system to reach all RODP students” (Owens, Interview). An interview with Dr. J.P. Montgomery, Dean of the University Honors College, reveals another issue that arose from the focusing event. He stated, “There was no opportunity to preview the new budget or to clarify the impact it would have on the university or its students. Because of the pressure to pass a budget, any budget, there was insufficient time to examine the structure of the budget or what it would mean to our institutions” (Montgomery, Interview).

Each of these issues created both a problem and an opportunity for MTSU to refine and strengthen its crisis communication plan. Aftermath responses to the issues expressed by students, faculty and staff led to multiple comments on how well, “Dr. McPhee and the administration handled the crisis” (Huddleston, Interview) and increased confidence in the ability of the university to, “Handle situations that require effective, immediate response” (McPhee, Interview).

Further commentary reveals that MTSU retained and in many cases strengthened its ‘organizational legitimacy’ with students, staff, and faculty. By continuing to listen to feedback from those affected by the crisis, framing credible response to the feedback, and implementing procedures to alleviate the problems identified, the administration at MTSU fulfilled the criteria for the last ‘stage’ of effective crisis communication.

An examination of the communiqués sent during the shutdown reveal consistency in the ‘centralized message’ determined in the contingency planning meeting held by Dr. McPhee with his advisors preceding the failure of the legislature to pass a budget. The e-mail states in part,

A s a university, our main mission is to provide the highest quality education to students. In carrying out this mission, all of us play very important roles and our jobs are ‘essential’ to the success of the institution. The Legislature’s inability to approve a budget for the new fiscal year was unfortunate. This budget impasse required the labeling of employees as essential or non-essential during the period of July 1-5. The passing of the Essential Government Services Act of 2002 mandated this classification. The vast majority of MTSU’s employees were asked to stay home because we were required to do so by law. Personally, if it were my decision, I would not have used the label “essential” in referring to our employees during this period; however, no other options were available to us.” (McPhee, E-Mail, 5 July, 2002)

The content of the e-mail contributes to the success of the university’s crisis plan in several ways. First, the e-mail contains the same core message established by Dr. McPhee in the contingency and initial response stages of the crisis communication plan. Second, it adds both credibility and legitimacy to both the institution and its central spokesperson, Dr. McPhee. Third, it employs ‘ongoing corrective and reactive’ responses to the focusing event. Fourth, the message results from evaluation and
follow-up of issues that surfaced during the crisis. Last, the core components of the message garner attention for a period of time, provide a “window of opportunity” (Fishman) for legislative action and squarely set responsibility for the crisis on the shoulders of the legislators of the state of Tennessee.

Suggestions for changes to MTSU’s crisis communication plan are directed mainly at ‘stage four’ planning. Solicitation of input from administrators, faculty, and staff are all necessary for formulation of effective response models. There is however, one flaw in that structure – input from the students. The primary goal of a university is to educate and prepare its students for their future. Soliciting input from student had the potential to include issues not identified in the contingency plans or the initial response of the university. Given the clarity of hindsight and the unique nature of the ‘focusing event’ faced by MTSU, the President and his staff did a very credible job of handling the crisis.

References


“Sept. 11 changed crisis communication strategies,” (2002). (Pinnacle Worldwide survey), Business Record (Des Moines), v.18 no.36, p.7 (1).